

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

October 2, 2018
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – Jack Lemen, CAC Chair, called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting and to take action.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Chris McGlothlin/IAIG (A)	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)	South
Kings	Dustin Ference/IAIG (P)	Central
	Kelly Deming/EIG (P)	Central
	Tim Parcel/IAIG (A)	Central
	Alvaro Preciado/CIG (A)*	Central
	Donald Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
Madera	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
	Jack Lemen/CIG (P)	Central
Merced	Kevin Abernathy/EIG (P)	North
	Ned Leiba/EIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Richard O'Brien/CIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
Tulare	Greg Gomez/CIG (A)	Central

(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

**Arrived at 10:18 a.m.*

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR AUGUST 7, 2018 – The Chair asked for member comments and corrections to the draft CAC Minutes for August 7, 2018. Hearing none, he declared the Minutes approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, provided CAC members with a recap of the key items from the 2018 Governing Board Study Session in September, including:

- Assessment of renewed engagement with schools through Healthy Air Living Schools Program and pilot project to deploy Real-time Electronic Air Quality Displays (READs)
- Review and reaffirmation of the District's economic analysis procedures and guidelines that are used when evaluating new or amended regulations
- Collaboration with land management agencies to reduce the frequency and scale of wildfires through increased forest management and fuel reduction efforts, including prescribed burning, in light of increased attention and new tools at the state and federal level
- Progress report on the District's Drive Clean in the San Joaquin program including a demonstration on the new online vehicle replacement portal
- Adoption of guiding principles to direct District staff on the creation of steering committees under AB 617 to ensure opportunities for engagement are inclusive of all community stakeholders
- Report on the implementation of the District's low-cost sensor action plan adopted by the Governing Board in October 2017 to facilitate good citizen science through the education of the public on the limitations and capabilities of different sensor technologies
- Adoption of policy positions for prioritizing near-term air quality and public health benefits through the deployment of near-zero and zero emission technologies, where technologically and economically feasible, as expeditiously as possible
- Report on efforts to increase Kern County interest and participation in District voluntary incentive programs and direction to pursue potential new options for enhancing the incentive program participation in Kern County
- Progress report on the District's implementation of the state oil and gas methane regulation

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, provided an update on the District's planning and rule development efforts, including the PM2.5 Plan, PM10 Maintenance Plan, Rule 9510 (*Indirect Source Review*), Rule 2201 (*New and Modified Stationary Source Review*), Rule 4311 (*Flares*), Rule 4692 (*Charbroiling*), and Rule 4905 (*Natural Gas-Fired, Fan-Type Central Furnaces*).

Public Comment: None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD - Laura Carr, CARB representative, provided a summary of select items before the California Air Resources Board at their meeting held on September 27 and 28, 2018, including:

- The Board approved the program requirements to implement community monitoring, community emission reduction programs, and community selection guidelines contained in the proposed Community Air Protection Blueprint for implementing AB 617.
- The Board adopted amendments to the Low Carbon Fuel Standard regulation to extend it through 2030. The Board also adopted amendments to the Alternative Diesel Fuels regulation based on a supplemental environmental analysis related to the mitigation of NOx emission increases caused by the regulation.
- The Board considered the new proposed Innovative Clean Transit (ICT) Regulation that would require California transit agencies to gradually transition their buses to zero-emission technologies while enhancing services.

Public Comment: None

9. UPDATE ON PM2.5 ATTAINMENT STRATEGY - Sheraz Gill, Deputy APCO, provided an update on the status of the District's PM2.5 planning efforts. For the past three years, the District and the California Air Resources Board have led an extensive public process to develop an attainment strategy to address multiple federal PM2.5 standards. This public process has included multiple workshops and public meetings, Public Advisory Workgroup meetings, and regular discussions at Citizens' Advisory Committee and Environmental Justice Advisory Group meetings. He said through the public engagement process, the District and CARB have identified a comprehensive list of potential new regulatory and incentive-based measures to achieve significant emissions reductions from both stationary and mobile sources. Modeling conducted by CARB as part of the planning process demonstrates that the Valley will attain all three PM2.5 standards by their respective deadlines. The District posted the draft plan for public review on August 31, 2018. The District and CARB are working to finalize the remaining elements of the plan prior to posting the final draft of the plan for public comment ahead of the November 2018 Governing Board meeting where the plan is scheduled to be considered for adoption.

Mr. Clark asked about concerns raised by Professor Engstrom in a letter distributed to CAC members that related to the science behind the health effects of PM2.5, which are the foundation for the establishment of the air quality standards by EPA. Mr. Sheikh said the District is obligated to meet the health-based standards as established by EPA and the requirements of the federal Clean Air Act. He said if the federal requirements are not met, the Valley would face sanctions and the potential for loss of local control through the imposition of a federal implementation plan. He added that the concerns

raised by Professor Engstrom in no way impact these mandates or the purview of the District and are better targeted to the scientific review process utilized by EPA is establish federal health-based standards.

Mr. Leiba commented that CAC members should celebrate the successes of the District, its remarkable work bringing down PM2.5 numbers, noting an 80 to 90 percent reduction in emissions. He said he would like to see studies that show the health effects of reducing PM2.5. He said it was important for members to understand the costs and benefits of these measures to ensure these plans are cost efficient. He said he would love to see some solutions that involved the planting and maintenance of trees as studies have shown trees are beneficial to reducing PM2.5 emissions. He suggested encouraging the District to hear Professor Engstrom's and others' concerns regarding the health effects of PM2.5. Mr. Lieba said that he does not think he is ready to support the plan as he does not know enough yet to say if this is the best plan. He suggested appointing an Ad Hoc Subcommittee to review the draft plan in more detail and report-back to members at a future meeting prior to taking action.

Mr. McGlothlin agreed this is a time to celebrate, as it has been a very long public process over the last several years, including 15 public outreach meetings and workshops to give community members plenty of opportunities to speak out on specific issues outlined in staff presentations. More specifically, he said the agricultural industry was grateful for the District's incentive programs including those for heavy-duty trucks, all-terrain vehicles, and agricultural tractor upgrades. He added that he understood that funding would be a critical piece moving forward and said the agricultural industry was committed to keep working with the District to help turn over and increase the number of clean emission vehicles.

Mr. Smith clarified the next public hearing would be when the proposed plan is presented to the Governing Board for adoption on November 15, 2018. He voiced concern that staff would not be able to incorporate comments made by CAC members after the proposed plan is published in October for adoption in November. Mr. Sheikh reiterated that there have been many opportunities for the public to provide input during plan development over the last several years. He said staff continues to receive feedback on proposed measures and do their best to incorporate suggestions. He said public comment deadlines are required so that staff has adequate time to absorb that feedback and possibly incorporate into the draft plan.

Mr. Horal said he was not comfortable voting on the plan at today's meeting.

Mr. Gomez stated that he did not believe it is in the CAC's jurisdiction to question the science behind the establishment of the federal standards, but is to provide recommendations to the Governing Board on these plans as they are considered for adoption.

Mr. Abernathy said EPA has promulgated the standards and it is CAC members' responsibility to simply review the proposed plan and vote to support or not support it.

Mr. Sheikh said there was a Public Advisory Workgroup formed by the Governing Board, which included several CAC members that worked with staff on the development of this plan and had numerous discussions on PM2.5, the science behind it and health effects of it. He recognized the suggestions raised by Mr. Leiba with respect to including scientific references in the plan and clarified that cost-effectiveness is one of the District's Core Values and central to the way staff designed the plan. Most of the District's measures are recognized for being cost-effective and when staff designs regulatory measures, they only pursue cost-effective ones.

Mr. Sheikh added that CAC members could vote to support, not support or request more information on the plan before they take a position. He reminded that timing is of the essence as staff is working on bringing the plan for Board consideration at the November 15th Board meeting. He also asked members if they had specific concerns about any measures in the draft plan besides the science behind it and questioning the health effects of PM2.5.

Mr. Williams said he felt the majority of CAC members were not ready to make a decision whether to support the plan. Mr. Smith suggested an ad hoc subcommittee could be formed to review the draft plan and report back to members at a future meeting.

Mr. Sheikh responded that the CAC is normally dark in November, but staff would be happy to facilitate a meeting in November if they would like to meet to consider action on the plan. He agreed with Mr. Smith's suggestion to form a subcommittee to review the draft plan and report back to CAC members at a potential November 6th meeting. Mr. Smith said even if CAC members were to come up with suggestions on the plan, it would be too late to make changes to the plan before the planned public hearing November 15, 2018. Mr. Sheikh responded there was ample time for CAC members to take a position on the plan and have their feedback considered by the Governing Board before the hearing.

Mr. Leiba made a motion to establish a subcommittee to develop recommendations on the draft PM2.5 plan posted on August 31, 2018 and report back to CAC members at a November meeting. Ms. Deming seconded the motion.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Leiba
Seconded: Deming
Ayes: McGlothlin, Clark, Horal, Williams, Deming, Smith,
Leiba, Preciado, Lemen, O'Brien
Nays: Ference, Abernathy, Gomez

Motion carried 10-3 to establish a subcommittee to develop recommendations on the draft PM2.5 Plan posted on August 31, 2018 and report back to CAC members at a November meeting.

Mr. Lemen asked for volunteers for the subcommittee. Mr. Abernathy, Ms. Deming, Mr. Smith and Mr. Williams volunteered. Mr. Sheikh said he would reach out to members of the Public Advisory Workgroup who were also Public Advisory Workgroup members, including Mr. Cunha, Mr. Hamilton, and Mr. Hoffdahl to ask them to serve on the subcommittee.

10. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATE – This item was tabled to the next meeting.
11. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Maricela Velasquez, Senior Outreach and Communications Representative, provided an update on current outreach activities at the District. She reported the District is continuing its efforts to increase Healthy Air Living Schools Program participation and distributed an additional 20 READ (Real-Time Electronic Air Quality Displays) throughout the Valley. Ms. Velasquez reminded CAC members that the District's Check Before You Burn program will once again begin on November 1st and run through the end of February. Lastly, the District is accepting artwork for the Healthy Air Living Kids Calendar for one more week.

Public Comment: None

12. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS: CAC MEMBER SUGGESTIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION OF THE CAC REPORT DURING THE GOVERNING BOARD MEETING ON OCTOBER 18, 2018 – None
13. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Lemen volunteered to present the report. Mr. Sheikh said Mr. Cunha also volunteered to present the report at the meeting, if Mr. Lemen was unable to make it.

Meeting adjourned at 12:10 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next CAC meeting is scheduled on November 6, 2018. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.