

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

February 6, 2018
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting but not to take action.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
Kern	Jenifer Pitcher/IAIG (A)	South
Kings	Alene Taylor/EIG (A)	Central
	Alvaro Preciado/CIG (A)	Central
Madera	Don Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Kevin Abernathy/EIG (P)	North
	Jack Lemen/CIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	Shivaughn Alves/EIG (P)	North
	Richard O'Brien/CIG (A)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
	Greg Gomez/CIG (A)	Central

(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

District Staff Present in Central Region Office (Fresno) – Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO; Dave Warner, Deputy APCO; Sheraz Gill, Director of Strategies and Incentives, Jon Klassen, Program Manager, Chay Thao, Program Manager, Alex Krivobok, Network Systems Analyst II; Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards

District Staff Present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Ann Marie Collins, Office Services Manager

District Staff Present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Christal Martinez, Office Services Manager; Leonard Scandura, Permit Services Manager

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR DECEMBER 5, 2017 – The Chair, Manuel Cunha asked for member comments and corrections to the draft CAC Minutes for December 5, 2017 as included in the agenda packet. Hearing none, he declared the Minutes were approved as written.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None
5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None
6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO, provided updates to the CAC on the following:
 - At the January 2018 Governing Board meeting, there was extensive discussion regarding the District's Real-time Air Advisory Network (RAAN) and other public outreach tools used to provide the public with timely air quality information and the ability to use this information to take protective actions as necessary. Furthermore, at the upcoming February 2018 Governing Board meeting, the District will be recommending the launch a new public outreach campaign to further educate Valley residents about the District's RAAN system and the upcoming enhancements to the system which will provide neighborhood-by-neighborhood level air quality information to the public.
 - Changes approved by the Governing Board at the January 2018 meeting to enhance the Burn Cleaner incentive program and Check Before You Burn Outreach efforts in response to findings from the recent Residential Wood Burning Survey.
 - At the January 2018 meeting, the Governing Board accepted the Government Finance Officers' Association of the United States and Canada Certificate of Achievement for Excellence in Financial Reporting for the District's Comprehensive Annual Financial Report for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2016.
 - At the upcoming February 2018 Governing Board meeting, the Board will consider the District resources necessary to meet the mandates of AB 617 along with the hundreds of millions of dollars in new incentive funding coming to the District as a result of the extension of the state's Cap and Trade program.
 - The Central Valley Summit on Alternatives to Open Burning of Agricultural Waste was hosted by the District in Parlier, CA on November 7th and 8th of 2017. At the February 2018 Board meeting, the Governing Board will receive an update on the Summit as well as consider recommendations built on the lessons learned

from the Summit to continue to advance the development of alternatives to the open burning of agricultural waste.

Mr. Gomez asked about the District's multilingual outreach materials. Mr. Sheikh said District staff have recently expanded the air quality information available in other languages by making information on the District's RAAN program available in Spanish. Mr. Williams suggested discussing the District's enhancements to its RAAN program at the next Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) meeting. Mr. Sheikh responded affirmatively. Mr. Smith urged Mr. Sheikh to have staff examine the role that CAC members could play in the implementation of AB 617. Mr. Cunha voiced appreciation for the concerns of the rural communities in the Valley and said District staff have done an excellent job of addressing them. Regarding implementation of AB 617, he said he looked forward to seeing the rural communities receiving the much-needed funding. In addition, he congratulated District staff and the Governing Board on receiving the award from the Government Finance Officers' Association.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, provided an update on the District's planning and rule development efforts, including the 2017 PM2.5 Plan, 2017 PM10 Maintenance Plan, Rule 9510 (*Indirect Source Review*), Rule 2201 (*New and Modified Stationary Source Review*), Rule 3110 (*Air Toxics Fees*), Rule 4311 (*Flares*) and Rule 4692 (*Charbroiling*).

Public Comment: None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (ARB) – Laura Carr, ARB representative, provided a summary of select items before the ARB Board at their December 14, 2017 meeting, including:

- The Board heard an informational update regarding the status of the next round of regional greenhouse gas per capita reduction targets for California's Metropolitan Planning Organizations as required by the Sustainable Communities and Climate Protection Act of 2008 (Senate Bill 375).
- The Board approved the 2017 Climate Change Scoping Plan Update along with the related Environmental Analysis and written responses to comments received on the Environmental Analysis. The update described the State's strategy for achieving California's 2030 greenhouse gas target of 40 percent reductions from 1990 levels pursuant to Senate Bill 32.
- The Board approved the Proposed Fiscal Year 2017-18 Funding Plan for Clean Transportation Incentives (Funding Plan). The Funding Plan describes investments from four related funding sources: the Low Carbon Transportation

Program funded with Cap-and-Trade auction proceeds; the Air Quality Improvement Program; the one-time Volkswagen settlement funding for zero-emission vehicle aspects of vehicle replacement programs; and the one-time funding for Zero/Near Zero Emission Warehouse Program. These programs provide incentives for clean vehicle and equipment projects to reduce greenhouse gas, criteria pollutant and toxic emissions with a priority on benefitting disadvantaged and low-income communities and households.

Mr. Cunha said there are still tremendous problems with truck registration at ARB and said many farmers and others are currently unable to register their trucks, which could be a deterrent for their participation in future incentive funding programs. He asked for this issue to be addressed at a future CAC meeting.

Public Comments: None

9. AB 617 PRESENTATION – Vernon Hughes and Heather Arias from the Air Resources Board (ARB) presented on the requirements of AB 617, which focuses on identifying and addressing cumulative impacts in communities throughout the state. As ARB works to implement the many facets of AB 617, they are currently engaged in a public outreach process to educate stakeholders on the requirements of the Bill as well as to solicit input to be considered in crafting the community-level framework and programs to implement the legislative mandates. AB 617 requires new community level monitoring, identification and application of Best Available Retrofit Control Technology on certain stationary sources, an enhanced emissions inventory reporting framework, an identification of disproportionately impacted communities, and the development and implementation of community emission reduction programs within those communities. Throughout the implementation of AB 617, extensive coordination will be necessary between ARB, the District, local businesses and communities through the Valley.

Mr. Sheikh added the District has created a webpage dedicated to AB 617 information at www.valleyair.org/community that includes a wealth of information. He announced that a public workshop would be held on February 20, 2018 at 6pm, which will focus on early emission reduction opportunities through incentive programs. He said a meeting on February 27, 2018 would take place in Bakersfield and asked ARB staff if the meeting would be webcast for those who could not attend. Ms. Arias responded that a webcast would not be possible as it will be an all-day event with numerous breakout sessions. She said ARB chose the Bakersfield location because the last meeting was held in Fresno, and they wanted to ensure that Valley residents in all areas had the opportunity to participate. She said ARB is planning additional future workshops and welcomes input on meeting locations. She said once the Community Air Protection Program Framework Concept Paper is released, there will be opportunities for one-on-one meetings with stakeholders. Mr. Sheikh added the District would be hosting an evening workshop on March 6, 2018 in Fresno, with the Modesto and Bakersfield offices participating via VTC. He said this item would also be discussed by EJAG at

their next meeting on February 22nd. In addition, Mr. Sheikh suggested that ARB representatives provide a presentation or documentation for AB 617 updates at future meetings to help members keep track of dates and information.

Mr. O'Brien asked how AB 617 would impact the sustainable communities that all metropolitan planning organizations (MPOs) are updating right now with SB 375. Ms. Arias responded that ARB does not anticipate any conflicts in those updates. She said all applicable planning documents would be reviewed, including the sustainable plans and then determinations made as to building blocks moving forward. Mr. Hughes said ARB has a new department called the Office of Community Air Protection (OCAP), of which Karen Magliano is the Director and he and Ms. Arias are Branch Chiefs. He said AB 617 will be integrated into programs across the agency and they have been coordinating with their planning folks who oversee SB 375. Mr. O'Brien said he is concerned about conflicts down the road due to a disconnect between the mandates of AB 617 and SB 375. Mr. Hughes said ARB is recommending that air districts and stakeholders work closely with Councils of Governments (COGs) and MPOs to integrate AB 617 successfully. Mr. Cunha reiterated the need for ARB to carefully coordinate with stakeholders, COGs and MPOs on implementation.

Ms. Alves requested to have an AB 617 summit scheduled in the Northern Region. Ms. Arias said they are working closely with the District and their consultation group to schedule meetings and she would pass along Ms. Alves request. Ms. Taylor asked if the additional air monitoring required by AB 617 would utilize existing equipment. Mr. Hughes responded that there are a couple of elements to the monitoring plan, including assessing the type of equipment available and the appropriateness of that equipment for monitoring certain chemicals and air quality issues in a community. Ms. Arias added there is also an assessment of current air monitoring networks in place and it is designed to build upon not to circumvent any of the existing regulatory systems. She said part of the question is to decide if additional monitoring is necessary in these communities.

10. PROCESS USED IN ASSESSING DISTRICT COSTS AND REVENUES – Dave Warner, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, provided a presentation on the process used by the District to assess District costs and revenues. He reported that this process is critical to maintaining the District's focus on streamlining and efficiency efforts, as well as identifying on an ongoing basis any developing imbalances in costs versus revenues. The process consists of several steps:

- Estimate workload for existing mandates
- Estimate workload for foreseeable new mandates
- Estimate cost savings achievable through streamlining and efficiency
- Prepare services, supplies, and fixed assets costs
- Employ zero-based budgeting to ensure execution of all mandates at the lowest cost possible

- Estimate revenues - existing fees, other sources
- Hold public workshops if fee adjustments are necessary, prior to presentation to Governing Board

Mr. Warner reported that this process was used recently to identify several streamlining opportunities in the District's implementation of the state Air Toxics Hot Spots program. Subsequent implementation of these efficiency efforts led to significantly reduced costs and the Governing Board adopted a sizeable fee reduction for facilities subject to that program.

Mr. Warner also discussed a number of mandates and essential work performed by the District and presented a long list of streamlining and efficiency measures implemented by the District to reduce the costs of implementing the related workload, and to maintain the lowest fees of any of the large air districts.

The District's efficiency and fiscal management has been lauded by many independent audits, confirming the efficacy of the District's streamlining and efficiency efforts and resulting low permit fees, as well as its overall transparency and excellence in exercising its fiduciary responsibilities. Mr. Warner reported that the District has identified in their early budgeting for Fiscal Year 2018/19 a potential imbalance between revenues and costs of about \$2.9 million. Based on the District's experience with its zero-based budgeting process, as much as 50% of this imbalance is expected to be mitigated by further streamlining and efficiency efforts, leaving a projected imbalance of approximately \$1.45 million. District staff will be presenting in a public workshop on February 6th a proposed two-phased increase of most District fees. Specifically, the proposal is to increase most fees by 4.8% in 2018/19 and by 4.6% in 2019/20. After these increases, Mr. Warner reported, the District's fees will still be far lower than other large air districts.

Public Comment: None

11. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – This item was tabled to the next meeting.
12. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS: CAC MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE CAC REPORT DURING THE GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON FEBRUARY 15, 2018 – Mr. O'Brien commented that he believes that it will be more difficult to implement unfunded mandates and fee increases in the future. Mr. Smith asked if the District would be responding to the potential impacts from fertilization of soils through agricultural practices. Mr. Sheikh responded that it is important to look at individual research projects in the context of the greater body of research done and the study's conclusion that further research is warranted. He said the District has always supported sound research and science, and staff will be looking into the study results further.

13. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON FEBRUARY 15, 2018 – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report at the February 15th meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:13 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on March 6, 2018. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.