

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE SPECIAL MEETING

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

Tuesday, November 1, 2011
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 2700 M Street, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. Call to Order - The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:08 a.m.
2. Roll Call - was taken and a quorum was present.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
	Ryan Jacobsen/IAIG (A)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/EIG (P)*	Central
	Amarpreet Dhaliwal/CIG (P)	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)	South
	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
Kings	Dennis Tristao/CIG (P)	Central
Merced	Tim Durham/IAIG (P)	North
	Mary-Michal Rawling/EIG (P)	North
	Richard Jantz/CIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	Chris Savage/IAIG (P)	North
	Richard Gibson/EIG (A)	North
	David Geer/CIG(A)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
	Ed Needham/IAIG (A)	Central

*Mr. Hamilton arrived at 10:21 a.m.

(P)=Primary, (A)=Alternate, IAIG=Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG=Environmental Interest Group, CIG-City Interest Group

Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO; Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO; Cathy Blevins, Network Systems Analyst; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer ; Samir Sheikh, Director of Strategies and Incentives Program; David Lighthall, Health Science Advisor; Errol Villegas, Program Manager for Strategies and Incentives; Carol Flores, Operations and Program Support Supervisor

Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Theresa Haywood, Senior Office Assistant

Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) –Nannette Diaz, Senior Office Assistant

3. Public Comments – *The following persons provided testimony during the public comments portion of the meeting:*
 - Bob Smith, Bike Bakersfield
4. Discussion and Brainstorming Session On Air Alert program And Complementary Programs –

A. Presentation by District Staff Recapping 2011 Activities: Mr. Cunha thanked everyone for attending the meeting and explained the meeting's purpose is to allow everyone the opportunity to voice their ideas while professionally respecting everyone's comments. Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, presented a brief presentation summarizing information previously discussed at the Governing Board meeting on October 20, 2011. She explained the Air Alert Program was conceived over a year ago when, in spite of significant improvement in air quality over the past several years, the Valley failed to meet the 1-Hour Ozone Standard by the 2010 deadline which triggered Section 185 of the Clean Air Act and federal penalties. She reported District staff developed a multi-faceted strategy to address the issue, considered economic and health impacts, identified the challenges of achieving the Standard and gave the public and business communities as many tools as possible to reach the goal of attainment of the 1-Hour Ozone Standard.

Ms. Holt explained there was a collaborative effort to coordinate the Air Alert Program with other programs already in existence. She noted the key objective of the Air Alert Program was to focus on changing the public's behaviors. She commented the District felt the public heard the message of the Air Alert Program in its inaugural season, and the next step is to assess and better address whether or not people are changing their behaviors. She noted the program targeted drivers from all sectors including business, public and schools. Ms. Holt then summarized the media partnerships contributing to promoting the Air Alert Program.

Dr. David Lighthall, Health Science Advisor, gave an overview of the Real-Time Air Advisory Network (RAAN) Program by explaining its development which began about two years ago with the desire to take advantage of the extensive network of hourly air monitors throughout the Valley. He noted the District spent an entire summer engaging school districts throughout the Valley and obtaining input on how to put a real-time air advisory network program into practice. Mr. Lighthall described how the RAAN Program works and how the monitoring stations update the air quality information each hour. He commented that several grants have been given to the American Lung Association to actively promote and engage school districts on the RAAN Program, including how to integrate the Flag Program. He explained the Flag Program gives forecasted information by county versus RAAN, which gives information hourly for a school area. Mr. Lighthall then demonstrated how to access the information from the District website.

Mr. Hamilton commented this program has huge potential and asked about the possibility of using home addresses instead of school areas. Mr. Lighthall responded there is technology available to do this. He commented staff is developing a smart phone application to quickly access the information.

Mr. Dhaliwal suggested incorporating weather information to the smart phone application in development. Samir Sheikh, Director of Strategies and Incentives Program, explained the same phone services used to provide weather information is used for the Air Alert Program so it may be possible to integrate the two.

Mr. Sheikh concluded the staff update presentation by reviewing the four Air Alert episodes announced in 2011. He explained the Air Alerts were announced with a conservative perspective. He also noted the exceedances occurred within the Fresno metropolitan area only. Mr. Sheikh reported the Valley could possibly still attain the 1-Hour Ozone Standard during the 2011-13 time period.

Mr. Sheikh stated the District felt the strategy to involve public and minimize ozone levels was effective due to the great outreach in communicating the complex message to a diverse audience. He commented the emphasis on what the cost to the Valley would be if attainment could not be reached was a good mechanism to begin discussions on bringing awareness to the RAAN Program and health impacts due to air quality. Mr. Sheikh noted the value of the media outreach outweighed the actual amount spent and received positive support from businesses and residents.

Mr. Dhaliwal commented the Healthy Air Living campaign is great and noted he was on a radio program and he was able to give information on

the different studies and programs from the website. Mr. Tristao asked about the causes of Fresno's urban area exceedences. Mr. Sheikh explained research is currently being conducted to determine the factors. He commented there are urban emissions and issues with the re-circulation of the air, especially with the hot afternoon conditions, which lead to ozone-like plumes wafting towards southeast Fresno. Mr. Tristao asked if the District is contacting transportation planning agencies in the Fresno/Clovis area, since the problems seem to be a mobile source issue. Mr. Lighthall responded one of the issues in Fresno is there are several gross polluting vehicles and a large population in the metro area. He explained this is where the Tune In Tune Up Program comes into play.

Mr. Tristao stated he was interested in reviewing the data to confirm the assertion of the calculated percentage of gross polluting vehicles in this metropolitan area and others. Mr. Sheikh commented an objective of these types of programs is to shear off some of those peaks that are still being driven by the emissions side of the equation. He explained the metropolitan conditions are largely driven by perfect conditions of high temperatures, air stagnation and in Fresno, the re-circulation pattern. Mr. Sheikh stated research is being conducted to determine how much of the peak is due to emissions versus metropolitan conditions and what can be done to lower the peak below the 1-Hour Ozone Standard.

Mr. Hamilton asked if construction on Highway 99 was considered as an emission source during the time period of September 22, 2011 when ozone levels were exceptionally high. Ms. Holt stated she and Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, met with CALTRANS to begin a dialogue. Ms. Holt said there is another meeting scheduled with CALTRANS to discuss shifting construction hours during an Air Alert episode but also to utilize their changeable message signs to inform persons when Air Alerts are in place.

Mr. Clark asked if there was any correlation with permissive burns from the Forest Service and forest fires occurring during the Air Alert periods. Mr. Sheikh responded those types of exceptional events are considered. He explained during the 1-Hour exceedence in Clovis there was no wildfire occurrence that could be considered an exceptional event.

Mr. Green stated he was glad to hear the District is working with CALTRANS. Mr. Jantz asked if vendors of drive thru establishments are aware of the emissions caused by vehicles idling and if the vendors were willing to participate in some kind of means to mitigate this practice during Air Alert episodes. Ms. Holt responded District staff is working with local restaurant associations, and this is an area that will be revisited. She noted ideas would now be written down as part of the brainstorming discussion.

Mr. Geer commented on increased interest in roundabout traffic circles and asked if the District would be promoting further development of roundabouts in the Valley.

Public Comments: *The following persons provided testimony on this item:*

- Tom Frantz, Association of Irrigated Residents

Ms. Rawling left at 10:46 am.

B. Brainstorming Discussion Regarding Suggestions for 2012:

i. Who Are the Target Audiences

- a. Mr. Needham suggested fast food restaurants, not only at the corporate level but also the franchised establishments as well. He suggested the restaurants give incentives for customers coming inside instead of using the drive thru. Mr. Hamilton stated he liked the idea of either money off coupon or promoting the restaurant as family friendly.
- b. Mr. Williams suggested a promotion for shoppers to stock up on items so they don't have to go out during an Air Alert episode. He commented he was in favor of roundabouts.
- c. Mr. Savage commented the list of target audiences on the agenda is good, however to move forward some key information is missing. He suggested informing the target audience their relative contribution to the problem and what they can do to help solve the problem. Mr. Savage commented this may help in letting the public understand what their role in the process is and he understood this was a large task but it is something that is going to have to be done. Ms. Holt agreed with the need to specify a key message for each of the target audiences.
- d. Mr. Jantz asked if it was possible to give advance notice of the Air Alert days. Ms. Holt explained the District would like to announce Air Alert episodes 48 hours in advance; however the District does not want to give false alarms. She explained the media coverage that was received for the Air Alert Program was due to the Program's uniqueness and urgency of the air alerts. Mr. Sheikh commented the goal is to allow some planning time for businesses and residences prior to the Air Alert episode.
- e. Mr. Gibson suggested the signs that give information on road conditions on the way to mountains also include that an Air Alert episode has been announced and limit wood burning.

- f.** Mr. Clark complimented the staff on the notification to the target audience. He commented the Check Before You Burn took three years to really succeed and suggested continuing with working out issues. He gave the example of successful notification when he receives feedback from the community including his school aged grandson. He recommended reviewing bike lanes versus bike paths.
- g.** Mr. Green commented due to the economy and school busses not being utilized to drive students to events because of overtime pay to the bus driver, parents are driving their children to after school events and suggested the District assist with funding somehow. Mr. Clark stated he agreed the bussing issue is critical.
- h.** Mr. Williams suggested contacting EPA or utilizing state and federal legislative contacts to offer tax credits for businesses that would consider closing their drive thru during Air Alert episodes.
- i.** Mr. Tristao commented other target audience members include CALTRANS and other city public works departments and suggested requesting their projects cease or modify their construction activity so it does not delay traffic.
- j.** Mr. Hamilton stated he wanted to ensure agricultural businesses were included in the target audience and suggested adjusting their schedules and offering more education.
- k.** Mr. Needham asked if leaf blowers were a large impact and suggested landscape businesses be part of the target audience. Ms. Holt reported there will be a Lawn Care Conference on March 21, 2012 and there will be more information forthcoming. Mr. Lighthall explained landscape businesses are being requested to utilize cleaner lawn care technology during Air Alert episodes.
- l.** Mr. Cunha commented heavy duty equipment utilized today is cleaner due to retrofit or replacement programs. He stated farmers did respond to the Air Alert episodes by curtailing harvesting activities and general farm activities. Mr. Cunha commended the Kings Areal Rural Transit (KART) Program which provides various services for all Kings County residents. He stated a concern with a regulation requiring vehicle liability insurance costing \$100,000 per seat making it difficult to use vans to transport people. Mr. Cunha reported the Department of Labor has been citing the owners of vans, which are

- customarily used to transport agricultural workers, for not having vehicle liability insurance. He explained the agricultural workers must use their own vehicles to go to work and they primarily own older vehicles.
- m. Mr. Sheikh reported there was communication with agricultural stakeholders across different sectors during the Air Alert episodes to curtail as many emission causing activities as possible.
 - n. Mr. Cunha suggested drive thru include pharmacies, banks, credit unions.

Public Comment: *The following persons provided testimony on this item:*

- Frances Contreras, Fresno/Madera Agency on Aging
- ii. **What Should We Be the Specific Message for Each Target Audience and How Do We Grab Their Attention?**
 - iii. **What Should We Be Asking Our Target Audiences To Do?**
 - a. Mr. Cunha suggested a neighborhood health program modeled after a neighborhood watch program. He recommended two or three barbeques are used for a neighborhood and the neighborhood comes together instead of each household using their own barbeque. Mr. Cunha stated that to get attention of persons is to direct the message to their pocket book.
 - b. Mr. Jacobsen commented his opinion after watching news clips informing the public of the Air Alert episodes is the public is mostly concerned with paying the extra \$12 fee. He suggested informing the public they could be saving money if they link trips, car pool, not drive during Air Alert episodes and include what other benefits could be gained including health benefits. He commented the pocket book is always going to be the strongest tie.
 - c. Mr. Williams suggested adding barbeques to the no burn rule especially on Air Alert days. He stated he sees small stores cooking meat over an open drum all day long.
 - d. Mr. Jacobsen stated there is awareness in the community about the challenges. He gave the example of a restaurant near Fresno State that spews smoke. He said he is asked how the restaurant is allowed to have smoke but the community is not allowed to burn. Mr. Jacobsen stated people are recognizing there is an issue and noticing other people and businesses causing emissions.
 - e. Mr. Tristao commented to be cautious when discussing personal home cooking. Mr. Williams

clarified his comment was directed towards charcoal and wood burning barbeques. Mr. Tristao commented an educational program would be fine but would not want to see a ban on barbeques.

- f. Mr. Dhaliwal suggested the message be directed at the \$29 million penalty instead of the \$12 fee. He recommended possibly utilizing a per capita cost.
- g. Mr. Cunha acknowledged families gathering together and cooking as part of their community is a good thing but if a family can only afford charcoal or wood then how the message is presented needs to be carefully reviewed.
- h. Mr. Cunha stated the largest contributors to the issue are vehicles, but construction projects are also a major source of idling vehicles. He commented the message must not only be from the District but also community and legislative leaders.
- i. Mr. Cunha suggested beginning a dialogue with school districts.

Public Comment: *The following persons provided testimony on this item:*

- Bob Smith, Bike Bakersfield

Mr. Savage left at 11:53 am.

Mr. Needham left at 11:56 am.

Mr. Green left at 11:58 am.

Mr. Jantz left at 12:06 pm

Mr. Jacobsen left at 12:09 pm

Mr. Tristao left at 12:13 pm

Mr. Williams suggested having longer school days and shorter school years.

Mr. Cunha thanked District staff and CAC members for their contributions and comments.

Mr. Cunha tabled the rest of items until the next meeting. He requested the discussion points be sent to all CAC and EJAG members.

Meeting adjourned at 12:16 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on December 6, 2011. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.

Target Audiences

1. General Public
2. Schools
3. Business Community
4. Media
5. Community and Environmental Groups
6. Fast Food Restaurants
7. Other Drive-thru Businesses
8. Shoppers
9. Caltrans and other Public Works Agencies
10. Landscapers
11. Aging Population
12. Drivers

Suggestions

1. Work with drive-thru business operators to promote and incentivize in-store service during air alerts
2. Encourage Caltrans and other public works agencies to avoid road construction and maintenance during peak traffic hours
3. Promote the use of "roundabouts" and traffic circles to lessen traffic congestion
4. Work with Fresno Transportation Planning Agencies to reduce peak mobile source emissions in Fresno/Clovis area
5. Educate and encourage mountain residents to limit wood-burning. Use road signs to notify mountain residents of wood-burning restrictions
6. Further evaluate and consider incentives for bicycle infrastructure to reduce vehicle emissions
7. Promote and support the use of school buses for transportation to and from schools and school events
8. Consider proposing a tax credit for drive-thru operators that shut down "drive-thrus" during air alerts
9. Encourage businesses to make additional changes in response to air alert notifications
10. Support continued and expanded use of vanpools, work to eliminate conflicting regulatory requirements and disincentives – Use strong cities/strong communities initiative to open dialog with federal agencies
11. Use Radio/TV to engage senior citizens, use newer technologies to engage baby boomers
12. Encourage senior citizens to trip-link early in the day to reduce emissions and exposure
13. One member recommended extending burning restrictions to barbecues—another advocated using caution when proposing to limit personal preferences like the use of barbecues

14. Address smoke from commercial barbecues
15. Continue with existing Air Alert program and allow time for the program to work
16. Focus on economic message including the Section 185 penalty and costs related to health impacts of air pollution
17. Start school year later
18. Develop "Safe Routes" to school for walking and bicycling
19. Provide more bicycle infrastructure in environmental justice areas