

Action Summary Minutes  
**San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District**

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**April 4, 2017**  
**10:00 a.m.**

*The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.*

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting

<b>County</b>	<b>Member Name/Interest Group</b>	<b>Location</b>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/EIG (A)*	Central
	Rey Leon/CIG (P)*	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)	South
	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
	Carolyn Temple/EIG (P)	South
Kings	Dustin Ference/IAIG (P)*	Central
	Alene Taylor/EIG (A)	Central
	Dennis Tristao/CIG (A)	Central
Madera	Don Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Tim Durham/IAIG (P)	North
	Kevin Abernathy/EIG (P)***	North
	Jack Lemen/CIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	David Phippen/IAIG (A)**	North
Stanislaus	Chris Savage/IAIG (P)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
	Greg Gomez/CIG (A)	Central

*(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group*

*\*arrived at 10:06 a.m.*

*\*\*arrived at 10:18 a.m.*

*\*\*\*arrived 11:09 a.m.*

District Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Samir Sheikh, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO); Morgan Lambert, Deputy APCO; Dave Warner, Deputy APCO; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives; Chay Thao, Program Manager, Todd DeYoung, Program Manager; Alex Krivobok, Network Systems Analyst II; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards

District Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Ann Marie Collins, Office Services Manager

District Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Christal Martinez, Office Services Manager

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR MARCH 7, 2017 – The Chair asked for comments and corrections regarding the March 7, 2017 Minutes. Hearing none, the Chair deemed the Minutes approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, provided detailed updates on the following:

- At the March 2017 meeting, the Governing Board:
  - Received and filed the District's annual air toxics report for 2016 and directed staff to begin rulemaking process to reduce fees for facilities subject to the AB 2588 Air Toxics Program, incorporating new cost reductions from streamlining and efficiency measures developed by the District
  - Received a visual demonstration of prototype Real-Time Electronic Air-Quality Display (READ) and approved pilot project to recruit up to 20 schools throughout the Valley to assist with final design and deployment
  - Reaffirmed the District's existing position that draconian measures that impose no driving days and severe restrictions on commerce are not feasible
  - Received a report on the District's preliminary cost and incentive funding estimates to achieve the enormous emissions reductions required to demonstrate attainment with federal mandates under the new PM2.5 standards
  - Supported provisions of state Senate Bill 49 (De Leon) relating to air quality that, consistent with the District's existing policy position, ensure no rollback of the District's existing health protective rules and regulations. Furthermore, directed staff to work with the authors of the bill to incorporate language that will ensure that the Valley's disadvantaged communities will not become subject to

economically devastating sanctions due to air pollution from sources under the sole legal authority of the state and federal governments, and incorporate language to establish safeguards aimed at avoiding unintended adverse consequences.

Mr. Savage asked Mr. Sheikh for an update on the recent Air Resources Board meeting in Riverside where the State Strategy for the State Implementation Plan (State SIP Strategy) was considered. Mr. Sheikh said that despite identifying reductions in the State SIP Strategy that South Coast AQMD is using in their plan, ARB did not adopt any new measures to provide the near-term reductions necessary as part of the District's PM2.5 planning efforts. He said ARB adopted what they called a "down payment", committing to return with significant new mobile source reductions as needed for the District's PM2.5 planning efforts. Mr. Sheikh thanked Valley stakeholders who presented at the meeting and called for ARB to delay adoption of the strategy until ARB includes measures with the near-term reductions the Valley needs. Despite these presentations and a letter sent from the three CAC Interest Groups asking ARB to delay taking action, the Board proceeded to adopt the State SIP Strategy. Mr. Hamilton said it was very frustrating to hear the ARB Board failing to insert the pieces the Valley needed in the State SIP Strategy and said the frustration exists across the state.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, provided an update on the District's planning and rule development efforts, including the 2017 PM2.5 Plan, 2017 PM10 Maintenance Plan, Rule 9510 (*Indirect Source Review*), Rule 2201 (*New and Modified Stationary Source Review*), Rule 3110 (*Air Toxics Fees*) and Rule 4692 (*Charbroiling*).

Public Comment: None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (ARB) – Elizabeth Melgoza, ARB representative, provided the following summary of the items before ARB at their March 23-24, 2017 meeting:

- The Board approved the Ventura County Air Pollution Control District and San Diego County APCD Plans for the 2008 75ppb 8-Hour Ozone Standard. These plans will be submitted to EPA as a revision to California's State Implementation Plan.
- The Board approved the South Coast AQMD 2016 Air Quality Management Plan for the 8-hour Ozone, Annual PM2.5 and 24-hour PM2.5 standards in the South Coast Air Basin and the 8-hour Ozone

standard in the Coachella Valley. This plan will be submitted to EPA as a revision to California's State Implementation Plan.

- The Board approved the Proposed 2016 State Strategy for the State Implementation Plan (State SIP Strategy).
- The Board approved the proposed Final Short-Lived Climate Pollutant (SLCP) Reduction Strategy.
- The Board heard an informational update regarding the status of the regional target update process for California's Metropolitan Planning Organizations (MPO) required by the Sustainable Communities and Climate Protection Act of 2008 (SB 375).
- The Board adopted the *Greenhouse Gas Emissions Standards for Crude Oil and Natural Gas Facilities* regulation.
- The Board heard a presentation by Professional Engineers in California Government honoring CARB engineers involved in discovering and investigating Volkswagen's diesel engine defeat devices.
- The Board heard the completed midterm review and recommendations on the Advanced Clean Cars regulations for the 2022-2025 model years.
- The Board heard a status update on an overview of Volkswagen's first 30-month Zero Emission Vehicles (ZEV) Investment Plan.

Public Comments: None

9. REVIEW THE ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF THE CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE AND ASSESS IF ANY CHANGES ARE NECESSARY –

With a number of new CAC members and the growing maturity and complexity of the District's air quality management programs, Morgan Lambert, Deputy APCO, led a discussion with CAC members on the role of the Committee and expectations of its members, as directed by the District's Governing Board and specified in the Board adopted CAC by-laws.

CAC members reviewed the established roles and responsibilities and after discussion had no suggestions for changes.

Public Comment: None

10. REVIEW PRELIMINARY COST AND INCENTIVE FUNDING ESTIMATES FOR MEASURES AIMED AT REDUCING EMISSIONS FOR DISTRICT'S PM2.5 ATTAINMENT STRATEGY - Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives, reviewed the District's preliminary cost estimates for measures aimed at reducing directly emitted PM2.5 and NOx emissions in pursuit of the District's attainment strategy for the federal PM2.5 standards. In addition, he reviewed the District's preliminary estimates for the funding for incentive-based measures necessary to achieve and expedite reductions in pursuit of the District's attainment strategy for the federal PM2.5 standards.

Mr. Savage expressed concern about the huge amount of money that the District will potentially spend to achieve reductions while still potentially not be in compliance with the federal standards. He said meeting these standards must be a statewide effort and not solely driven by Valley residents. He said members really need to understand the District's broader perspective on how they are going to engage all statewide agencies to develop the necessary infrastructure to comply with the federal air quality standards. He asked the Chair to add an item to a future meeting agenda to familiarize members with what is needed to reach attainment. He reminded members that the vast majority of greenhouse gas incentive funds are coming from stationary sources, and are not a free pot of money.

Mr. Durham thanked Mr. Gill for the informative report. He said the District must go back to state and federal government and ask them to justify where the funds will come from to meet these impossible mandates.

Mr. Hamilton said it appears about \$40 billion of the \$51 billion required is the responsibility of ARB or the federal government. He said it appears that market forces are driving natural gas technology forward. He suggested a formal, independent economic assessment would be very useful. He thanked staff for their hard work putting this report together.

Mr. Ference asked if staff knew the amount of mobile sources emissions in the Valley that were the result of out of state operators. He asked if there were an option to level the playing field with out of state operators. Mr. Cunha said it was a complicated situation, and asked staff for a report at a future meeting on the District's jurisdiction and other questions asked by members on this issue. Mr. Leon asked for a list of source emissions by county. He suggested identifying innovative pilot projects that would help reduce county-specific emissions.

In response to member comments, Mr. Sheikh said the Valley has a huge attainment challenge. He the District is very optimistic that technology will become available, but it is not likely to be deployed on the large scale necessary within the very short timeframes called for in the federal Clean Air Act. He said the District is collaborating with other air districts on the need for the near-term investment in ultra-low NOx

technology. With regard to Cap and Trade funds, he said the important thing is to reinvest those funds in disadvantaged communities to provide air quality benefits. He said the District is advocating for maintaining federal funding to help the Valley with its air quality challenges. He said incentives play a critical role as regulation alone is not enough to help the Valley reach attainment. Lastly, he said staff can work with Mr. Leon on his request for inventory numbers and acknowledged the potential of focusing strategies on key locations in the Valley. In response to Mr. Hamilton's comments about costs, he said staff is using costs and incentives information in areas they deal with daily as a result of running the District's many programs. He noted that District staff have extensive experience in implementing a wide variety of incentive and technology advancement programs that help inform the Valley's needs moving forward.

Public Comment – None

11. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, asked members to let their constituents know about current vacancies on the District's Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) in Madera and Merced counties. She said her team is actively participating in many events in honor of Earth Day on April 22<sup>nd</sup>. Lastly, she reminded members that May is Bike to Work Month and encouraged all to tune up their bikes to get ready for the many activities throughout the Valley.

Public Comments - None

12. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS; CAC MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE CAC REPORT DURING THE GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON APRIL 20, 2017 – Mr. Leon thanked Mr. Sheikh and staff for all of their hard work. He noted that many rural areas have electric vehicle chargers and electric buses, and said it is important to keep moving forward in that direction. Mr. Sheikh expressed gratitude to people such as Mr. Leon who have worked with the District on such great projects to improve air quality in disadvantaged communities.
13. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report at the April 20, 2017 Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:06 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on May 2, 2017. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.