

Action Summary Minutes  
**San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District**

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**March 6, 2018**  
**10:00 a.m.**

*The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.*

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:10 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold a meeting and to take action.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)	South
	Jenifer Pitcher/IAIG (A)	South
	Carolyn Temple/EIG (P)	South
	Wayne Clausen/CIG (P)	South
	Kings	Kelly Deming/EIG (P)
Madera	Alvaro Preciado/CIG (A)*	Central
	Don Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
Merced	Kevin Abernathy/EIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	David Phippen/IAIG (A)	North
Stanislaus	Richard O'Brien/CIG (A)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
	Greg Gomez/CIG (A)	Central

*(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group*

*\*Arrived at 10:10 a.m.*

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 6, 2018 – The Chair, Manuel Cunha asked for member comments and corrections to the draft CAC Minutes for February 6, 2018 as included in the agenda packet. Hearing none, he declared the Minutes approved as written.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None
5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None
6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO, provided updates to the CAC on the following:
  - At the February 2018 Governing Board meeting, the Board accepted \$108 million in state Funding Agricultural Replacement Measures for Emissions Reductions (FARMER) incentive funding and approved appropriations for staffing, support services, and equipment for administration of hundreds of millions in new incentive funding and implementation of AB 617 mandates.
  - At the February 2018 Governing Board meeting, the Board approved a new comprehensive, multilingual public education and outreach campaign to further educate Valley residents about the District’s RAAN system and the upcoming enhancements to the system which will provide neighborhood-level air quality information to the public. The District’s Real-time Air Advisory Network (RAAN) and other public outreach tools that are used to provide the public with timely air quality information and use this information to take protective actions as necessary. The goal of this outreach campaign is to produce a quantifiable increase in the number of RAAN users. The campaign will run during March, April, and May of 2018.
  - The District has been hosting a number of public meetings to engage Valley residents and businesses regarding AB 617. On the evening on March 6, 2018, the District will be holding a public workshop to solicit input on AB 617 implementation and the District’s Community Engagement and Protection Program.

Regarding AB 617, Mr. Cunha said that community outreach to rural communities will be critical and both Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) and CAC members will need to take an active role. He gave kudos to District staff for asking Air Resources Board staff to be more involved in these outreach efforts and to coordinate with local efforts to ensure these funds reach environmental justice communities. He also thanked Karen Magliano, Chief of the Office of Community Air Protection at the Air Resources Board (ARB), for working closely with the District on this important endeavor.

Public Comment: None

7. APPOINT CAC REPRESENTATIVES TO THE ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP – Mr. Sheikh said there were several vacant CAC positions on EJAG, including the Industry/Agriculture Interest Group Primary member seat formerly held by Dustin Ference, whose term ended earlier this year as well as an Alternate seat. Mr. Williams asked if any other Industry/Agriculture members were interested in serving in either role. Hearing none, he made a motion to reappoint Mr. Ference to EJAG, as

the CAC Industry/Agriculture Interest Group Primary member, and to appoint Greg Gomez, as CAC City Interest Group Alternate member, to the District's Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG).

Public Comment: None

*Moved:* Williams  
*Seconded:* Deming  
*Ayes:* Cunha, Clark, Horal, Phippen, Williams, Temple, Deming,  
Abernathy, Clausen, Preciado, O'Brien, Gomez  
*Nays:* None

***Motion unanimously carried to reappoint Dustin FERENCE, Industry/Agriculture Interest Group Primary member and appoint Greg Gomez, City Interest Group Alternate member to the District's Environmental Justice Advisory Group***

8. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, provided an update on the District's planning and rule development efforts, including the 2017 PM2.5 Plan, 2017 PM10 Maintenance Plan, Rule 9510 (*Indirect Source Review*), Rule 2201 (*New and Modified Stationary Source Review*), Rule 3110 (*Air Toxics Fees*), Rule 4311 (*Flares*) and Rule 4692 (*Charbroiling*).

Mr. Sheikh added that staff recently submitted an attainment request to EPA and ARB for the 1997 24-hour PM2.5 standard. Mr. Clark asked about the potential fee increase and expressed concern about how small businesses would be able to afford higher fees. Mr. Sheikh responded that the District appreciates the concerns raised by Mr. Clark, and that District staff conducts a careful evaluation of the actual costs of administering its programs each year in its zero-based budgeting process. Mr. Sheikh additionally responded that the District is continuing to evaluate whether a fee increase will be necessary.

Mr. Cunha asked if the administrative funds included in the District's incentive funding streams were sufficient to cover the costs of administering those programs. Mr. Sheikh responded that the new grant funding for the emission reduction incentive projects does come with sufficient funding to administer those programs. He said there is other funding that came with the Cap and Trade legislative package that will help cover the costs of some of the other work that goes into AB 617 including the required Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT) evaluations and monitoring, along with community evaluations. Mr. Sheikh further responded that the District would start off with a measured approach of filling positions first with temporary positions and as mandates are understood. Mr. Cunha said the District spends its incentive funds very efficiently and it is important that there is ongoing communication with CAC members regarding resources and fees.

Public Comment: None

9. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (ARB) – Elizabeth Melgoza, ARB representative, provided a summary of select items before the Air Resources Board at their February 8, 2018 meeting, including:

- The Board adopted amendments to the regulations designating areas of California as attainment, nonattainment, nonattainment-transitional, or unclassified for pollutants with state ambient air quality standards. Based on 2014 to 2016 air quality data, a total of seven changes to area designations were approved for State ozone, PM<sub>2.5</sub> and PM<sub>10</sub> standards.
- February 8, 2018 marked the 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the first Air Resources Board hearing. For this anniversary, the Board heard a retrospective presentation reviewing five decades of achievements improving air quality, public health, economic benefits, and environmental justice.
- The Board presented David Hawkins, Congressman Henry Waxman, Professor Mario Molina, Governor Arnold Schwarzenegger, and Professor Gina McCarthy with Haagen-Smit Legacy Awards in recognition of their significant contributions to meeting air quality and climate goals in California and beyond.
- The Board approved the California Phase 2 Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Emissions Standards and amendments to the Tractor-Trailer GHG regulation.
- Executive Officer Richard Corey provided the Board with an overview of California Air Resources Board priorities for 2018.

Mr. O'Brien asked about the outcome of the Cap and Trade changes at the workshop held on March 2<sup>nd</sup>. Ms. Melgoza said she would send the information after the meeting for distribution to CAC members. Mr. Abernathy asked about the premature deaths avoided number shown in a slide from ARB's 50-Year Air Quality Trends and Health Benefits Presentation. Ms. Melgoza said she would send that information after the meeting as well.

Public Comment: None

10. AB 617 PRESENTATION – Ms. Magliano gave a presentation to CAC members on the framework ARB is developing to implement the requirements of AB 617, which focuses on identifying and addressing cumulative impacts in communities throughout the state. As ARB works to implement the many facets of AB 617, they are currently engaged in a significant public outreach process to educate stakeholders on the requirements of the Bill as well as to solicit input to be considered in crafting the community-level framework and programs to implement the legislative mandates. Ms. Magliano discussed the major milestones and program elements being considered in addressing the new community level monitoring, identification and application of Best Available Retrofit Control Technology on certain stationary sources, enhancement of emissions inventory

reporting framework, identification of disproportionately impacted communities, and the development and implementation of community emission reduction programs within those communities required by AB 617.

Mr. Cunha said he hoped to see incentive funding available soon in the Valley. Mr. Sheikh said the District and ARB are working quickly to hold workshops, meetings, and other events to engage the community and solicit ideas regarding these new incentive funds and hope to start spending these funds soon. Ms. Magliano said ARB has gotten the grant agreements out to the air districts, which is a good first step along with the initial outreach events. Mr. Sheikh thanked Ms. Magliano for presenting in person at this meeting and her commitment to keeping CAC members informed on AB 617.

Mr. Clark voiced appreciation for Ms. Magliano's attendance and presentation at the meeting. He asked about the community air monitoring requirements under AB 617. Ms. Magliano responded that the legislation directs air districts to develop these community air monitoring programs and said there is also an important role for community-led efforts. She said AB 617 is really laying out how to design and implement a robust monitoring program that can lead to data that helps answer the questions behind the monitoring. Mr. Sheikh added that ARB is drafting the framework to outline what the monitoring plan would look like. He said the District's monitoring plan is to have a very science-based, flexible approach that is tailored to the needs in a specific community.

While excited about the new incentive programs, Mr. Williams voiced concern that ARB may try to regulate land use or limit the number of automobiles on the road as a result of AB 617. Ms. Magliano responded that land-use tools are listed on the ARB website under "Resource Center" as they have been previously deemed to be effective in some situations, but they are not mandated under AB 617. Mr. Preciado emphasized the importance of conducting outreach in the Valley's rural communities. Mr. Gomez voiced appreciation for the planning tools in ARB's "Resource Center", and said his community's planner is very proactive and believes in walkable communities and said it is unfortunate that many other communities do not have similar access.

Mr. Abernathy said he would like to see part of this effort directed towards shifting residents away from their current situation of living in a disadvantaged community. He voiced concern at the high cost of developing a PM Plan to meet the standards versus the low amount of available funding. He also said a key component of AB 617 must be teaching residents about the small things they can do every day to make a difference. Mr. Cunha said the partnership between ARB and the District is the most important aspect in the success of AB 617. He commended Ms. Holt and the District's Outreach and Communications team for getting the word out to rural communities and suggested ARB utilize many tools available and think outside of the box in order to get funding to those communities as early as possible.

Public Comment: None

11. REPORT ON THE CENTRAL VALLEY SUMMIT ON ALTERNATIVES TO OPEN BURNING OF AGRICULTURAL WASTE – This item was tabled to the next meeting.

Public Comment: None

12. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, reported that District staff would be participating in various Earth Day events and AB 617 workshops across the Valley. She also reminded members that Kids Calendars were still available in all three regional offices.
13. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS: CAC MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE CAC REPORT DURING THE GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON MARCH 15, 2018 – Mr. Williams announced that the EJAG Grants Committee did pass its Recommendations for the grants funds which were approved in the EJAG's general meeting and given to the District.
14. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON MARCH 15, 2018 – Mr. Cunha said he would be out of town on March 15<sup>th</sup>, and asked staff to contact Mr. Savage and Mr. Lemen to inquire about their availability to deliver the CAC report at the next Governing Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:03 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next meeting is scheduled on April 3, 2018. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.