

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

April 3, 2018
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Vice Chair, Chris Savage, called the meeting to order at 10:13 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting and to take action.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Kevin Hamilton/EIG (P)	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)	South
	Christine Zimmerman/IAIG (A)	South
	Carolyn Temple/EIG (P)	South
	Wayne Clausen/CIG (P)	South
	Alvaro Preciado/CIG (A)*	Central
Kings		
Madera	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Kevin Abernathy/EIG (P)	Central
	Jack Lemen/CIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)	North
	David Phippen/IAIG (A)	North
Stanislaus	Chris Savage/IAIG (P)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central

(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

**Arrived at 10:13 a.m.*

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR MARCH 6, 2018 – The Vice Chair, Chris Savage, asked for member comments and corrections to the draft CAC Minutes for March 6, 2018 as included in the agenda packet. Hearing none, he declared the Minutes approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None
5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None
6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Morgan Lambert, Deputy APCO, provided updates to the CAC on the following:
 - At the March 2018 Governing Board meeting, the Board consolidated and rebranded the District’s heavy-duty truck incentive programs as the “Truck Replacement Program”, adopted enhancements to the programs, and added new funding options to encourage adoption of advanced, cleaner technologies. The funding options include up to \$200,000 for zero emission trucks, up to \$150,000 for near-zero emission trucks, and up to \$100,000 for trucks with engines certified to meet the ultra-low NOx 0.02 g/bhp-hr standard. Additionally, the enhancements will allow for the replacement of model year 2010 and newer trucks with advanced, cleaner technologies, create a trade-up program for replaced 2010 and newer trucks, and create an incentive option for fleet expansions.
 - At the April 2018 Governing Board meeting, the Board will consider accepting \$1 million in state funding to implement a first-of-its-kind pilot heavy-duty truck repair incentive program. Working with reputable repair facilities, the District will provide incentives to complete emissions related repairs. The focus of the pilot program will be on small fleet owner/operators with less than 20 trucks. If successful, this pilot program may lead to additional funding for an ongoing heavy-duty truck repair incentive program.
 - Last year proved to be another good year for air quality progress in the Valley. In 2017, the Valley had the highest number of days with Good air quality across all 8 counties, the lowest 8-hour ozone design value on record, and the fewest number of days exceeding the 84 ppb 8-hour ozone standard. In addition, the Valley continued to meet the 65 µg/m³ 24-hour PM_{2.5} standard and the annual PM_{2.5} design value continued to trend downward.

Mr. Hamilton asked if natural-gas engines would be included in the Truck Replacement Program. Mr. Lambert responded affirmatively. Mr. Hamilton suggested that a natural gas retro fit could be a cost-effective option for this program. Mr. Phippen commended District staff for their comprehension of the value of the trade up program, and said as a member of the agricultural community they are running many of the older trucks that Mr. Lambert previously mentioned, and are ready to embrace the newer models as soon as they are made available through the program. Mr. Savage commented on the positive news conveyed in terms of air quality, even though it has been a very difficult year. He

asked for the point-of-contact for the Truck Replacement Program. Mr. Lambert responded that Todd DeYoung, Incentives Program Manager would be the person to contact for program information.

Public Comment: None

7. APPOINT CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE CHAIR FOR A TWO-YEAR TERM – Mr. Lambert said the City Interest Group was up in the rotation for the chairmanship of the Citizens Advisory Committee. However, he said members have not been able to elect a new Chair since January 2018 for various reasons. He reported again today, there were not enough CAC members present to hold the Chair election. He said upon review of the CAC Bylaws, District staff determined that if the CAC membership is unable to elect a new Chair for several meetings, regardless of the reason, the District's Clerk can appoint the new Chair. He said Deputy Clerk of the Boards, Ms. Franco, was present and able to appoint a new Chair at this meeting if there was a candidate from the City Interest Group present and consensus of the members present.

He said at the previous meeting it was mentioned that Jack Lemen, City Interest Group Primary representative from Merced County, had agreed to serve as the new CAC Chair for a two-year term ending in December 2019. Mr. Lemen responded that he is still willing to accept the appointment. Mr. Lambert asked if there were any concerns from members to appoint Mr. Lemen as the new CAC Chair. Hearing none, he said he would take the members' silence as consensus to appoint Mr. Lemen. On behalf of the District, Ms. Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards, appointed Mr. Lemen as new CAC Chair for a term ending on December 31, 2019.

Public Comment: None

8. APPOINT CITY INTEREST GROUP CHAIR – Mr. Lambert reminded members that each Interest Group has a Chair position, and that person serves as Vice Chair when their interest group holds the Chairmanship of the CAC. He said five affirmative votes were needed from the City Interest Group in order to appoint the new interest group Chair, and there were not enough City Interest Group members present at this meeting to hold the election. This item was tabled to a future meeting. Mr. Savage suggested that Mr. Lemen try to set up a meeting with his interest group to try to improve attendance at future meetings so they can elect a new Chair of the interest group. Mr. Lemen responded affirmatively.
9. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, provided an update on the District's planning and rule development efforts, including the 2017 PM2.5 Plan, 2017 PM10 Maintenance Plan, Rule 9510 (*Indirect Source Review*), Rule 2201 (*New and Modified Stationary Source Review*), Rule 3110 (*Air Toxics Fees*), Rule 4311 (*Flares*) and Rule 4692 (*Charbroiling*).

Public Comment: None

10. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (ARB) –
Laura Carr, ARB representative, provided a summary of select items before the ARB Board at their meeting held on March 22-23, 2018, including:

- The Board adopted the South Coast Air Quality Management District's On-Road Heavy-Duty Vehicle Incentive Measure for submission to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency as a revision to the California State Implementation Plan (SIP).
- The Board approved amendments to the California Cap on Greenhouse Gas Emissions and Market-Based Compliance Mechanisms Regulation.
- The Board approved seven research proposals developed in response to the Board-approved Fiscal Year 2017-2018 Annual Research Plan. The proposals are:
 1. "Measuring Emissions from the On-Road Vehicle Fleet in West Los Angeles," University of Denver.
 2. "Identify Outlier Makes and Models of Light-Duty Vehicles Using Remote Sensing Device Data," Eastern Research Group.
 3. "Brake and Tire Wear Emissions," Eastern Research Group.
 4. "Design and Development of an Instrument for Toxic-Metal Aerosol Real-Time Analysis (TARTA)," University of California, Davis (UCD).
 5. "Benchmarking of Post-AMMP (Alternative Manure Management Practices) Dairy Emissions and Prediction of Related Long-term Airshed Effects," UCD.
 6. "Strategies to Reduce Methane Emissions from Enteric and Lagoon Sources," UCD.
 7. "Zero-Carbon Buildings in California: A Feasibility Study," UC, Berkeley.
- The Board approved updates to the regional greenhouse gas emissions reduction targets for California's Metropolitan Planning Organizations as required by the Sustainable Communities and Climate Protection Act of 2008 (SB 375).

- The Board heard an update on implementation of the 2016 State Strategy for the State Implementation Plan (State SIP Strategy) and the South Coast Air Quality Management Plan (AQMP).
- In March 2017, the Board directed CARB staff to return within one year with concepts for an indirect source review rule (ISR) and alternatives to reduce pollution from large freight facilities. In response to the Board's direction, CARB staff identified 9 new actions (5 of which are regulatory) that will reduce emissions and community exposure to freight pollution, in addition to fulfilling commitments in the State SIP Strategy.
- The Board heard an informational update on efforts underway to implement the mandates of Assembly Bill 617 to reduce exposure in communities most impacted by air pollution. CARB's new Community Air Protection Program (CAPP) will implement a new community focused planning framework to identify impacted communities, establish criteria for community air monitoring and local emissions reduction programs, and develop strategies for reducing emissions.
- The Board approved the Funding Agricultural Replacement Measures for Emission Reductions (FARMER) Program Guidelines (Guidelines).
- The Board adopted a regulation prohibiting the use of certain high-global warming potential hydrofluorocarbons (HFC) in stationary refrigeration and foam end-uses.

Mr. Hamilton commented on the item regarding minimizing impacts from freight facilities and said it was a very extensive item on the agenda that has a lot of implications in the Valley. He said CAC members would appreciate the details on this item with regards to the proposed publication of the freight facility handbook, along with other restrictions on the construction and operation of warehouses and distribution centers in the Valley. He asked Ms. Carr to forward additional information to the Deputy Clerk of the Boards for distribution to members. Regarding the Greenhouse Gas Program, Mr. Savage asked if there was a schedule for ARB to modify the 3rd compliance period to reflect the changes needed for the free allowance program. Ms. Carr said she would forward additional information on both items to Ms. Franco for distribution to CAC members after the meeting.

Public Comment: None

11. AB 617 PRESENTATION – Heather Arias, ARB Office of Community Air Protection Branch Manager, and Vernon Hughes, ARB Office of Community Air Protection Branch Manager, provided an update on extensive efforts underway by ARB and District staff to implement the mandates of Assembly Bill 617. ARB is developing a framework to

implement the requirements of AB 617, which focuses on identifying and addressing cumulative impacts in communities through the state. As ARB works to implement the many facets of AB 617, they are currently engaged in a significant public outreach process to educate stakeholders on the requirements of the Bill as well as to solicit input to be considered in crafting the community-level framework and programs to implement the legislative mandates. Ms. Arias focused on the major milestones and program elements with upcoming deadlines including the finalization of the planning framework and the 1st year community selections. Air districts are required to submit their initial community lists to ARB by April 2018 and to finalize their community recommendations by July 2018. The ARB Board will consider adoption of the finalized planning framework and 1st year community selections in September 2018.

Mr. Clark expressed concern at the accuracy of information from proposed additional monitoring sites and how it will be utilized. He said he did not feel it is proper for ARB and EPA to rely on outdated emission inventory information. He said quality assurance of air monitoring is very important to him. He asked about additional proposed ARB measures as a result of AB 617. Ms. Arias said ARB aims to ensure that the monitoring that is taking place through the program provides accurate information and articulates the problem to be addressed in a community. She said their staff have been working with air districts and other stakeholders to develop criteria that will be used for the monitoring program, and added they would be happy to share feedback they have received with CAC members, as well as add the members' feedback.

Regarding potential new regulations, Ms. Arias clarified this statute does not change ARB's or local air districts' regulatory authority. She confirmed that ARB still has the overarching authority for mobile sources and local air districts have the authority over stationary sources and they will continue to work together to identify the best path moving forward. She said ARB is working to build in mechanisms for steering committee members so that those who live and work in these communities are at the table and can guide the process for ARB and local air districts. Mr. Lemen asked who would comprise the steering committees and how the selection of members would be made. Ms. Arias responded the community steering committees as currently proposed would be comprised of people who live and work within the community. She said ARB is currently asking that the air districts be responsible for convening these committees, for which the majority should be made up of community members, and include representatives from either the city or county depending on the location, the county public health office and maybe representatives from the area school districts.

Mr. Hamilton said there could be multiple sources contributing to the air pollution problem in a particular area, yet all of those sources could be in compliance with state and local rules and regulations individually. He asked how this situation would be addressed. Mr. Hughes responded there are land use issues that would be identified by the steering committees and are potential strategies that can be implemented to address these issues.

Mr. Savage commented that the AB 617 process is ambiguous at best and will take form and function as it moves forward. He said there is great potential for creating job “dead zones” which could force residents to drive further to get to paying jobs which then would increase vehicle miles traveled. He reiterated that CAC members would like to be kept heavily informed, if not heavily involved in how this program develops. He suggested keeping AB 617 as a standing agenda item, with brief updates from ARB as well as District staff on their progress. Mr. Lambert responded affirmatively and said staff plans to continue to have a standing item on the agenda to report on progress for AB 617. CAC members asked for a report on the District’s recommendations on the community list that will be provided to ARB and along with a discussion on the rationale for identifying those communities, at the next CAC meeting. Mr. Lambert said the District would provide a report at the next CAC meeting.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- John Haley, AERA Energy

12. REPORT ON THE CENTRAL VALLEY SUMMIT ON ALTERNATIVES TO OPEN BURNING OF AGRICULTURAL WASTE – Morgan Lambert and Jon Klassen, Program Manager, provided an update on the District’s recent Central Valley Summit on Alternatives to Open Burning of Agricultural Waste and recent Governing Board direction to build on the lessons learned at the Summit. As a part of the District’s ongoing efforts to identify and advance cleaner alternatives to the open burning of agricultural waste, on November 7th and 8th, 2017, the District held the Central Valley Summit on Alternatives to Open Burning of Agricultural Waste, which brought together a wide array of Valley growers, researchers/experts, representatives from the biomass power industry, representatives from new and developing technology vendors, and other Valley stakeholders. At the February 2018 Governing Board meeting, the Board considered the major lessons learned from the Summit and directed staff to take the following actions to continue advancing cleaner alternatives while minimizing emission impacts from agricultural burning in the short-term:

- Withhold rolling back the District’s current agricultural burning prohibitions until further work on exploring and advancing alternatives to open burning is completed.
- Continue to implement the District’s Smoke Management System safeguards to ensure no adverse air quality impact from authorized agricultural open burning.
- Explore the feasibility of utilizing air curtain burn boxes subject to the District’s Smoke Management System safeguards as an extension of agricultural operations.
- Continue to support state and federal financial assistance to biomass power industry for the disposal of agricultural waste.

- Support technology advancement for emerging cleaner alternatives to the open burning of agricultural waste, with priority given to on-the-farm deployable (minimum or no transportation related emissions) and scalable technologies.
- In assessing the feasibility of alternatives to open burning, consider the full life-cycle emissions and impact on air quality.

Mr. Phippen said he wanted to be sure that the District was looking at the life-cycle emissions when comparing open burning to the various alternatives. He wondered about the amount of emissions generated recently by chipping a 40-acre almond orchard including operating heavy equipment for several days and hauling away several truckloads of ag waste versus open burning. Mr. Lambert responded that the District undertake a life-cycle emission evaluation when comparing alternatives.

Public Comment: None

13. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Heather Heinks, Manager of the Outreach and Communications Department, reported that the District has been participating in numerous public events including Earth Day, outdoor gatherings, health fairs and employee gatherings. She said they are very busy working on the HAL Schools program, and are very excited about having deployed the first set of READ (Real-Time Electronic Air Quality Display) to Valley schools with the hope they will eventually replace the school flag program. She also reported the District is busy working on the District's Annual Report, which will be presented to the Governing Board at their April 19th meeting.

Public Comment: None

14. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS: CAC MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE CAC REPORT DURING THE GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON APRIL 19, 2018 – Mr. Williams asked if the names of alternate members could be added to the roster on the District's website. He also mentioned that a new environmental interest group alternate member and industry/agricultural interest group alternate member would need to be appointed to EJAG at a future meeting.
15. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON APRIL 19, 2018 – Mr. Lemen and Mr. Savage said they were unable to present the report on April 19, 2018. Mr. Savage said he would coordinate with Mr. Cunha and staff to identify someone to present the report.

Meeting adjourned at 12:02 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on May 1, 2018. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.