

Action Summary Minutes  
**San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District**

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**August 2, 2016**  
**10:00 a.m.**

*The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.*

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting. Deputy Clerk of the Boards, Michelle Franco, announced that the City Interest Group did not have enough members present to take action.

<b>County</b>	<b>Member Name/Interest Group</b>	<b>Location</b>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
	Sarah Sharpe/EIG (P)	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)*	South
	Jenifer Pitcher/IAIG (A)*	South
	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
Kings	Dustin Ference/IAIG (P)	Central
	Kelly Deming/EIG (P)	Central
Madera	Donald Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Jack Lemen/CIG (P)	Central
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central

*(P)=Primary, (A)=Alternate, IAIG=Industry/Ag Interest Group,  
EIG=Environmental Interest Group, CIG-City Interest Group*

*\*arrived at 10:09 a.m.*

*\*\*arrived at 10:11 a.m.*

Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO; Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO; Dave Warner, Deputy APCO; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives; Chay

Thao, Program Manager, Todd DeYoung, Program Manager; Cathy Blevins, Network Systems Analyst II; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards

Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Ann Marie Collins, Office Services Manager

Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Christal Martinez, Office Services Manager

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR JUNE 7, 2016 – Chairman Cunha asked for comments or corrections regarding the June 7, 2016 Minutes. Hearing none, he deemed the Minutes approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – Chairman Cunha commented on the low number of CAC members in attendance at the meeting. He suggested next year the CAC meetings should go dark in July, August and November due to historically low attendance for those meetings. Mr. Sadredin responded affirmatively.

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, provided detailed updates to CAC members on the following topics:

- Wildfires and the associated impacts on the Valley air quality and public health
- Cap and Trade revenue shortfall and ongoing state legislature negotiations
- ARB's Short Lived Climate Pollutant strategy aimed at reducing methane and black carbon reductions
- EPA's recent inaction with respect to the District's PM2.5 attainment plan for the 1997 PM2.5 Standard and resulting effects to the San Joaquin Valley

Mr. Cunha mentioned the alarming number of forest fires that are being battled in the area, as well as challenges faced by the logging industry. He suggested mentioning the collaboration with NRCS at the August Board meeting, as well reinstating logging sawmills to deal with the huge amount of dead trees.

Ms. Pitcher commented it appeared to her at the ARB Board meeting on the oil and gas methane rule that the ARB Board does not have a clear understanding of natural gas storage versus oil production. Mr. Sadredin responded affirmatively and suggested it would be helpful for industry to provide ARB some education moving forward. In regards to wells, Mr. Clark commented that ARB does not have an accurate inventory of wells. He suggested streamlining the process. He said currently 3,500 jobs have been

lost in the Kern County oil industry and any additional costs to run the oil business could cost more businesses and jobs.

Mr. Smith asked about the consequences of having a Federal Implementation Plan (FIP). Mr. Sadredin responded staff does not take the FIP consequence lightly as there are costly sanctions that come with it. He said ultimately, the District is on a path where a FIP could be unavoidable. He said the sanctions would come into play before the FIP, including a de facto ban on new businesses locating in the Valley (due to doubling of the offset requirements) as well as loss of federal highway funds. He said the District needs to have an honest conversation with Valley residents, businesses, municipalities, and transportation agencies about the possibility of the Valley, under the regiment of the current Clean Air Act, not being able to craft an approvable plan to EPA's liking. He said South Coast AQMD may also be in the same situation as their new Ozone Plan relies on \$10-15 billion in incentive funds to get the necessary reductions. The District's plan will be similar and EPA has not been willing to approve a plan that relies heavily on incentive-based measures for which the source of funding is not yet identified. He said ultimately, if the Valley is given a FIP, the silver lining is that it may expose the unreasonable nature of some of these federal mandates.

Mr. Cunha voiced his disappointment in EPA's recent inaction in respect to the District's PM2.5 Plan for the 1997 PM2.5 Standard. He commented on the amazing job the District has done and the many air quality improvements achieved with public funds, including the hugely successful Tune In Tune Up program as well as the groundbreaking Check Before You Burn and Clean Green Yard Machine programs. He urged CAC and EJAG members to attend the August Governing Board meeting in support of the District's efforts. He voiced concern for the negative effect of EPA's inaction on Valley businesses and jobs.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, gave an update on District planning and rule development efforts, including:

- The District's Governing Board adopted the 2016 Plan for the 2008 8-hour Ozone Standard at their meeting on June 16, 2016
- The District is working with ARB to perform modeling runs to determine the amount of emission reductions necessary for attainment of the standard. The District is also in the process of identifying and reviewing potential opportunities to reduce emissions. Public workshops will be scheduled at a later date.
- The District is in the process of addressing the 2012 PM2.5 Standard
- The District hosted a public workshop on April 26, 2016 for Rule 9510 (Indirect Source Review). The public comment period ended on May 24, 2016 at 5:00 p.m. The Public Hearing is scheduled to be held on September 15, 2016.

- The District hosted a public workshop on the proposed amendments for Rule 2201 (New and Modified Stationary Source Review) and has received no adverse comments to date. The Public Hearing is scheduled to be held on September 15, 2016.
- A public workshop will be scheduled at a later date for Rule 4692 (Charbroiling).

Public Comment: None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (ARB) –

- a. *ARB Board Meeting Summary* – Patricia Velasco, ARB Representative, gave a report on highlights of the ARB Board meeting held on July 21, 2016, including: The Board found that the District's 2016 State Implementation Plan (SIP) for the 2008 federal 0.075 parts per million 8-hour Ozone standard met all requirements of the federal Clean Air Act. The Board also heard a report from staff on proposed greenhouse gas emission standards for crude oil and natural gas production facilities, natural gas processing plants, natural gas, gathering, boosting and transmission compressor stations, and underground natural gas storage facilities. Lastly, she reported the Board heard an overview from staff of a study being developed pursuant to Senate Bill 350 to assist in understanding and addressing barriers low-income consumers face to access zero-emission and near-zero emission transportations options throughout the State.

Public Comments: None

9. PROVIDE INPUT AND CONSIDER SUPPORT FOR LEGISLATIVE INITIATIVE TO ESTABLISH NEW NATIONAL CLEAN AIR INVESTMENT AND CLEANUP FUND –

Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, presented this item to solicit CAC input for a legislative initiative to establish a new National Clean Air Investment and Cleanup Fund that provides the scale of funding necessary to reduce emissions from mobile sources under state and federal jurisdiction and attain federal air quality standards. The District, ARB, and EPA agree that the bulk of needed reductions will have to come from mobile sources, primarily through the deployment of incentive-based measures. To implement these incentive-based strategies, billions of dollars of new state and federal funding will be required to reduce emissions from mobile sources in the San Joaquin Valley over the next decade. The South Coast Air Quality Management District faces similar challenges in meeting federal air quality standards and has recently published a draft attainment plan that relies on incentive-based measures and calls for at least \$1 billion per year in state and federal incentive funding over the next 10-15 years to achieve the necessary emissions reductions from mobile sources.

Ms. Sharpe commented that she always supports bringing more resources to the Valley to help clean the air. She said she is unsure if she is comfortable with trying to get credit for it in the District's plan but she understands the logic behind it and need for it.

She said this is another example of the crisis that the Valley is facing in terms of meeting the numerous air quality standards and said all groups need to work together to bring as much money to the Valley as possible. Mr. Jordan responded affirmatively, and said the communication strategy is part of building support for the effort. He also noted that different groups may value and highlight different areas. He said there are not a lot of other options available for the District to get the necessary reductions.

Ms. Sharpe asked about the 2025 projections and whether they reflect what ARB is proposing with the sustainable freight strategy and the goal to have 100% zero-emission vehicles. Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO, responded that the District has been advocating for ARB to do a better job in quantifying and focusing their analysis and efforts in their mobile source strategy on near-term reductions. He said the entire mobile strategy and everything that South Coast has been doing is in the 2031 timeframe for ozone. For PM2.5, the timeframe for reductions is 2024-25. He said this highlights just how difficult it is to achieve those reductions by that timeframe and emphasizes the need to have incentives that take advantage of new technology that is starting to become available. None of the proposed regulations are able to achieve these reductions in such a short timeframe. Mr. Williams voiced appreciation for Mr. Sheikh's comments and said he fully supports bringing more federal funds into California. He suggested looking at building coalitions with like-minded groups across the country to gain support. Mr. Jordan responded that staff has looked for ways to work with other groups and broaden support without watering down the program funding. Mr. Sheikh asked CAC members to share their questions and/or concerns with staff regarding this strategy.

Mr. Ference asked about the status of the Board's Clean Air Act modernization proposal. Mr. Jordan responded that the House passed a bill that has part of the District's proposal in it along with other provisions that go a little further than the District proposed and a bill was introduced in the Senate but the clock is ticking toward the end of the legislative session. He said the initiative has been a big success and has provided the Board and staff with tremendous opportunities to educate a lot of people about the Valley's air quality challenges along the way. Ms. Deming asked if there was a presentation available to help gain support from other community groups. Mr. Jordan responded there would be more information available as the plans are being developed. He said staff would be happy to speak to other groups regarding this initiative. Mr. Sheikh responded there would be more information to share after staff gets direction from the Board at their next meeting. Mr. Cunha thanked staff for a very informative presentation and urged members to attend the next Board meeting to show support for this initiative. He confirmed there was not a quorum present to take action on this item but said there was a consensus of members to support this initiative.

Public Comments: None

10. DISCUSS POTENTIAL CHANGES TO DISTRICT'S TRUCK VOUCHER PROGRAM –

Aaron Tarango, Grants Program Supervisor, presented this item. Mr. Tarango informed the CAC that the District had recently been selected for Diesel Emission Reduction Act (DERA) program funding by EPA through a national competitive grant application process in the amount of \$900,000 for the District's Truck Voucher Program. This program has been successful in providing over \$41 million in funding to replace 993 Valley-based heavy duty trucks. In addition to accepting these funds at the August Governing Board meeting, the District will also be presenting potential enhancements to the Truck Voucher Program for Governing Board consideration. Mr. Tarango provided a summary of these potential enhancements in the face of looming deadlines under the statewide truck and bus regulation, including expanding the program eligibility to include all Valley-based truck fleets while continuing to focus outreach efforts on small fleets, and expanding vehicle eligibility.

Mr. Clark confirmed this regulation applied to school buses. Mr. Tarango responded affirmatively. Mr. Williams suggested members review the EJAG grant funding recommendations that were also part of the agenda packet. He voiced concern that the recommended programs were not consistent with EJAG's recommendations. Mr. Sheikh responded by noting this program would add even more flexibility to fund projects that would benefit EJ communities in the Valley and still be open to smaller fleets - although he pointed out that interest has waned significantly in those areas. Mr. Williams voiced support for this program. Mr. Cunha commented that staff is doing a great job but cautioned that banks rarely issue loans to single truck owners. He voiced concern for the effects on smaller businesses and Valley communities. He thanked staff for their hard work on this and other incentive programs.

Public Comment – None

#### 11. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG) BUSINESS

- a. Report on EJAG Activities for April and June – Derek Williams, Vice Chair, reviewed the highlights from the EJAG meetings held on April 28<sup>th</sup> and June 23, 2016. He also welcomed the newest EJAG member, Dr. Gennean Bolen.
- b. Appoint CAC City Interest Group Representative on EJAG – This item was tabled for lack of a quorum

Public Comments: None

12. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, reported this has been a very busy wildfire season and her team has done a tremendous amount of outreach to the public regarding the air quality impacts in the Valley from numerous wildfires in the state. She said although things are a little better this week, this is just the beginning of a season expected to last until October. She also reported her team just held an online naming contest for characters in the District's new

outreach materials for kids. Lastly, she noted the District's latest outreach campaign entitled "We Pledge" has begun and there are opportunities for residents to win many prizes on the District's Healthy Air Living website. Mr. Cunha asked if the materials will be available in Spanish. Ms. Holt responded affirmatively.

Public Comments: None

13. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS; CAC MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE CAC REPORT DURING THE GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON AUGUST 18, 2016 – Mr. Clark voiced appreciation for the important topics discussed at this meeting. He also said he appreciated staff efforts to impart common sense ideals working with EPA. Mr. Ference complimented staff on their informative and well put together presentations. Mr. Cunha asked staff to schedule a meeting with the National Resources Conservation Service (NRCS) in the next week or two, in an effort to enlist their help disposing of the multitude of dead trees in the area in an attempt to alleviate wildfire concerns in the area.
14. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report to the Board on August 18, 2016.

Meeting adjourned at 12:18 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on September 6, 2016. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.