

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

May 7, 2019
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield, and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. **CALL TO ORDER** – The Deputy Clerk of the Boards, Michelle Franco, called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.
2. **ROLL CALL** – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting and to take action.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha/IAIG (P)	Central
	Chris McGlothlin/IAIG (A)	Central
	Gary Yep/CIG (P)	Central
Kern	Carolyn Temple/EIG (P)	South
	Wayne Clausen/CIG (P)	South
Kings	Alvaro Preciado/CIG (A)*	Central
Madera	Don Horal/IAIG (P)	Central
	Lee Smith/EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Kevin Abernathy/EIG (P)**	North
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl/IAIG (P)	North
	Ned Leiba/EIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	Suzanne Bauer/IAIG (A)	North
	Shivaugn Alves/EIG (P)***	North
	Richard O'Brien/CIG (P)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams/IAIG (P)	Central
	Greg Gomez/CIG (P)	Central

(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

**Arrived at 10:25 a.m.*

***Left at 11:25 a.m.*

****Left at 11:39 a.m.*

Ms. Franco announced that Chairman Lemen was not able to attend the meeting. As there is currently not a Vice Chair, she said the Committee would need to appoint an acting Chair for this meeting. Mr. Cunha volunteered to Chair the meeting.

Ayes: Cunha, Horal, Hoffdahl, Bauer, Williams, Temple, Smith, Abernathy,
Leiba, Alves, Yep, Clausen, O'Brien, Gomez

Nays: None

CAC members voted unanimously to appoint Mr. Cunha as acting Chair for the May 7, 2019, CAC meeting

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR APRIL 2, 2019 – Mr. Cunha asked for member comments or corrections to the Minutes for April 2, 2019. Mr. Abernathy said the Roll Call did not reflect his presence at the meeting but he was there. Mr. Cunha declared the Minutes approved with the correction to properly reflect Mr. Abernathy's attendance.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, provided CAC members with a summary of the following items:

- The Governing Board expanded the District's Public Benefits Grant program to include hybrid police pursuit vehicles on the eligible vehicle list and to include Community Action Agencies as eligible entities under the program.
- The Board approved \$1 million in additional funding for the Alternatives to Agricultural Burning Incentive Program as well the Low Dust Nut Harvesting Incentive Program. Additional funding was added to these two pilot programs to respond to the significant level of interest and to expand the participation in the pilots to better understand the potential benefits of utilizing these practices and technologies.
- The District's 2018-19 Annual Report to the Community is now available in print and electronically on the District's website. He invited members to share the information with their constituencies and said this is an easy to read format with key stories on the Valley's air quality progress and District activities related to its mission.
- Upcoming Tune In Tune Up events in the Valley are scheduled on May 18th at the Fresno Fairgrounds, June 1st in Oakdale and June 15th in Bakersfield. He reminded members that complete information on these events and program components is also available on the District's website.

Mr. O'Brien announced they are breaking ground next week on a new plant that will convert 1.6 million tons of agricultural waste into ethanol. Mr. Sheikh said the District has supported this project. Mr. Cunha thanked Mr. Sheikh and District staff for their support of this important project to turn agricultural waste into ethanol.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, provided an update on the District’s planning and rule development efforts.

Mr. Gomez said at a recent City Council meeting, a gas company representative said the state was looking to transition away from residential natural gas towards all electric homes. He asked if District staff was aware of this effort. Mr. Sheikh responded there is not a hard mandate at this time to go electric, although there are efforts underway to look at electric as a transition option. He said there were a couple of bills adopted that set up some pilot programs that go into communities and provide funding to transition to some of these newer technologies, including electric. Part of the concern that came out of the public process in development of the bill was the option to look at other technologies, as there are communities that do not currently have access to natural gas. Mr. Sheikh added the District has previously taken policy positions to push for fuel neutrality along with the best technologies that really work, whether electric or natural gas. He said he would be happy to invite the California Public Utilities Commission to give a presentation on this topic at the future meeting. Mr. Gomez requested a presentation from a CPUC representative at a future meeting. Mr. Cunha voiced agreement with this suggestion.

Public Comment - None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD – Laura Carr, CARB representative, provided a summary of select items that were considered by the California Air Resources Board at their meeting held on April 25, 2019.

Public Comment – None

9. UPDATE ON REVIEW OF DISTRICT’S EMISSION REDUCTION CREDITS PROGRAM – David Mallory, CARB Enforcement Division Manager, provided an update on CARB’s review of the District’s Emission Reduction Credit (ERC) Program. He reminded members that the CARB Board directed staff to conduct the review and tasked them with providing an update at their September Board meeting. He said the goal of the review is to describe how the District’s ERC program works, determine whether the program is meeting state and federal requirements, and identify if any potential opportunities for improvement exist. Additionally, Mr. Mallory said CARB staff were recently briefed on the District’s Annual Offset Equivalency Demonstrations, which will be an important element of the review. He said CARB is still early in their review and commended District staff for their responsiveness in responding to CARB’s requests for information.

Mr. Mallory reported on the recently held public meeting to discuss the ERC review, which at the request of the CAC, was held at the District's Bakersfield office, and video teleconferenced to the District's Fresno and Modesto offices. The meeting was well-attended, with 28 attendees in Bakersfield, 9 in Fresno, and 2 in Modesto. He added that CARB staff was pleased with the level of stakeholder engagement at the meeting. He said that the comments received ranged from concerns over the oil and gas industry in the South Valley to the need to continue economic growth in the Valley. Mr. Mallory said CARB staff plan to review at least 40 previously-issued ERCs, not targeting any individual industry but looking at a cross-section of ERCs. They will evaluate each to make sure the ERCs meet applicable requirements and the reductions are real, quantifiable, surplus, permanent, and enforceable. Mr. Mallory referred members to the CARB website dedicated to this project for additional information located at <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/san-joaquin-valley-emission-reduction-credit-program-review>.

Mr. Cunha thanked Mr. Mallory for his presentation and voiced appreciation on behalf of CAC members for CARB holding the meeting in the District offices. He also thanked District staff for hosting the meetings.

Mr. Sheikh said he appreciated CARB staff spending time with District staff to learn the District's ERC program. He said it is a very complicated framework, with NSR and federal requirements and staff spent significant time bringing CARB up to speed on what the program is all about and how it was developed and the history and operational details. He said the program is designed to satisfy all federal Clean Air Act requirements as they relate to NSR and offsetting requirements and has been approved as such by CARB and EPA. He voiced appreciation for CARB's efforts on the review and said District staff agrees that transparency is very important and are very open to any suggestions for operation of the program. He added the Earthworks report complimented District staff for their in depth and comprehensive response. He said the District's ERC program is designed to accommodate all scenarios that come up in terms of the availability of credits.

Mr. Abernathy said this subject matter requires an extensive expertise and anyone who thinks they can quickly understand this complex program is mistaken. Mr. Mallory agreed this is extremely complicated issue and said CARB is trying to learn as much as possible from District staff and relay the information in easily understandable terms for the community.

Ms. Alves thanked CARB staff for their efforts with this project, and keeping it as transparent as possible.

Mr. Smith confirmed that CARB staff are planning to review specific ERCs. Mr. Mallory responded affirmatively. Mr. Smith asked if that information would be disclosed to the public. Mr. Mallory responded affirmatively. Mr. Smith expressed concern at the focus

on specific ERCs and suggested they should not disclose that information. Mr. Cunha agreed that publishing the names of individual companies was not a good idea, could potentially expose confidential information, and potentially lead to legal action.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- John Haley, AERA Energy

Mr. O'Brien said that in the interest of transparency, all relevant information associated with the review should be released.

10. END OF SEASON WOOD BURNING REPORT – Robert Gilles, Air Quality Analysis and Research Supervisor, and Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, gave members a report on implementation of the wood burning emissions reduction strategy in the 2018-19 winter season, detailing the following:

- Improvement in Valley air quality during 2018-2019 winter season
- Public health benefits of strategy
- Air quality and meteorology compared to previous seasons
- Effectiveness of District's control strategy
- Impact of wildfires during the 2018-2019 winter season
- District's Burn Cleaner Program implementation
- Extensive public outreach efforts
- Enforcement and compliance assistance activities
- Upcoming enhancements to residential wood burning emission reduction strategy

Mr. Cunha asked for clarification on the use of propane versus natural gas. Ms. Holt clarified that if residents are connected to the public utility, they would be subject to the more stringent curtailment days proposed as part of the enhancements.

Ms. Alves asked if there were smaller level presentations available with regards to the smoke impacts and updates to the wood burning rule that could be shared with community members. She asked if electric fireplaces would also be included in these enhancements and what type of outreach was planned for Valley schools. Ms. Holt responded that District staff would love to conduct additional outreach in Valley communities. She added that District staff conduct numerous presentations and participate in assemblies at Valley schools throughout the year. With regards to electric fireplaces and heaters, Mr. Sheikh responded there are some technologies that are

available, ranging in cost and effectiveness. He said the District is looking at expanding its program in that direction if there is a viable option found.

Mr. Yep asked about the fundamental fairness issue between emissions from residential wood burning devices versus the numerous wood burning barbecues at retail stores. Mr. Sheikh said the District's 2018 PM2.5 Plan commits to a measure to reduce emissions from commercial under-fired operations, which would potentially include these establishments. He said it would most likely be a combination of incentive-based efforts to help restaurants install more sophisticated controls to reduce emissions and a regulatory measure for larger operations. Mr. Sheikh added these measures are two of the more cost-effective measures in terms of reducing emissions. Mr. Yep explained he was most concerned by small businesses who cut regulatory corners to make a little extra money on the weekend by selling barbecue.

Public Comment: None

11. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATES – Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, provided an update on the District's activities related to AB 617 implementation. In September 2018, CARB finalized their selection of 10 communities statewide, including the communities of South Central Fresno and the City of Shafter in the Valley, for first year implementation of AB 617 community emission reduction and monitoring programs. Consistent with the requirements of AB 617, the District has appointed steering committees for the two selected communities, and the committees have been meeting over the past several months. Working with the steering committees, the District must implement community air monitoring plans by July 1, 2019, and adopt community emission reduction programs by October 1, 2019. More information is available at www.valleyair.org/community.

Mr. Warner gave updates on the progress of the Shafter Steering Committee including community input on air quality monitoring plan and ongoing Department of Pesticide presences regarding pesticide regulations and monitoring. The Committee will receive a presentation on the health effects of pollutants from the Office of Environmental Health and Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), discuss existing control requirements, and development of Community Emission Reduction Program. As for the South Central Fresno Steering Committee progress, he reported they established a Monitoring Plan Subcommittee which met last week with the subcommittee input to be presented to the full Committee on May 8th. Next, members will receive a presentation on the health effects of pollutants by OEHHA, existing control requirements and development of Community Emission Reduction Program.

Public Comment – None

12. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, gave an update on current District outreach activities, including:

- There are still a few Kids Calendars available for distribution
- The District's 2018-19 Annual Report to the Community is now available in hard copy and on the District's website
- Outreach staff participated in many Earth Day events throughout the Valley
- May is Bike to Work Month and all are encouraged to ride their bicycles
- Outreach staff is conducting outreach on the District's many new incentives programs

Public Comment - None

13. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS – None

14. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report at the June 20, 2019 meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 11:46 a.m.

Next Meeting – The next CAC meeting is scheduled on June 4, 2019. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.