

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

February 5, 2019
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Jack Lemen, called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting and to take action.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton**	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)	South
	Carolyn Temple/EIG (P)	South
	Wayne Clausen/CIG (P)	South
Kings	Tim Parcel/IAIG (A)	Central
	Kelly Deming/EIG (P)	Central
Madera	Don Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Kevin Abernathy/EIG (P)***	North
	Jack Lemen/CIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)	North
	David Phippen/IAIG (A)	North
	Ned Leiba/EIG (P)	North
	Valeria Sanabia/EIG (A)*	North
	Chris Savage/IAIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	Suzanne Bauer/IAIG (A)	North
	Richard O'Brien/CIG (P)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
	Greg Gomez/CIG (P)	Central

(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

**Arrived at 10:06 a.m.*

***Arrived at 10:11 a.m.*

****Arrived at 10:30 a.m.*

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR DECEMBER 4, 2018 – Chairman Lemen asked for comments or corrections on the draft Minutes for December 4, 2018. Hearing none, he declared the Minutes approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Mr. Lambert provided CAC members with a summary of the following items:

- On January 24, 2019, the Air Resources Board unanimously adopted the District's 2018 Plan for the 1997, 2006, and 2012 federal PM2.5 Standards that was adopted by the District Governing Board in November of 2018. The Plan will now be forwarded to the federal EPA for their consideration.
- The District Governing Board approved \$5,000,000 in funding for the implementation of a new incentive program to replace older, high-polluting emergency vehicles in the San Joaquin Valley.
- During the 2018 ozone season the Valley experienced record improvements across several key metrics including the number of days exceeding the 8-hour ozone standards despite the unprecedented wildfire impacts.

Given additional incentive funding called for in the 2018 PM2.5 Plan, Mr. Cunha suggested the CAC should send a letter in support of increasing the allocations of funding in key incentive programs such as FARMER in the Governor's draft budget. Mr. Lambert suggested staff could work on a draft letter and bring this back as an item on the March agenda for the CAC to consider. Chairman Lemen said he would add this item to the next CAC meeting agenda.

Mr. Hamilton said he wanted to reinforce Mr. Cunha's statement that getting this funding would require all interest groups to work together to advocate for the needs of the Valley. He added the Valley's needs should be brought to the new Governor's attention to help him understand that these funds will help protect the health of children in the San Joaquin Valley. He said the Valley's environmental justice advocates are ready to partner with the District and other Valley stakeholders in these efforts.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, provided an update on the District’s planning and rule development efforts.

Public Comment - None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD - Laura Carr, CARB representative, provided a summary of select items before the California Air Resources Board at their meeting held on January 24, 2019.

Mr. Leiba asked for clarification regarding a statement ARB make in a press release announcing the approval of the District’s 2018 PM2.5 Plan. In the press release, ARB stated that PM2.5 exposure is responsible 1,200 cases of premature death in the Valley each year. Mr. Leiba asked for the source of this information. Ms. Carr said she would send the citation to members at a later date.

Mr. O’Brien asked Ms. Carr about the status of ARB approval of the 2018 Sustainable Communities Strategy plans for the Valley’s eight Metropolitan Planning Organizations. Ms. Carr said she would follow-up with the information at a later date.

Public Comment - None

9. APPOINT INDUSTRY/AGRICULTURE INTEREST GROUP REPRESENTATIVE AND REAPPOINT ENVIRONMENTAL AND CITY INTEREST GROUP REPRESENTATIVES TO THE ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP (EJAG) – Mr. Lambert said the District’s Environmental Justice Strategy establishes the Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) to serve in an advisory role and provide advice, direction, and critique to the District concerning its continuing efforts to advance environmental justice in the San Joaquin Valley. The Environmental Justice Strategy sets the membership of EJAG at 13 members, which includes three members from the CAC, one representing each of the three CAC interest groups.

After consideration, the committee recommended that the Governing Board appoint Tim Parcel as the CAC Industry/Agriculture Interest Group Primary Representative, Lee Smith as the CAC Environmental Interest Group Alternate Representative, Manuel Cunha as the CAC Industry/Agriculture Interest Group Alternate Representative, and Greg Gomez as the CAC City Interest Group Alternate Representative. The committee also recommended that the Governing Board reappoint Kevin Hamilton as the CAC Environmental Interest Group Primary Representative and Jack Lemen as the CAC City Interest Group Primary Representative.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Williams
Seconded: Cunha
Ayes: Cunha, Clark, Parcel, Horal, Hoffdahl, Savage, Williams,
Hamilton, Temple, Deming, Smith, Leiba, Clausen, Lemen,
O'Brien, Gomez
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to recommend that the Governing Board appoint Tim Parcel as the CAC Industry/Agriculture Interest Group Primary Representative, Lee Smith as the CAC Environmental Interest Group Alternate Representative, Manuel Cunha as the CAC Industry/Agriculture Interest Group Alternate Representative, and Greg Gomez as the CAC City Interest Group Alternate Representative. In addition the committee recommends the Governing Board reappoint Kevin Hamilton as the CAC Environmental Interest Group Primary Representative and Jack Lemen as the CAC City Interest Group Primary Representative

10. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATE –Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, provided an update on the District’s activities related to AB 617 implementation. In September 2018, CARB finalized their selection of 10 communities statewide, including the communities of South Central Fresno and the City of Shafter in the Valley, for first year implementation of AB 617 community emission reduction and monitoring programs. Consistent with the requirements of AB 617, the District has appointed steering committees for the two selected communities, and the committees have been meeting over the past few months. Working with the steering committees, the District must implement community air monitoring plans by July 1, 2019, and adopt community emission reduction programs by October 1, 2019. In addition to community monitoring and emission reduction program requirements, he provided an update on the District’s ongoing AB 617 Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT) efforts, including the December 2018 adoption of the expedited BARCT implementation schedule required under AB 617.

Mr. Smith asked if the District would be commenting on the proposed Criteria Pollutant and Toxic Emissions Reporting (CTR) regulation. Mr. Warner explained this was an emissions inventory regulation that ARB adopted in December with direction to their staff to workshop some additional changes under a 15-day review process. He said once ARB staff has completed their changes to the rule, they will hold a public workshop along with providing their responses to comments received. He said District staff has heard that ARB staff is planning to introduce a proposed rule in the end of February or early March timeframe. He said staff is carefully watching as there are a lot of resource implications from this proposed rule, as the rule in general requires more detailed emissions inventory from essentially all permitted emissions sources in the state.

Mr. Hamilton said it was his understanding that CARB was also charged with creating a technology inventory for BACT and BARCT technology for specific industrial sources, in all areas of the state. Mr. Warner said CARB is compiling BACT and BARCT information across the state.

Public Comment - None

11. OVERVIEW OF THE SAN JOAQUIN VALLEYWIDE AIR POLLUTION STUDY AGENCY – Sheraz Gill, Deputy APCO, welcomed John DaMassa, Chief of the Modeling and Meteorology Branch for ARB, and thanked him in advance for providing the committee with a detailed review of the San Joaquin Valleywide Air Pollution Study Agency and the Central California Air Quality Studies. Mr. DaMassa presented that over the past 30 years, the Study Agency has provided an unbiased assessment of air quality science to guide regulatory decisions in the Valley. With over \$60 million in funded research, the Central California Air Quality Studies have played a significant role in understanding mobile, area and point source emission inventories and emission profiles, in evaluating and enhancing modeling, and understanding photochemical reactions and relationships in the Valley. Mr. DaMassa added the data collected during these studies, and the findings from the many associated research efforts funded through the Study Agency, have been an integral part of every State Implementation Plan since 1990 and will continue to play a major role for future plans.

Mr. Leiba thanked Mr. DaMassa for this presentation, which he requested. He said he was especially interested in the links with health outcomes and said it would seem that the studies should take a look at the premature deaths and the current situation where there has been a dramatic improvement in health quality in the Valley due to lessened exposure to air pollution over the past 20 years. He said he would expect there to be a decrease in premature deaths. He said he did not hear any information on epidemiological health risk studies that would go to the core of these questions. Mr. DaMassa responded that the policy committee, which provides overall guidance on the types of studies conducted, made a determination early on that these efforts would focus on air quality data collection and better understanding the science underlying the air quality challenges faced in the Valley in an attempt to better inform the necessary policy decisions.

Mr. Clark thanked Mr. DaMassa for his presentation. He said Mr. DaMassa pointed out that the information gathered in these studies is still useful to consultants and decision makers. He said industry and the Study Agency did an excellent job of gathering information and studying emissions in the Valley.

Mr. Hamilton thanked Mr. DaMassa and suggested it would be a good idea to repeat these studies in the future given the changes in emission sources and inventories over the past 20 years. He also asked how confident Mr. DaMassa was that the modeling conducted for attainment plans is able to characterize air quality at the neighborhood level. Mr. DaMassa responded there is a lot of value in the data that was collected in

the 2000-2001 studies and agreed there have been a lot of changes in the emission sources, but the meteorology hasn't changed that much. He said Mr. Clark and Mr. Cunha would agree that it was a very large and difficult process to raise the money for these studies, including numerous trips to Washington, D.C. In addition, he said federal funding would be needed to repeat these studies and he was unsure how successful efforts would be given the current political climate. While he said he agreed that the technology has changed significantly and has become more sophisticated, in some respects the instrumentation may be cheaper but the really good measurements are still pretty costly. Regarding the models used for attainment planning, he said they are gridded models and the best they can do is 4 kilometers. He said they would need to go to different models with finer resolution to properly characterize neighborhood level air quality.

Mr. Smith left at 11:40 a.m.

Public Comment: None

12. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer reported on the following:

- Several of the District's grants programs now have online web portals and more will be rolled out in the near future. She said both the rebate and replacement portions of the Drive Clean in the San Joaquin program are now available online. She added that Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, has made it a priority to have more online tools available for Valley residents to participate in the District's programs.
- The District's annual Check Before You Burn season will end on February 29th.
- The District's 2019 Kids Calendar is now available in every office and has been re-designed to be less resource heavy but still highlight the artwork of Valley children.

Public Comment - None

13. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS – None

15. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report at the February 21, 2019 meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 11:45 a.m.

Next Meeting – The next CAC meeting is scheduled on March 5, 2019. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.