

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

February 7, 2017
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Vice Chair, Chris Savage, called the meeting to order at 10:08 a.m. He announced that the Chair, Manuel Cunha, was on his way to the meeting and would take over when he arrived.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)*	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/EIG (A)	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)	South
	Jenifer Pitcher/IAIG (A)**	South
	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
	Carolyn Temple/EIG (P)	South
Kings	Dustin Ference/IAIG (P)	Central
Madera	Don Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Jack Lemen/CIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Katelyn Roedner/EIG (P)*	North
Stanislaus	Chris Savage/IAIG (P)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central

*(P)=Primary,
(A)=Alternate,
IAIG=Industry/Ag Interest
Group,
EIG=Environmental
Interest Group, CIG-City
Interest Group*

**arrived at 10:21 a.m.*

***arrived at 10:42 a.m.*

Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO; Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO; Morgan Lambert, Deputy APCO; Dave Warner, Deputy APCO; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives; Chay Thao, Program Manager, Todd DeYoung, Program Manager; Alex Krivobok, Network Systems Analyst II; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards

Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Ann Marie Collins, Office Services Manager

Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Christal Martinez, Office Services Manager

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR DECEMBER 6, 2016 – The Chair asked for comments and corrections regarding the December 6, 2016 Minutes. Hearing none, the Chair deemed the Minutes approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, provided detailed updates on the following:

- District success in competing for \$5 million in federal Targeted Airshed grant funding for the replacement of heavy duty trucks and residential wood burning devices in the Valley.
- \$2.5 million in District incentive funding to be considered by the Governing Board at the February meeting to replace two passenger locomotives for the Altamont Corridor Express (ACE) transit service in the Northern Region in partnership with the Bay Area Air Quality Management District and San Joaquin Regional Rail Commission (\$15 million total project).
- Indirect Source Review Rule amendments and ongoing public process, including recent comments received by the District.
- District plans to bring together Valley growers, researchers/experts, representatives from the biomass power industry, representatives from new and developing technology vendors, and Valley stakeholders, at Central Valley Summit on Alternatives to Open Burning of Agricultural Waste to be held in late May or early June 2017.
- Governing Board discussion at the February meeting regarding potential options for obtaining additional emissions reductions from public fleets.

- In 2016, the San Joaquin Valley had the cleanest year on record for PM2.5, with zero exceedances of the 1997 PM2.5 24-hour standard (65 µg/m³) for the first time in Valley history, fewest exceedances for the 2006 PM2.5 24-hour standard (35 µg/m³), zero Unhealthy days during the 2015-2016 winter season, the highest number of days with Good air quality, and the fewest number of days with Unhealthy air quality. 2016 was also a near-record clean ozone year and continued to demonstrate tremendous progress with respect to ozone throughout the Valley.

Mr. Hamilton congratulated Mr. Sadredin on the District's air quality accomplishments. He suggested that perhaps the drought was not a big factor in exceedances as previously thought. Mr. Sadredin stated that the congratulations and recognitions should be directed to Valley businesses and residents for their added investments and sacrifices. He said the Valley's inversion layer, stagnation and lack of precipitation negatively affect air quality, and regardless of whether the Valley exceeded the standards or not, its numbers were definitely higher as a result of the drought conditions. Mr. Smith asked how to access the recent comments on the District's Indirect Source Review (ISR) Rule. Mr. Sadredin responded that information would be included as part of the agenda packet for the February Governing Board meeting.

Mr. Savage complimented the District and Valley businesses on a very successful 2016 with regards to air quality. He asked if a date had been set for the proposed biomass summit. Mr. Sadredin responded the District is planning to bring in a number of experts in that area and the scheduled date would depend on the availability of these experts. He said staff is hoping for a date in May or June and is working with ARB to coordinate the summit. Mr. Savage suggested inviting other regulatory agencies that may be restricting composting operations. Mr. Sadredin responded affirmatively. He said it could also impact other bioenergy sectors in that some solutions to the issue could involve gasification of agricultural waste. He said all ancillary sectors that could be affected would be invited to participate in the summit.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, gave an update on District planning and rule development efforts, including:

- The District is in the process of preparing the 2017 PM2.5 Plan, which will include the specific attainment plans for the 1997, 2006, and 2012 PM2.5 standards required by the federal Clean Air Act. The development of this plan will undergo an extensive public outreach process which has already begun as follows:

December 1, 2016: ARB workshop in Fresno
December 7, 2016: District scoping workshop

January 11, 2017: Public Advisory Workgroup (PAW) meeting to discuss air quality modeling

January 25, 2017: PAW meeting to discuss ARB Mobile Source Measures

The next PAW meeting is scheduled for February 9, 2017 to discuss District Measures. In the coming months, the District will conduct additional workshops and PAW meetings.

- The District will hold a public workshop for the 2017 PM10 Maintenance Plan in early 2017
- The originally proposed September 2016 adoption date for proposed amendments to Rule 9510 (Indirect Source Review) was postponed to address comments received. The District's proposed responses and revised rule language was presented at a public workshop on January 17, 2017, and another public workshop will be held in late February or early March.
- The District hosted a public workshop on the proposed amendments to Rule 2201 (New and Modified Stationary Source Review) on July 26, 2016. District staff had planned on presenting the rule to the Governing Board for adoption in September of 2016. However, in August of 2016, EPA released long-overdue regulations on implementing the PM2.5 standards in NSR rules that require an assessment of the significance of precursor pollutant emissions using a specific type of air quality modeling. EPA will not be able to approve an NSR rule that does not address EPA's implementation regulation, so adoption has been delayed until such modeling can be completed.
- Regarding Rule 4692 (Charbroiling), despite the District's efforts in promoting available funding under the Restaurant Charbroiler Technology Partnership program, the District has faced difficulty in finding restaurants willing to demonstrate new technologies. To date, the District has initiated one demonstration project and recently entered into a contract with an additional restaurant. Due to the limited availability of demonstrated control technologies, the District will address the SIP commitment in the upcoming 2017 PM2.5 Plan.

With Regards to the proposed amendments to Rule 2201 (New and Modified Stationary Source Review), Mr. Clark asked who would be absorbing the cost of the additional air quality modeling. Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, responded that the staff is working with ARB, which does the majority of the modeling in addition to utilizing the District's modeling center to make adjustments. Mr. Clark expressed concern about the cost of additional modeling. Mr. Warner responded that EPA changed the way that New Source Review Rule modeling is done with the new PM2.5 Implementation Rule. He

said agencies all over the country are struggling to figure out what EPA wants here and this does get traced right back to work done by the Study Agency. Mr. Sadredin said an additional issue related to modeling, which set the foundation for strategies that the District puts in place and lead to regulations, is how they attribute PM2.5 sources of pollution to what sources are causing the problem. ARB speciation from modeling is basically telling the District that 70% of the Valley's PM2.5 problem might be related to organic carbon emissions with a high percentage from cooking. He said that is why you cannot underestimate the impact of modeling which can change the entire regulatory scheme that the District must pursue.

Public Comment: None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (ARB) – ARB Board Meeting Summary – Mr. Cunha asked about if the District's PM2.5 Plan would be discussed at their next Board meeting in February. Mr. Sadredin responded that because neither staff nor Dr. Sherriffs would be able to attend that meeting, as it will be held on the same day as the District's February Governing Board meeting, ARB would reschedule that item to a future meeting.

Elizabeth Melgoza, ARB Representative, gave a summary of the ARB Board meeting held on December 8, 2016, which included:

- An update on investments resulting from the Volkswagen fraudulent emission control practices
- An update on the school bus population in California and associated funding resources available for school bus cleanup
- An update on efforts to implement Assembly Bill 1071 by revising the current Supplemental Environmental Projects policy
- An informational update on the process to develop a Carbon Capture and Sequestration quantification methodology and permanency protocol

Regarding the Volkswagen settlement, Mr. Sadredin reported that Volkswagen has rolled out a competitive process to solicit project proposals for a total of \$200 million in California. He said the District has taken the lead in working with Bay Area AQMD and South Coast AQMD to put a joint proposal together to expand the EV charging infrastructure from the Bay Area to Los Angeles for a total of \$150 million with the District as lead project administrator and distributor of the funds. He said this proposal ultimately has to go to ARB for final approval and staff may ask CAC members for letters of support.

Regarding the school bus fleet item, Mr. Clark, having been a school board member for many years, asked for information on school bus replacement programs. Mr. Cunha asked staff to respond to Mr. Clark's comments on school bus replacement programs.

Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO, responded that the District has a long history of working with local school districts to both retrofit and replace the local school bus fleets to the tune of \$100 million over the years. He said the District's program has worked so efficiently and effectively, they now run the Statewide School Bus Retrofit Program for any school district across the state who needs help retrofitting their buses. He said staff is interested in any renewed priority at the state level in this program, as the District has a lot of history operating the program effectively, and would be happy to take part in discussions with ARB. Ms. Melgoza said she would send follow up information to members via the Deputy Clerk to the Boards at a future date. Mr. Cunha requested a report on the school bus program at the March CAC meeting.

Mr. Hamilton said the school bus issue is very concerning and he would email Mr. Corey. He said school districts are very interested in school bus replacement and retrofit and did not foresee a change in the District running the statewide program. Regarding upcoming ARB meetings, Mr. Hamilton noted there is an upcoming meeting between the state Environmental Justice Advisory Committee (EJAC) and the Air Resources Board on February 15th to discuss concerns about the climate change scoping plan. He invited members to review the CHAP website for the latest children's health research. Mr. Williams commented that he appreciated Mr. Sadredin's comment on the Volkswagen funding, noting the high number of disadvantaged communities that exist in the Valley. Mr. Sadredin responded that ARB did a great job in settling for a greater amount of money for California per ton of emissions, using the Valley's and South Coast's air quality challenges as a basis for getting more funding. Regarding the PM2.5 Plan, he suggested CAC and stakeholders take advantage of the situation of having ARB's staff and Board attention to ensure they do their part regarding the 85% pollution that comes from mobile sources.

Public Comments: None

9. REVIEW POLICY POSITIONS ADOPTED BY DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD ON DECEMBER 15, 2016 AND PROVIDE FEEDBACK AND GUIDANCE ON DISTRICT'S INTEGRATED PM2.5 ATTAINMENT STRATEGY – Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives, provided a detailed presentation reviewing the policy positions adopted by the District Governing Board on December 15, 2016 to guide the work with ARB in preparing the District's attainment strategy for PM2.5. The policy positions detail strong action by the District consistent with previous guidance provided by the District Board while asking ARB to do its part for sources under their jurisdiction. As the District continues the extensive public outreach process to prepare the PM2.5 attainment strategy, other measures may be identified and the scope and nature of the ones adopted by the Governing Board may change. Mr. Gill provided an update on the ongoing public process to develop the PM2.5 attainment strategy, including multiple public workshops and Public Advisory Workgroup meetings that have been held to date. Mr. Gill requested CAC member feedback and guidance with respect to the District's ongoing preparation of the integrated PM2.5 attainment strategy. CAC members

expressed ongoing interest in participating in the public process. Les Clark expressed concern with ARB's ongoing reluctance to recognize natural gas as a near-zero technology option that can provide reductions in the more immediate timeframe. Kevin Hamilton also concurred with this concern regarding ARB's reluctance to pursue near-zero natural gas technology as a viable near term option for the Valley.

Mr. Sadredin said he wanted to emphasize that it is critical for all stakeholders to put pressure and educate ARB on the need for significant reductions from mobile sources in the near-term to benefit public health in the Valley. He voiced hope that there would be ample additional efforts by ARB to help the Valley move towards attainment.

Mr. Savage commented that many people who operate flares have difficulty at current levels, and said there could be serious safety concerns if the levels are dropped farther. Mr. Clark voiced agreement with Mr. Savage's comments on the flare rule. He voiced concern regarding the low-NOx burners. Regarding the use of natural gas, he said he supports that proposal 100% but doesn't believe that ARB does. With regard to glass plants, Mr. Hamilton asked why the standard was pounds of NOx per ton of glass, instead of pounds per day. Mr. Sadredin said when establishing standards for performance a daily limit does not translate to a specific control efficiency. A pounds per tons of glass limit better establishes a performance standard for glass furnaces. Mr. Hamilton commented that the environmental justice community agrees with the industry position on natural gas in several areas. Mr. Sadredin commented the District agrees and is in line with the industry position as well. He said there are two opportunities to raise this issue further in addition to the Scoping Plan itself, the ARB's Mobile Source Strategy which they are taking to their Board in March and the District's PM2.5 Plan.

Public Comment: None

10. DISCUSS AND PROVIDE INPUT TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO CONCERNING THE DISTRICT'S LEGISLATIVE PLATFORM – Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, provided a detailed presentation regarding the District's 2017 Legislative Platform adopted by the Governing Board at the January 19, 2017, Board meeting. The platform contains the District's top legislative priorities for the upcoming legislative session and general principles that will guide the District when taking positions on specific legislative and regulatory proposals. Mr. Jordan solicited guidance and assistance from CAC members regarding the implementation of the District's legislative priorities. A number of CAC members expressed support and offered assistance in facilitating additional discussions regarding this matter.

Public Comments: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Dolores Weller, CVAQ

11. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG) BUSINESS

- a. *Reappoint CAC Environmental Interest Group Primary Member and Appoint CAC Environmental Interest Group Alternate member* – Mr. Sadredin announced this item would need to be tabled to the next meeting as there was not a quorum present to take action.
- b. *Assess and Provide Guidance to the Executive Director/APCO Concerning the Effectiveness of the Environmental Justice Advisory Group Under the Current Trial Reporting Structure* – Mr. Sadredin said about a year ago the Governing Board changed the reporting structure for EJAG and CAC, allowing EJAG to report directly to the Board instead of through CAC for a one year trial period. He asked CAC members for input for his evaluation and subsequent report back to the Board on how the trial reporting structure has worked. Given the lack of a quorum he asked members to share their thoughts on how best to get their input on the process. Mr. Cunha said CAC members definitely need to be involved in this discussion and given the late hour, he suggested holding this discussion at the March 7th CAC meeting. He also suggested perhaps appointing an ad hoc subcommittee of CAC and EJAG members. Mr. Smith asked about the timeline for the Board evaluation. Mr. Sadredin said he will give an update at the next Board meeting to let them know the evaluation is in process. He said he would also place this item on the next EJAG agenda. Mr. Williams said his personal opinion is to wait until the next meeting to decide if a subcommittee is necessary. Mr. Clark voiced agreement with Mr. Cunha's comments on the need for additional discussion at the next CAC meeting. Mr. Cunha said he would meet with Mr. Sadredin prior to the next CAC meeting and bring a recommendation before members at that time.

Public Comment - None

12. REVIEW THE ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF THE CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE AND ASSESS IF ANY CHANGES ARE NECESSARY – In the interest of time, the Chair tabled this item to a future meeting.
13. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, reported that the District's 2017 Kids Calendars are still available for distribution in all three regions.
14. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS; CAC MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE CAC REPORT DURING THE GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON FEBRUARY 16, 2017 – Mr. Hamilton said that the state EJAC held a meeting in partnership with the District last July, consisting of stakeholders, environmental interests and community members to discuss the first draft of the GHG

Scoping Plan. He said the Plan is now in its final draft and EJAC would like to hold another meeting this spring at the District offices during the evening.

15. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report at the February 16, 2017 Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:20 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on March 7, 2017. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.