

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

December 6, 2016
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/EIG (A)	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)	South
	Jenifer Pitcher/IAIG (A*)	South
	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
	Carolyn Temple/EIG (P)	South
Kings	Kelly Deming/EIG (P)**	Central
Madera	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Tim Durham/IAIG (P)	North
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)*	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central

*(P)=Primary,
(A)=Alternate,
IAIG=Industry/Ag Interest
Group,
EIG=Environmental
Interest Group, CIG-City
Interest Group*

**arrived at 10:22 a.m.*

Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO; Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO; Morgan Lambert, Deputy APCO; Dave Warner, Deputy APCO; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Sheraz Gill, Director

of Strategies and Incentives; Chay Thao, Program Manager, Todd DeYoung, Program Manager; Brandon Swedblom, Network Systems Analyst II; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards

Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Ann Marie Collins, Office Services Manager

Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Christal Martinez, Office Services Manager

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR OCTOBER 4, 2016 – The Chair asked for comments and corrections regarding the October 4, 2016 Minutes. Hearing none, the Chair deemed the Minutes approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, wished everyone Happy Holidays and provided members a detailed update on the following:

- Efforts at the Bakersfield-Planz air monitoring station located at the Bakersfield Municipal Airport and operated by the State Air Resources Board to mitigate localized dust impacts from nearby sources and to analyze the causes of an abnormally high concentrations measured on May 5, 2013.
- The District's Presidential Transition White Paper (<http://www.valleyair.org/documents/PRESIDENTIAL-TRANSITION-WHITE-PAPER.pdf>)
- Ongoing District efforts to prepare an integrated PM2.5 strategy to address multiple federal PM2.5 standards

Mr. Clark asks who operates the Bakersfield/Planz monitor. Mr. Sadredin responded ARB is responsible for the monitor. Mr. Hamilton asked if there was unusual activity at the Bakersfield-Planz air monitoring station that would correspond with the abnormally high reading. Mr. Sheikh responded that the District confirmed there were unusual activities including helicopter landings along with wind-blown activity. He said this extra project will help answer some of those questions.

Mr. Cunha voiced disappointment that ARB held a public workshop on December 1st regarding the District's PM2.5 Plan with little or no notice to Valley stakeholders and

interested parties. He thanked the District for planning to hold a well-publicized workshop shortly after the ARB workshop.

Mr. Cunha asked about the February deadline to submit information to ARB. Mr. Sadredin clarified the February deadline was meant for ARB staff to return to their board with a report on what should be the next course of action. He said it is his hope that ARB staff will recommend returning the plan to the District so they can put it through the integrated, comprehensive public process and allow the District Governing Board to adopt the plan in August. He said he hoped to present information to ARB at that meeting that it was a joint effort amongst the environmental community, businesses and the District in support of the proposed plan to come into attainment as expeditiously as possible. He said he would not be happy if ARB falls short on delivering on mobile source reductions, which was a clear direction from their Board.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, gave an update on District planning and rule development efforts, including:

- On October 20, 2016, the Air Resources Board held a public meeting in Fresno and voted to table action on the District's Moderate Plan for the 2012 PM2.5 Standard. The Air Resources Board directed ARB staff to return with additional measures to reduce mobile source emissions in the pre-2025 timeline that is critical for the District and to work with the District to find additional measures to reduce directly emitted particulate matter from stationary sources. ARB staff will return to the ARB Board in February 2017 to provide an update.
- A summary of the multiple upcoming attainment plan requirements under the Clean Air Act.
- The District will hold a public workshop for this *2017 PM10 Maintenance Plan* in late 2016 / early 2017.
- The originally proposed September 2016 rule adoption date for Rule 9510 (Indirect Source Review) was postponed to address comments received. The District's proposed responses and revised rule language will be presented at a public workshop in early 2017, and will be made available to the public for additional review and comment before final adoption of the rule.
- The District hosted a public workshop on the proposed amendments to Rule 2201 (New and Modified Stationary Source Review) on July 26, 2016, and received no adverse comments. District staff had planned on presenting the rule to the Governing Board for adoption in September of 2016. However, in August of 2016, EPA released long-overdue regulations on implementing the PM2.5 standards in NSR rules that require an assessment of the significance of precursor pollutant emissions using a specific type of air quality modeling. EPA will not be able to approve an NSR rule that does not address EPA's

implementation regulation, so adoption has been delayed until such modeling can be completed.

- Regarding Rule 4692 (Charbroiling), despite the District's efforts in promoting available funding under the RCTP program, the District has faced difficulty in finding restaurants willing to demonstrate new technologies. To date, the District has initiated one demonstration project and recently entered into a contract with an additional restaurant. Due to the limited availability of demonstrated control technologies, the District will consider amending our SIP commitment to reflect the state of charbroiler control technologies.

Public Comment: None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (ARB) –

a. *ARB Board Meeting Summary* – Elizabeth Melgoza, ARB Representative, gave a summary of the ARB Board meeting held on October 20, 2016, including:

- The Board approved four research proposals developed in response to the Board-approved FY2016-17 Annual Research Plan. The approved proposals are: "Measurement of In-Use Emissions and Fuel Consumption from Vocational Heavy-Duty Vehicles with Conventional and Alternative Engine and Fuel Technologies in Southern California" (South Coast AQMD); "Emerging Technology Zero Emission Vehicle Household Travel and Refueling Behavior" (UC Davis); "Monitoring Carbon Dioxide and Methane in Los Angeles, California through Source Attribution and Long-Term Trend Analysis" (Caltech); and "Identifying and Characterizing Air Pollution Sources Along the United States-Mexico Border" (San Diego State)
- The Board adopted the Innovative Technology Regulation (ITR) to provide targeted, short-term, certification flexibility to facilitate the market launch of advanced trucks and buses.
- The Board heard an assessment of the Federal Phase 2 Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Standards for heavy-duty engines and vehicles that were published in October. The Phase 2 standards will set technology-forcing GHG emissions standards for medium- and heavy-duty engines and vehicles.
- The Board heard an update on efforts to establish more stringent NOx standards for heavy-duty on-highway engines, which are critical for meeting federal air quality standards in the South Coast and San Joaquin Valley over the next fifteen years.
- The Board considered the San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District Moderate Area State Implementation Plan (SIP) for the federal PM2.5 annual standard of 12 ug/m3.
- The Board approved modifications to the Fiscal Year 2016-17 Funding Plan for Low Carbon Transportation and Fuels and the Air Quality Improvement Program (Funding Plan).

Mr. Williams said at the last meeting he asked about the linkage to Ontario and whether that linkage involves any effect on sovereignty as far as allowing people from that side of the border to take action against businesses in California. He asked if there could be cross-complaints from other countries against American businesses that can be adjudicated outside our legal system. Ms. Melgoza responded that California retains oversight and authority over the program in California.

Mr. Cunha said he hoped that ARB would work with the District, environmental justice and business communities to set realistic funding levels for truck incentive programs. He said the District has a tremendous record of administering incentive programs and suggested the District should run the incentive programs at ARB.

Public Comments: None

9. FINALIZE CAC TECHNICAL RULE REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE - Morgan Lambert, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, brought this item back to the CAC to finalize the reinstatement of the Technical Rule Review Subcommittee in light of the attainment plans and control measures to be developed in the coming years to address multiple federal PM2.5 and ozone air quality standards. After requesting volunteers and input, the following CAC members were appointed by the Chair to Technical Rule Review Subcommittee:

Chris Savage (Chair of subcommittee)
Lee Smith
Kevin Hamilton
Jack Lemen
Dennis Tristao
Jenifer Pitcher
Derek Williams

10. DISCUSS AND PROVIDE GUIDANCE TO DISTRICT STAFF FOR POTENTIAL ENHANCEMENTS TO THE HEALTHY AIR LIVING (HAL) SCHOOLS PROGRAM – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, presented this item to solicit CAC input and guidance in the District's goal to continuously improve the Healthy Air Living (HAL) Schools program. The District has prioritized air-quality education opportunities for children and parents, and since 2012 has been contracting with the Central California Asthma Collaborative (CCAC) to engage schools across the San Joaquin Valley with educational materials, no idling signs and specific Real-time Air Advisory Network (RAAN) information to educate administrators and teachers on its health protective benefits for students. District staff specifically asked the CAC to provide guidance on the following questions:

- 1) Should the focus moving forward be on trying to recruit more schools or working with schools already in the program to strengthen their participation and enhance the effectiveness of the tools?
 - a) Is there value in spending resources to recruit additional schools? If so, what steps do we need to take to reach the remaining schools?
 - b) In what areas could the existing program be enhanced with the currently enrolled schools with respect to interactions with parents or school staff?
- 2) Is the current funding level adequate?
 - a) Are there other potential funding sources/entities to pursue?
 - b) What opportunities exist to reduce cost while maintaining or improving program effectiveness?
- 3) What type of entities can most effectively implement the new program if it differs from the current design?
 - a) Should all or part of the program be run internally by the District?
 - b) What other entities can or should be approached?

Mr. Hamilton disclosed that as of December 1, 2015 he has served as the Executive Director for CCAC and would be recusing himself from this discussion. He introduced Destiny Rodriguez, a CCAC staff member who leads the HAL Schools team. He complimented Ms. Rodriguez and staff for working hard with limited resources. Mr. Cunha clarified that Mr. Hamilton could provide comments as a member of the public on this item as it was not an action item. Mr. Durham said it was amazing to be able to conduct this program voluntarily. He commented that smaller children were much more affected by emissions from idling vehicles as they are closer to the tailpipes. He suggested it would make more sense to focus on the schools with higher vehicular traffic. Mr. Clark said as a school board member in Taft for the past 39 years, he is concerned about limiting of recess time based on general air quality information, and said using the Real Time Air Quality Advisory Network (RAAN) with area-specified readings is very important to ensure activities are limited only when necessary. Ms. Holt responded in 2017, the District's Web-Based Archived Air Quality (WAAQ) System is being seamlessly rolled into the RAAN system, which will evolve to be able to give much more accurate and area specific information. Mr. Williams asked how often District Outreach staff participate in area HAL Schools events conducted by CCAC. Ms. Holt responded District staff participates about 80% of the time. Mr. Williams suggested having a designated staff person at the District to work on the HAL Schools program.

Mr. Clark and Ms. Pitcher left at 11:32 a.m.

Public Comments: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Kevin Hamilton, CCAC
- Destiny Rodriguez, CCAC

12. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, gave updates on recent Outreach and Communications activities at the District including that staff is: conducting outreach for the District's PM2.5 Plan process; awaiting the impending arrival of the 2017 Kids Calendars, which can be obtained at any of the District's 3 regional offices; and working with various Chambers of Commerce to present information on the District's Grants programs. Ms. Holt asked CAC members who are also members of chambers of commerce to contact her to arrange a presentation. In addition, she reminded members that outdoor fire pits are not allowed to be burned when it is a "No Burning Unless Registered" day during the Check Before You Burn Season which runs through the end of February.

Mr. Smith asked if the District posted notices at Valley hardware stores to warn about the restriction on outdoor fire pits during the Check Before You Burn season. Ms. Holt responded that it is difficult to get messaging through corporate hardware businesses, even when the District is willing to pay for it. In addition, Ms. Holt reminded members there are still incentive funds available for the District's Check Before You Burn program, and announced the District's kids curriculum kits entitled "Healthy Air Heroes" is now available for distribution in the Valley.

Public Comments: None

13. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS; CAC MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE CAC REPORT DURING THE GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON DECEMBER 15, 2016 – Mr. Cunha wished members a safe Christmas and Happy New Year and advised them to be careful during the foggy season.
14. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report at the December 15, 2016 Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 11:50 a.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on January 3, 2017. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.