

Action Summary Minutes  
**San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District**

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**Tuesday, September 6, 2011**  
**10:00 a.m.**

*The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 2700 M Street, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.*

1. Call to Order - The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m.
2. Roll Call - was taken and a quorum was present.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/EIG (P)	Central
	Amarpreet Dhaliwal/CIG(P)*	Central
Kern	Carolyn Temple/EIG (P)	South
	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
Kings	Riley E. Jones/IAIG (P)	Central
	Kelly Deming/EIG (P)	Central
Madera	Donald Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Tim Durham/IAIG (P)	North
	Richard Jantz/CIG (P)	North
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)**	North
	Randall Blank/CIG (A)	North
Stanislaus	Chris Savage/IAIG (P)	North
	Pamela Neronha/EIG (A)	North
Tulare	David Geer/CIG (A)	North
	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
	Ed Needham/IAIG (A)	Central
	Christine Foster/EIG (P)***	Central

\*Mr. Dhaliwal arrived at 10:22 a.m.

\*\*Mr. Hoffdahl arrived at 10:13 a.m.

\*\*\*Ms. Foster arrived at 10:15 a.m.

*(P)=Primary, (A)=Alternate, IAIG=Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG=Environmental Interest Group, CIG-City Interest Group*

Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director; Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO; Alex Krivobok, Network Systems Analyst; Brandon Swedblom, Network Systems Analyst; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer ; Jessica Fierro, Supervising Air Quality Specialist ; Carol Flores, Operations and Program Support Supervisor

Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Theresa Haywood, Senior Office Assistant

Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) –Nannette Diaz, Senior Office Assistant

3. Approve Minutes of June 7, 2011 and August 2, 2011 – The Minutes were approved with no changes.
4. Public Comments – None
5. Chair Comments – Mr. Cunha acknowledged and commended the 8 counties, public, businesses, industries, District staff, and Board members for achieving the month of August without a violation of the 1-Hour Ozone Standard.

Mr. Cunha announced Ryan Jacobsen, Industry/Ag Interest Group alternate, welcomed his first child, a boy.

6. Executive Director/APCO Comments – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, reported there will not be a September Governing Board meeting. Mr. Sadredin reported the EPA will not be establishing a new ozone standard. Mr. Sadredin stated currently there is a 2008 standard; however EPA has not yet adopted an implementation rule or other plan information for that standard. Mr. Sadredin reported EPA has acted on a number of District rules and regulations and is approving the PM2.5 Plan, the Ozone Plan and the DMV non-attainment penalty fee rule. Mr. Sadredin reported the Governing Board approved funding for the Short Sea Shipping project for the Port of Stockton. He stated CARB executed an MOU to pay the District to administer a state-wide school bus retrofit program. Mr. Sadredin commented CARB complimented the District staff on their work implementing very effective and cost-efficient incentive programs. He reported the Board approved \$2 million for a new grant program that will support electrification of parcel delivery trucks. Mr. Sadredin reported the air quality reading indications point to a very successful effort for the Air Alert Program. He stated with the large amount of media coverage for this program and several partners disbursing the information, the Valley was able to have its first August in history without 1-Hour Ozone exceedances. Mr. Sadredin explained September is another critical month for air quality. He further explained if there are no exceedances during the month of September then the Valley is 1/3 of the way to eliminating the DMV non-attainment penalty fees. Mr. Sadredin thanked everyone for their help.

Mr. Williams asked if there was a possibility of filing for an exemption or waiver during the Air Alert Program due to the fires in the Tehachapi area. Mr. Sadredin explained the District can request an exceptional event declaration from EPA if there is an exceedance. Mr. Cunha added the USDA Air Quality Task Force including Deputy APCO Rick McVaigh, will have an exceptional event discussion at their Board meeting in September.

Public Comment: None

7. Rules Under Development – Jessi Fierro, Supervising Air Quality Specialist, reported the Governing Board adopted four rule actions: Rule 2020 (Exemptions), Rule 4684 (Polyester Resin Operations), Rule 4566 (Organic Material Composting Operations) and Rule 4702 (Internal Combustion Engines). She commented there is only one rule left to be adopted from the two last attainment plans and noted that rule is scheduled to go before the Board for adoption in 2014. Ms. Fierro reported a workshop is scheduled for September 7, 2011 for Rule 2301 (Emission Reduction Credit Banking). She reviewed the last five RACT Rules District staff has been working with EPA to amend.

Public Comment: None

8. Verbal Report from California Air Resources Board (ARB) – Patricia Velasco, Air Resources Board (ARB) representative, reported the Board approved an updated environmental analysis of alternatives to the AB32 Scoping Plan. She explained the action was taken at the conclusion of the presentation by ARB staff providing an update on the full range of actions, measures and initiatives to achieve the reduction of greenhouse gasses required under state law. Ms. Velasco explained these included the Low Carbon Fuel Standard, the progress on SB375 and the forthcoming Advance Clean Car Program to be considered by the Board later this year. Ms. Velasco reported in October the Board will consider the final adoption of the Cap and Trade regulation.

Ms. Neronha asked how the AB32 Scoping Plan related to the judge's legal order. Ms. Velasco responded she will forward information to Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards, who will forward the information to all CAC members.

Public Comment: None

9. Health Risk-Based Strategy – Ms. Fierro reported it has been almost one year exactly since the Board first approved the Risk-Based Strategy and over the past twelve months the concept of the Strategy has been refined. Ms. Fierro gave the example of performing several health related studies in the San Joaquin Valley area including the UCSF/Fresno pilot study on ultrafine particulates, and the follow-up to the Epidemiological Study that examined correlations between air quality concentrations and hospitalizations and

emergency room visits. She explained staff is also looking at new research areas, and there is an allotment in the budget for health related studies and efforts to contribute to the Risk-Based Strategy.

Ms. Fierro commented one of the source categories attracting attention is lawn care emissions. Ms. Fierro explained staff is working with ARB on emissions inventory for this category and learning how ARB quantifies the amount of lawn care emissions that are anticipated from the San Joaquin Valley, both from residential and commercial applications. Ms. Fierro reported District staff will be coordinating a Lawn Care Conference next year to address these emissions. Ms. Fierro reported several recent programs have been organized which contribute to the Risk-Based Strategy, including the Air Alert Program, which empowers the general public to contribute to healthier air quality and alerts people as to when they should monitor their local air quality to protect their own health. She explained staff has been exploring targeting a risk-based approach within some incentive programs including the current round of Technology Advancement Program (TAP) funding, as proposals are reviewed, any potential benefits to that Strategy will be considered. Ms. Fierro reported staff is currently preparing for the next PM2.5 Plan which is the 2012 PM2.5 Attainment Plan and is due to EPA in December of 2012. She explained each measure will be evaluated to benefit the Risk-Based Strategy and ultimately public health.

Mr. Sadredin stated the Risk-Based Strategy was promoted in the context of the new Ozone Standard that EPA was considering. He explained now that EPA has decided to abandon that effort, the District needs to make sure to continue to pursue that approach for the existing 2008 Standard. Mr. Sadredin commented the PM2.5 plan is another opportunity to build on the Risk-Based Strategy because, unlike just ozone, particulate matter has different size particles, different chemistries of particles and more opportunities to ensure efforts are focused on pollutants that matter. He commented he wants to ensure everyone doesn't think there is no need to pursue the Risk-Based Strategy due to EPA not adopting the new standard.

Public Comment: None

10. Economic Workgroup Recommendations – Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO, reported the following recommendations provided by the workgroup.
  - a. Modify the District rule development procedures to include provisions to share the list of impacted trade organizations that District staff has identified at the first public meeting with stakeholders and in the draft staff report at the beginning of each rule development cycle.
  - b. Include descriptions and cost estimates for previous generations of air pollution controls that have been required for the source category in each rule staff report and also reference previous socioeconomic impact reports as each rule is amended.
  - c. Include a provision in the rule development procedures to prioritize the use of cost data based on a hierarchy of data sources, and

- appropriately characterize the source of cost data in reports to the Governing Board
- d. More clearly document in staff reports, the efforts and diligence of staff to obtain performance data and cost data for control equipment.
  - e. Verify that proposed control equipment is approved by other agencies with applicable regulations such as EPA, DOT, and OSHA.
  - f. Ensure that any costs associated with new employee safety requirements are included in cost effectiveness and socioeconomic analyses.
  - g. Socioeconomic reports that are presented to the Governing board should reflect the provisions of the rule as proposed to the Governing Board and not previous draft versions. Any efforts to mitigate impacts based on previous rule drafts should be described separately.
  - h. Identify appropriate industry subgroups for socioeconomic analysis where costs, profits, or production methods vary significantly within and industry.
  - i. Add more emphasis in the socioeconomic analysis report on the discussion of the impacts on small business and add a section that discusses the impacts on municipalities.
  - j. The socioeconomic analysis should more fully characterize current Valley economic issues and challenges, and be expanded to include impact on "at-risk" communities, where the community's major employer may respond to compliance costs by laying off workers.
  - k. For proposed rules where a new technology is introduced and the cost of the control is estimated to be significant, provide the Board the option of requesting that a retrospective analysis of actual costs to industry be performed.
  - l. To ensure and improve accuracy of socioeconomic analysis reports, provide the District with the option to do a case-by-case analysis to determine if an economist should be contracted based on the expertise level of the economist in the specific industry affected by rule amendments.
  - m. In economic analyses, recognize that there is a need for air pollution control because of the adverse impacts of air pollution on public health, the economy and the quality of life, and that health risk impacts need to be primary considerations. While it is generally not possible to specifically analyze or quantify the health benefit of individual rule actions because the quantity of reductions that can be achieved may be small, the need to develop and implement plans to meet health based air quality standards, and the overall benefit of coordinated air pollution control efforts needs to be recognized in economic analyses.
  - n. Modify rule development procedures to include specific guidance on resolving discrepancies between Staff and stakeholder estimates of control costs, and identify staff and stakeholder responsibilities in this process.
  - o. The District should dedicate enough funds for future socioeconomic analysis contracts to ensure that all potential socioeconomic impacts can be thoroughly investigated and analyzed.

Mr. McVaigh commented the level of input and participation from the workgroup members was great and he appreciated their time and energy. Mr. Savage thanked the staff for their efforts, crafting the recommendation and patience with committee members. Mr. Jantz commended staff for taking on the fine balance between economic development, those rules that impact economic development and the Risk-Based Strategy. Mr. Hamilton commented with sufficient effort, public awareness and cooperation and the District proactively working showed it is possible to have success with air quality. He also thanked the staff for being supportive.

Public Comments: *The following persons provided testimony during the public comments portion of the meeting:*

- Elizabeth Jonasson, Coalition for Clean Air

Mr. Cunha thanked staff and Mr. McVaigh for coordinating the workgroup meeting. He requested a motion to endorse the recommendations for improvements to the economic analysis process.

*Moved:* Durham  
*Seconded:* Deming  
*Ayes:* Cunha, Jones, Horal, Durham, Hoffdahl, Savage, Williams, Hamilton, Temple, Deming, Smith, Neronha, Foster, Dhaliwal, Green, Jantz, Blank, Geer  
*Nays:* None

***Motion unanimously carried to endorse the recommendations for improvements to the economic analysis process.***

11. Appoint CAC Hearing Board Subcommittee to Make Recommendations on Hearing Board Vacancies – Mr. Sadredin explained there are three Hearing Boards, one in each region and their duties include holding monthly hearing and making decisions on: variance applications pertaining to air quality rules and regulations affecting business and industry in the Valley, appeals to permits, orders of abatement and revocations of permits. He stated there are vacancies on these Hearing Boards and asked CAC members to forward the information to the community. He commented the medical professional vacancy is difficult to fill and staff would appreciate assistance in forwarding the information. Mr. Sadredin reported two members from each of CAC's interest groups must serve on the committee to perform interviews and make recommendations to the Governing Board for appointments to the Hearing Board.

The following CAC members volunteered to be on the committee to make recommendations to the Governing Board for appointments to the Hearing Board:

Ms. Deming, Environmental Interest Group  
Mr. Hamilton, Environmental Interest Group

Mr. Green, City Interest Group  
Mr. Williams volunteered Mr. Santana, City Interest Group  
Mr. Williams, Industry/Ag Interest Group  
Mr. Durham, Industry/Ag Interest Group

Mr. Cunha will confirm that Mr. Santana is available.

Mr. Horal asked if CAC members can also be Hearing Board members. Mr. Sadredin responded positively but explained there are state requirements for each vacancy.

Public Comment: None

12. Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) –

- a. Verbal Report on EJAG Activities:** Mr. Hamilton reported at the first meeting of the Grants Subcommittee, Mr. Williams was elected Chair and Mr. Dean was elected Vice Chair. He explained staff was instructed to bring information on existing projects focused at small communities in the Valley and designed to assist them in complying with District regulations. Mr. Hamilton reported the Grants Subcommittee will be meeting one hour before the EJAG meeting. He explained EJAG reviewed the action plan to date and are pleased several items have been successful. Mr. Hamilton reported EJAG continues to review the documents the District distributes to the public and have completed their review of the Don't Trash brochures and the Complaints process. He explained EJAG will review and potentially enhance the Air Alert promotional item, a storyline for a fotonovela.

Public Comment: None

*Mr. Hoffdahl left at 11:24 am*

13. Outreach and Communications Report – Ms. Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, explained the fotonovela is a bilingual outreach document and is heavily based on photos. She explained the fotonovela is set up in a comic book like scheme. Ms. Holt reported that the District is still actively recruiting Healthy Air Living (HAL) Partners. She explained the list of Partners is a tool that is used to disburse information including the Air Alert Program. She commented that should a business/individual not want to be a HAL Partner, it is possible for them to only get information on the Air Alert Program. Ms. Holt reported tube packages were mailed throughout the Valley containing information on Air Friendly Fridays.

Mr. Sadredin thanked Ms. Holt for her hard work on the Air Alert Program. He commented she met personally with television stations throughout the Valley

and in Sacramento and garnered broad support from the media. Mr. Dhaliwal asked if there is a Facebook page for the HAL Partners. She explained HAL Partners are asked to get approval from the top person in their organization, utilize materials sent to them, forward information to their employees and other types of things. Ms. Foster thanked Jaime for her work and displayed the information she received on the bulletin board at her school.

Mr. Sadredin explained one of the items the District is attempting to do is to get information regarding not idling vehicles to the parents and asked for recommendations on how to distribute the information. Mr. Hamilton suggested selecting a school in each area and focus the awareness efforts including having staff walking around and make it fun, suggest persons get out of their car and meet each other and perhaps get media attention. Mr. Hamilton stated he appreciated the hard work done by staff. Mr. Green stated he understood the District's limited ability to monitor mobile sources and explained his concern regarding Cal-Trans construction on I-5 and the long line of cars that were idling for hours. Mr. Green suggested contacting Cal-Trans to become a HAL Partner. Mr. Sadredin stated a letter will be sent to Cal-Trans requesting they do what they can at least on Air Alert days. Mr. Dhaliwal commented this is a great strategy for awareness and suggested persons need more education. Mr. Cunha commented the fotonovela designed by CAL-OSHA on heat illness was able to educate about 400,000 agricultural employees. He complimented Ms. Holt on the work done with the District's fotonovela.

Public Comment: None

14. CAC Member Comments and Suggestions to be Included in the Presentation of the CAC Report During the Governing Board Meeting on October 20, 2011 – Ms. Foster asked the Hearing Board Selection appointments be reported to the Governing Board.
15. Volunteer to Present Report During Governing Board Meeting - Mr. Cunha stated he will present the report.

Meeting adjourned at 11:45 a.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on October 4, 2011. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.