

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

April 1, 2014
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. Call to Order – The Chair, Lee Smith, called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m.
2. Roll Call – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting. A quorum for voting was not met due to lack of members present in the City Interest Group.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Kevin Hamilton/EIG (A)**	Central
	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)*	Central
	Ryan Jacobsen/IAIG (A)	Central
Kings	Diane Friend/IAIG (A)	Central
	Alene Taylor/EIG (A)	Central
Madera	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Jack Lemen/CIG (P)	Central
	Tim Durham/IAIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Wade Broughton/CIG (P)	North
	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)	North
	David Phippen/IAIG (A)	North
Stanislaus	Richard Gibson/EIG (P)	North
Tulare	Michael Brown/EIG (P)	Central
	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central

*Mr. Cunha arrived at 10:09 a.m.

**Mr. Hamilton arrived at 10:12 a.m.

(P)=Primary, (A)=Alternate, IAIG=Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG=Environmental Interest Group, CIG-City Interest Group

Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) –Dave Warner, Permits Services Director; Samir Sheikh, Director of Strategies and Incentives; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Jessi Fierro, Program Manager/Legal Specialist; Todd DeYoung, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager; Anna Myers, Senior Air Quality Specialist; Cathy Blevins, Network Systems Analyst; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards

Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Ann Marie Collins, Office Services Manager

Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Nannette Diaz, Senior Office Assistant

3. Approve Minutes of March 4, 2014 – Approval of CAC Minutes was tabled until a quorum could be met.
4. Public Comments – None
5. Chair Comments – Mr. Smith made a point of order to have Agenda Item Number 12 – *Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) Business* be presented before Agenda Item Number 7 – *Rule Updates*.
6. Executive Director/APCO Comments – Dave Warner, Permits Services Director, reported at the March Governing Board meeting there was a presentation on the Arvin Ozone Saturation Study which was designed to build a scientific foundation for estimating ozone concentrations at a neighborhood level in the Kern/Arvin area. He added the District retained an independent contractor to install and operate a network of temporary ozone monitors at 21 sites in Kern County with the focus around the city of Arvin. Mr. Warner reported that measurements at the new Arvin site were higher than readings at the old Arvin site.

Mr. Warner reported the Governing Board also reviewed and approved the Annual Air Toxics Report. He added the Board also heard a presentation on the recently completed scientific bilingual public opinion survey regarding several key air quality issues and public behaviors related to air quality in the Valley. He noted the survey focused on three main habits: residential burning, lawn care and driving habits. He added the purpose of the survey was to guide the District's outreach efforts. Mr. Warner shared some highlights of the results, which were mostly positive.

Mr. Warner reported the Governing Board also heard a presentation on the proposed pilot program to replace high polluting vehicles which would also be presented later at the meeting. Mr. Warner noted proposed agenda items for the April Governing Board meeting included an update to the revisions of

the Residential Wood Burning Rule which would also be presented later at this meeting. He added the End of Season Wood Burning Report would also be presented at the April Governing Board meeting.

Ms. Friend asked why there was not more of a focus on transporting children to school and vehicle idling at school locations. Mr. Warner explained that issue will be the subject of a major outreach effort by the District this summer and will be an item of discussion at the upcoming May Governing Board Study Session.

Public Comment: None

12. Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) Business

a. Verbal Report on EJAG Activities for February – Derek Williams, Tulare County At-Large Representative, reported EJAG members voted to accept the Grant Committee's incentive funding recommendations. Mr. Williams added an update on the California Air Resources Board (CARB) Truck Rule was presented. He added EJAG members also completed the 2014 Goals and Objectives and reviewed District Outreach materials.

b. Review and Provide Input on EJAG Recommendations for Emissions Reduction Grants in EJ Areas – Mr. Williams briefly reviewed the recommendations for grant funding in the Valley environmental justice areas and requested recommendation number 3a regarding the DMV fee assessment be removed due to the subject matter not being in the purview of EJAG.

Mr. Warner suggested obtaining consensus of CAC members present to forward to the Governing Board due to lack of quorum to take action. Mr. Smith asked if there were any objections to the EJAG Recommendations; seeing none he declared a consensus of CAC members present were in agreement with the EJAG/Grants Committee Recommendations absent recommendation 3a.

c. Consultation on EJAG Action Items – No additional comments were provided by the CAC.

Public Comment: None

7. Rule Updates – Anna Myers, Senior Air Quality Specialist, updated CAC members on upcoming rules. She explained the District is continuing to await further guidance from EPA for adopting PM2.5 Attainment Plans under

subpart 4 of the Clean Air Act. She added District staff is continuing to work on the preliminary stages of preparing for the 2008 8-hour ozone standard. Ms. Myers reviewed upcoming rule developments including Rule 2201 (New and Modified Stationary Source Review Rule). She explained EPA is requiring states and air districts to revisit PM2.5 NSR requirements developed under prior EPA guidance. She added that while new EPA guidance has not been finalized, the District must have a new rule adopted by December 31, 2014, that complies with subpart 4 (of Part D, title 1, federal Clean Air Act). She noted likely revisions include PM2.5 precursor relationship clarifications and a change to the definition of major source threshold.

Mr. Brown asked what expectations are of Rule 4905 (Natural Gas-Fired, Fan-Type Residential Central Furnaces) and Rule 4692 (Charbroiling). Ms. Myers explained South Coast AQMD and the District are together performing research and development of new technologies that will possibly lower the PM limits for Rule 4905 (Natural Gas-Fired, Fan-Type Residential Central Furnaces). She added extending the applicability of Rule 4692 (Charbroiling) to under-fired units to further reduce PM2.5 emissions. She added a new incentive program to assist in the deployment of new technologies will be considered.

Mr. Gibson requested clarification of under-fired charbroilers. Mr. Sheikh explained the District would request existing restaurants to retrofit their facilities to reduce emissions. He clarified an under-fired charbroiler is the steak house type restaurant units that have an actual flame without a chain.

Mr. Hamilton asked if there are any other regulations in other parts of the country relating to the under-fired charbroilers. Mr. Sheikh responded the District Rule would be the first of its kind. He noted the challenge is the need to demonstrate technologies in restaurants and the subsequent deployment of technologies once they are demonstrated to be feasible.

Ms. Friend requested clarification on the terminology, significant emission reductions. Mr. Sheikh explained the additional reductions from the commercial charbroiling measure was necessary to bring the Valley into attainment .

Mr. Smith requested clarifications on changing the definition of a major source threshold. Mr. Warner explained EPA most likely will establish an initial attainment status of 'moderate' for all non-attainment areas with the PM2.5 standard meaning the District probably won't adjust the major source threshold for PM2.5 but perhaps may be required to in the future.

Mr. Lemen asked the reason for not including residential charbroilers. Mr. Sheikh explained that the focus was on commercial operations due to their higher emissions.

Public Comment: None

8. Verbal Report from California Air Resources Board (ARB)

- a. ARB Board Meeting Summary – Patricia Velasco, ARB representative, reported no Board meeting was held in March 2014. She reviewed an upcoming workshop and training as listed on the summary. She noted an upcoming workshop not listed on the Summary will be on Low Carbon Fuel Standard on April 4, 2014 in Sacramento. She added she will forward the information for members after the meeting.

Ms. Velasco responded to a question at the previous CAC meeting regarding a definition for a small business. She explained the Office of the Ombudsman noted there was no one definition that encompasses all industry types. She added the definition depends on the purpose of a specific program or rule and the definition will change accordingly. She suggested contacting the Office of the Ombudsman liaison and she will forward the contact information after the meeting.

Mr. Brown explained he uses the definition from the California Department of General Services adding a small business under their definition is determined by the dollar amount of expenditures and the number of employees.

Public Comment: None

Mr. Smith briefly left at 11:01 a.m. and Mr. Williams assumed the role of Chair. Mr. Smith returned at 11:19 a.m.

9. Pilot Program to Replace Cars under Tune In Tune Up – Todd DeYoung, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager, gave the presentation on this item. He noted the District's Tune-In Tune-Up repair program has been extremely successful and the District has been advocating for clean-vehicle replacement strategies in communities of need. Mr. DeYoung explained the goals of the pilot program including utilizing existing weekend repair events to identify and engage candidates for replacement which will provide the 'proof of concept' to ARB. He reviewed the pilot program criteria which will target pre-1996 model year unregistered vehicles, and noted eligible participants would agree to scrap their existing vehicle for a \$5,000

redeemable voucher. Mr. DeYoung explained 18 vehicles are anticipated to be replaced with the pilot program. He noted the District would be able to secure a significant portion of \$3 million currently available through state Enhanced Fleet Modernization Program (EFMP) funding. Mr. DeYoung reported the Governing Board approved up to \$100,000 for a pilot program and authorized the Executive Director/APCO to execute agreements with Valley Clean Air Now as necessary.

Mr. Gibson asked if the existing vehicles will be resold. Mr. DeYoung explained the existing vehicles will be crushed and not be used again to ensure the engine and drive train will not make it back into circulation.

Mr. Hamilton expressed appreciation for the District's efforts with this issue.

Ms. Friend asked if there are any repairs done at the events. Mr. DeYoung explained the process of the Tune-In Tune-Up event. He stated a car will come through for a diagnostic test and if it fails then the owner receives a voucher worth up to \$500 for emissions related repairs that would be scheduled at a participating smog shop. He noted the \$500 voucher covers the majority of emissions repairs necessary.

Mr. Williams requested how dealerships would be selected, since not many dealerships have a presence in all three regions. Mr. DeYoung explained there will have to be a balance in terms of streamlining the operation but there may be more than one dealership participating. Mr. Williams asked if there will be a system in place to ensure the cost of the vehicle to the applicant will be comparable to Kelley Blue Book value. Mr. DeYoung explained that one of the criteria is to ensure the cars purchased are reasonably priced.

Public Comment: None

10. Update on Amendments to Rule 4901(Wood Burning Rule) – Jessi Fierro, Program Manager/Legal Specialist, gave the presentation on this item. She explained the importance of Rule 4901 (Wood Burning Rule) noting because it is reducing one of the largest sources of directly-emitted PM2.5, it is one of the most cost-effective measures and is important for attaining federal PM2.5 standards. Ms. Fierro reported the District runs highly successful incentive and outreach programs to encourage residents upgrade to cleaner devices and to curtail residential wood burning emissions. She also reviewed the results of the 2014 public opinion survey. Ms. Fierro explained the changes under consideration include increasing the number of “No Burn” days by lowering the curtailment level and encouraging transition to registered clean burning devices by allowing them to be used on more days and through increased financial incentives.

Ms. Fierro reviewed issues under consideration include maintaining the simplicity of the messaging, the registration process and the enforcement of the regulation. She added the definition and time of a certification of the device would need to be considered as well. She noted other changes under consideration include potential enhancements to an incentive program because it will play a key role in the overall strategy. Ms. Fierro reviewed the comments received at the evening scoping meeting on March 27, 2014 adding that the comment period is still open. She stated another public workshop will be held and an amended rule is expected to be presented to the Governing Board in the summer 2014.

Mr. Phippen commented encouraging residents to purchase cleaner devices would be received by the public rather than reducing the amount of Burn Days.

Ms. Friend asked if scheduling No Burn days during key periods is a possibility. Ms. Fierro explained a No Burn day is declared on a 24-hour basis because if the forecast is too far ahead there is too much of a possibility that things could change. Ms. Friend suggested the possibility of allowing a Burn day on Christmas but then not on any other day. She added persons tend to adhere to regulations if they know they are going to get something in return. Ms. Fierro responded the approach will be considered.

Public Comment: None

11. Consider Recommendations by CAC Subcommittee for Hearing Board Appointments – Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards, stated the item would be tabled due to lack of quorum from the City Interest Group.
12. Outreach and Communications Report – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, reported staff completed the public opinion survey and assisted with the Wood Burning Workshop. She noted there will be several outreach events in the coming months including Earth Day and the Bike to Work events. She added there is an ongoing promotion for the Clean Green Yard Machine program. Ms. Holt reported staff is working on enhancements to the District website and the smartphone app. She added schools are being targeted to provide information on the RAAN program and school transportation.

Mr. Williams suggested the possibility for an incentive program to assist with installing synthetic lawns. Ms. Holt responded the District is open to suggestions and thanked Mr. Williams for his comment. Mr. Sheikh added the District is currently focusing on lawn care in a feasibility study.

Public Comment: None.

13. CAC Member Comments; CAC Member Suggestions To Be Included In The Presentation Of The CAC Report During The Governing Board Meeting on April 17, 2014 – Mr. Smith requested an agenda item to discuss a CAC Subcommittee to oversee the Grants Committee Recommendations.

Ms. Friend requested assistance from the Governing Board in distributing any materials on mitigating air quality effects of the drought. Mr. Warner reported meetings with agriculture representatives are being coordinated to discuss concerns, scientific data and what actions will be sought.

14. Volunteer to Present Report During Governing Board Meeting – Mr. Smith volunteered to present the report during the Governing Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 11:43 a.m.

Next Meeting –The next meeting is scheduled on May 6, 2014. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.