

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

June 7, 2016
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:14 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting. Deputy Clerk of the Boards, Michelle Franco, announced that the Environmental Interest Group did not have enough members present to take action.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
	Sarah Sharpe/EIG (P)	Central
Kern	Jenifer Pitcher/IAIG (A)*	South
	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
Kings	Dustin Ference/IAIG (P)	Central
	Dennis Tristao/CIG (P)	Central
Madera	Donald Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Tim Durham/IAIG (P)	North
	Jack Lemen/CIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	Chris Savage/IAIG (P)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central

*(P)=Primary, (A)=Alternate, IAIG=Industry/Ag Interest Group,
EIG=Environmental Interest Group, CIG-City Interest Group*

**arrived at 10:18 a.m.*

Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO; Dave Warner, Deputy APCO; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives; Chay Thao, Program

Manager, Todd DeYoung, Program Manager; Cathy Blevins, Network Systems Analyst II; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards

Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Ann Marie Collins, Office Services Manager

Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Christal Martinez, Office Services Manager

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR MARCH 1, 2016 and MAY 3, 2016 – The Chair asked for comments and corrections regarding the March 1 and May 3, 2016 Minutes. Hearing none, the Chair deemed the Minutes approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO provided detailed updates to CAC members on the following:

- The Valley had zero violations of the 1997 8-hour ozone standard (84ppb) during the month of May, for the first time in history and is on track to attain that standard before 2024.
- Development of the new ARB oil and gas regulation to control methane, which could potentially increase flaring and resulting NOx emissions in the Valley. He said the District compelled ARB to avoid requiring excessive flaring and to work with the District to mitigate excess NOx impacts from the rule. He said ARB has been responsive so far and the District plans to testify at the ARB Board meeting in July to make sure the District's concerns are addressed appropriately
- At their meeting on June 16, 2016, the Board will consider adoption of the 2016 Plan for the 2008 Ozone Standard, one of 4 different ozone standards for which the District must write plans. The deadline for attainment of this standard is 2032. While it appears the Valley will be able to meet the standard with current measures, he said the requirement from EPA to add contingency measures in the plan will require the plan to have a black box and highlights the urgent need for modernization of the Clean Air Act. He said the requirement for the black box can actually impede progress towards attainment.
- Also at their meeting on June 16th, the Board will consider approving a petition to EPA to take responsibility for reducing emissions from sources under their jurisdiction. This petition specifically asks that EPA establish national point-of-sale standards for new trucks and locomotives. The petition further asks EPA to establish national standards for in-use and remanufactured locomotives.

- At the direction of the Board, the District has begun a major educational process with cities and counties throughout the Valley, as well as members of the business community, relating to the upcoming PM2.5 Plan which is due in August of 2017. In order to meet this standard, the Valley would have to come close to zero emissions and is planning to assign regulatory and financial responsibilities to ARB and EPA to achieve **necessary** reductions in emissions. Mr. Sadredin said the District is planning to propose a federal clean air superfund to bring resources to areas that are challenged like the Valley.

Mr. Savage thanked Mr. Sadredin and staff for the District's efforts to present effective attainment plans. He voiced agreement with taking a more aggressive stance. He also said he believed CAC members could provide more opportunities for staff to engage with the business community who would be receptive because they are being asked to do things that are simply unattainable. He asked for a brief update on the equivalency discussion. Mr. Sadredin provided a brief update and said the District has held workshops on that topic.

Regarding locomotives, Mr. Hoffdahl asked if interstate transport would be an issue. Mr. Sadredin responded this is exactly why the District is taking the position that EPA should be required to develop new standards to address locomotive emissions, which account for over 10% of local NOx emissions. Mr. Hoffdahl asked if there was a push for EPA to remove the nonattainment fee. Mr. Sadredin responded that EPA has proposed a determination of attainment which will likely be finalized within the next two or three months, but it may be longer until all legal actions are exhausted.

Regarding the ARB oil and gas rule, Ms. Pitcher voiced appreciation for Mr. Sadredin and staff taking WSPA's suggestions into consideration and said they also support local implementation.

Mr. Sadredin asked industry representatives to put a platform together to provide opportunities for the District to educate their constituents on the potential consequences of the upcoming federal mandates. Mr. Cunha responded affirmatively and thanked the District and staff for their efforts on the Clean Air Act modernization.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, gave an update on District planning and rule development efforts, including:

- The District published and made available the Proposed 2016 Plan for the 2008 8-Hour Ozone Standard for public review and comment on the District's website on May 17, 2016.
- The District is working with ARB to perform modeling runs to determine the amount of emission reductions necessary for attainment of the 2006 PM2.5

Standard. The District is also in the process of identifying and reviewing potential opportunities to reduce emissions and public workshops will be scheduled at a later date.

- The District is in the process of addressing the 2012 PM2.5 Standard and will schedule public workshops sometime in 2016.
- The District hosted a public workshop for Rule 9510 (Indirect Source Review) on April 26, 2016.
- A public workshop will be scheduled at a later date for Rule 4692 (Charbroiling).

Public Comment: None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (ARB) –

- a. *ARB Board Meeting Summary* – Patricia Velasco, ARB Representative, gave a report on highlights of the ARB Board meeting held on May 19, 2016 including: the Board approved the Great Basin Unified Air Pollution Control District 2016 Owens Valley Planning Area PM10 Plan as a revision to the California State Implementation Plan. They also presented the 2015 Haagen-Smit Clean Air Awards to four scientists for their significant contributions toward improving air quality, public health, and our understanding of climate change issues. In addition, the Board approved the 2016-17 Research Plan, which identifies ARB's highest priority research needs. She also reported the Board heard a report on the Proposed Short-Lived Climate Pollutant (SLCP) Reduction Strategy. Lastly, they heard a presentation on the draft California Sustainable Freight Action Plan, which was released on May 3rd.

Public Comments: None

Mr. Cunha asked for a report from ARB on the District's request to assign responsibility to EPA. Ms. Sharpe commented that ARB's Environmental Justice Advisory Committee (EJAC) will be holding workshops in the Valley at the end of July to get feedback on elements of the new scoping plan.

9. CONSIDER SUPPORT POSITION FOR DISTRICT'S APPLICATION FOR EPA TARGETED AIR SHED GRANT PROGRAM – Todd DeYoung, Program Manager, asked for CAC members support for the District's application to the EPA Targeted Air Shed Grant Program. He said this program was developed to be targeted only at the most polluted areas in the country, including the Valley, and has brought significant funding to the region in the past. He said it is targeted at the most polluted regions for ozone, and annual and 24-hour PM2.5. The District, in addition to South Coast AQMD and several other counties throughout the country are eligible for this program. The District has been very successful in this effort in the past, with support from CAC members, having received approximately \$5 million from this grant program which represented half of the funding available nationwide. The monies received from this

program were used for the District's very important Ag Tractor Replacement and Burn Cleaner programs. This year, there is \$20 million in available funds nationwide. He said EPA usually picks 6 – 10 proposals for funding and each entity is allowed to submit 4 proposals, which the District will do. This year's focus will be on the Ag Tractor Replacement, Burn Cleaner, Heavy Duty Truck Replacement, and the District's very successful Tune in Tune Up programs.

Mr. Cunha commented that the District's many successful programs are a testament to District staff, the communities, Valley businesses, stakeholders working together to improve the Valley's air quality. As the group was short one Environmental Interest Group member to take a formal vote of support, the Chair declared there was a consensus of members present to support the District's application for EPA Targeted Air Shed Grant Program. In addition, the City and Industry/Ag Interest groups voted to support the District's application.

Public Comments: None

10. LOCAL IMPLEMENTATION OF STATE AIR RESOURCES BOARD'S PROPOSED OIL AND GAS GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION REGULATION – Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, explained ARB is developing their proposed new Greenhouse Gas Emission Standards for Crude Oil and Natural Gas Facilities, to reduce methane emissions from oil and gas production operations in California. He explained 70-80% of the state's oil and gas production occurs within the Valley, and the ARB regulation can therefore be expected to have a proportionally greater impact on the District and oil and gas production operations in the Valley. Therefore, he said the District has been taking an active role in the rule development efforts by commenting on rule language and anticipated impacts and through direct discussions with ARB. In May 2016, the District's Governing Board directed staff to begin working with affected facilities and other stakeholders to develop a regulatory program to efficiently implement the proposed regulation, once adopted by ARB, including a mechanism for the District to recover the associated costs.

Ms. Pitcher commented that WSPA received the newest rule language last week from ARB and there were certain components included that they had not previously included in the rule and were not anticipated. She said the San Joaquin Valley has a very mature Leak Detection and Repair (LDAR) program and WSPA supports any way the new rule can be streamlined into the existing programs. Also, she said District staff is familiar with industry and used to implementing this type of program. Mr. Lemen asked about the number of active wells in the Valley. Ms. Pitcher responded there were approximately 56,000 in Kern County alone. Ms. Sharpe asked about the projected increase in NOx emissions. Mr. Warner responded the District's calculations include natural gas added to the low BTU waste gas that is coming from the tanks, which is necessary to get it to burn, and increased NOx emissions may be as high as 21 tons/yr.

Public Comment – None

11. USE OF INCENTIVE-BASED CONTROL MEASURES IN UPCOMING OZONE AND PARTICULATE MATTER ATTAINMENT – Sheraz Gill, Strategies and Incentives Director, said that in addition to the many attainment plans that the District has already developed and implemented, the District is mandated under the Clean Air Act to develop and adopt a number of new ozone and particulate matter plans in the coming years. He explained the degree of difficulty in meeting the new federal ambient air quality standards are unmatched by any other region in the nation. Attainment of the latest standards will require transformative changes and development of innovative control strategies to significantly reduce emissions from mobile sources, which now make up over 85% of the Valley's NOx emissions. He reviewed recent action taken by the Board regarding the potential inclusion of incentive-based measures in upcoming attainment plans, potential legal issues that have to be overcome, and approaches for seeking state and federal approval for such measures.

Mr. Savage left at 11:30 a.m.

Mr. Smith left at 11:50 a.m.

Mr. Ference left at 11:54 a.m.

Ms. Pitcher and Ms. Sharpe left at 11:55 a.m

Mr. Williams commented this was a great presentation and it was a shame that more CAC members were not present to hear it. He asked the District to bring back a more abbreviated version of this presentation at a future meeting.

Public Comment: None

12. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG) BUSINESS
- a. Appoint CAC City Interest Group Representative on EJAG – This item was tabled for lack of a quorum

Public Comments: None

13. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Ms. Holt reported the District is working with land management agencies on getting prescribed burns completed before fire season is totally shutdown. She said the District will be doing outreach to get the public to understand that a tiny bit of inconvenience will be much better than another big wildfire. She said a prescribed burn would be taking place in the Sequoias this weekend, in addition to other small burns in Fresno County and the Modesto area. Mr. Cunha commented on the importance of completing these burns in a timely manner.

Public Comments: None

14. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS; CAC MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE CAC REPORT DURING THE GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON JUNE 16, 2016 – None
15. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report to the Board on June 16, 2016. He also thanked members and staff for their patience with the meeting's late start time.

Meeting adjourned at 12:07 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on August 2, 2016. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.