

Action Summary Minutes  
**San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District**

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**March 6, 2012**  
**10:00 a.m.**

*The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 2700 M Street, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.*

1. Call to Order – The Vice Chair, Dennis Tristao, called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.
2. Roll Call - was taken and a quorum was present.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)*	Central
Kern	Nicholas Ortiz/IAIG (A)	South
	Carolyn Temple/EIG (P)	South
	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
	Les Clark/IAIG (P)	South
Kings	Dennis Tristao/CIG (P)	Central
	Riley E. Jones/IAIG (P)	Central
Madera	Donald Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Tim Durham/IAIG (P)	Central
	Mary-Michal Rawling/EIG(P)	Central
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	Pamela Neronha/EIG (A)	North
	David Geer/CIG (A)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
	Ed Needham/IAIG (A)	Central
	Christine Foster/EIG (P)	Central

\*Mr. Cunha arrived at 10:05 am

*(P)=Primary, (A)=Alternate, IAIG=Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG=Environmental Interest Group, CIG-City Interest Group*

Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO; Brandon Swedblom, Network Systems Analyst; Cathy Blevins, Network Systems Analyst; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Jessica Fierro, Supervising Air Quality Specialist ; Samir Sheikh, Strategies and Incentives Director; Errol Villegas, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager; Todd DeYoung, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager; David Lighthall, Health Science Advisor; Dave Warner, Permit Services Director; Carol Flores, Operations and Program Support Supervisor

Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Theresa Haywood, Senior Office Assistant

Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) –Nannette Diaz, Senior Office Assistant

3. Approve Minutes of February 7, 2012 – The minutes were approved with no changes.
4. Public Comments – None
5. Chair Comments – None
6. Executive Director/APCO Comments – Mr. Sadredin reported the Governing Board appreciated CAC's support for the acceptance of \$359,689 in Carl Moyer funding from the Mojave Desert Air Quality Management District for qualifying emission-reduction projects in the Valley. He stated at their February meeting the Board approved a contract with Agilaire LLC to implement a new automated air quality management system. He explained the two-phase project includes a pilot system and noted if the pilot system meets the District's objectives then the entire monitoring system would be put in place. Mr. Sadredin added the project will reduce labor costs associated with operating the District's expanding air monitoring network. Mr. Sadredin reported the Board approved a Memorandum of Understanding with the Local Government Commission for \$12,000 to implement local educational leadership conferences. He explained the conferences will advance the District's Healthy Air Living program and clean air goals related to land use, CEQA and Indirect Source Review. Mr. Sadredin reported the Governing Board approved the proposed action plan for the development of approaching federal attainment plans including core plan components, guiding principles and a timeline for plan development and the public process.

Mr. Sadredin reported the District's annual trip to Washington D.C. will include four Board members. He invited CAC members to attend the Board's Study Session scheduled for May 2 and 3, 2012 at Bass Lake. He

explained that although this is an informal setting, the meeting is a fully Brown Act compliant meeting and will be duly noticed to the Public. He asked CAC members to review the forthcoming Study Session agenda items and submit suggestions to staff.

Mr. Sadredin reported a presentation will be provided to the Board at their March meeting to approve an agreement for \$184,700 with the Stanislaus Council of Governments to purchase land use tools to assist cities and counties with developing land-use scenarios and to assess the associated emissions impacts. He explained this grant will be for seven of the eight counties in the Valley, excluding only Fresno County due to their own development plan.

Mr. Cunha asked if the new Board members will be receiving information on various District programs. Mr. Sadredin responded there are orientation sessions scheduled for the new Board members to inform them of District programs.

Public Comment: None

7. Rules Under Development – Errol Villegas, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager, reviewed Rule 1020 (Definitions). He explained the 2012 PM2.5 plan development is in process and there will be public workshops beginning in April 2012. He requested suggestions for outreach possibilities to inform the public of the planning process.

Public Comment: None

8. Verbal Report from California Air Resources Board (ARB) – Patricia Velasco, Air Resources Board (ARB) representative, reported ARB did not hold a meeting in February. Ms. Velasco stated that on February 28, 2012 an event to showcase advances in clean diesel technology was held in Sacramento. She added ARB and industry officials held a press conference to highlight key policies and events that have led to the transformation of clean diesel technology. She commented major innovations in diesel technology have been driven by the stringent diesel engine emissions and clean diesel fuel standards adopted by the ARB. Ms. Velasco reported that in addition to the press conference an outdoor exhibit featured agricultural tractors, construction machines and equipment, commercial and pick-up trucks, clean diesel cars and engines used in marine vessels displaying the latest in low emissions clean diesel technologies.

Ms. Velasco reported the EPA, ARB, California Energy Commission, SJVAPCD, South Coast AQMD hosted a meeting on February 29, 2012 to

assist in encouraging regional deployment of zero and near zero emission trucks in the San Joaquin Valley and the South Coast air basin.

Public Comment: None

9. Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) Business –

- a. **Verbal Report on EJAG Activities:** Ms. Pam Neronha, Stanislaus County At-Large Representative, reported there was a presentation from Errol Villegas, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager on the update for the PM2.5 Attainment Plan. She explained staff has been developing guiding principles and preparing foundational work for the plan which is due to EPA by the end of this year. She stated there was an update from the Grants Committee by Todd DeYoung, Strategies and incentives Program Manager. She explained he reviewed emission control options, cost effectiveness and other aspects of the eight Potential Recommendations for the Use of DMV Funds made by the members of the Grants Subcommittee at the January meeting. She stated the Subcommittee prioritized funding for two incentive projects and recommended approval by the full EJAG Committee. Ms. Neronha reported EJAG members agreed and voted to request the District allocate \$1 million per region from the \$10 million DMV fees set aside for EJAG for school bus replacement or retrofit and \$1 million per region from the \$29 million DMV fees to retrofit or replace refuse trucks owned and operated by private haulers in areas covered by the District's EJAG maps. She commented the remaining projects will be discussed at future meetings. Ms. Neronha commented the presentation by Jonathan London, Director of the Center for Regional Change at UC Davis was very informative. Ms. Neronha reported the EJAG members received information on the Lawn Care Conference and the For Reel Video Contest.

Mr. Williams and Mr. Jones concurred that the school bus replacement or retrofit projects are based on the EJAG maps. Mr. Williams noted the Grants Subcommittee meets at 4:30 pm just before the EJAG meeting.

Ms. Rawling requested clarification as to why the refuse trucks eligible for grant funds are only for private haulers and not public entities. Mr. Jones responded municipalities are more able to maintain the equipment than private haulers. Ms. Rawling expressed her concern that people in cities or unincorporated areas are affected by emissions from all refuse trucks and recommended being more inclusive as to who is eligible for the

funds. Mr. Sadredin explained the recommendations from EJAG members will go to the CAC members for input.

- b. Appointment to the CAC-Industry/Ag Interest Group EJAG seat:** This item was tabled until the next CAC Meeting on April 3, 2012.

Public Comment: None

10. Discuss And Offer Suggestions And Recommendations Concerning The District's "Health Risk Based Strategy" Which Is Intended To Provide For A More Reasonable Implementation Of National Ambient Air Quality Standards By Prioritizing Public Health – Samir Sheikh, Strategies and Incentives Director, and David Lighthall, Health Science Advisor, provided this presentation regarding the implementation of the District's health risk-based strategy. Mr. Sheikh explained the basic framework of the risk-based strategy including the difficulty to meet new federal standards. He explained the risk-based strategy will not replace mass-based federal standards but will focus on implementation with public health serving as they key factor in developing and implementing strategies including EJ communities.

Dr. Lighthall explained particles are complex and therefore not all PM2.5 emissions are the same with regard to health impact. He presented a graph illustrating how outdoor exercise magnifies exposure and chemical uptake of ultrafine particles. He did note that EPA is not regulating ultrafine particles but stated it is important to take their impact on health into consideration.

Mr. Sheikh discussed the role of the risk-based strategy in development of the 2012 PM2.5 Plan including the prioritization of strategies to achieve the greatest public health benefits and perform an analysis of plan health benefits over time. Dr. Lighthall added the tracking of emerging health research and proposing further health research would also be considered in the implementation of the 2012 PM2.5 plan. Mr. Sheikh also explained there is a pursuit of technology demonstration projects with risk-based strategy benefits.

Ms. Temple expressed her concern regarding efforts towards indoor air quality. Mr. Sheikh responded there has been work done by both the state and EPA in establishing regulations and outreach tools to assist in improving indoor air quality. Mr. Durham asked if there may be a cost per ton on NOx that people may be able to pay to help reduce emissions. Mr. Sheikh responded that although NOx is critical to both the ozone and PM2.5 standards there is not an easy solution. He explained the cost to achieve a ton of NOx reduction is incredibly high; however there are less expensive opportunities in the areas of mobile sources that unfortunately the District

does not regulate. Mr. Sadredin added the Advanced Emission Reduction Option (AERO) is currently an opportunity for businesses that already employ advanced controls to pay fees in lieu of additional controls if they find that option to be more cost effective. He explained within a risk-based strategy the driving factor will be what is best for public health and the methodology will be less important.

Mr. Cunha stated he supports the risk-based approach but is concerned regarding the price of the technology, specifically for landscapers. Mr. Cunha asked if the research that is funded is being administered through the District. Mr. Sadredin responded a topic on the number of research proposals that are of interest to the District is one of the items slated for the Governing Board Study Session. He discussed outreach to landscape type businesses utilizing a multi-faceted approach. Dr. Lighthall added the Lawn Care Conference will include information on improving health of employees and reducing costs in the long run.

Public Comment – The following persons provided testimony on this item:

- Elizabeth Jonasson, Coalition for Clean Air

11. New Voucher Incentive Program – Todd DeYoung, Strategies and Incentives Manager provided a presentation on a new grant program as an enhancement to the District's overall portfolio. He explained the District is proposing to create a new, ongoing streamlined voucher-based program targeted at small trucking businesses that do not qualify for other incentive programs. He stated staff is proposing to use \$3 million of existing vehicle surcharge revenues to fund this program. Mr. DeYoung discussed heavy dealer participation will include physical inspection of new and old vehicles and District verification of all information submitted will ensure the integrity of this program.

Public Comment: None

Mr. Cunha thanked staff for their efforts. He motioned to recommend support staff's proposal of the New Voucher Incentive Program to the Governing Board.

Moved: Cunha

Seconded: Horal

Ayes: Cunha, Clark, Jones, Horal, Durham,  
Hoffdahl, Williams, Temple, Smith, Foster,  
Green, Tristao, Geer

Nays: None

***Motion unanimously carried to recommend support of staff's proposal of the New Voucher Incentive Program to the Governing Board.***

*Ms. Rawling left at 11:25 a.m.*

12. Outreach and Communications Report – Maricela Velasquez, Senior Outreach and Communications Representative, reported the 2011 Annual Report is available and the registration is open for the Lawn Care Conference on March 21, 2012 in Fresno. She announced the For-Reel Video Contest began March 5, 2012 with the theme being *Healthy Air, Healthy You* and the winner receives an I-pad and the video will be aired on television. Mr. Sadredin added there are two i-Pads being donated by the Industry/Ag Interest Group of the CAC.

Mr. Jones asked if the CAC members have viewed the previous winner's video. Ms. Velasquez requested the video be played for the CAC members present. Ms. Foster commented the 2011 Annual Report was very helpful and thanked staff. Mr. Cunha asked if the outreach for the Lawn Care Conference included bilingual radio and television stations. Ms. Velasquez responded the bilingual media is scheduled to be contacted.

Public Comment: None

*Mr. Green left at 11:38 a.m.*

13. CAC Member Comments; CAC Member Suggestions To Be Included In The Presentation Of The CAC Report During The Governing Board Meeting on March 15, 2012 – Ms. Foster asked that the recommendation for support on the New Voucher Incentive Program be included in the presentation.
14. Volunteer to Present Report During Governing Board Meeting – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report during the Governing Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 11:41 a.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on April 3, 2012. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.