

Action Summary Minutes  
**San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District**

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**Tuesday, February 1, 2011**  
**10:00 a.m.**

*The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 2700 M Street, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.*

1. Call to Order - The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.
2. Roll Call - was taken and a quorum was not present. Quorum was formed at 10:30 a.m.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha, Jr./IAIG (P)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/EIG (P)*	Central
Kern	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
Kings	Riley Jones/IAIG (P)	Central
	Kelly Deming/EIG (P)	Central
Madera	Donald Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG(P)	Central
Merced	Richard Jantz/CIG (P)**	North
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)	North
	Wade Broughton/CIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	Pamela Neronha/EIG (A)***	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
	Christine Foster/EIG (P)	

\*Mr. Hamilton arrived at 10:28 a.m.

\*\*Mr. Jantz arrived at 10:30 a.m.

\*\*\*Ms. Neronha arrived at 10:22 a.m.

*(P)=Primary, (A)=Alternate, IAIG=Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG=Environmental Interest Group, CIG-City Interest Group*

Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Seyed Sadredin, APCO; George Heinen, Supervising Air Quality Engineer; James Sweet, Senior Air Quality Specialist; Scott Nester, Senior Projects Manager; Todd DeYoung, Program Manager; Cathy Blevins, Network Systems Analyst; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer

Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Karen Morris, Office Services Manager

Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Emily Gonzalez-Demont, Office Services Manager; Amy Nakanishi, Senior Office Assistant

3. Approve Minutes of January 4, 2011 – Due to a quorum not present at the beginning of the meeting, CAC minutes were approved, with no changes, after Item #14.
4. Public Comments – None
5. Chair Comments – None
6. Executive Director/APCO Comments – Mr. Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, provided an update on AB32 (Global Warming Solutions Act). He reported that a Superior Court judge in San Francisco issued a tentative ruling to stop implementation of AB32. The case focuses on the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) process. The ruling was prompted by a petition filed by the Association of Irrigated Residents, represented by the Center on Race Poverty and the Environment (CRPE), an organization located here in the Valley. The petition expressed concern that ARB did not, in their scoping plan, adequately analyze the alternatives to Cap and Trade. Mr. Sadredin said the case number and instructions on how to download the information can be provided to CAC members.

Mr. Sadredin advised the February Governing Board meeting has been cancelled, as there are no time sensitive issues on the agenda, and also due to the time extensive nature of the last few Governing Board meetings.

Mr. Sadredin discussed the new EJAG business cards, a copy of which was provided in the CAC meeting packet. He stated the last time this item was brought before the CAC, CAC expressed that the EJAG business card logo should distinctly differ from the District logo, in order for people not to confuse EJAG representatives with District staff. He said the District did their best to create a design that satisfies that requirement and requested CAC comment on the new cards.

Mr. Sadredin reported District comments were sent to the EPA yesterday concerning the EPA's proposed partial approval/partial disapproval of the

District's PM2.5 Plan. He explained the EPA came up with a ruling that approved most of the District's plan; however, issued disapproval based on two areas:

- ARB's delay of adopting/submitting on-road and off-road diesel rules to EPA and ARB's emission estimates.
- EPA's contention that VOC emissions should be addressed in the Plan.

Mr. Sadredin said ARB did adopt final amendments to the truck rule and off-road engine rule in December. Additionally, and as the District had suggested, ARB included language in their resolution to have routine and frequent monitoring on progress in reducing emissions in order to take corrective action if needed.

Regarding VOC emissions, Mr. Sadredin explained that studies have shown that because of the chemistry here in the Valley and because of the ratio of nitrogen oxide emissions to VOCs and other constituents, reducing VOCs was not an effective way to reduce PM2.5 concentrations and, in fact, reducing VOCs could even increase PM2.5. Despite this information, EPA made a finding that VOCs were significant and needed to be included in the PM2.5 plan. This would also result in the disapproval of the 5-year extension to meet the standard. This would mean the Valley would fail to show conformity, which would be devastating to the Valley's economy. Mr. Sadredin said both ARB and the District have sent letters to EPA, providing detailed information that, perhaps, EPA did not have access to previously, which will hopefully lead to full approval of the District's PM2.5 plan. He stated the letters are available for anyone who would like a copy. Mr. Sadredin added that disapproval of the South Coast Air District's PM2.5 plan was also proposed by EPA, as was their extension to 2015.

Mr. Sadredin requested CAC members assistance with a public outreach program focused on creating ideas on how the public could help the Valley come into attainment, especially during the summer months and when the back to school traffic starts up; thus avoiding exceeding the 1-hour ozone standards and the related penalties. Once the outreach program is developed, Mr. Sadredin said the District would like to get the public engaged in the process by getting the word out possibly through TV commercials, a cell phone application, etc.

***Ms. Neronha arrived at 10:28 a.m.***

Mr. Jones said he thought the CAC should become involved in this type of program. Mr. Williams agreed and suggested an alert system for the packing houses, which could also result in lower vehicle miles traveled. Additionally, he suggested the city bus schedule could be cut by twenty-five percent on certain days.

Concerning public outreach focusing on the Valley coming into attainment, Mr. Cunha agreed the CAC needs to be involved and recommended workshops involving the CAC, EJAG, and other entities. He suggested the workshop be held within the next couple of months, in order to allow time to develop ideas and present them to the District.

Mr. Sadredin said two or three workshops, focusing on what is reasonable to implement and what strategies make sense to pursue, could be scheduled and the public as well as key stakeholders invited. He said CAC members could participate and CAC could also invite constituencies they represent to attend the workshops. Mr. Sadredin explained that from a scientific standpoint there are technical issues to resolve in order to develop a program that works for the Valley, as there could be a delayed effect in the 1-hour ozone concentrations downwind in the Valley due to emissions generated 3 or 4 days previously in upwind locations.

7. Rules Under Development – Mr. George Heinen, Supervising Air Quality Engineer, gave an update on various rules under development.

***Mr. Hamilton arrived at 10:28 a.m.***

***Mr. Jantz arrived at 10:30 a.m.; quorum for voting formed.***

8. Verbal Report from California Air Resources Board (ARB) – Mr. Jeff Lindberg, ARB Liaison, commented on ARB's response to the EPA regarding the PM2.5 Plan. He said ARB focused their comments on trying to convince EPA that in the San Joaquin Valley a commitment beyond the arbitrary ten percent of the total that they cited is appropriate. Mr. Lindberg said the ten percent is not in a rule anywhere and it is just an assertion that EPA has taken similar actions on other plans in other areas under other circumstances at other times. Concerning the VOC as a limiting precursor, he said ARB agrees with the District that when taken in light of the entire control program and the focus on NOx and directly emitted PM, VOC reduction really does not provide any benefit and often it could provide a non-benefit to PM2.5 levels. He said ARB conveyed this to the EPA, in addition to the technical information supporting the findings. Mr. Lindberg added the best science available in the nation was used to develop these plans.

Mr. Sadredin clarified the difference between enforceable regulations versus commitments. Usually when the District writes a plan, it is indicated what has already been done and that more will be done. Regarding EPA's finding in this matter, EPA has ruled that the commitments in the plan cannot exceed 10 percent of the total need for meeting that standard; which means that 90 percent of what is needed to reach the standard when a plan is submitted has to already be in the form of adopted regulations. This is virtually impossible in the San Joaquin Valley, and in the South Coast Air District region, where emissions need to be reduced by another 90 percent to meet the standard EPA is about to propose, or even to meet the existing standard. He said in the letters to the EPA, it was expressed that in the San Joaquin Valley and the South Coast, the Districts need to be able to commit to do more and not be limited to only 10 percent more.

9. Update on Fast Track to Attainment – Mr. Scott Nester, Senior Projects Manager, provided an update on Fast Track measures. Mr. Cunha requested the presentation be provided to CAC members. The following informational handouts were provided to CAC members in their packets:

- Alternative Energy: On the Fast Track to Clean Air
- Urban heat Island Mitigation: An innovative way to reduce air pollution and energy usage
- Green Purchasing and Contracting: A guide to reducing environmental impacts through the procurement process

After his presentation, Mr. Nester requested the District receive comments from CAC and the Fast Track task force by February 18, in order for the District to present the item to the Governing Board in March. Additionally, the District will continue to develop Fast Track grant programs and develop the outreach and resources for all three items discussed.

Mr. Sadredin requested feedback from CAC on the District's outreach campaign to get the public engaged to do what they can to assist in this effort, as the District still has major challenges to reach attainment. He referenced the article in the Fresno Bee, which was also published in the Sacramento Bee, that stated that within the past 10 years there has been an eighty percent reduction in the number of unhealthy days, a 60 percent reduction in the number of unhealthy days for sensitive people, and a 20 percent increase in the number of good air quality days in the San Joaquin Valley.

Mr. Hamilton said this is an opportunity to help get the public more engaged in efforts to create a cleaner environment. He suggested incentives be used to encourage the public to choose green alternatives. Mr. Horal suggested working with city and county agencies regarding regulations that require parking lot sizes to be determined by the size of the building being constructed, which results in large asphalt parking lots that are not needed or used.

Ms. Neronha said once the plans are approved by the Governing Board, EJAG will be able to conduct public outreach. In regards to the green purchasing and contracting, she said there is a conference in Bakersfield on February 18 called the Fourth Annual Public Contracting Expo. This type of event would be a perfect venue for public outreach in the future.

Mr. Green expressed his concern regarding credibility, especially in the current economic environment. Mr. Sadredin said the job here is to promote thinking about it, give any assistance we can and encourage people to move in that direction by providing workable solutions. Mr. Nester asked Mr. Green to review the documents and assist the District in refining the content. Mr. Sadredin agreed with Mr. Green's comments regarding economics, and that will definitely be a big part of how the District packages the public outreach efforts. He reiterated this program will be voluntary in nature. Additionally, the District will also look at alternatives, such as - if the program will be more cost effective than asking businesses to spend more money to get a fraction of the reductions in emissions. Additionally, as the economy picks up, this will play a role on how cities and counties decide to spend their resources. Mr. Smith expressed

concern that a voluntary program would be worked into a general plan amendment and transformed to an enforceable program.

Public Comment: *The following persons provided testimony during this portion of the meeting:*

- Colby Morrow, Southern California Gas Company

Mr. Cunha requested Ms. Morrow provide the information she referred to during the Public Comment section and Mr. Williams requested Mr. Nester provide that information during the February 18 program.

10. Update on Proposition 1B and Other Funding to Reduce Truck Emissions – Mr. Todd DeYoung, Program Manager, Grants and Incentives, provided a brief update on recent activities with respect to funding for the replacement and retrofit of heavy-duty vehicles. Mr. DeYoung said the District will be accepting applications in March and April and there are two voucher programs open currently for trucks and truck replacements. He said information regarding the program will be available on the District website.

Mr. Green asked if there was a shortage of trucks in California to handle the cargo because of the new changes in the rule. He said a lot of feedback has been received indicating truckers are looking into trans-loading operations that are being setup in Las Vegas, where the cargo would be transferred to only California trucks. Mr. Green also asked if new trucks are coming on line fast enough to fulfill the needs as the rest of the fleet gets retired out.

Mr. Cunha requested Mr. DeYoung come back in March and provide further information regarding Proposition 1B and the funding. He also requested handouts covering those issues be provided to CAC members. Mr. Cunha said the presentation will be scheduled on that agenda right after the Executive Director/APCO's comments.

11. Update on New Air Quality Studies Funded Through the San Joaquin Valleywide Air Pollution Study Agency – Mr. Sweet provided a brief presentation, which covered the creation of the Study Agency and its purpose, the Policy Committee and its purpose, and the Research Technical committee and its purpose. He also discussed the Study Agency's research approach, current research being conducted and planned research projects.

Mr. Cunha requested Mr. Sweet provide a more in-depth presentation during the April CAC meeting and requested handouts of the presentation to be provided to CAC members.

12. Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) Business –

- a. EJAG Highlights:** Ms. Pamela Neronha, CAC and EJAG member from Stanislaus County, gave a report on the items discussed

at the EJAG January 25, 2011 meeting. She reported EJAG did have a quorum for the January meeting. Ms. Neronha also provided updates on the three following EJAG ad-hoc committees:

- 2011 Objective Committee
- Mapping Committee
- EJAG/CAC Collaborative Workshop Committee

Additionally, she said the EJAG Action Plan to increase public participation in the northern San Joaquin Valley is in its final form. In addition, the following three regional efforts are related to EJAG's finalized action plan:

- In the Southern region, Mr. Dean, the Ethnic Small Business Owner representative, is holding a public meeting on Friday, February 18 in Bakersfield at the Fourth Annual Public Contracting Exposition, at which time he will introduce EJAG's Goals and Objectives to the community and elicit comments from community members.
- In the Central region, Mr. Williams, EJAG representative from Tulare County, has recently recruited two community organizers representing the cities of Dinuba and Farmersville, who he plans to invite to the next EJAG meeting.
- In the Northern region, Ms. Neronha and Mr. Terhune, who represent the San Joaquin County, have scheduled a meeting on Monday, February 14, at the Catholic Charities in Stockton.

She said the goal of the action plan is to increase public participation in order for EJAG to bring timely issues of concern to the CAC and District Representatives.

Lastly, Ms. Neronha stated EJAG unanimously agreed to continue to hold monthly meetings on the fourth Tuesday of the month except for December, which has been tentatively scheduled for Tuesday, December 13, at 5:30.

Mr. Cunha requested an EJAG attendance sheet be included in the CAC packet.

**b. Appointment of CAC City Representative to EJAG:** Mr. Cunha said he would work with the APCO and Ms. Neronha in an effort to appoint someone by the end of this month.

**c. Review of Complaint Brochure:** The updated Complaint brochure was provided to CAC members in their packets. Mr.

Cunha stated the brochure looked good and no additional comments or suggestions were made.

12. Outreach and Communication Report – Ms. Holt, Chief Communication Office, said the 2011 Healthy Air Living Kid's Calendars and the 2010 Annual Report are available.

Mr. Williams asked if the District will have a booth at the farm show. Ms. Holt said the District will have a booth and the following four departments will be represented: Compliance, Permitting, Grants and Outreach and Communications.

Mr. Cunha encouraged CAC members to take a copy of the District's budget report and encouraged CAC members to take an extra one to provide to the Chair of the Board of Supervisors of each of the counties, as it shows how the District distributes funds, as well as how the DMV fees will benefit communities.

13. Member Comments and Suggestions to be Included in the Presentation of the CAC Report During the Governing Board Meeting on February 17, 2011 – The Governing Board meeting for February 17 is cancelled.

Mr. Williams suggested the EJAG attendance sheet that Mr. Cunha requested to be included in CAC members' packets be a rolling report and suggested CAC also have the same type of attendance report included in their packets, in order to keep current on potential attendance problem areas and vacancies.

Mr. Cunha said future CAC agendas will have a column on the left that will indicate if an item is for action or no action. This change will assist CAC members to identify items that require a vote.

14. Volunteer to Present Report During Governing Board Meeting – The Governing Board meeting for February has been cancelled.

Meeting adjourned at 12:01 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on March 1, 2011. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.