

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

September 3, 2019
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield, and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. **CALL TO ORDER** – The Deputy Clerk of the Boards, Michelle Franco, called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m.
2. **ROLL CALL** – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting but not to take action.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha / IAIG (P)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton / EIG (P)*	Central
Kern	Les Clark / IAIG (P)**	South
	Carolyn Temple / EIG (P)	South
	Wayne Clausen / CIG (P)	South
Kings	Tim Parcel / IAIG (A)	Central
	Kelly Deming / EIG (P)	Central
Madera	Don Horal / IAIG (P)	Central
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl / IAIG (P)	North
	Ned Leiba / EIG (P)	North
Stanislaus	Suzanne Bauer / IAIG (A)***	North
	Shivaugn Alves / EIG (P)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams / IAIG (P)	Central

(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

**Arrived at 10:05 a.m.*

***Arrived at 10:14 a.m.*

****Arrived at 10:22 a.m.*

Ms. Franco announced that Chair Lemen was not present at the meeting. Mr. Williams suggested members appoint Mr. Cunha to Chair the meeting. Mr. Cunha agreed to serve as acting Chair in the absence of Chair Lemen.

Ayes: Cunha, Parcel, Horal, Hoffdahl, Williams, Hamilton, Temple, Deming, Leiba, Alves, Clausen,

Nays: None

CAC members voted unanimously to appoint Mr. Cunha as acting Chair for the September 3, 2019, CAC meeting

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR AUGUST 6, 2019 – This item was tabled, as there was not a quorum present to take action.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, advised the CAC that the District Governing Board will be considering adoption of the Community Emissions Reduction Programs (CERPs) for Shafter and South Central Fresno at the September 19, 2019 meeting. These plans are being brought forward after an extensive public process over the past year and the input of Community Steering Committees in each of the communities. Mr. Sheikh recognized the CAC members who served as Community Steering Committee members and those that have been involved in the process for their valuable input and contribution throughout the public process.

Mr. Cunha thanked Mr. Sheikh and staff for all of their hard work on AB 617 implementation in South Central Fresno and Shafter.

Public Comment: None

Mr. Clark arrived at 10:14 a.m.

Ms. Bauer arrived at 10:22 a.m.

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Chay Thao, Program Manager, provided an update on the District's planning and rule development efforts.

Mr. Hamilton asked for a status update on the upcoming amendments to District Rule 4311 (*Flares*). Sheraz Gill, Deputy APCO, responded that the District held an initial

scoping meeting in 2018, and staff is planning to hold a public workshop during fourth quarter 2019.

Public Comment - None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD –

- a. Laura Carr, CARB representative, said the California Air Resources Board (CARB) did not meet in August. She said there was a list of upcoming CARB workshops and trainings included in CAC member's September agenda packets.

Mr. Hamilton encouraged CAC members to attend CARB's Transportation Refrigeration Unit Regulation Concept Workshop that afternoon at 1:00 pm at the District's Fresno Office.

Public Comment – None

9. APPOINT AD HOC SUBCOMMITTEE FOR HEARING BOARD APPOINTMENTS –

Ms. Franco asked for two volunteers from each Interest Group to serve on the Ad Hoc Subcommittee for Hearing Board Appointments. She said the members would be responsible for conducting telephone interviews with the candidate for the Southern Region Hearing Board Medical primary seat. The following members volunteered to participate in the recruitment process: Environmental Interest Group – Ms. Deming and Mr. Hamilton; Industry/Agriculture Interest Group – Mr. Cunha and Mr. Williams; City Interest Group – Mr. Clausen.

10. DISTRICT'S NEW CLEAN VEHICLE FUELING INFRASTRUCTURE INCENTIVE

PROGRAM – Brian Dodds, Program Manager, provided an update on the District's new Clean Vehicle Fueling Infrastructure incentive program. Under the program, the District will provide funding for battery charging or alternative fuel stations serving heavy-duty on-road vehicles, off-road equipment and vehicles, locomotives, and agricultural sources. This new program is part of the District's ongoing multifaceted approach to reducing emissions from mobile sources.

Mr. Sheikh said he wanted to make sure that members were aware of the program that was adopted by the Board at their August 15, 2019 meeting. He invited them to share their thoughts on the best ways to promote this funding, as they work in the Valley helping businesses and public agencies think about their fleet transitions. He said the guidance and advice of CAC members would be very much appreciated.

Mr. Leiba suggested a cost benefit analysis would be a good way to rank projects for funding. Mr. Sheikh responded the cost effectiveness criteria was the single biggest component for program priorities, and included analyzing the volume of fuel and trying to relate that to the benefits that would be provided by transitioning fleets from that

particular fuel. He thanked Mr. Leiba for making a great point and said staff would provide more information in the solicitation for these projects.

Given the state's commitment in the 2018 PM2.5 plan to replace 30,000 trucks in the Valley, Mr. Williams asked if this money would be sufficient to meet the infrastructure demands on these new zero and near-zero trucks. Mr. Sheikh responded this funding would certainly not provide enough money for the large-scale transitions to zero and near-zero truck technologies that are called for in the Plan. He added that staff hoped the market would also sustain the necessary investment in infrastructure as these new technologies become available and prices come down. He said there certainly is a role for these programs to help nudge fleet transitions but added that without the infrastructure, the fleet transitions cannot be done at the scale as discussed in the District's PM2.5 Plan. Mr. Williams asked if technologies such as near-zero combustion engines would allowed to compete with battery electric technologies or would combustion technologies be phased-out in the next 5 to 10 years. Mr. Sheikh responded there is a lot of discussion and debate statewide right now about this topic. He said there are a lot of different fuels and technologies being developed and all have a variety of advantages and disadvantages. He said no one fully knows what the mix is going to be and this program would be open to supporting a variety of technologies as they develop and as fleets are able to make this work for their particular application. He said he hoped to see more of a push in technology advancement, as battery electric becomes more and more available and more technologies that go beyond what is available commercially today.

Mr. Hamilton said it was important to focus more funding for infrastructure towards electric technologies, since there is more funding going to that area. He suggested each type of technology requires a different outreach strategy. He said he agreed that it is important to reduce emissions from school buses, whether a public, charter, or private school. Mr. Sheikh responded the program would allow for natural gas funding at a school, and said there would be a preference for going to cleaner technology such as battery/electric. He said the District is coupling this funding with VW Mitigation funding, which is \$130 million dollars that was focused on zero-emission technology.

Mr. Cunha commended staff for their great work.

Public Comment: None

11. CARB UPDATE ON REVIEW OF DISTRICT'S EMISSION REDUCTION CREDITS PROGRAM - Todd Sax, CARB Enforcement Division Chief, provided an update on CARB's review of the District's Emission Reduction Credit (ERC) program. He reminded CAC members that the CARB Board directed staff to conduct the review of the District's program with the goal of the review being to describe how the District's ERC program works, determine whether the program is meeting state and federal requirements, and identify if any potential opportunities for improvement exist. Mr. Sax

advised the members that CARB plans to hold a public workshop on September 10, 2019, to provide a status update on the review and to hold future public workshops on the review early next year.

Mr. Cunha thanked CARB staff for presenting the information at today's meeting. Mr. Clark said the ERC program is a critical component of operations and asked what additional information would be provided at their public workshop on September 10. Mr. Sax said staff would present a status update and provide more detail of the types of analyses they are conducting for the ERCs and equivalency system. He said there were no results available yet, but staff would ask for input on the final portion of the review. Mr. Hamilton thanked Mr. Sax and his team and said he is looking forward to their final report.

Public Comment: None

12. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATES –

- a. Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, provided an update on the District's activities related to AB 617 implementation. In September 2018, CARB finalized their selection of 10 communities statewide, including the communities of South Central Fresno and the City of Shafter in the Valley, for first year implementation of AB 617 community emission reduction and monitoring programs. Consistent with the requirements of AB 617, the District has appointed steering committees for the two selected communities, and the committees have been meeting over the past several months. Working with the steering committees, the District implemented community air monitoring plans by July 1, 2019, and must adopt community emission reduction programs by October 1, 2019. Mr. Warner presented an overview of the measures included in the draft CERPs for the South Central Fresno and Shafter communities, and advised the members that the District Governing Board would be considering adoption of the CERPs on September 19, 2019. More information is available at www.valleyair.org/community.

Mr. Warner also provided an update of the District's efforts to propose communities for CARB's consideration under Year 2 of the AB 617 program. The District held public workshops on July 30, 2019, and August 29, 2019, to solicit input on the proposed community selection methodology for Year 2 of the program. Mr. Warner shared that there seems to be considerable support for the potential focus for Year 2 to be on the Northern Region (e.g., Stockton), given that first-year communities were in Central and South Regions. The Governing Board will consider staff's Year 2 community proposal at the September 19, 2019, meeting, and CARB will formally commence the community selection process in December 2019.

- b. Karen Magliano, CARB Chief of Office of Community Air Protection, provided an update on efforts underway by CARB to implement AB 617. Consistent with AB 617, the CARB board must consider new communities each year for implementation of Community Emission Reduction Programs (CERPs). Ms. Magliano provided an overview of the efforts CARB is undertaking to support the CERP development and the state measures CARB is including in the CERPs. She also reported that their Board will consider the CERPs for the Year 1 communities between December 2019 and March 2020. The Board will be meeting in the respective communities to consider the CERPs after they are adopted by the local air district boards. CARB plans to consider the CERPs for South Central Fresno and Shafter in February 2020 at a hearing in Shafter, CA.

Mr. Cunha thanked Mr. Warner and Ms. Magliano for the hard work of their teams on the AB 617 program. Mr. Leiba asked Mr. Warner for more information on the city nomination process. Mr. Warner responded there are considerable resources associated with the workshop held the past week. He said this information is available on the District's website at www.valleyair.org/community. He said staff would send that link out to members. Mr. Sheikh added that CARB has information on their website on the city nomination process and said staff would send that link out as well. Mr. Leiba suggested having a Request for Proposals for good health studies in the selected areas. Ms. Magliano responded that CARB has been developing partnerships at the state level, with California Department of Public Health and the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Protection who are also very interested in how they can take advantage of the new information coming forward.

Ms. Alves asked if more than one organization could submit a community nomination form for the same area. Mr. Warner responded affirmatively.

Mr. Hamilton reinforced Mr. Leiba's comments regarding the health assessment of the impacts of this program, and said it is very critical to make sure that is included. With regard to solar, he said particularly with larger warehouses and businesses, it would reduce pollution as it reduces reliance on CNG peaker-plants in the summertime, when it is most valuable.

Public Comment – None

11. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communication's Officer, said staff was busy working on enhancements to the District's Burn Cleaner program, which should be launched by the end of September. She reminded members that the District's Check Before You Burn season begins on November 1, 2019.

Public Comment - None

12. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS – None
15. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the report at the September 19, 2019 meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 11:59 a.m.

Next Meeting – The next CAC meeting is scheduled on October 1, 2019. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.