

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

March 5, 2019
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield, and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. **CALL TO ORDER** – The Deputy Clerk of the Boards, Michelle Franco, called the meeting to order at 10:10 a.m.
2. **ROLL CALL** – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting and to take action.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/EIG (P)	Central
	Gary Yep/CIG (P)	Central
Kern	Les Clark/IAIG (P)	Central
	Christine Zimmerman/IAIG (A)	Central
	Wayne Clausen/CIG (P)	South
Kings	Dustin FERENCE/IAIG (P)	Central
	Tim Parcel/IAIG (A)	Central
	Alvaro Preciado/CIG (A)**	Central
Madera	Don Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)	North
	Ned Leiba/EIG (P)	North
	Suzanne Bauer/IAIG (A)*	North
Stanislaus	Richard O'Brien/CIG (P)*	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
	Greg Gomez/CIG (P)	Central

(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

**Arrived at 10:18 a.m.*

***Arrived at 10:22 a.m.*

Ms. Franco announced that Chairman Lemen was not able to attend the meeting. As there is currently not a Vice Chair, she said the Committee would need to appoint an acting Chair for this meeting. Mr. Cunha volunteered to Chair the meeting.

Ayes: Cunha, Clark, Ference, Horal, Hoffdahl, Williams, Hamilton,
Smith, Leiba, Yep, Clausen, Gomez

Nays: None

CAC members voted unanimously to appoint Mr. Cunha as acting Chair for the March 5, 2019, CAC meeting

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 5, 2019 – Mr. Cunha asked for member comments or corrections to the Minutes. Hearing none, he declared the Minutes approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO provided CAC members with a summary of the following items:

- March 1st marked the end of the annual Check Before You Burn season. This was again a very effective year of implementation of the program and a full report will be provided to the Governing Board in April. Additionally, the District has begun the public process to enhance the District's residential wood burning rule and the Burn Cleaner incentive program.
- The District Governing Board approved the allocation of up to \$47,500 in funding to conduct a study on the feasibility of developing new transportation infrastructure to shift shipping containers from trucks to rail via an inland port system. The District funding will be leveraged with \$75,000 in public and private match funding from the South Coast Air Quality Management District, Port of Los Angeles, County of Merced, County of Fresno, County of Madera, City of Fresno, and Central Valley Community Foundation.
- The District Governing Board approved \$4,000,000 in additional incentive funding for the District's new Zero Emission Agricultural Utility Terrain Vehicle (Ag UTV) Program. This program, funded through the state's Funding Agricultural Replacement Measures for Emissions Reductions (FARMER) program provides incentives to replace older, higher polluting gasoline or diesel powered Ag UTVs with new, zero-emission UTVs.

Mr. Clausen pointed out that the City of Shafter has an existing intermodal facility and owns the property and the rail line. Mr. Cunha said he appreciated the work of District staff to add more funding to the Zero Emission Agricultural Utility Terrain Vehicle

program. He said when CARB was running the program there were very few participants in the program, and when the District took it over it and came up with a logical incentive base, participation rose immediately. He acknowledged staff's work on the incentive program along with their collaboration with farmers, agricultural groups, packing houses and those that use utility terrain vehicles.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, provided an update on the District's planning and rule development efforts.

Mr. Hamilton requested that the proposed regulatory measures contained in the 2018 PM2.5 Plan be included on the list with the planned rule development schedule.

Public Comment - None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD - Laura Carr, CARB representative, provided a summary of select items before the California Air Resources Board at their meeting held on February 21, 2019.

Mr. Leiba said he asked during the February 5, 2019 meeting for clarification regarding a statement CARB made in a press release announcing the approval of the District's 2018 PM2.5 Plan. In the press release, CARB stated that PM2.5 exposure is responsible for 1,200 cases of premature death in the Valley each year, and Mr. Leiba asked for the source of the information. At that time, Ms. Carr said that CARB staff would get back to him. Mr. Leiba said that Ms. Carr and her colleague, Ms. Turner, provided a response to him and the Clerk of the Boards sent the email out to members the day before this meeting. He asked Ms. Carr if she could point exactly where in the documents that she referenced or in the email, where she got that specific case information. Ms. Carr said that the references provided were gathered by Ms. Turner and she had worked with some of their Research Division staff in order to get the information. She added that she had not read the documents but recommended that if Mr. Leiba had follow-up question, he should contact Ms Turner.

Public Comment - None

9. CONSIDER LETTER ADVOCATING FOR INCREASING FUNDING FOR FARMER AND AB 617 EARLY ACTION INITIATIVE PROGRAMS – Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, reported that for the last few years the District has been successful at garnering significant resources from the state Cap and Trade program to reduce localized air pollution. Unfortunately, he said in the Governor's draft budget the funding in two key programs was scaled back significantly. Over the past two years the FARMER program has contained \$135 million, of which the District received 80%, and the program in support of early emission reduction actions for communities has

contained \$250 million, of which the District received approximately 30%. Under the draft budget those programs have been reduced to \$30 million and \$200 million, respectively, statewide. Recognizing the significant need for emission reductions in the Valley, especially within the Valley's disadvantaged communities, he requested the CAC members to approve a letter to be sent to the State Legislature in support of increasing the funding in these two critical programs to \$250 million for FARMER and \$400 million for Community Emission Reduction Incentives.

Mr. O'Brien said there was a lot of information included in the letter and suggested revising it to communicate the District's requests more concisely, using a bulleted format. Mr. Sheikh said a subject line would also be added and staff would work to make the information more concise, better formatted, and easier to read. Mr. Cunha agreed with the proposed changes. Mr. Clausen voiced support for the letter and submitting it as soon as possible.

Mr. Hamilton said while it is always good to be concise, based on his experience, because the letter is coming from the District it will be read, considered and talked about. He noted this Governor is focused on improving the health of California residents, with a special focus on the health of children and here in the Valley we have a disproportionate rate of asthma in children. He said air pollution is one of the asthma triggers and suggested it would be more powerful if there was a way to weave the needs of Valley families and children into this letter to communicate that this funding is directly tied to a pollutant that when reduced, will significantly improve their health.

Mr. Smith suggested moving the reference to CAC members to the first paragraph of the letter. Mr. Yep agreed it was important to submit this letter as soon as possible, and it was important to keep it brief. He suggested limiting the letter to one page and adding footnotes with the detailed information. Mr. Williams agreed with the suggestion to add a subject line. Mr. Leiba agreed with Mr. Hamilton's comment, and said the Governing Board should communicate this message to the state legislature. Mr. Sheikh responded that the Board previously adopted this item as one of its central advocacy positions in the District's 2019 Legislative Platform, and have already been extremely active in Sacramento talking to legislative staff about the same issues. He said given its broad representation, CAC members are valuable as an additional voice. He said in the past, when there is a stronger coalition, the Valley has always done better. This letter is an additional piece of what is already a broader, Valley-based, and aggressive advocacy effort happening in Sacramento right now.

Mr. Cunha agreed with Mr. Hamilton's suggestion to add information on the public health effects of reducing air pollution. Mr. Sheikh responded affirmatively and said staff would re-work the letter to expand on the message of expedited public health benefits, include that information earlier in the letter, and perhaps point to some examples of the associated health impacts. Mr. Cunha said it would be very important for the letter to be sent on behalf of CAC members because of their broad

representation of government, environmental, and industrial/agricultural interests. He said this letter would get the attention of the state legislature and CARB. Mr. Gomez suggested adding the health component to the paragraph regarding disadvantaged communities. Mr. Sheikh said based on the direction from CAC, staff would make the updates immediately and suggested a representative from each interest group could sign the letter. Mr. Hamilton, Mr. Preciado, and Mr. Cunha agreed to sign the letter on behalf of each of their respective interest groups.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Ference

Seconded: Hamilton

Ayes: Cunha, Clark, Ference, Horal, Hoffdahl, Bauer, Williams, Hamilton, Smith, Leiba, Yep, Clausen, Preciado, O'Brien, Gomez

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to support a letter to be sent to the State Legislature in support of increasing funding for FARMER to \$250 million and Community Emission Reduction Incentives to \$400 million with the suggested changes incorporated.

10. RECEIVE REPORT ON 2018 OZONE AIR QUALITY - Jessica Olsen, Program Manager, presented a report on 2018 ozone air quality. The District has developed and implemented numerous air quality plans to reduce NOx and VOC emissions from stationary sources, adopted nearly 650 of the most stringent rules in the nation, and has put in place a strong voluntary incentive program that has invested more than \$2.2 billion of public and private funds into clean air projects. These incentives have resulted in more than 145,000 tons of emission reductions throughout the region, assisting the Valley make progress toward attaining the health-based federal ozone and PM2.5 standards. With respect to addressing ozone, the District's Governing Board has demonstrated leadership and commitment in reducing ozone concentrations throughout the Valley by approving and implementing numerous attainment strategies for the 1979, 1997 and 2008 federal ozone standards. As a result of these extensive emissions reduction efforts, Valley residents have experienced measurable and sustained improvements in ozone air quality, with 2018 recording historic improvement across a number of key metrics.

With regard to wildfires, Mr. Hamilton wondered how much of the NOx is actually reaching the Valley. Ms. Olsen said based on spatial modeling, staff is confident that there are NOx impacts in the Valley from wildfires occurring throughout the state. Mr. Sheikh said in talking about the wildfire impacts, they occur during the summer when the Valley is experiencing peak ozone issues. He said those emissions definitely move into the Valley and there have been exceptional event demonstrations in other regions acknowledging this fact that have been approved by EPA in the past. Mayor Preciado

asked if there would be fines related to the 84 ppb requirements in 2023 and asked when it was expected that the Valley would meet the requirements. Mr. Sheikh responded that the Valley is on track to reach attainment by 2023. However, should the Valley not reach attainment with a federal ozone standard there are ramifications under the Clean Air Act. He said the District would have to put a new plan together to demonstrate what additional measures would be put into place to meet the standard and then there would be non-attainment penalties that would kick in upon a finding that the region was not able to attain by the federally established deadline.

Mr. Cunha said he appreciated the follow up regarding the impacts of wildfires, as not only do they have an impact air quality but they have a huge impact on agricultural products as well. He said while the District is addressing wildfires, it is important to hold the responsible agencies accountable for doing a better job managing the forests.

Public Comment: None

11. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATE – Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, provided an update on the District’s activities related to AB 617 implementation. In September 2018, CARB finalized their selection of 10 communities statewide, including the communities of South Central Fresno and the City of Shafter in the Valley, for first year implementation of AB 617 community emission reduction and monitoring programs. Consistent with the requirements of AB 617, the District has appointed steering committees for the two selected communities, and the committees have been meeting over the past few months. Working with the steering committees, the District must implement community air monitoring plans by July 1, 2019, and adopt community emission reduction programs by October 1, 2019.

Mr. Smith asked if the District would be commenting on the proposed Criteria and Toxics Reporting (CTR) regulation from CARB, and said there is a real concern that CARB is using the 15-day process to expand the scope of the rule without going through a robust public process. Mr. Warner responded the District is watching this regulation extremely carefully and have been in communication with CARB as they have been putting together the proposed regulation.

Mr. Hamilton asked for the District’s position on the proposed expansion to the CTR regulation. Mr. Sheikh responded the rule has gone from the relatively focused concept adopted by CARB, which affected a limited subset of sources to what now appears to be a much broader concept affecting a larger universe of sources. He said the District’s position is to ensure this is a manageable process and that CARB makes any proposed changes through a transparent process. He said the District’s position is not one of support or oppose, it is that staff understands they will be expanding the scope and there will definitely be a resource impact that will require a lot more District staff time to be able to work with sources to comply with the proposed regulation. He said it is

important that there are resources to help fund this new mandate and structure is needed for a regulation that makes sense from an implementation point of view.

Mr. Preciado suggested residents of cities near the selected communities should also participate in the steering committee meetings as they might also see some benefits from the community air monitoring plans. Mr. Warner responded any member of the public is welcome to attend the steering committee meetings and has an opportunity to comment and take part in the process. Regarding the potential for increased regulations resulting from AB 617, Mr. Cunha said it is important to protect Valley businesses and the jobs they provide to residents, especially those in rural communities.

Public Comment – None

12. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer reported on the following:

- The District's Check Before You Burn season ended on February 28, 2019
- Outreach staff are planning to participate in various Earth Day events across the Valley during the month of April
- Bike to Work week is coming up during the 2nd week of May
- Outreach staff continue to work on the HAL Schools program, with the latest push being to connect schools with the District's grants programs

Mr. Cunha congratulated District staff on an extremely successful Tune In and Tune Up program event held recently in Stockton.

Public Comment - None

13. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS – Mr. Williams reported at the Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) meeting held on February 28, 2019, members approved the 2019-2020 Grants Committee Recommendations as well as their Annual Goals and Objectives.

14. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report at the March 21, 2019 meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:11 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next CAC meeting is scheduled on April 2, 2019. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.