

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

June 6, 2017
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/EIG (P)	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)	South
	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
	Carolyn Temple/EIG (P)	South
Kings	Alene Taylor/EIG (A)	Central
	Dennis Tristao/CIG (A)	Central
Madera	Don Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
Merced	Tim Durham/IAIG (P)	North
	Kevin Abernathy/EIG (P)	Central
	Jack Lemen/CIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	Chris Savage/IAIG (P)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central

(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

District Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Dave Warner, Deputy APCO; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Arnaud Marjollet, Director of Permit Services, Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives, Jon Klassen, Program Manager, Chay Thao, Program Manager, Cathy Blevins, Network Systems Analyst II; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards

District Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Ann Marie Collins, Office Services Manager

District Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Christal Martinez, Office Services Manager

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR MAY 2, 2017 – The Chair asked for comments and corrections regarding the May 2, 2017 Minutes. Mr. Williams said Item 17 should state that he had requested a copy of the letters for his meetings with Assemblymember Mathis and Senator Vidak. Hearing no further comments, the Chair deemed the Minutes approved with the correction.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Dave Warner, Deputy APCO provided detailed updates on the following:

- California Air Resources Board met on May 25, 2017, and received an update from ARB staff on the District's and ARB's efforts with respect to the process of putting together a PM2.5 State Implementation Plan. ARB staff have now made a finding that achieving the federal 24-hr PM2.5 standard by 2019 and the annual standard by 2021 is not possible. Cooperation between the District and ARB, and a robust public process, has resulted in the discussion of a number of new control measures, but these efforts have yet to identify sufficient reductions to achieve the standards by the federal deadlines. The District asked for ARB to commit to significant new incentive funding to assist in the effort, specifically identifying the VW settlement and state Cap and Trade revenues as potential funding sources.
- District Governing Board meeting on May 25, 2017, items including the presentation of the Proposed Fiscal Year 2017-18 Budget. The Board set June 15, 2017, as the date for considering adoption of the Budget.

Mr. Tristao congratulated District staff for doing an excellent job at the ARB Board meeting in Sacramento and at the District Governing Board's public hearing for the presentation on the proposed budget for Fiscal Year 2017-18. Mr. Cunha thanked Mr. Warner, saying he attended the ARB meeting and heard great responses about the District's budget processes, including managing funds for other air districts. He voiced hope that in the future that ARB staff would do a better job of coordinating with the District to avoid date conflicts when scheduling their Board meetings.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, provided an update on the District’s planning and rule development efforts, including the 2017 PM2.5 Plan, 2017 PM10 Maintenance Plan, Rule 9510 (*Indirect Source Review*), Rule 2201 (*New and Modified Stationary Source Review*), Rule 3110 (*Air Toxics Fees*) and Rule 4692 (*Charbroiling*).

Mr. Tristao said he has attended many of the PM2.5 Workshops and heard comments made regarding banning backyard barbecues. He said he spoke with many of his constituents in Corcoran and they were definitely against that approach. Mr. Cunha said while it is important to consider all options to reduce air pollution, such as a ban on fireworks, that activity along with backyard barbecues has a meaning and a purpose, most notably of bringing people and families together. He commended Mr. Tristao for discussing some of the comments with his constituents and suggested other CAC members should do the same to obtain valuable feedback.

Public Comment: None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (ARB) – Sylvia Vanderspek, ARB representative, provided a summary of select items before the ARB Board at their May 25, 2017 meeting, including:

- The PM2.5 State Implementation Plan development process for the San Joaquin Valley
- Opportunities for overcoming barriers to clean transportation access for low-income residents
- International coordination efforts

Mr. Tristao asked for more information on ARB’s international coordination efforts. Ms. Vanderspek responded that lately ARB has received a significant amount of international visitor requests, from countries including China, who are interested in learning about their air quality efforts. Mr. Tristao clarified that he was wondering about the Western Climate Initiative, and if new members would be added under the Cap and Trade Program. Ms. Vanderspek said she was not aware but would look for more information on that.

Mr. Warner thanked Ms. Vanderspek for her update, and said he wanted CAC members to understand that the District does not agree with ARB’s characterization that the Valley is very close to developing a plan to demonstrate attainment with the federal PM2.5 standards. He said there is a very significant reduction in NOx and directly-emitted PM2.5 that is necessary to get the final few micrograms per cubic meter reductions. He said the District is unsure how to get there right now. Ms. Vanderspek agreed that it would be hard and require sacrifices from the state and the District, but it could be done. Mr. Warner said that at the ARB Board meeting in May, District representatives asked ARB to recognize that there would be a need for a significant

amount of incentive dollars to accomplish this. He said they specifically asked ARB to use all of their authority possible in the VW settlement agreement to ensure the Valley's disadvantaged communities benefit from those funds through new directions in incentive funding, as well as examining Cap and Trade funds to find every opportunity to bring dollars to the Valley to reduce not only greenhouse gases, but to generate some co-benefits in criteria pollutants. Mr. Cunha commented that the District will do all they can without destroying businesses and losing jobs in the Valley. He said the timeline must be moved for the Valley, to ensure the controls can be put in place without costing much needed jobs. Regarding the foreign trade discussion between China and the Governor, he asked that any correspondence that is public information be sent to the District and forwarded to CAC members. He reiterated that additional funding is crucial for the Valley to attain its air quality goals. He expressed appreciation for funding sources, such as USDA-NRCS, DERA funding from EPA, and said the need continues for incentive funding for businesses and industry to meet air quality requirements.

Public Comments: None

9. ANNUAL AIR TOXICS REPORT FOR THE YEAR 2016 AND PROCESS TO REDUCE FEES FOR AFFECTED FACILITIES – Arnaud Marjollet, Director of Permit Services, provided the Annual Air Toxics Report for year 2016 detailing the District's efforts and progress in reducing Valley residents' exposure to toxic air contaminants. Additionally, Mr. Marjollet provided an overview of a new rulemaking process to reduce fees for facilities subject to the AB 2588 Air Toxics Program due to cost reductions from streamlining and efficiency measures developed and implemented by the District.

In addition to a myriad of efforts aimed at reducing ozone and particulate emissions throughout the Valley, the District also devotes significant resources and implements comprehensive strategies to reduce toxic air pollutants. The District's integrated air toxics program fulfills the state Hot Spots mandates which are aimed at quantifying and assessing localized health risk, notifying affected residents, and reducing risk from facilities with high risk caused by air toxic emissions. Another state mandate addressed by the District's integrated air toxics program is the Airborne Toxic Control Measure regulations promulgated by the Air Resources Board requiring prescribed control measures for various source categories that cause significant risks at a regional level. Additionally, the District's integrated program fulfills federal mandates under Title III of the federal Clean Air Act, requiring Maximum Available Control Technology for sources of air toxics. In addition to the state and federal mandates, the District's integrated air toxics program also implements the more stringent local permitting and California Environmental Quality Act requirements, to ensure installation of Best Available Control Technology for air toxics and that new permits or modifications to existing facilities will not result in a significant increase in health risk to the public.

Mr. Clark asked about an expected fee increase from ARB. Mr. Warner responded the District is unsure where ARB is headed with air toxics fees at this point, and said current state law allows them to essentially double the fees they have been collecting so far without legislative action. He said the District has heard that ARB is interested in pursuing legislation to allow them to raise the fees even higher but at this point has not received any real word or analysis from ARB on where they are going with their fees, only that they are expected to increase. Mr. Clark said it would make sense that any fees generated from the air toxics program would be given to the District. Mr. Warner responded that the fees that ARB generates from this program also fund a significant percentage of the work that the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA) does with respect to AB2588 as well.

Mr. Tristao said his company is currently in the process of addressing AB2588. He thanked Mr. Marjollet for the template and the streamlining work, and said he can accurately represent that the District's efforts, as opposed to the last time they went through this process using a consultant, has saved his company tens of thousands of dollars in consultant fees. He applauded the District's efforts in streamlining the process, saying it has a direct impact on the costs that facilities incur when analyzing data for submission of the reports. Mr. Hamilton said he has been working with ARB and OEHHA on air toxics and said there was a report issued in January to address the health impacts of air toxics and air pollution. He said the principal role of this program is to protect public health. He said the reporting frequency is a problem when assessing the public health impact and made the health evaluation impossible. He said the recommendation in the report was to standardize the reporting time framework. He said it was great that the District has developed tools for streamlining this reporting process. Mr. Warner said AB2588 is part of the District's three-pronged effort in the area, along with an extensive list of regulations that are designed to reduce toxics from individual source types, and the District regulates any changes made to these facilities through its New Source Review program, and does not allow a change that causes a significant increase in health risk. He said it is virtually impossible for these facilities to become a significant risk facility. He agreed that reporting of criteria pollutants on an annual basis enables the reporting of air toxics emissions on an annual basis. He said he is very confident in the ability of the integrated air toxics program to prevent the creation of new, significant health risks. Mr. Cunha thanked Mr. Marjollet for the report saying the District has done a great job with this program.

10. END-OF-SEASON REPORT ON THE 2016-17 WOOD BURNING SEASON – Jon Klassen, Program Manager, provided an in-depth report on the 2016-2017 Wood Burning Season. Due to the Valley's topography and climate conditions, winter months are typically when high particulate matter concentrations are experienced in the region. A key measure that has been instrumental in reducing particulate matter concentrations during the winter peak season is the District's wood burning curtailment program. This measure combined with strong controls on other sources of air pollution in the San Joaquin Valley has resulted in steady and significant improvements in air quality.

During the 2016-2017 winter season, the San Joaquin Valley set several new air quality records across the months of November to February. With a return to more normal winter meteorological conditions over the last couple of years and with ongoing emissions reductions achieved through the District's control strategies, the Valley is back on track to meeting the 65 µg/m³ federal 24-hour PM_{2.5} standard.

The 2016-2017 winter marked the third season under the recently amended wood-burning rule, which significantly increased the number of no-burn days for high polluting wood-burning devices, and allowed for a substantial increase in burn days for clean wood-burning devices. This winter season also included the successful implementation of the District's Burn Cleaner grant program with over \$2.4 million in funding for over 1,400 vouchers issued for residents to upgrade to clean wood-burning and natural gas devices. Since 2009, the District has issued over 12,200 vouchers with a total allocated funding amount of over \$16.6 million. These regulatory and incentive-based strategies combined with the District's multifaceted public education and outreach program led to the following clean winter as summarized below:

- Recorded the greatest number of "Good" AQI days across all of the counties in the District (423 days)
- For the second winter season in a row, recorded zero exceedances of the 65 µg/m³ federal 24-hour PM_{2.5} standard
- Recorded the lowest average PM_{2.5} concentration across all counties during the months of the wood burning season
- Recorded the second lowest number of days the counties throughout the Valley exceeded the 35 µg/m³ federal 24-hour PM_{2.5} standard
- Recorded the second lowest number of days the counties throughout the Valley measured Unhealthy AQI for PM_{2.5} during the months of the wood burning season

Mr. Hamilton thanked Mr. Klassen for the great work on the bar graphs in his presentation. He asked if they were based on 24-hour measurements. Mr. Klassen responded affirmatively, saying it is an average for the entire winter season. Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives, said the District is in compliance with the 65 µg and will be submitting a clean data finding to EPA through ARB this year.

Public Comment - None

11. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Heather Heinks, Outreach and Communications Manager, reported on the following outreach activities:
- Spring and Summer public outreach campaigns
 - The District's messaging regarding the 4th of July and the health impacts of fireworks
 - The District's 2016-17 Annual Report

- The District's wildfire campaign

Mr. Cunha thanked the District for monitoring wildfires affecting the Valley's air quality saying this is a very important factor and would help educate residents and other government agencies on the subsequent health impacts.

12. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS: CAC MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE CAC REPORT DURING THE GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON JUNE 15, 2017 – Mr. Hamilton said Cal Fire, Cal Recycle and ARB are about to release the Sierra Forest Management Plan that includes the wildfire forest treatment and management information. He suggested it would be a good idea to have them present this information at a future meeting. Mr. Cunha asked staff coordinate to bring this information to CAC members. Mr. Tristao thanked staff for the excellent presentations saying they were well presented and concise. He said he would like the report to the Board to emphasize the importance of streamlining air toxics. He said he would like to hear more about the attainment of the 65 µg standard. Mr. Warner responded affirmatively. Mr. Cunha thanked members for taking time to attend this meeting and expressed that Mr. Gill did an excellent job delivering the District's comments at the ARB Board Meeting in May. He said the many Valley stakeholders present at the meeting greatly appreciated his messaging and professional demeanor.
13. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report at the June 15, 2017 Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 11:57 a.m.

Next Meeting – NO MEETING IN JULY. The next meeting is scheduled on August 1, 2017. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.