

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

September 5, 2017
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m.

2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
	Chris McGlothlin/IAIG (A)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/EIG (P)	Central
	Rhonda Armstrong/CIG (P)	Central
Kern	Jenifer Pitcher/IAIG (A)	South
	Brent Green/CIG (P)	South
Kings	Dustin Ference/IAIG (P)	Central
	Kelly Deming/EIG (P)	Central
	Dennis Tristao/CIG (A)	Central
Madera	Don Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Kevin Abernathy/EIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	Chris Savage/IAIG (P)	North
	Shivaughn Alves/EIG (P)	North
	Richard O'Brien/CIG (A)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
	Greg Gomez/CIG (A)	Central

(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

District Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Dave Warner, Deputy APCO; Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer; Arnaud Marjollet, Director of Permit Services, Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives, Jon Klassen, Program

Manager, Chay Thao, Program Manager, Cathy Blevins, Network Systems Analyst II;
Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards

District Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Ann Marie Collins,
Office Services Manager

District Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Christal Martinez,
Office Services Manager

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR JUNE 6, 2017 – The Chair asked for member comments or changes on the minutes for the meeting held on June 6, 2017. Hearing none, the Chair deemed the minutes as approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, provided detailed updates on the following items from the June 15, 2017 and August 19, 2017 Governing Board meetings, including:

- The Board accepted and appropriated \$6.5 million in Carl Moyer, Cap & Trade and federal DERA incentive funding that will go into replacing heavy duty trucks, aging school buses, agricultural equipment and locomotives. He stated that the District takes pride for the success in garnering these competitive grants that help reduce air pollution in the Valley.
- The Board adopted an amendment to Rule 3110 to reduce the fees paid by Valley businesses subject to the Air Toxics "Hot Spots" Information and Assessment Act (AB 2588). The District invested significantly in upfront streamlining of the AB2588 program administration and implementation processes, reducing both the District's and the regulated businesses' costs of implementation, while simultaneously improving the protection of the public health via the implementation of the District's more health protective air toxics health risk assessment methodologies. The rule amendments will result in a 30% reduction in fees charged to facilities subject to the Air Toxics "Hot Spots" program, over the multi-year cycle of the program, compared to the fees that would have been collected under the current rule.

- The Board set the agenda for the 2017 Governing Board Study Session, to be held on September 20th and 21st, 2017 at Bass Lake. He invited members to attend this important educational experience, and mentioned one of the items presented will be the Executive Director/APCO's evaluation of the Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) reporting structure.

Mr. Warner also reported on the very busy state legislative process, saying that the Governor has been pushing hard and has been successful at getting an extension of the state's Cap-and-Trade program. He said the District's legislative advocacy has been aimed at making sure that the Valley gets its fair share, or even more, of the Cap-and-Trade dollars that may be available. Last week, the Governor released his \$1.5 billion Cap-and-Trade funding proposal, including \$140 million for electric vehicles this coming year, \$380 million for trucks and buses in various programs, \$85 million for agriculture equipment, and \$200 million in sustainable agriculture, a lot of that aimed at dairy methane emissions reductions. He said the Governor's proposal does not specify where these dollars will go to, but staff believes the Valley is well positioned to receive a considerable portion of it.

Mr. Warner stated that the Valley's air quality has been heavily impacted by a number of wildfires recently, noting the high smoke conditions and falling ash over the holiday weekend. He said while conditions have cleared a little over the past couple of days, the District is extending its health cautionary statement, due to expected smoke impacts throughout the Valley this week. He mentioned the Mariposa and Oakhurst areas have been especially impacted by the smoke and unhealthy air and the District would be conducting focused outreach in those areas.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, provided an update on the District's planning and rule development efforts, including the 2017 PM2.5 Plan, 2017 PM10 Maintenance Plan, Rule 9510 (*Indirect Source Review*), Rule 2201 (*New and Modified Stationary Source Review*), Rule 3110 (*Air Toxics Fees*), Rule 4311 (*Flares*) and Rule 4692 (*Charbroiling*).

Mr. Savage thanked Mr. Thao for the update, and asked if staff had received much feedback from those in attendance at the Rule 4311 scoping meeting to the likely probability of increased controls on flares. Mr. Thao responded the purpose of the scoping meeting was to kick off the public process. He said the intent of the next focused workgroup meetings will be to dive into the potential control strategies in greater detail.

Public Comment: None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (ARB) – Elizabeth Melgoza, ARB representative, provided a summary of select items before the ARB Board at their July 27, 2017 meeting, including:

- The Air Resources Board adopted amendments to the Cap-and-Trade Regulation to extend the program beyond 2020, link the program with the Ontario, Canada Cap-and-Trade program, and clarify and streamline select requirements of the regulation.
- The Air Resources Board adopted California's Proposed Compliance Plan to meet the Federal Clean Power Plan.
- The Air Resources Board adopted the Volkswagen (VW) Zero Emission Vehicles Investment Plan with an amendment to encourage the VW subsidiary Electrify America to hire contractors from within local and disadvantaged communities to expand zero emission vehicle infrastructure.

Ms. Alves asked how the public would find out where the charging stations would be located. Ms. Melgoza responded that is still in the planning stages. Mr. Hamilton said he was working with Electrify America and others on this plan over the last year and while the specific locations are not yet identified, the idea is to have multiple, fast car charging stations that will charge your battery in 15 minutes or less about every 53 miles up and down Highway 99 and the I-5. He said there were also no green cities in the Valley originally, and through a number of people being active on this, Fresno has now been identified as a green city that will be invested in. He there is still a lot of work to be done to address disadvantaged communities in the area.

Ms. Pitcher voiced appreciation for the ARB representative's ability to call in and asked for more detailed information on upcoming workshops, specifically the short-lived climate pollutant reduction strategy workshops. Ms. Melgoza responded that the handouts that were included as part of the agenda packet contain links to more comprehensive meeting information, as well as staff contacts for those items. She said she had no further information on those meetings at this time. Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO, stated that the ARB handouts did not include an upcoming community meeting in Lamont on September 18th regarding local health impacts from freight facilities. He asked Ms. Melgoza to send additional information to the District to forward to CAC members. Mr. Cunha asked Ms. Melgoza if she could send more information on future upcoming meetings, including staff contacts, to the Clerk of the Boards so she could forward to CAC members.

Mr. Green asked for more explanation on the relationship between the District's Rule 9510 (*Indirect Source Review*) and ARB's potential Indirect Source Review rule. He said stakeholders need a better understanding, especially those who will be impacted.

Mr. Warner responded that the ARB effort at this point is what staff considers to be a scoping process of learning all they can about options to reduce emissions associated with freight systems and hubs. He said one of those options that they are specifically talking about is an indirect source rule. He said District staff have been in communication with ARB about the existence of the District's ISR rule and have sent them quite a bit of information on how the District's rule works. He said at this point, staff focus will be on making sure there is no duplication of regulatory effort but it is still very early in the ARB process. He said it is important for stakeholders to stay involved in these efforts. Mr. Green said it is very important for stakeholders to understand the position that the District is going to take. He asked if staff planned to comment or provide more information at the meeting on the 18th, as it could have a huge impact on his area. Mr. Warner responded affirmatively. Mr. Sheikh said District staff planned to attend the meeting on the 18th to continue to educate stakeholders on the District's Indirect Source Rule. He said the format is not really a workshop, and believed it would be more of a listening session, with breakdown into groups so that individuals can share their input on freight and concepts. He said staff would be involved in the process, to do some education as well as listening to what ARB's mandates are from their Board. He said staff would update CAC members accordingly.

Mr. Cunha requested that ARB hold a workshop in the Valley. He asked Ms. Melgoza and staff to work together accordingly. Mr. Green commented that they have had two meetings with ARB staff including Board members and the Executive Director on site at their industrial facility in Shafter. He said stakeholders need to have a much better understanding of what is planned as thousands of jobs are involved and this is not something to be taken lightly. Mr. Cunha asked Ms. Melgoza to share these concerns with ARB staff and request that a meeting be scheduled in the Valley.

Public Comments: None

9. CLEAN DATA FINDING TO EPA FOR THE 1997 24-HOUR PM_{2.5} STANDARDS AND PM_{2.5} ATTAINMENT STRATEGY – Chay Thao and Jon Klassen, Program Managers, informed CAC members that the District would submit a clean data demonstration to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) and request a finding that the Valley is in attainment of the 24-hour component of the 1997 PM_{2.5} Standard of 65 µg/m³. Specifically, they reported this document supports both a clean data finding and a finding that attainment is due to permanent and enforceable emissions reductions, including:

- **Monitoring data:** Air monitoring data from the relevant three-year period (2014-2016) meets the 1997 24-hour PM_{2.5} standard of 65µg/m³.
- **Monitoring network:** As regularly documented in the District's annual monitoring network plans, the Valley's PM_{2.5} monitoring network meets all applicable monitoring requirements.

- **Regulations and emissions reductions:** The District and ARB have adopted the nation's most stringent regulations, and these regulations achieve significant PM2.5 precursor emissions reductions.
- **No unusually favorable meteorology:** Meteorological analysis shows that 2014-2016 meteorology was neither unusual nor the cause of attainment.
- **No decrease in economic activity:** Analyses of vehicle miles traveled and state fuel sales, indicators of economic activity, shows that there was not a decrease in economic activity responsible for attainment.

Mr. Cunha thanked District staff for all of the work they have done to develop this attainment strategy. Mr. O'Brien commented that he has spoken to several farmers in his area who said the incentive amounts offered by the District are not enough to take a low or moderate piece of equipment out of service and still have to pay an excessive amount to get the new equipment. Mr. Cunha responded that the agricultural industry is working diligently with USDA-NRCS, ARB and the District on the agricultural equipment trade up program, which is of tremendous value in getting reductions and getting rid of tier zero equipment. He said the District has worked to increase, in concert with the agriculture industry, the funding sources for farmers. He voiced agreement with the high costs of farming operations, but said there has been tremendous discussion aimed at increasing incentive funding for replacing tractors, harvesters, engines and now alternative terrain vehicles. Mr. Sheikh voiced appreciation for Mayor O'Brien's comments and said he would be happy to reach out to him with the latest information on the incentive structure for the program.

Ms. Alves asked if there were incentives available for farmers to switch to solar pumps. Mr. Sheikh responded currently there isn't any District incentive funding available, but they do incentivize changing out to electric motors on pumps, along with some line extension costs which are also very important. Ms. Alves thanked him for the information and asked for information on the District's Ag Tractor Trade Up program as well. Ms. Alves asked if there were any plans to incentivize the sending of agricultural waste to compost facilities. Mr. Sheikh responded that is definitely one of the subjects that will be discussed during the upcoming Agricultural Waste Summit in November. He said preliminary feedback is that it is a tough proposition due to the tipping fees and the cycle of the way the operations work. He said District staff has seen agricultural operations develop more localized composting options that may be more of an option moving forward.

Ms. Pitcher congratulated staff on the 1997 Clean Data Finding and said her organization did not oppose staff on the proposed PM2.5 Attainment Strategy, but said she thought these two items should have been discussed separately. She said she knows there has been an extensive public process, and she has attended all of the meetings, but voiced concern that she has not seen an actual plan to review and comment on. She said Western States Petroleum Association (WSPA) has submitted comments on the proposed control measures and was awaiting response. She re-

emphasized the Board's direction for staff to work with affected stakeholders on the technological parts of the proposed control measures. She encouraged staff to continue to work with all industries on the various proposed control measures. She also asked for more detailed descriptions of the local emission reduction measures under consideration. She said WSPA would continue to support the District's incentive programs where possible. Mr. Sheikh voiced appreciation for Ms. Pitcher's comments and said staff agrees on the need to talk about the details, look at technological feasibility, and come up with measures that are hopefully reflecting what science and technology is available out there. He reaffirmed that the District is committed to working with interested and affected stakeholders as they move forward in this process. Mr. Cunha acknowledged staff and how complicated the process of designing the attainment strategy is. He commented on the need for ARB and EPA to work with the District on this important plan and thanked staff for the great job they have done working with the Board and developing a plan that makes sense economically to agricultural and other industries.

Public Comment - None

10. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, reported on the following outreach activities:

- Smoke impacts from wildfires in eastern Fresno and Tulare Counties
- The District's Healthy Air Living campaign which typically runs during back to school season, including television and radio spots, billboards, and social media. She said the message is to be mindful of how you use your automobile such as get your car tuned up, drive less if possible, carpool, trip link, don't idle and help reduce emissions
- The District is actively soliciting entries for the annual Kids Calendar contest with a deadline during the first week in October
- Governing Board Study Session scheduled for September 20 and 21, 2017 at Bass Lake, CA. She advised members to call the Pines Resort for accommodations
- The Agricultural Waste Summit at the Kearney Ag Research Center in Parlier is scheduled for November 7 and 8, 2017 and save the date cards will be sent out this week with information to follow on the website

Public Comments - None

11. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS: CAC MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE CAC REPORT DURING THE GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON OCTOBER 19, 2017 – Mr. Cunha announced that Mr. Williams was recently elected as Chair of the Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) and the CAC looked forward to working with him. Mr. Cunha welcomed Ms. Armstrong and Ms. Alves to their first meeting. Ms. Armstrong said she is very interested in information on the District's agricultural incentive programs due to the area she represents and voiced appreciation for Mr. Cunha's comments. Mr. Williams reported that Ms. Vielma was elected as Vice Chair of EJAG at the last meeting and EJAG members approved their draft 2017-18 Goals, Objectives and Action Plan. He mentioned there are a couple of vacancies on EJAG and he has been reviewing attendance records and plans to meet with members who have not attended meetings on a regular basis to confirm they still want to serve on EJAG. Mr. Cunha thanked Mr. Williams for all of his hard work on EJAG. He also thanked staff and ARB representatives for their hard work and the information presented today.

12. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report at the October 19, 2017 Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 11:48 a.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on October 2, 2017. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.