

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG)

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

Monday, March 15, 2010
2:30 p.m.

The Environmental Justice Advisory Group Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto

1. CALL TO ORDER – The meeting was called to order at 2:45 p.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting:

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Kern	Linda MacKay, At-large Rep.	South
Merced	Melissa Kelly-Ortega, At-large Rep.	Central
Madera	Catherine Garoupa, At-large Rep.	Central
Fresno	Kevin Hamilton, CAC*	Central
Kings	Riley Jones, CAC	Central
San Joaquin	Jeremy Terhune, At-large Rep**	North

*Arrived at 2:52 p.m.

** Arrived at 2:57 p.m.

Staff present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO; Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO; Maricela Velasquez, Senior Public Information Representative; Claudia Encinas, Bilingual Public Information Representative.

Staff present in Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Brenda Turner, Public Information Representative.

Staff present in Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Anthony Presto, Public Information Representative.

Members of the public present – Derek Williams, Rey Leon, and Amber Darby.

3. APPROVE MINUTES OF MONDAY, February 8, 2010 – (no discussion)

Moved: Garoupa
Seconded: Hamilton
Ayes: Terhune, Kelly-Ortega, MacKay, Garoupa, Hamilton
Nays: None
Abstain: Jones

Motion passes 5-0, with 1 abstention, to approve the Minutes of the February 8, 2010 EJAG meeting.

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS (FIRST OPPORTUNITY) – None.

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – No comments by Chair. Ms. Garoupa asked if this section could include comments by EJAG members, as she desired to update EJAG on events that transpired during the last CAC meeting, held on March 2, which she attended. (During later discussion it was decided EJAG comments would be added after the “Public Comment (Second Opportunity)” section).

Ms. Garoupa then provided an update of the discussions that occurred during the March 2, 2010 CAC meeting concerning the presentation to EJAG by the High Speed Rail Authority, CAC expressed concern regarding EJAG submitting material to the representatives of the High Speed Rail Authority without CAC reviewing the material first, and the CAC discussion and subsequent vote on EJAG’s Fee Waiver Request Policy. She stated due to the CAC discussions and subsequent actions, there appears to exist an atmosphere of distrust between the CAC and EJAG, which could influence EJAG’s effectiveness negatively in the future. Ms. Garoupa advised the Request for Fee Waiver was rejected, due to not receiving the majority of the City group vote; however, it will be discussed further during the next CAC meeting and voted on again.

Mr. Hamilton arrived at 2:52 p.m.

Mr. Hamilton said it appeared there was a misunderstanding among the CAC members regarding the Request for Fee Waiver. He recommended a substantial number of EJAG members attend the next CAC meeting, as well as individuals of the public who have had experience requesting documents and who would benefit from the fee waiver. He further suggested EJAG request to present information about the fee waiver at the next CAC meeting.

Mr. Terhune arrived at 2:57 p.m.

Public comment: The following person provided testimony on this matter:

- Derek Williams

6. DRAFT GOALS AND OBJECTIVES FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2010 – Ms. Kelly-Ortega provided a brief history concerning the goals and objectives, stating the work began in August 2009, some evaluation charts were started in September, input from EJAG members and CAC members occurred in October, and the ad-hoc committee began meeting in January of this year.

Mr. Sadredin explained the Bylaws indicate the APCO will finalize the goals and objectives in consultation with the CAC.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega listed the current goals and objectives as created by the ad-hoc committee, which were:

- 1) EJAG will set up a retreat to build trust between District leadership, CAC members, GB members, EJAG community members, and EJAG.
- 2) Increase level of knowledge and understanding the District has regarding cultural awareness and EJ.
- 3) EJAG will ensure specific public documents created by the District are culturally sensitive and reflect EJ principles.
- 4) Advise the District on the enhanced use of EJ maps.
- 5) Increase public participation at EJAG meetings.
- 6) EJAG will have representation on the District's Study Agency.
- 7) EJAG members are encouraged to form a pilot local organizing community in the northern region in order to increase attendance and participation in the District's EJAG process, rules, regulations, and developments.
- 8) EJAG will enhance representation of EJ communities during the California Air Resources Board AB 32 and SB 375 plans (this goal was suggested by Dr. Telles).
- 9) EJAG will work with the District to implement a Tools for Schools program grant to various school districts throughout the San Joaquin Valley. EJAG will work with the District to apply for other grants that will assist communities Valley-wide.
- 10) EJAG will obtain letterhead and business cards.

Attainable goals were then discussed, which resulted in the list of goals and objectives being changed to the following:

- Items 1 and 2 were combined.
- Item 3 remains as written.
- Item 4 remains as written.
- Items 5 and 7 were combined, and item 10 was also added under this section because it was considered part of outreach.
- Item 6 was removed from the list, as the APCO will investigate to see if it is feasible, and will then report back to EJAG.

- Items 8 and 9 were briefly discussed; but, not included on the list of goals and objectives.

During the discussions, Ms. Garoupa proposed listing action items for each goal, in order to assist with completing certain aspects of a goal within an established timeframe. Mr. Sadredin suggested timeframes be referred to in terms of quarters rather than months (i.e. early fourth quarter, late third quarter).

Mr. Jones and Mr. Hamilton stressed the importance of building better working relationships between CAC and EJAG, District staff and EJAG, and Governing Board and EJAG. It was discussed how the District staff and EJAG could work together to accomplish this goal. Possible strategies included:

- A retreat with CAC members, conducted by an outside facilitator. It was suggested CAC members and EJAG members form an ad-hoc committee to organize the retreat and formulate the agenda, which would focus on providing the opportunity for EJAG and CAC to educate the other on matters of interest to each group. It was suggested the retreat be held late in the third quarter, possibly September.
- Increase EJAG's representation at CAC meetings.
- Hold a joint session with CAC and EJAG. Ms. Garoupa stated this was originally recommended by the former CAC Chair, Mary-Michal Rawling. The agenda for the joint session would not include action items, in order to avoid the complications imposed by two different sets of bylaws and the Brown Act; but could include educational items, such as rule updates.

It was decided to combine item #1 with item #2, due to the similar nature of both goals. Mr. Sadredin suggested an action item to list under "increasing the level of knowledge and understanding the District has regarding cultural awareness and EJ" would be to identify who from EJAG will provide the training. Then, once the training topic is chosen, the District will schedule meetings with District staff and/or management with presentations from EJ experts.

Goal #3 was accepted as written.

Regarding goal #4, addressing EJ maps, Ms. Garoupa said when she attended an EPA conference in New Orleans, she heard about a new mapping tool that takes into account a variety of different factors in order to determine where EJ communities exist. To ensure EJAG provides the District with up-to-date and accurate information, she suggested adding the following action item to this objective:

- Compare other mapping systems available in order to ensure EJAG is being as inclusive as possible.

Mr. Sadredin expressed the importance of goal and objective #5, as EJAG's main purpose is to improve the two-way communication process between the District and EJ communities by presenting community concerns to the District and relaying information from the District back to the communities. Mr. Hamilton suggested combining this goal with #7, which deals with the pilot study for the northern region, with the following action item:

- The northern region will form a pilot program to test the community organizing method of recruiting more individuals to participate in EJAG meetings.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega confirmed with Mr. Terhune that the goal for that action item would be to form a local organizing committee that will engage 50 northern region residents in EJAG activities.

Ms. Garoupa recommended changing the wording under goal and objective #5, specifically 1C, where it reads "EJAG is creating EJ literature." She said it was more appropriate for EJAG to work with District staff on this task.

Ms. MacKay then suggested goal #10 also be covered under item #5, as #10 can be considered part of the outreach effort.

The deadline for completing goal #5, which was combined with item #7 and #10, is the fourth quarter.

Goal and objective #6 was removed from the list, as Mr. Sadredin said this could be a task for him to look into and then report back to EJAG.

Regarding goal and objective #8, Mr. Sadredin informed EJAG of two key decisions ARB is making this year related to AB 32, which outlines California's major initiatives for climate change and addressing greenhouse gas emissions. In September, there will be a hearing on SB 375, the nation's first law to control GHG emissions by curbing sprawl, which will affect each of the eight counties in the San Joaquin Valley. In October, ARB will hold a public hearing regarding the Cap-and-Trade program, which is a broad-based program that will impose limits on emissions from a variety of sources. Mr. Sadredin said an action item could be for the District to provide a presentation to EJAG on these issues, EJAG to discuss the topics and form a position, and then testify at those hearings.

Catherine Garoupa recommended tabling items 8 and 9 to the next agenda to allow a vote while a quorum was still present.

Items 8 and 9 were not included in the final motion.

Please note that although objectives 1-6 were referenced in the meeting, only four remained after combining 1 and 2, combining 5, 7, and 10, eliminating 6, and tabling 8 and 9.

1. District staff and EJAG will work collaboratively to create strong working relationships between District staff, the Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC), the Governing Board and EJAG within the next year by:
 - a. Increasing the District staff, CAC and Governing Board's level of knowledge and understanding of Cultural Awareness and Environmental Justice.
 - b. Increasing the Environmental Justice Advisory Group's level of knowledge and understanding of the needs and concerns of other entities: the District, Governing Board and CAC: Agriculture, Industry and Cities groups.

This goal was broken into 14 action items assigned to EJAG and District staff.

2. EJAG will ensure specific public documents created by the District are culturally sensitive and reflect Environmental Justice (EJ) principles. Some considerations include literacy level, languages, and presentation of the information.

This goal was broken into five action items assigned to EJAG and District staff.

3. Advise the District on the enhancement and use of EJ maps.

This goal was broken into four action items assigned to EJAG and District staff.

4. Increase public participation at EJAG meetings.

This goal was broken into 13 action items assigned to EJAG and District staff.

A motion was made to approve draft goals and objectives for submittal to APCO for review and final approval in accordance with the EJAG bylaws.

Moved: Terhune
Seconded: Hamilton
Ayes: Kelly-Ortega, Terhune, Jones, Hamilton, MacKay, Garoupa
Nays: None

Motion passes 6-0, to approve EJAG's Goals and Objectives for 2010.

After the vote, Mr. Sadredin said he needed to receive the goals and objectives by the end of March, in order to make any necessary changes and have the revised goals and objectives ready for the next EJAG meeting.

Ms. Kelly-Ortega stated she will send the goals and objectives to Mr. Sadredin.

Public comment: The following persons provided testimony on this matter:

- Derek Williams
- Rey Leon
- Amber Darby

6. PUBLIC COMMENTS (SECOND OPPORTUNITY) – None.
7. EJAG MEMBERS SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE EJAG REPORT DURING THE CAC MEETING ON TUESDAY, APRIL 6, 2010 - EJAG goals for 2010. Mr. Sadredin suggested more than one member attend the CAC meeting, due to EJAG items on the CAC agenda. Ms. MacKay said she may attend and Ms. Garoupa said she would check her calendar.
8. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT EJAG REPORT DURING CAC MEETING, TUESDAY, April 6, 2010 AT 10:00 A.M. – Ms. Kelly-Ortega.

ADJOURN

Meeting adjourned at 5:14 p.m.

NEXT MEETING – The next EJAG meeting is scheduled on Monday, April 19, 2010 at 4:30 p.m. Meeting held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.