

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

February 4, 2020
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield, and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Kevin Abernathy, called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting and to take action.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha / IAIG (P)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/ EIG (P)	Central
Kern	Les Clark / IAIG (P)	South
	Carolyn Temple / EIG (P)	South
	Wayne Clausen / CIG (P)	South
Kings	Kelly Deming / EIG (P)	Central
	Tim Parcel / IAIG (A)	Central
Madera	Don Horal / IAIG (P)	Central
	Brittany Dyer / EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Kevin Abernathy / EIG (P)	North
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl / IAIG (P)	North
	Ned Leiba / EIG (P)	North
	Eleassia Davis / CIG (A)	North
Stanislaus	Richard O'Brien / CIG (P)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams / IAIG (P)	Central

* (P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR JANUARY 7, 2020 – Mr. Abernathy asked for corrections on the Minutes dated January 7, 2020. Hearing none, he deemed the Minutes as approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, reported that in January the Governing Board adopted the District's 2020 Legislative Platform and the District's 2020 Outreach Strategy. Mr. Sheikh also provided a preview of the items on the February 20, 2020, Governing Board meeting including the District's annual air toxics report, an update on the District's upcoming plan for the 2015 ozone standard, and an item to increase the funding in the District's very successful Alternatives to Open Burning of Agricultural Materials incentive program.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Jessica Coria, Program Manager in the District's Air Quality Science and Planning Department, provided an update on the District's planning and rule development efforts.

Public Comment – None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD – Laura Carr, CARB representative, gave a brief summary of the Board meetings held on January 15, 2020 and January 23, 2020.

Mr. Williams asked how someone would mitigate exposure to smoke from forest fires that might burn for weeks or months. Ms. Carr responded the initial focus would be on education and outreach, making sure that residents are aware of the effects of exposure to smoke from forest fires. She added that is a very active area of discussion between CARB and air districts.

Mr. Cunha expressed concerns regarding the state's transport refrigeration unit (TRU) regulation. He said the costs of electrification of these units are enormous and neighboring states do not have these regulations. He asked CARB staff to work closely with the agricultural community to address their concerns. He said it was important to make sure agricultural facilities and businesses in rural communities are not forced to close and people do not lose their jobs.

Mr. Hamilton suggested CARB staff give a presentation on TRUs to address concerns of Valley stakeholders at the next CAC meeting. Ms. Carr said she would work with CARB staff to pursue a potential presentation on TRUs at the next CAC meeting. Chairman Abernathy asked District staff to work with Ms. Carr to arrange the presentation.

9. CARB RESEARCH FOR FISCAL YEAR 2020-21 AND ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE RESEARCH PRIORITIES - Sarah Pittiglio, CARB Research Division Air Quality and Climate Change Research Coordinator, and May Bhetraratana, CARB Research Division Air Pollution Specialist, provided CAC members with an overview of CARB's FY 2020-21 research projects and their Environmental Justice Research Priorities. CARB's FY 2020-21 research projects continue to implement the strategical guidance contained in their Triennial Strategic Research Plan for Fiscal Years 2018-2021. CARB's Environmental Justice Research Priorities encompass numerous projects that fall within three focus areas: Identifying Sources, Satellite Data, Toxics & Odors, and Cumulative Impacts.

Chairman Abernathy said it seemed that many research projects went from concept to awarded contracts before the CAC was aware of them. He asked if there was an opportunity for CAC members to participate in the project selection process before contracts were awarded, to help drive and direct research that may be more applicable to the Valley's needs, given CAC's expertise in the environmental justice community, industry, agriculture, and government sectors.

Mr. Hamilton said he was curious to know what would come next for the air pollution and indoor filtration project. He said his organization helped recruit some of the people in the cohort and they were not very happy with the way the project was left. He said technology was put in people's homes and it was left sitting there doing nothing. He said there was a lot of subjective versus objective data collected as they were unable to get access to the medical records they thought would be critical to evaluate instead of self-reports about whether patients had encounters. He voiced agreement for Chairman Abernathy's suggestion to work closely with CAC members and those who are tied to the research projects in the Valley.

Elizabeth Scheele, Division Chief, CARB Research Division, voiced appreciation for the comments and said they would work with CAC members on how to best interact and bring projects back to them. She said having industry and citizen input helps create a better project at the end of the day.

Regarding agriculture in Los Angeles near the I-710, Mr. Cunha said there is not much agriculture left in the South Coast air basin anymore. He added that he wholeheartedly agreed with Chairman Abernathy and Mr. Hamilton that if CARB is going to cite agriculture for their studies, it would be more important to conduct studies in the Valley.

He said the Valley has a very solid commitment from the community, and has been involved in research with CARB since 1993. He asked CARB researchers to work with industry, environmental groups and agriculture in the Valley, collaboratively.

Mr. Williams commented on environmental stressors and said he was glad to see that food availability was included. He said there are so many different problems and items that overlap in this state, and water availability and storage is another huge issue that affects residents of the Valley. He said he would like to see CARB take a proactive pro water storage position because it is good for everything we are trying to accomplish from a health and food supply standpoint and will improve the overall quality of life.

Ms. Dyer thanked CARB staff for the presentation and suggested including the impacts of wildfires. Ms. Pittiglio said the 2020-21 projects are just starting out and are still in the statement of work phase and she would be happy to talk about how best to integrate input on those projects.

Mr. Leiba thanked CARB staff for their presentation and echoed the recommendations and comments previously made. He said CAC members looked forward to CARB being attentive to the requests and especially in the Stockton AB 617 area. He said he hoped they can take a look at actual health outcomes and repeated his concerns that there have been major reductions in pollution up to 85 or 90% and we should see the effect on mortality and morbidity from those reductions. In addition, he encouraged CARB to embrace the comments that were made by members and design good health studies, especially in the Stockton area. He added he was very concerned about childhood asthma because in the face of what is thought to be declining mortality and morbidity, there has been a significant increase in childhood asthma, and that is one of the most important health issues that should be addressed.

Mr. Clark said he agreed with Chairman Abernathy's and Mr. Cunha's comments. He said he and Mr. Cunha have helped to raise millions of dollars for studies to be conducted in the Valley, and said he would not endorse studies that ignore what is happening here. Mr. Clark asked if the contractors had been selected for these projects. Ms. Scheele responded no and said CARB was in the statement of work solicitation for these projects. Mr. Clark said that lost jobs should also be a consideration as thousands of people may lose their jobs due to various CARB regulations.

Ms. Davis thanked CARB staff for their presentation and asked for numbers on the Indian residents that are huge part of the agricultural community in the racial statistics portion of the study. Ms. Pittiglio said that information was included in the "other races" category.

Mr. Sheikh thanked CARB staff for providing this update at CAC members' request. He said there is an ongoing commitment by District staff to serve as a resource to assist

with projects that have particular Valley relevance. He added there were a number of studies discussed that are good opportunities for additional conversation about what District staff have learned in the Valley and helping to add more value to these projects. He said he would follow up with Ms. Scheele on information that the District has and would help inform them of the vehicle emissions and characteristics of our disadvantaged communities.

Chairman Abernathy observed there have been local heating and air companies advertising full, portable generator installations to address the potential rolling blackouts from PG&E. He suggested both CARB and the District should take a look at potential increases in emissions from these generators.

Public Comment: None

10. CARB UPDATE ON REVIEW OF DISTRICT'S EMISSION REDUCTION CREDITS PROGRAM - Todd Sax, Division Chief, CARB Enforcement Division Chief, provided an update on CARB's review of the District's Emission Reduction Credit (ERC) program. He said CARB staff have been meeting with District staff to discuss the draft findings of the review. He said the report should be released in early March and a public workshop will be scheduled during the week of March 9th. The workshop will be held in Bakersfield and video teleconferenced to the District's Fresno and Modesto offices. CARB intends to take the review back to their Board on March 26, 2020. Detailed information on the ERC review, along with current updates, is located on the CARB website at <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/san-joaquin-valley-emission-reduction-credit-program-review>.

Public Comment – None

11. UPDATE ON AIR QUALITY FUNDING IN PROPOSED STATE BUDGET - Tom Jordan, District's Senior Policy Advisor, provided an update on air quality funding included in the Governor's proposed budget. Recent state budgets have included significant funding for emission reductions from mobile sources to benefit AB617 communities and to achieve reductions in emissions from agricultural equipment. Unfortunately, the initial draft budget released by the Governor's office contains reductions in the state's funding commitment to these public health investments. Recognizing the significant air quality challenges faced in the San Joaquin Valley and the incentive-based control measure commitments by CARB in the Valley's 2018 PM2.5 Plan, the CAC took unanimous action to send a letter urging the Legislature to consider the following recommendations for the 2020/21 Budget:
- Allocate \$193 million per fiscal year through fiscal year 2022/23 in funding to the "Funding Agricultural Replacement Measures for Emissions Reductions Program" (FARMER). These funds will assist in achieving the state's commitment to reduce emissions from heavy-duty agricultural off-road equipment

in the San Joaquin Valley (12,000 tractors by 2024) and provide for significant air quality, and related community health, improvements throughout the Valley, and state.

- To assist in achieving emissions reductions in the Valley's disadvantaged communities and to meet the state's commitment to reduce emissions from heavy duty diesel trucks and other diesel fleets, allocate \$250 million in funding statewide for incentives in Community Air Protection Program.

Public Comment: None

Motion: Hamilton

Second: Cunha

Ayes: Cunha, Parcel, Horal, Hoffdahl, Williams, Hamilton,
Temple, Deming, Dyer, Abernathy, Leiba, Clausen, Davis, O'Brien

Nays: None

12. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATES –

- a. Ryan Hayashi, Director of the District's Compliance Department, provided an update on the District's ongoing activities related to AB 617 implementation. Throughout 2019, the District worked with Community Steering Committees and the public to develop Community Emission Reduction Programs (CERPs) for the AB 617 communities of South Central Fresno and Shafter. On September 19, 2019, the District's Governing Board approved the CERPs for both communities. Mr. Hayashi said District staff is now working with the Community Steering Committees to prioritize and begin implementation of the CERP measures.

Mr. Hayashi said the Board also took action in September 2019 to recommend that CARB considered Southwest Stockton as a second year AB 617 community, and on December 13, 2019, CARB selected Southwest Stockton as one of the 3 new AB 617 communities. The District held an AB 617 Community Kickoff meeting on January 22, 2020, and applications are currently being accepted for the Southwest Stockton Community Steering Committee. The first Southwest Stockton Community Steering Committee meeting is scheduled for March 5, 2020.

- b. Karen Buckley, Supervisor of the CARB Office of Community Air Protection, provided an update on efforts underway by CARB to implement AB 617. Ms. Buckley reported that their Board has begun considering the CERPs for the Year 1 communities. The Board will be meeting in the respective communities to

consider the CERPs now that they have been adopted by the local air district boards. CARB plans to consider the CERPs for South Central Fresno and Shafter on February 13, 2020, at a hearing in Shafter, CA. The staff report is now available at <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/community-air-protection-program>.

Mr. Clark expressed concern about implementation of the emission reduction programs.

13. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, gave an update on outreach efforts in the Valley, including the availability of the Healthy Air Living Kids calendars, AB 617 activities and Check Before You Burn outreach.

Public Comment: None

14. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS – Mr. Williams announced that the Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) approved their annual Goals and Objectives and Grants Committee recommendations at their last meeting on January 23, 2020.
15. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Abernathy volunteered to present the report at the February 20, 2020 Governing Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:14 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next CAC meeting is scheduled on March 3, 2020. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.