

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

October 6, 2015
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Lee Smith, called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Chris McGlothlin/IAIG (A)	Central
	Amarpreet Dhaliwal/CIG(P)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/EIG (A)***	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)*	South
	Jenifer Pitcher/IAIG (A)	South
	Carolyn Temple/EIG (P)	South
	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
Kings	Kelly Deming/EIG (A)	Central
	Dennis Tristao/CIG (P)****	Central
Madera	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
	Donald Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
Merced	Jack Lemen/CIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)	North
	Katelyn Roedner/EIG (P)	North
	Wade Broughton/CIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	Chris Savage/IAIG (P)**	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
	Greg Gomez/CIG (A)	Central

*arrived at 10:05 a.m.
**arrived at 10:14 a.m.
***arrived at 10:16 a.m.
****arrived at 10:26 a.m.

(P)=Primary, (A)=Alternate, IAIG=Industry/Ag Interest Group,
EIG=Environmental Interest Group, CIG-City Interest Group

Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO; Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO; Dave Warner, Deputy APCO; Morgan Lambert, Deputy APCO; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives; Mehri Barati, Director of Incentives and Administrative Services; Todd DeYoung, Program Manager; Errol Villegas, Program Manager; Chelsea Gonzales, Senior Air Quality Specialist; Shawn Ferreria, Senior Air Quality Specialist; Alex Krivobok, Network Systems Analyst II; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards

Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Anthony Presto, Outreach and Communications Representative

Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Ann Marie Collins, Office Services Manager

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR SEPTEMBER 1, 2015 – This item was tabled due to lack of a quorum.
4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None
5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None
6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, announced that EPA recently published the newest Ozone Standard at 70 ppb which was the high end of the range under consideration. He reported at their last meeting, the Governing Board approved an Op Ed to be published in various newspapers across the Valley on the District's proposed legislation to streamline and bring common sense changes to the Clean Air Act.

Mr. Sadredin requested assistance from CAC members to notify interested parties about the District's incentive program for installing public EV charging stations across the Valley. To qualify for the incentives, the locations must be accessible to the public throughout the day. He asked members to refer interested parties to the District. Regarding the near-roadway monitoring requirements from EPA, which currently requires 4 monitors to be located in the Valley, the population threshold was raised from 500,000 to over 1 million residents, which would remove the requirement for the Modesto and Stockton areas. Lastly, Mr. Sadredin said he was sad to report that Dr. David Lighthall, the District's Health Science Advisor, passed away last week after a serious illness. Dr. Lighthall did a lot of work to elevate the District's platform in terms of scientific research and would be sorely missed.

Ms. Pitcher asked how the near-roadway monitors would affect the District, given its lack of jurisdiction over mobile sources. Mr. Sadredin responded the Board is on record stating that higher readings on those monitors should not result in stricter regulatory requirements for stationary sources. Mr. Williams said he was very impressed by Dr. Lighthall's intelligence and honesty and that he would be missed. He asked if it would be appropriate to bring the air quality empowerment zone proposal before the SJV Regional Planning Policy Council. Mr. Sadredin said the District tried for a number of years to get legislation introduced for the air quality empowerment zone and at this point the Board has prioritized the proposed changes to the Clean Air Act which are much more critical to the Valley's ability to meet these requirements without being unfairly penalized.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chelsea Gonzales, Senior Air Quality Specialist, gave an update on District plans and rules. Regarding the 2016 Plan for the 2008 8-hour Ozone Standard (75 ppb), the District has demonstrated RACT and technologies beyond RACT are in place for the Valley. Research and study efforts to identify further emission reduction opportunities are ongoing at this time. The District hosted Public Advisory Workgroup Meetings on August 25th and September 30th and staff look forward to hosting more as the plan continues to be developed. Public Workshops will also be hosted throughout the development of the plan, which is planned to be taken before the Board during the 2nd Quarter of 2016. Concurrently, the District is in the initial process of developing plans to address two PM2.5– the 2006 PM 2.5 Standard and the 2012 PM2.5 Standard. The District will be hosting public workshops throughout the plan development process and is currently anticipating Governing Board action for 3rd Quarter 2016 for the 2012 Standard and either late 2016 or 2017 for the 2006 Standard.

She reported staff is currently working on amendments to Rule 9510 (Indirect Source Review) to create uniform applicability throughout the Valley. Regarding Rule 2201 (New and Modified Stationary Source Review Rule), the current applicability threshold for PM2.5 emissions is consistent with a moderate nonattainment area status. However, as of April 2015, EPA finalized reclassification of the Valley as a serious nonattainment area which requires the District to modify its rule to lower the threshold to 70 tons per year. Governing Board action is anticipated in early 2016. Lastly, she said staff is working on potential amendments to Rule 4692 (Commercial Charbroiling). The District is exploring emission reduction opportunities through the potential expansion of rule applicability to include under-fired charbroilers. Under-fired charbroiler emission control technologies are still untested in real life applications and need further demonstration and evaluation at Valley restaurants. The Board recently approved \$750,000 in funding for the restaurant technology funding partnership to assess

the feasibility of potential control technologies and potential requirements during these upcoming amendments. Board action is tentatively scheduled in 2016.

Mr. Green voiced disagreement for proposed amendments to Rule 9510. Mr. Sadredin responded that Valley industries have made sacrifices and investments to reduce air pollution in areas such as agriculture, oil production, and manufacturing. Stationary sources have reduced emissions by over 80% and businesses have asked for a fair distribution of responsibility between stationary and mobile sources. He said the basic principle of having indirect sources reduce their pollution has been well-litigated and it is the policy of the Board to reduce mobile source emissions where possible. This proposed change is minor to ensure the rule is applied uniformly. Mr. Smith asked if the draft rule amendments were available. Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, responded the document was still in the early stages and had not yet been published. Mr. Sadredin added that public workshops will be held and the proposed amendments would be presented to CAC members prior to Board action, which is the normal process.

Mr. Dhaliwal asked for more information on Rule 9510. Mr. Sadredin responded the District is the only air district in the state with an Indirect Source Review rule. Given the Valley's attainment mandates and the fact that 80% of pollution comes from mobile sources, it was heavily lobbied for by the business and environmental communities. Developers are encouraged to either build features into the design of their project to minimize mobile source emissions or to pay a mitigation fee which the District uses to incentivize the transition to lower emission units such as newer trucks or agricultural irrigation pumps. He said this rule was challenged all the way to the U.S. Supreme Court and the District prevailed. He said the proposed amendments are the result of a lawsuit in the City of Visalia regarding a proposed distribution centered that was deemed a non-discretionary project and therefore did not trigger the Indirect Source Review rule. As the rule is written now, all discretionary projects trigger the Indirect Source Review rule and non-discretionary projects do not and these rule amendments are designed to make applicability the same in all 8 counties and 59 cities in the Valley. Mr. Hamilton asked if Mr. Sadredin knew of any Valley projects that did not go forward because of the Indirect Source Review rule. Mr. Sadredin responded he was not aware of any, noting many projects opt to make changes in the design of the project versus paying a mitigation fee.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Colby Morrow, So Cal Gas

This item was revisited at the Chair's prerogative

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR SEPTEMBER 1, 2015 – The Chair announced that a quorum to take a vote had been reached due to late arriving members. He asked

for member comments regarding the Minutes for September 1, 2015. Hearing none, he deemed the Minutes approved.

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (ARB)
 - a. *ARB Board Meeting Summary* – Patricia Velasco, ARB Representative, gave a summary of the ARB meetings held on September 24 and 25, 2015. She reported the Board: approved a proposed regulation governing the introduction of alternative diesel fuels into the California commercial market, including special provisions for biodiesel; approved the proposed re-adoption of the Low Carbon Fuel Standard; approved grant awards for local agency projects to reduce freight-related emissions in California's four priority trade corridors; approved the draft Funding Guidelines for agencies administering investments from the Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund; appointed four new members from Inland Empire, Sacramento, and Alameda County to fill Environmental Justice Advisory Committee (EJAC) vacancies; and adopted amendments to the OBD II regulations that update requirements to account for Low Emission Vehicle III applications and monitoring requirements for gasoline and diesel vehicles, and clarify and improve the regulation.

9. GOVERNMENT FINANCE OFFICERS' ASSOCIATION CERTIFICATE OF ACHEIVEMENT FOR EXCELLENCE IN FINANCIAL REPORTING – Mehri Barati, Director of Incentives and Administrative Services, reported that for the second year in a row the District was awarded the highest honors from the Government Finance Officers' Association for the their Comprehensive Annual Financial Report (CAFR). She said the District's financial documents are prepared and audited annually and this is a huge honor that requires the transparency and detail that was directed by the Governing Board and is part of the District's Core Values. Mayor Dhaliwal congratulated Mr. Sadredin and the Finance team. Mr. Tristao asked, in light of the scrutiny placed on the District's finances by various interests groups, if it would be appropriate to show a vote of confidence by CAC members in the District's accounting staff for this accomplishment. Mr. Sadredin voiced appreciation for the motion and consensus from CAC members expressing CAC's confidence in the District's accounting staff. The Chair asked if there were any objections to the consensus and none were noted.

Public Comments: None

10. DISTRICT RECEIVES \$4,967,215.50 FROM EPA UNDER THE FEDERAL COMPETITIVE TARGETED AIR SHED GRANT – Todd DeYoung, Program Manager, reported the Targeted Air Shed Grant program is a nationwide

solicitation for \$10 million for projects that reduce emissions for nonattainment areas that the EPA has determined are the most heavily polluted areas relative to the ozone and PM standards. On May 28, 2015, the District submitted four proposals in response to the solicitation for tractor replacements, on-road truck replacements, repair of high polluting vehicles under the Tune In Tune Up program, and fireplace change outs utilizing the District's Burn Cleaner program. On September 16, 2015, the District was notified that two of its projects were selected for funding for a total of over \$4.9 million which represents just less than 50 percent of the total available funding nationwide. The two projects selected were for agricultural tractor replacements and fireplace change outs. The tractor replacement funding will be used to replace approximately 187 additional ag tractors and will reduce 699 tons of NOx, 138 tons of PM, 106 tons of VOCs, and 510 tons of CO over their lifetime. The monies received under the fireplace change out proposal will fund the change out of approximately 2,500 additional dirty wood burning devices to new clean burning units and will reduce almost 2,000 tons of particulate matter over the life of those projects. Staff will take an item to the Governing Board at their November 19, 2015 meeting to accept this funding and make the necessary amendments to the District's budget.

Mr. Hamilton congratulated District staff for their successful efforts to obtain such a large amount of funding for the Valley. Mr. Tristao echoed Mr. Hamilton's remarks and said the agricultural industry greatly appreciates the additional funding for tractor replacements. Mayor Dhaliwal echoed Mr. Tristao's remarks. Mr. Hamilton asked if there were funding available for stationary engines. Mr. DeYoung responded currently no, as the only stationary ag engines eligible for the funding are pump engines.

11. UPDATE ON PUBLIC ADVISORY WORKGROUP FOR 8-HOUR OZONE PLAN – Errol Villegas, Program Manager, reported the Public Advisory Workgroup has met twice since the Governing Board approved its formation in May. Designed to enhance the District's already robust public outreach process, the workgroup consists of 9 members from the CAC, 3 members from EJAG, and a host of District representatives and members from EPA and ARB who serve as technical advisors. The workgroup was created to hear the perspective and receive input from all affected stakeholders and subject matter experts during the development of the upcoming 8-Hour Ozone Plan. The workgroup will provide committee members with tools to reach out to the constituents that they represent so the District can receive comments from affected stakeholders, and provide a forum and discussion of suggestions before each plan milestone is completed. So far, the meetings have been well-attended and there have been good discussions facilitated by the members of the workgroup. The District is in process of scheduling future meetings for the workgroup, including a tentative meeting in late-October or early-November.

Mr. Sadredin said one of the items that will be discussed with the workgroup and could be added to a future CAC Agenda is the issue of assigning responsibilities to EPA. He reported there are mixed feelings toward this proposal, especially from environmental groups. He said the Board has directed staff to pursue a legally binding assignment to EPA to reduce pollution from mobile sources. Mr. Smith asked for this item to be added to a future CAC Agenda.

Public Comment: None

12. WILDFIRE AIR QUALITY IMPACTS AND POTENTIAL ACTIONS BY THE DISTRICT – Mr. Sadredin said this item will be presented to the Board at their next meeting and is a timely topic, given the ongoing drought conditions and wildfires in the area. He asked CAC members for their feedback on possible additional measures by land managers, fire agencies and the District to minimize wildfire impacts in the future. He introduced Shawn Ferreria, Senior Air Quality Specialist, who discussed air quality impacts from recent wildfires, District efforts to minimize public exposure and potential measures to minimize wildfire impacts.

Mr. Sadredin said the District is the only air district that has set up the Real-Time Air Advisory Network (RAAN) to advise Valley residents of real time air quality concentrations in their area. The District also works with ARB, the Department of Emergency Services, and the U.S. Forest Service to install specialized, temporary monitors in affected areas. He thanked the agricultural community for working with the District and for being sensitive to the wildfire issues by refraining from open burning, which is critical to minimize the air quality impacts.

The District also worked closely with Valley school districts to curtail outdoor activities when there were high pollution readings nearby and when smoke is visible or detectable by odor. Ultimately, he said curtailing activities is a call that individual school districts must make and the District's advice was followed to various degrees in the Valley. In addition, the District issues Health Cautionary Statements when pollution reaches critical levels through Valley media along with general Press Releases to advise residents of current air quality conditions and actions they can take. District staff also meets daily with land and forest managers, the fire agencies to make sure air quality is taken into consideration with the decisions they make regarding the wildfires. Mr. Sadredin asked members to advise the District on key areas including reducing the fuel build up, that sometimes due to various means builds up over time. Options include prescribed burning, which the District allows and encourages during certain times of the year. The District is reviewing their prescribed burning program to ensure it does not become an obstacle to the process, and accounts for resource issues at the various agencies. Once a wildfire is established, none of the District's, state or federal regulations will apply and some agencies may take advantage of that leeway to allow the fire to burn uncontrollably.

Mr. Clark said minimizing the fuel build up is a real concern, especially prescribed burns. He said it would be a difficult battle and suggested researching available options. Mr. Sadredin responded affirmatively, and said the Board wanted to have this discussion now while there is public attention on this issue. Mr. Savage echoed Mr. Clark's comments and said it would be an enormous challenge to address these issues. He suggested applying staff resources to go after policy and legislative changes where possible, noting it would be hard to change practices that have been in place for several hundred years. Mr. Gomez asked about District activities to engage Public Health Officers in each county. He said he noticed there were days when school outdoor activities were curtailed, yet there were many athletic teams out practicing in the same area. Mr. Sadredin said this is an area that the District needs to take a closer look at - ways to engage local school districts and athletic programs. He said some school districts are hesitant to make the call, fearing backlash from parents and the public. Mr. Tristao suggested the California Cattlemen's Association, the Resource Conservation and Development Districts, NRCS and USDA, and Association of Foresters and Land Managers would be good resources. Mr. Hamilton suggested focusing on stronger relationships with local health departments.

13. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG) BUSINESS

- a. Verbal Report on EJAG Activities for August – Mr. Sadredin reported at the last Board meeting, Board members asked EJAG to help find ways to increase low-income participation in the District's Burn Cleaner program. Currently the participation rate is approximately 20% from low income communities and EJAG members were directed to review and report back to the Board with suggestions to increase participation. Regarding the EJAG meeting held in August, Mr. Hamilton reported members received a report on the Tune In Tune Up program and the funding now available for the Plus Up vehicle replacement component. He said EJAG members were looking at the availability of funding for vehicles in possession of those who are not currently the registered owners. He said it is his understanding that funding is now available for those who have completed the title paperwork for their vehicles. He said there was also a discussion on drayage trucks and the trip reduction strategy.

14. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, said her team is continuing to ensure that the wood burning registration program is in place prior to the November 1, 2015 kickoff. She said there are two registration options for residents with EPA Phase 2 certified devices including a temporary one year registration or a full registration that will be valid for four seasons. Staff is working hard to ensure the information is disseminated across the Valley by various means, including a large mailout

which generated good response. Residents are also being advised that the Burn Cleaner Incentive Program continues to be up and running for those with an open hearth fireplace or older device that is not EPA Phase 2 certified. She reported the District will be accepting Kids Calendar entries for one more week. Also, she said there have been several electric vehicle events across the Valley, including a recent one in Fresno and an upcoming event in Bakersfield which are great opportunities for the public to get information about and test drive these vehicles. Staff is also reaching out to businesses and municipalities about the charging infrastructure grant that is available and compliment other incentives that are available. Lastly she reported the District is co-hosting an open house and press conference with the Milk Producers Council in Hanford to showcase one of the District's Technology Advancement projects, the electrification of a dairy feeding operation.

15. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS; CAC MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE CAC REPORT DURING THE GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON NOVEMBER 19, 2015 – Mr. Tristao commented that the ARB Scoping AB32 Plan is underway and said he assumed the District is playing a very active role in that process. Mr. Sadredin responded affirmatively. He asked about funding guidelines for Cap and Trade funds. Mr. Sadredin said the District is very engaged in that process and gave a full report on last year's spending plan. He said a lot of the Cap and Trade funds are paid by businesses in the Valley. Mr. Tristao said he supported the concept of assigning responsibility to EPA and asked for that to be mentioned in the report to the Governing Board.
16. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Smith volunteered to present the report at the next meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 11:58 a.m.

Next Meeting – NO MEETING IN NOVEMBER. The next meeting is scheduled on December 1, 2015. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.