

Action Summary Minutes

San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

GOVERNING BOARD MEETING

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**Thursday, October 21, 2021
9:00 a.m.**

Given the international COVID-19 pandemic, and consistent with public health recommendations and Assembly Bill 361, this meeting was held via Zoom Webinar and video teleconferencing with the Central Region Office (Fresno). This meeting was also webcast.

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER – The Chair, Supervisor Craig Pedersen, called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present.

Present:

Drew M. Bessinger, Councilmember	City of Clovis
David Couch, Supervisor	Kern County
Christina Fugazi, Vice Mayor	City of Stockton
Deborah Lewis, Mayor Pro Tem	City of Los Banos
Buddy Mendes, Supervisor	Fresno County
Tania Pacheco-Werner, Ph.D.	Appointed by Governor
Lloyd Pereira, Supervisor, Vice Chair ***	Merced County
Craig Pedersen, Supervisor, Chair	Kings County
Alvaro Preciado, Mayor	City of Avenal
Monte Reyes, Mayor	City of Porterville
Robert Rickman, Supervisor*	San Joaquin County
Alexander Sherriffs, M.D.	Appointed by Governor
Amy Shuklian, Supervisor	Tulare County
Tom Wheeler, Supervisor**	Madera County

Absent:

Vito Chiesa, Supervisor	Stanislaus County
-------------------------	-------------------

*arrived at 9:05 a.m.

**arrived at 9:07 a.m.

***arrived at 9:42 a.m.

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

4. ASSEMBLY BILL 361 AND DISTRICT REMOTE TELECONFERENCING UPDATE – Annette Ballatore, District Counsel, asked the Board to approve Resolution 21-10-4 directing the District to continue conducting remote teleconference meetings with the intent to periodically review this determination every 30 days as required by Assembly Bill 361.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Shuklian
Seconded: Pacheco-Werner
Ayes: Bessinger, Couch, Fugazi, Lewis, Mendes, Pacheco-Werner, Preciado, Reyes, Rickman, Sherriffs, Shuklian, Wheeler, Pedersen
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve Resolution 21-10-4 directing the District to continue conducting remote teleconference meetings with the intent to periodically review this determination every 30 days as required by Assembly Bill 361

5. APPROVAL OF CONSENT CALENDAR – Item Numbers (18 – 26): *These matters are routine in nature and are usually approved by a single vote. Prior to any action by the board, the public was given the opportunity to comment on any consent item.*
18. APPROVE ACTION SUMMARY MINUTES FOR THE SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY UNIFIED AIR POLLUTION CONTROL DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD MEETING OF THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 16, 2021
19. RECEIVE AND FILE LIST OF SCHEDULED MEETINGS FOR 2021
20. RECEIVE AND FILE OPERATIONS STATISTICS SUMMARY FOR SEPTEMBER 2021
21. RECEIVE AND FILE BUDGET STATUS REPORTS AS SEPTEMBER 30, 2021
22. RECEIVE AND FILE QUARTERLY UPDATE TO THE BEST AVAILABLE CONTROL TECHNOLOGY (BACT) CLEARINGHOUSE
23. RECEIVE AND FILE LISTING OF REFUNDS FOR FISCAL YEAR 2020-21
24. EXECUTE AGREEMENT WITH FACILITY DESIGNS INC. TO DESIGN, PROVIDE AND INSTALL WORKSTATIONS AT DISTRICT FRESNO OFFICE AT A COST NOT TO EXCEED \$242,384
25. APPROVE AND AUTHORIZE CHAIR TO SIGN AN AGREEMENT WITH

CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD FOR CONTINUED
ENFORCEMENT SUPPORT OF STATE REFRIGERANT MANAGEMENT
PROGRAM

26. APPOINTMENTS TO THE DISTRICT'S ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
ADVISORY GROUP

Regarding Item 26 APPOINTMENTS TO THE DISTRICT'S ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP, Dr. Pacheco-Werner said she hoped part of the process of onboarding new members onto the Environmental Justice Advisory Group includes orientation about environmental justice core competencies. Mr. Sheikh responded the training has been included in this year's EJAG Goals and Objectives.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Mendes

Seconded: Bessinger

Ayes: Bessinger, Couch, Fugazi, Lewis, Mendes, Pacheco-Werner, Preciado, Reyes, Rickman, Sherriffs, Shuklian, Wheeler, Pedersen

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve Consent Calendar (Items 18-26)

6. PUBLIC COMMENT – *The following persons provided public comments at this meeting:*

- Connie Young, Citizens Climate Lobby (CCL)
- Clare Statham, Fresno Resident

7. S.T.A.R. RECOGNITION (Service, Teamwork, Attitude, Respect) – Chenecua Dixon, Personnel Director, recognized the following individuals who reached a service milestone during the third quarter of 2021:

Ten Years of Service

Ryan Buchanan, Controller
Chenecua Dixon, Director of Personnel
Dante Sanson, Air Quality Specialist
Brandon Swedblom, Senior Network Systems Analyst

Fifteen Years of Service

Adriana Myovich, Senior Personnel Analyst
Maricela Velasquez, Senior Air Quality Education Representative

Twenty Years of Service

Brian Dodds, Program Manager
Shawn Ferreria, Senior Air Quality Specialist
Esteban Gutierrez, Supervising Air Quality Specialist
Ryan Hayashi, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer
Kevin McCaffery, Senior Air Quality Specialist
Daniel Martinez, Supervising Air Quality Inspector
Kashmir Pandher, Air Quality Specialist

8. **RECOGNIZE KATHI CRUMP FOR RECEIVING THE 2021 RODNEY SWATZENDRUBER OUTSTANDING INSPECTOR AWARD** – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, recognized Kathi Crump, Supervising Air Quality Inspector, on being awarded the 2021 Rodney Swartzendruber Outstanding Inspector Award by the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association. Ms. Crump has worked at the District for 27 years, has played a number of different important roles at the District, and brings positivity, mentorship and outstanding leadership to her team. Ms. Crump expressed her honor and appreciation at receiving the award, and accepted it on behalf of all of the great District inspectors.

Chairman Pedersen thanked Ms. Crump for her professionalism and positive interactions as one of the District's representatives to the community. He said her work is invaluable and appreciated by the Board.

9. **REPORT ON DISTRICT CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE ACTIVITIES** – Chairman Abernathy presented highlights from the Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC) meeting held on October 5, 2021.
10. **RECEIVE UPDATE AND APPROVE ENHANCEMENTS TO BURN CLEANER PROGRAM** – Brian Dodds, Program Manager, provided an update on Burn Cleaner Program implementation, and recommended the Board consider enhancements to the program recognizing the localized impacts of wood burning emissions and the desire to expedite progress in meeting the Valley's attainment goals. The enhancements would revise program eligibility to only fund the purchase and installation of natural gas and electric devices in all Valley counties for residences with access to natural gas.

Councilmember Bessinger asked about the possibility of funding electric fireplaces as an option for this program. Mr. Sheikh responded this is something that the Board and staff are interested in continuing to evaluate, particularly with respect to ensuring permanent emissions reductions.

Dr. Sherriffs said only 5% of the projects with wood and pellet devices were residents with access to natural gas which would suggest they are not relying on their woodstoves for heat. He said this highlights that it is not a critical issue for those people and the finances are not enough to want to go out and buy a lower

emitting stove.

Dr. Pacheco-Werner said she really supports the recommended enhancements. She said the District needs to help push the technology forward and thanked staff for intensively looking at how to move residents in the Valley from burning unnecessarily.

Mayor Pro Tem Lewis commented on the different types of plug-in fireplaces, including gas burning units that must be inserted inside the fireplace cavity. She said there were also standalone, portable electric fireplaces that serve as portable heaters and add the ambiance of a fireplace. She said the portable units do not fit the criteria of what the Board has proposed to do with this program. Mr. Sheikh clarified the goal of the program is to establish a permanent transition away from open hearth burning and the smaller, portable electric units are not currently fundable under this program. He said the only electric options right now are heat pumps as something that can actually achieve the program goals.

Supervisor Pereira arrived at 9:42 a.m.

Dr. Sherriffs suggested developing an incentive package that would render a wood burning device inoperable as well as provide an electric fireplace unit. Mr. Sheikh said staff could evaluate as part of looking at these other low cost options to render the wood burning device inoperable and get the needed reductions. He added generally, he did not think the costs of electric portable fireplace units have been as much of a barrier but staff could definitely evaluate if these devices would meet overall program goals.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Connie Young, CCL
- Clare Statham, Fresno Resident
- Thomas Menz, Fresno Resident

Moved: Sherriffs

Seconded: Bessinger

Ayes: Bessinger, Couch, Lewis, Mendes, Pacheco-Werner, Pereira, Preciado, Reyes, Rickman, Sherriffs, Shuklian, Wheeler, Pedersen

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to revise the eligibility of the Burn Cleaner program to only fund the purchase and installation of natural gas and electric devices in all Valley counties for residences with access to natural gas, and to authorize the Executive Director/ACPO, on behalf of the Board, to make administrative changes to the program as necessary.

11. DISTRICT ENGAGEMENT ON CURRENT STATE AND FEDERAL CLIMATE INITIATIVES – Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, asked the Board to consider options for ensuring that the Valley is well-positioned to respond to opportunities under new state and federal climate initiatives in support of the District’s public health mission, including:

1. Engagement with policy makers on new climate initiatives at the state and federal level to maximize opportunities for achieving the dual goals of reducing local air pollution (criteria/air toxics) and GHG emissions.
2. Engagement with Valley stakeholders to identify and leverage local opportunities that can be supported through funding and programs available under new state and federal climate initiatives.
3. Support to Valley Metropolitan Planning Organizations, cities, and counties in identifying and evaluating potential projects, and providing technical assistance as needed.

Mr. Sheikh said Mr. Jordan outlined some of the core ideas and opportunities that the District can be very helpful in supporting with the goal of continuing to bring a substantial amount of resources into the region. He said this was not meant to be an exhaustive list and staff were looking for any other ideas that Board members may have.

Dr. Pacheco-Werner applauded the District in their intent to engage on these issues and to secure funding for the great things that our different stakeholders are doing to move our emission goals forward. She said she personally sees the co-benefit in engaging in the climate change conversations as a way to ensure that the Valley is represented. As for policy making and resource allocation, she said one of her personal goals with CARB is to do similar engagement because she has seen how easy it is to forget the Valley if someone is not there at the table. She added this was a key role that the District is very appropriately suited for.

Supervisor Wheeler said the lack of forest management over the past 30 years was leading to the massive wildfires taking place over the past several years. He said if we do not start managing the forests, all efforts to clean the air are futile.

Vice Mayor Fugazi said she was really happy that this item was on the agenda. She said climate change is an important topic in her classroom, is something that is personally very important to her, and the fact that the District has the opportunity to do something and have some consensus building is very important. She said we are all part of one big globe and she does not mind the District being leaders on this at all and working collaboratively with as many groups as possible in order to do things that are valuable and demonstrate that we can do them.

Mayor Reyes said climate change is being discussed with or without the District, so being at the table is critical. He voiced appreciation for having this item included on the meeting agenda.

Supervisor Pereira thanked staff for doing a wonderful job. He said being in the conversation and using science to make a difference is very important.

Chairman Pedersen said the District was light years ahead of the rest of the nation in dealing with climate change, which has been our goal in air quality and public health and said we had a lot to share. He said the collaborative nature of the Board and the organization have been shown in their leadership. He said the District would continue to lead in air quality improvement efforts and addressing the issues.

Dr. Sherriffs said he agreed with previous comments and it was great to see this item on the agenda. He said it represents another opportunity for the District. It is clear the District has taken advantage of past opportunities looking at the funding dollars we have been able to secure. He said 190 countries have committed to net zero by 2050 and companies like Shell Oil are also committing to net zero, so the direction that the District needs to go in is clear and there are great opportunities for the agency to achieve its goals as well as help Valley businesses and provide for public health for our communities.

Mr. Sheikh thanked the Board for the feedback and consensus support and reaffirmation of the discussed policy positions and opportunities.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Chris McGlothlin, Western Agricultural Processors Association and California Cotton Ginners and Growers Association
- Shayda Azamian, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability
- Connie Young, CCL
- Thomas Menz, Fresno Resident

12. ACCEPT AND APPROPRIATE \$750,000 IN STATE FUNDING AND APPROVE NEW WILDFIRE SMOKE CLEAN AIR CENTERS FOR VULNERABLE POPULATIONS INCENTIVE PILOT PROGRAM – Todd DeYoung, Director of Grants and Incentives, presented this item which asked the Board to accept and appropriate \$750,000 in funding from the State's Wildfire Smoke Clean Air Centers for Vulnerable Populations Incentive (Clean Air Centers) Pilot Program and approve the attached Budget Resolution to amend the District's Fiscal Year 2021-22 Budget. Mr. DeYoung also recommended the Board approve a new District incentive pilot program to provide funding to support the development of clean air centers in vulnerable populations within the San Joaquin Valley consistent with CARB-approved guidelines, with funding priority for the purchase and deployment of portable air cleaners.

Mr. Sheikh highlighted that staff are sensitive to the fact that our cities, counties and other organizations are highly impacted from a resource perspective, and this is a brand new concept that came about due to the recent wildfires. He said staff understands that the city or county participating in this program may want to take a tailored approach depending on the conditions in their area. He said the District will have an extremely streamlined process for fulfilling requirements for this program, which may be as easy as purchasing one or more portable air filtration units and then sharing information with the District on how they are working. Lastly, he asked Board members to reach out to organizations in their jurisdictions to share information about this new program.

Dr. Sherriffs said it was great to see the District jumping in and very appropriately piloting this program. He said unfortunately, the need is great and only likely to increase in the next few years. As a physician, prevention is his first goal but that does not mean he will not treat a preventable illness. He suggested cooling centers should be a priority as they have figured out a lot of the logistics involved in this program. As a pilot, he asked what type of reporting program participants would need to submit. Mr. DeYoung responded that staff has researched the available cooling centers in the Valley and there was certainly a nexus there as they would be a part of continued outreach. As for reporting, he said staff would like to know the effectiveness, how many people they were able to reach and how easy it was to deploy the units.

Dr. Sherriffs said portability was important as we do not know where the greatest wildfire impacts will occur. He asked how it would work with this program. Mr. DeYoung said staff considered portability as an important piece and said applicants will be asked to provide a plan for serving residents and would be given the flexibility to move locations as needed.

Mayor Reyes said with recent wildfires there has been movement with this type of equipment into areas in order to provide safe spaces to people who are suffering the effects of wildfire smoke. He said if approved by the Board today, he presumed this funding would only apply to future purchases. He suggested asking applicants how well their previous programs have worked to allow them to have the opportunity to obtain funding to purchase additional equipment in the future. He added he would be more than happy to help promote this program with other agencies and organizations as this is something he has been talking about for a long time. He expressed appreciation to staff for putting this program together.

Supervisor Mendes said it would be important for selected locations to consider where the equipment was set up to ensure the air in the building was as clean as possible.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Thomas Menz, Fresno Resident

Moved: Pacheco-Werner
Seconded: Mendes
Ayes: Bessinger, Couch, Lewis, Mendes, Pacheco-Werner, Pareira,
Preciado, Reyes, Rickman, Sherriffs, Shuklian, Wheeler, Pedersen
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried (1) accept and appropriate \$750,000 in funding from the State's Wildfire Smoke Clean Air Centers for Vulnerable Populations Incentive (Clean Air Centers) Pilot Program and approve the attached Budget Resolution to amend the District's Fiscal Year 2021-22 Budget; (2) approve a new District incentive pilot program to provide funding to support the development of clean air centers in vulnerable populations within the San Joaquin Valley consistent with CARB-approved guidelines, with funding priority for the purchase and deployment of portable air cleaners; (3) authorize Executive Director/APCO to execute any necessary agreements with CARB and any other parties; and (4) authorize the Executive Director/APCO to make administrative changes to the program as necessary to ensure successful implementation of the program.

13. UPDATE ON THE 2021 WILDFIRE SEASON AND DISTRICT EFFORTS
Jon Klassen, Director of Air Quality Analysis and Planning, and Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, presented Board members with an update on the current 2021 wildfire season and ongoing District efforts.

Dr. Pacheco-Werner complimented staff on outreach efforts, and said her mom heard about how to protect herself from poor air quality on the Spanish-language television channel. She said it was great proof that the District's message is getting across to residents and congratulated the District's Spanish language team. She said the District's outreach is so valuable and is reaching the most vulnerable populations. She added she was glad to see outreach in Hmong as well. She expressed that it was extremely troubling seeing a half marathon take place during major smoke impacts, as well as high school sports. She asked if there were a current policymaking opportunity at the state level. Ms. Holt said the District asks schools to adopt a policy based on the District's Real-Time Outdoor Activity Risk (ROAR) Guidelines. She added while there may be a policy in place, it takes strong leadership at the school district level to make sure that policy is being followed at the school level. She added it was goal to work closely with community partners to educate more schools through the AB 617 program. She said her team works closely with each Valley school to ensure they have a policy in place and a point person at the school.

Supervisor Pareira left at 11:29 a.m.

Dr. Sherriffs thanked staff for the update and all of the great work they are doing on educating Valley residents, which is very important and an essential part of the public health mission in terms of reaching out to the public and helping them understand and protect themselves. He said the recent wind event was terrifying, worse than any fog he has ever been in and was impossible to drive in.

Mayor Reyes said there were several schools in his area with electronic signs and suggested staff meet with school administrators to see if there was a way to share air quality information on them.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Thomas Menz, Fresno Resident

14. APPOINT AD HOC GOVERNING BOARD SUBCOMMITTEE TO NOMINATE CANDIDATES FOR THE 2022 GOVERNING BOARD CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR – Mr. Sheikh asked the Chair to appoint an Ad Hoc Governing Board Nomination Subcommittee to nominate candidates for the 2022 Governing Board Chair and Vice Chair.

Chairman Pedersen appointed Supervisor Mendes, Supervisor Couch, Supervisor Rickman, Mayor Pro Temp Lewis, Mayor Reyes, and Dr. Pacheco-Werner to the Ad Hoc Subcommittee.

15. VERBAL REPORT ON CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD ACTIVITIES – Dr. Pacheco-Werner reported on highlights from the CARB Board meetings of September 9 and 23, 2021. She said CARB approved the District's SIP revisions and recognized Mr. Sheikh and his staff for working closely with Mr. Corey and his staff to get this huge task completed. She said it was now onto the next step with EPA.
16. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Mr. Sheikh expressed appreciation to Dr. Pacheco-Werner for her ongoing work on the District's PM2.5 SIP action. He said there was a lot of discussion on local efforts at the recent hearing while recognizing the ongoing work and challenges that we still have to meet the standards. He said he appreciated her ongoing attention to those issues and really helping to support the item. He said staff would continue to keep the Board and public apprised as the review moves forward.
17. GOVERNING BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS – Mayor Pro Tem Lewis thanked District staff for coordinating a Tune in Tune Up event in Los Banos on October 30th. She said the staff has been working very diligently with her to ensure that the north side of our Valley has the opportunity to take advantage of some of the incentives that are out there. She voiced appreciation to District staff in general and said she really appreciates all of the hard work they do.

Supervisor Wheeler thanked District staff for their recent Tune in Tune Up event held in Madera.

ADJOURN

Chairman Pedersen adjourned the meeting at 11:55 a.m.

The next scheduled meeting of the Governing Board is: Thursday, November 18, 2021, at 9:00 a.m. The meeting starts at 9:00 a.m., in the Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno. The meeting will be held via Zoom audio and video teleconference (VTC).