

Action Summary Minutes  
**San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District**

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**June 3, 2014**  
**10:00 a.m.**

*The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.*

1. Call to Order – The Chair, Lee Smith, called the meeting to order at 10:06 a.m.
2. Roll Call – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting. A quorum for voting was not met due to lack of members present in the Industry/Ag Interest Group.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Sarah Sharpe/EIG (P)* Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central Central
Kern	Carolyn Temple/EIG (P) Brent Green/CIG (P)	South South
Kings	Dennis Tristao/CIG (P) Kelly Deming/EIG (P)	Central Central
Madera	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	North
Merced	Jack Lemen/CIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Wade Broughton/CIG (P)	North
Tulare	Michael Brown/EIG (P) Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	South Central

\*Ms. Sharpe arrived at 10:12 a.m.

*(P)=Primary, (A)=Alternate, IAIG=Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG=Environmental Interest Group, CIG-City Interest Group*

Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) –Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO; Jessi Fierro, Program Manager/Legal Specialist; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Mehri Barati, Director of Administrative Services; Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives; Todd DeYoung, Strategies and Incentives Program Manager; Aaron Tarango, Supervising Air Quality

Specialist; Anna Myers, Senior Air Quality Specialist; Carlos Garcia, Senior Air Quality Engineer; Cathy Blevins, Network Systems Analyst; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards

Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Ann Marie Collins, Office Services Manager

Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Nannette Diaz, Senior Office Assistant

3. Approve Minutes of May 6, 2014 – Approval of CAC Minutes was tabled due to the lack of a quorum.
4. Public Comments – None
5. Chair Comments – Mr. Smith commented he appreciated having the option to chair the meeting from the Modesto office via the District's Video Teleconferencing system (VTC).
6. Executive Director/APCO Comments – Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO, thanked CAC members who attended the Governing Board Study Session, held on May 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> in Bass Lake, CA, noting the full agenda and variety of issues discussed. He reported a few of the items discussed included developing a strategy to reduce emissions at school sites, the possibility of imposing special measures during extreme weather conditions, and the upcoming neighborhood by neighborhood air quality information system for the public. He added there was also a presentation from EPA on the complexity of their regulations and also a discussion related to the District's CEQA commenting process. Mr. Sheikh reported staff received direction from the Board to continue the Air Alert Program, focusing on the importance of attainment and what it means to businesses and the economic vitality of the Valley. In addition he noted the Board directed staff to promote the Real-time Air Advisory Network (RAAN) as the best mechanism for schools to obtain information on air quality and be able to make informed decisions about student activities during periods of poor air quality.

Mr. Sheikh noted an additional item discussed was related to the biomass industry and where it fits with the District's open burning strategy. He added staff was directed by the Board to continue to work with the agricultural and biomass industries to address various issues and develop solutions to challenges. He also reported a separate discussion included a comprehensive action plan dealing with the strategies related to light duty vehicles titled Promoting the Use of Clean Passenger Vehicles in the San Joaquin Valley. He added this discussion included the District's electric

vehicle deployment plan, the Tune In, Tune Up program and programs promoting bicycle paths and other alternative ways of commuting.

In addition, Mr. Sheikh reviewed proposed agenda items for the June Governing Board meeting, including a Tune In, Tune Up agreement that would extend the repair program and incorporate the new vehicle replacement portion. He added two researchers will make presentations at the Board meeting on two recent scientific studies funded by the District..

Mr. Cunha asked if Cap and Trade funding for truck incentive programs was discussed at the Governing Board Study Session. Mr. Sheikh explained it was not, however, he noted the Board previously took a strong position that was captured in a letter sent to ARB requesting significant funding from Cap and Trade for truck replacement. Mr. Cunha requested a copy of the letter to be distributed to CAC members. Mr. Williams noted a letter from EJAG was also sent to ARB requesting Cap and Trade funds be used for truck replacement incentive programs.

Public Comment: None

7. Rule Updates – Anna Myers, Senior Air Quality Specialist, updated CAC members on upcoming rule projects. She noted the District hosted a public scoping style workshop to present the development of the District's next ozone attainment plan. Ms. Myers explained the presentation included a description of the scientific and regulatory foundations of the plan, control measures already in place, the District's "no stone left unturned" philosophy, a discussion of ozone – how it's formed and its health effects on the public, descriptions of the emissions inventory, transboundary ozone and the Reasonable Available Control Technology (RACT) demonstration report. She added there would be a presentation later in the meeting regarding RACT. Ms. Myers reviewed the upcoming rule projects and public workshops.

Mr. Brown requested staff to look into the safety aspect of prohibiting low income and small business owners from burning their wood burning devices. Mr. Sheikh explained Rule 4901 (Wood burning Fireplaces and Wood Burning Heaters) is extremely important because of its cost effectiveness and positive health impact. He encouraged CAC members to participate in the public workshops. He added staff is researching ways to increase grant funding, developing creative methods to assist land owners and are working with retailers so applicants do not have to pay up front for a clean burning device.

Mr. Smith asked if Rule 4901 would include the foothill communities. Mr. Sheikh explained the foothill communities will not be included in the Rule

since the Rule will likely maintain the exemption for communities that do not have access to natural gas. He added staff is taking a proposal to the Governing Board at a future meeting to consider additional outreach, education and better promotion of incentive programs for the residents in foothill communities.

Mr. Smith asked what happens if the Valley reaches an episodic criteria level. Mr. Sheikh explained the Valley has never reached the higher levels. He explained the process should the Valley reach episodic criteria levels.

Mr. Tristao requested review of the Clean Air Act (CAA) Subpart 4 requirements. Mr. Sheikh stated staff anticipates presenting at the next CAC meeting on upcoming PM2.5 attainment planning issues, including Subpart 4 issues.

Mr. Cunha expressed concern for residents that do not have funding to purchase a certified clean burning device. He requested staff to develop criteria that would meet the needs of low income residents. Mr. Sheikh noted staff and EJAG members are discussing those issues and have come up with some ideas. He added staff anticipates providing an update on Rule 4901 at the August CAC meeting.

Public Comment: None

8. Verbal Report from California Air Resources Board (ARB)
  - a. ARB Board Meeting Summary – Patricia Velasco, ARB representative, reported the Board met on May 22, 2014 and approved the first update to the Climate Change Scoping Plan and six research proposals. She added staff presented an informational update on the San Joaquin Valley Metropolitan Planning Organizations' (MPO) development of the Sustainable Communities Strategies (SCS). Ms. Velasco reported the Board approved submittal of the California Regional Haze Plan 2014 Program Report to EPA. She added the Board will meet on June 26, 2014 to consider approval of the 8-hour ozone emission inventory for the State's non-attainment areas for the federal 2008 8-hour ozone standard. Ms. Velasco reviewed upcoming workshops and trainings.

Mr. Smith asked what sources are being discussed during the update that includes fast-track reductions of 'short lived climate pollutants'. Ms. Velasco explained one of the sources she is aware of is mine methane.

Mr. Cunha expressed disappointment at the chosen research projects, specifically Improving DeNitrification-DeComposition (DNDC) Modeling Capability to Quantify Mitigation of Potential of Nitrous Oxide from California Agricultural Soils. He asked Ms. Velasco to forward his concerns to the appropriate personnel noting the usual process of the Ag Technical Committee and the USDA Air Quality Advisory Board reviewing research proposals was not followed. Ms. Velasco stated she will forward appropriately.

Mr. Cunha requested an update on the Truck Rule and the status be sent to District staff.

Public Comment: None

9. Consider Position on Reasonable Available Control Technology Demonstration (RACT) – Ms. Myers gave the presentation on this item. She explained the RACT SIP is part of the District's Attainment Plan for 2008 8-Hour Ozone Standard. She stated the RACT SIP fulfills Clean Air Act requirements by demonstrating that all federal RACT requirements continue to be satisfied in the Valley. She added EPA has issued federal actions documenting approval of current District rules as implementing RACT and as such this demonstration report focuses on the changes in technologies and regulations since EPA's previous RACT determinations. Ms. Myers reviewed what the 2014 RACT SIP demonstration report consists of including discussion of the negligible effect of VOC emission reductions to advance attainment of ozone. She noted EPA's proposed implementation rule of the analysis of VOC rules are not required as part of the RACT demonstration report if VOC emissions reductions do not advance attainment and to focus instead on NO<sub>x</sub> emissions reduction opportunities. She added modeling and technical analyses through recent plans have demonstrated that additional VOC reductions will not advance Valley's ozone attainment. She explained the evaluation of NO<sub>x</sub> rules includes the comparison of each rule to new federal, state and local regulations since the previous RACT determination for each individual rule. She noted the analysis has concluded that the determination of the District NO<sub>x</sub> rules continue to meet or exceed RACT levels of control. She reviewed the rules evaluated as part of the RACT SIP demonstration report. Ms. Myers reported staff is continuing to analyze and research for the attainment plan for the 2008 8-hour ozone standard.

Mr. Tristao requested an explanation on the timeline EPA follows for approval of the RACT SIP. Mr. Sheikh explained EPA has an 18-month process they must follow. He noted currently there is a proposed rule under which the District will submit the RACT SIP.

Mr. Williams voiced support for a recommendation to approve and submit the 2014 RACT demonstration report to the Governing Board. Ms. Sharpe stated she would not support a recommendation to the Board due to more information being needed.

Public Comment: *The following persons provided testimony on this item:*

- Colby Morrow, Southern California Gas Co.

Mr. Smith asked where the deadlines come from if EPA has not approved the rule. Mr. Sheikh explained the timelines are established in the proposed implementation rule.

10. Progress Report and Next Steps for the District Commitment to Provide Neighborhood by Neighborhood Air Quality Information to the Public – Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives, provided the presentation on this item. He explained the District operates an extensive air monitoring network consisting of 34 stations that are strategically located throughout the Valley. He noted the monitoring stations generally record worst-case concentrations, therefore actual air concentrations to which many Valley residents are exposed to are lower than those measured. He noted the District has the first communication network in the nation that allows schools, parents and others to make informed decisions about outdoor activities, the Real-Time Air Advisory Network (RAAN). Mr. Gill explained the District's approach to release the timely and accurate online resource to residents. He added District staff expects real time air quality data to be available at the neighborhood level in 2015.

Mr. Smith asked the purpose of providing air quality information at the neighborhood level. Mr. Sheikh explained the Board directed staff to provide accurate information to the public about air quality that they are experiencing.

Ms. Sharpe commented she and organizations she participates in are appreciative of the air quality information. She offered to assist with creation of focus groups consisting of parents of children. Ms. Sharpe expressed concern about the quantity of air monitors. She recommended utilizing mobile monitors during modeling to capture any differences in data. Mr. Sheikh explained staff is using mobile monitoring as one of the tools to develop the new system. Ms. Sharpe noted although RAAN records the worst-case pollutant concentrations, she stated it follows the precautionary principle. Ms. Sharpe also said she would not want the health impacts under-emphasized during an Air Alert.

Mr. Cunha commented the information obtained is scientific data and it should not be escalated or embellished. He added caution should be

exercised regarding how the information is used as it could possibly be used against the District and industries if not careful. Mr. Sheikh commented that the District recognizes that the new system will need to depend on a sound scientific foundation, particularly in developing the real-time component of the new system. Mr. Sheikh encouraged comments from CAC members and added more updates will follow.

Public Comment: None

11. Consider Support Position on District Application for Competitive Federal DERA Grant Funding – Aaron Tarango, Supervising Air Quality Specialist, reported the District has a very successful program for which it is going to submit an application to obtain approximately \$675,000 in funding for the replacement of class 5 and 6 trucks. He explained the Diesel Emission Reduction Act (DERA) grant funding program began in 2008 and is a very competitive funding resource. He noted the District has received over \$12 million incentive dollars so far. Mr. Tarango explained class 5 and 6 trucks are also subject to on-road regulations but have a little more time to become compliant. He added this extra time will be more cost effective because it gives more years of surplus for these types of trucks. Mr. Sheikh added a consensus of support from CAC members would be helpful to include in the grant application to EPA.

Mr. Brown commented he supported the position on the District application for competitive federal DERA grant funding. He asked for an example of a class 5 or 6 truck. Mr. Tarango gave the example of a UPS or a Frito Lay delivery truck. He added the trucks that actually go into neighborhoods are the focus of this program.

Mr. Smith asked if the focus was going to be on industries instead of individual drivers. Mr. Sheikh explained applicants will vary from smaller fleets to larger fleets. Mr. Tarango added small businesses such as recycling will be eligible.

Mr. Cunha expressed support for the position on the District application for competitive federal DERA grant funding. He commended District staff for the several programs they administer. He suggested drafting a letter from CAC members showing consensus in support of the District's application for the federal DERA grant funding.

Mr. Williams suggested communicating with all EJAG members to ask for support of the District's application for the DERA grant funding. Mr. Sheikh thanked Mr. Williams for his suggestion and stated he thought EJAG's prior support of incentive funding for heavy duty trucks could be useful in the application process.

*Ms. Sharpe left at 11:55 a.m.*

12. Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) Business
  - a. Reappoint CAC Environmental Interest Group Alternate Representative to EJAG – Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards, stated the item would be tabled due to lack of quorum from the Industry/Ag Interest Group.
13. Outreach and Communications Report – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, reported staff is actively promoting the Clean Green Yard Machine program. She added staff is also assisting with the neighborhood by neighborhood air quality information project and amendments to the Wood Burning Rule. Ms. Holt reported summer outreach will begin in July for the ozone season including the Air Alert Program. She noted staff is coordinating with the Central California Asthma Coalition for the next evolution of the HAL Schools Program including encouraging schools to utilize District tools such as the no-idling signs and RAAN program. She added staff has been out at several events and she encouraged CAC members to attend these events.
14. CAC Member Comments; CAC Member Suggestions To Be Included In The Presentation Of The CAC Report During The Governing Board Meeting on June 19, 2014 – None.
15. Volunteer to Present Report During Governing Board Meeting – Mr. Smith volunteered to present the report during the Governing Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:06 p.m.

Next Meeting –The next meeting is scheduled on August 5, 2014. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.