

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

January 7, 2020
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield, and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. **CALL TO ORDER** – The Deputy Clerk of the Boards, Michelle Franco, called the meeting to order at 10:08 a.m. and announced that the Chair was not able to attend this meeting.
2. **ROLL CALL** – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting and to take action.

County	Member Name/Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha / IAIG (P)*	Central
	Kevin Hamilton/ EIG (P)	Central
	Gary Yep / CIG (P)	Central
Kern	Les Clark / IAIG (P)	South
	Wayne Clausen / CIG (P)	South
Kings	Kelly Deming / EIG (P)	Central
Madera	Johnnie Siliznoff / IAIG (A)	Central
	Brittany Dyer / EIG (P)	Central
Merced	Kevin Abernathy / EIG (P)	North
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl / IAIG (P)	North
	Ned Leiba / EIG (P)	North
	Eleassia Davis / CIG (A)	North
Stanislaus	Chris Savage / IAIG (P)	North
Tulare	Derek Williams / IAIG (P)	Central

**Arrived at 10:15 a.m.*

** (P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group*

Mr. Hamilton arrived at 10:15 a.m.

Mr. Williams volunteered to run the meeting in the Chair's absence.

Ayes: Siliznoff, Hoffdahl, Savage, Williams, Hamilton, Deming, Dyer,
Abernathy, Leiba, Yep, Clausen, Davis

Nays: None

CAC members voted unanimously to appoint Mr. Williams as Chair of the meeting held on January 7, 2020

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR DECEMBER 3, 2019 – Mr. Williams asked for member comments or corrections on the Minutes for December 3, 2019. Hearing none, he deemed the Minutes as approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, reported that in December the Governing Board adopted two new rules to implement the refinery fence-line and community air monitoring requirements mandated by state law under Assembly Bill 1647 (Muratsuchi). The draft proposed version of these rules were shared with the CAC at the December 2019 meeting. Mr. Sheikh also provided a preview of the items in the January 16, 2020, Governing Board meeting including the District's 2020 legislative platform and the District's outreach strategy.

Mr. Hamilton asked when the District's proposed 2020 legislative platform would be made available to the public. Mr. Sheikh responded that it would be published as part of the Governing Board agenda packet on Friday, January 10, 2020. He added if CAC members agreed, staff could add an item to their next agenda, to discuss the proposed budget requests for Fiscal Year 2020-21 and to see if CAC members are interested in taking a position on those requests.

Mr. Hamilton asked if the District intended to challenge the federal government on its efforts to revoke California's authority to set auto emissions rules that are stricter than federal standards. Mr. Sheikh responded said staff is actively looking at that issue and there was an item on the December 19, 2019, Board meeting agenda to review the existing cases with the Governing Board. Mr. Sheikh said they are reviewing the impact of the Safer Affordable Fuel-Efficient Vehicle (SAFE) rule and associated waiver component. He added that EPA has moved forward with one piece and are still

deciding what to do about the second piece of it. He said to the extent that any of those measures have a Clean Air Act impact on this region, the District will be evaluating options, including any legal avenues we have to make sure the Valley is protected from those impacts. He added the District has weighed in previously by commenting and expressing concerns, and has long advocated for tougher national mobile source standards, as the Valley will not be able to meet its clean air goals without mobile source reductions. He reiterated the burden of not meeting those reductions falls right back on businesses and other sectors that continue to have to reduce emissions that are not achieved from national mobile source standards. Mr. Sheikh said EPA had just announced a Notice of Proposed Rulemaking for a new low NOx heavy-duty truck standard, which is something that the District has long been advocating for and formally petitioned EPA for. He said staff is currently reviewing and assessing their comments on this proposed rulemaking.

Mr. Cunha thanked Mr. Sheikh for his comments at the latest CARB Hearing in Sacramento on AB 617 and all the work that District staff has done with AB 617 communities in the Valley. He also thanked Mr. Hamilton for his comments in supporting the incentive funding for Cap and Trade dollars, and said the agriculture industry appreciates his support, which also showed that they can work together collaboratively on these issues and it is a win-win for all.

Mr. Savage agreed that he would like staff to bring the state budget item to CAC for review at their next meeting.

Public Comment: None

7. APPOINT CAC CHAIR FOR A TWO-YEAR TERM – Mr. Sheikh explained the CAC Chairmanship rotates between the City, Industry/Agriculture, and Environmental Interest Groups every two years. He said the next group up in the rotation was the Environmental Interest Group with the term set for 2020 – 2021. The Chair must be appointed by a majority vote of CAC members present at the meeting. He reminded members that the Chair conducts meetings under Robert’s Rules of Order and the Brown Act. He said staff would continue to provide information and training needed to ensure the Chair is successful in their new role.

Mr. Cunha nominated Mr. Abernathy to serve as CAC Chair for a two-year term. Mr. Hamilton seconded the nomination.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Cunha
Seconded: Hamilton
Ayes: Cunha, Clark, Siliznoff, Hoffdahl, Savage, Williams, Hamilton, Deming, Dyer, Leiba, Yep, Clausen, Davis

Nays: None
Abstain: Abernathy

Motion unanimously carried to appoint Mr. Abernathy as CAC Chair for a two-year term

8. APPOINT ENVIRONMENTAL INTEREST GROUP CHAIR – Mr. Sheikh explained the Environmental Interest Group Chair serves as the Vice-Chair of the CAC and runs meetings in the Chair’s absence. He added only the Environmental Interest Group members present would vote on this item.

Mr. Hamilton nominated Ms. Deming to serve as Environmental Interest Group Chair. Ms. Dyer seconded the nomination.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Hamilton
Seconded: Dyer
Ayes: Hamilton, Deming, Dyer, Abernathy, Leiba
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to appoint Ms. Deming as Environmental Interest Group Chair

9. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Jessica Coria, Program Manager in the District’s Air Quality Science and Planning Department, provided an update on the District’s planning and rule development efforts.

Public Comment – None

10. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD – Laura Carr, CARB representative, gave a brief summary of the Board meetings held on December 5, 2019 and December 12-13, 2019.

Mr. Abernathy said within the realm of the District always being driven by science-based research, it would be good for CARB to add proposed research projects to their reports at future CAC meetings. Mr. Cunha asked Ms. Carr to coordinate a presentation by a member of the CARB Research Division team at the next CAC meeting. Mr. Williams said he hoped CARB was not opening the door to sending taxpayer funds to other countries to help clean up their air quality issues. Mr. Hamilton said his organization works with CARB’s Research Division and noted they will appoint a new Research Chair, Bonnie Holmes-Gen, in January 2020. He said the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA) works closely with CARB on many research projects and suggested they also be invited to present at the next meeting.

Public Comment: None

11. UPDATE ON DISTRICT'S DRIVE CLEAN IN THE SAN JOAQUIN PROGRAM - Brian Dodds, Program Manager in the District's Grants and Incentives Department, provided an overview of the District's Drive Clean in the San Joaquin Program and discussed recently adopted program enhancements aimed at increasing the scope of the vehicle replacement component of the program. In December 2019, the Governing Board took action to expand the eligibility criteria of the program to no longer require an emission failure for 1999 model year and older vehicles, and to allow 2000-2006 model year vehicles with an emission failure to be eligible for replacement. It is estimated that these enhancements will result in a significant increase in participation in the replacement program. These enhancements will be implemented in a limited fashion under a pilot program to assess the potential impact to the program participation rates.

Mr. Williams said this was an extremely valuable program, but added it was important to not lose sight of the impacts of heavy-duty trucks on the Valley's air quality. Mr. Warner reiterated that this was just one small component of the District's overall air quality strategy and was a very visible and important program.

Mr. Hamilton said this was a great program, and added that his organization has been conducting surveys in disadvantaged communities about the potential barriers to participating in this program, and said one of the common obstacles they have heard is the program's requirement of vehicle ownership for the past two years. He asked about proposed program changes to change the required vehicle age to 2006. Mr. Dodds clarified that the District must confirm that the vehicle has been in regular operation for the past two years, but the individual applying for the program must have owned the vehicle for the past six months. With regard to the proposed program changes, including changing the required vehicle age to 2006, he said the District was working closely with Valley CAN to roll out the updates at weekend events in a manner that will allow the District to continue to provide excellent customer service and get participants through the process in a timely manner.

Public Comment – None

12. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATES –
- a. Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, provided an update on the District's ongoing activities related to AB 617 implementation. Throughout 2019, the District worked with Community Steering Committees and the public to develop Community Emission Reduction Programs (CERPs) for the AB 617 communities of South Central Fresno and Shafter. On September 19, 2019, the District's Governing Board approved the CERPs for both communities. Mr. Warner said

District staff is now working with the Community Steering Committees to prioritize and begin implementation of the CERP measures.

Mr. Warner said the Board also took action in September 2019 to recommend that CARB considered Southwest Stockton as a second year AB 617 community, and on December 13, 2019, CARB selected Southwest Stockton as one of the 3 new AB 617 communities. The District will be holding an AB 617 Community Kickoff meeting on January 22, 2020, and has begun the process of soliciting applications for the Southwest Stockton Community Steering Committee.

- b. Vernon Hughes, CARB Branch Chief of the Office of Community Air Protection, provided an update on efforts underway by CARB to implement AB 617. Mr. Hughes reported that their Board has begun considering the CERPs for the Year 1 communities. The Board will be meeting in the respective communities to consider the CERPs now that they have been adopted by the local air district boards. CARB plans to consider the CERPs for South Central Fresno and Shafter on February 13, 2020, at a hearing in Shafter, CA. Leading up to the Board meeting, CARB held community meetings in Shafter and South Central Fresno in November of 2019.

Consistent with AB 617, the CARB board must consider new communities each year for implementation of Community Emission Reduction Programs (CERPs). Mr. Hughes said CARB received 12 nominations for individual or combined communities for Year 2 implementation of AB 617. On December 13, 2019, CARB's Board approved 3 new communities (Southwest Stockton, South East LA, and Eastern Coachella) and 1 existing monitoring community transition to a community emissions reduction program (Portside Environmental Justice Communities in San Diego).

Public Comment – None

13. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Heather Heinks, Outreach and Communications Manager, reported on outreach activities at the District including: the District's Check Before You Burn Season and the District's Healthy Air Living Kids Calendar, which has returned to the original bilingual, 13-month format. She invited members to take calendars with them to distribute to schools and communities.

Mr. Cunha said he was pleased that the District returned to the original format and said he planned to distribute many calendars to his stakeholders across the Valley. He asked for additional calendars to be distributed to Clovis and Fresno Community Hospitals.

14. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS – Mr. Savage requested an update from CARB on the ERC review at the next CAC meeting.

10. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Abernathy and Ms. Deming volunteered to present the report at the January 16, 2020 Governing Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:01 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next CAC meeting is scheduled on February 4, 2020. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.