

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

March 3, 2020
10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield, and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Kevin Abernathy, called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting and to take action.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha / IAIG (P)	Central
Kern	Christine Zimmerman / IAIG (A) Wayne Clausen / CIG (P)	South South
Kings	Kelly Deming / EIG (P)	Central
Madera	Don Horal / IAIG (P)	Central
Merced	Kevin Abernathy / EIG (P)	North
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl / IAIG (P) Ned Leiba / EIG (P) Eleassia Davis / CIG (A)	North North North
Stanislaus	Chris Savage / IAIG (P) Shivaugn Alves / EIG (P)	North North
Tulare	Derek Williams / IAIG (P)	Central

** (P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group*

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 4, 2020 – This item was tabled as there was not a quorum present to take action.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – Chairman Abernathy announced he presented the letter approved by CAC members at their February meeting to the Governing Board during his report at their meeting held on February 20, 2020.

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, reported that in February the Governing Board reviewed the Annual Air Toxics report, which was once again a very positive report with respect to the ongoing progress being made to further reduce air toxics in the Valley. The Board also took action in February to add an additional \$3 million funding for the District's successful Alternative to Open Ag Burning Incentive program. As an air quality update, Mr. Sheikh reported that for the first time in recorded air quality history, there were zero unhealthy days with respect to PM2.5 during the winter season.

Mr. Cunha gave kudos to Mr. Sheikh and District staff for the excellent air quality update. He added that he appreciates the contribution and the commitment from the District Board and staff to continue to support the Alternative to Open Ag Burning incentive program.

Mr. Sheikh said that EPA will soon be taking action to quantify and provide credit for a number of emissions reductions that were achieved through the agricultural equipment measure. He said there was a commitment in the District's plan that called for many reductions in that sector. He added a lot has been achieved in partnership with the agricultural community, the USDA, NRCS and District programs, and added this was a very big milestone, very positive indication from EPA in terms of supporting that ongoing, very important work with the agricultural community to continue modernizing the fleet and really providing that necessary credit to those reductions.

Mr. Cunha recognized Mr. Hamilton for his efforts, working with CARB, the District, and the agricultural community and the other groups to ensure that the \$193 million in FARMER funding is continued until the end of 2023. Mr. Sheikh agreed and highlighted this continued support and definition now with EPA proposing approval of that plan lends even more credibility and importance to that particular measure, but also the quantified dollars that are needed to support that measure.

Chairman Abernathy asked what CAC members could do to help. Mr. Sheikh responded it would be helpful for CAC members to provide an updated request for additional funding to state leaders. Chairman Abernathy noted CAC members had

already unanimously approved a similar letter last month and said they would be happy to provide additional letters as needed to state leadership.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Jon Klassen, Director of Air Quality Science and Planning, provided an update on the District’s planning and rule development efforts.

Public Comment – None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD – Laura Carr, CARB representative, gave a brief summary of the Board meeting held on February 13, 2020.
9. TRANSPORT REFRIGERATION UNIT REGULATION UPDATE - Lea Yamashita, Air Pollution Specialist in the CARB Transportation and Toxics Division, provided an update on CARB efforts to update the state Transport Refrigeration Unit (TRU) regulation. Ms. Yamashita provided the CAC members with the updated concepts under consideration for truck TRUs, railcar TRUs, trailer and domestic shipping container TRUs, TRU gen sets, and applicable facilities that employ TRUs (refrigerated warehouses and distribution centers, grocery stores, and seaports/intermodal railyards). CARB will be holding public workshops on March 19th (Sacramento) and March 24th (Fresno) to discuss draft regulatory language, emissions inventory, health analyses, and preliminary cost analyses. CARB plans to take the amended regulation to the Board in December 2020.

Mr. Cunha thanked Ms. Yamashita for the presentation. He said at the last workshops stakeholders asked how CARB would deal with the agricultural perishable commodity go to and from the ports. He said the timeline of that product is not like a TV or cell phones or iPads. He asked how CARB would deal with interstate commerce on the perishable side, and also expressed concern there was no universal plug with the ability to be used by each refrigeration unit, especially with facilities that do not have the ability to accommodate charging. He also asked how CARB would handle power “brown outs” especially when transports are told they cannot use portable units. He said CARB has held numerous public workshops and expressed concern that these issues have still not been addressed.

Ms. Alves said she appreciates Mr. Cunha’s passion regarding the agricultural community and asked for information on the commodities that would be impacted by this regulation. Mr. Cunha responded there were over 389 commodities that would be impacted, basically anything that spoils and has refrigeration requirements would be affected.

Chairman Abernathy recommended to CARB that they need to spend some time in the real world before developing these regulations, as their estimates are setting them up for failure. He said what they are looking at doing logistically, from an enforcement standpoint is not achievable.

Public Comment: None

10. CARB UPDATE ON REVIEW OF DISTRICT'S EMISSION REDUCTION CREDITS PROGRAM - Todd Sax, Division Chief, CARB Enforcement Division, provided an update on CARB's review of the District's Emission Reduction Credit (ERC) program. He said CARB and the District are currently working through the draft report and additional time is necessary to evaluate and address the findings. Accordingly, the public workshops and CARB Board meeting have been postponed. Mr. Sax said the report should be released in early May along with a public workshop. The workshop will be held in Bakersfield and video teleconferenced to the District's Fresno and Modesto offices. CARB intends to take the review back to their Board in May 2020. Detailed information on the ERC review, along with current updates, is located on the CARB website at <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/san-joaquin-valley-emission-reduction-credit-program-review>.

Mr. Savage said based on the timing that Mr. Sax laid out, when would be the best time for him to report back to CAC members. Mr. Sax said CARB is planning a workshop in early-May, prior to their May Board Hearing. He suggested he could give some high level findings at the May CAC meeting, but the actual findings will be released at their public workshop. Mr. Savage requested that CARB's findings not be released to the public until CAC members have reviewed them. Chairman Abernathy agreed.

Mr. Sax responded part of the issue is whether or not the public report will be released prior to the CAC meeting on May 5, 2020, as he would not be able to discuss findings with CAC members until the report is released to the public. He suggested discussing the process with District staff to coordinate the report back to CAC members. Mr. Cunha agreed with Mr. Savage's request and suggested moving the report to the CARB Board meeting in June to allow more time for CAC members to receive the report findings and communicate them to their constituents. Mr. Sax committed to address the concerns that members have raised. He agreed CARB staff can work with District staff to find a way to make that happen.

Chairman Abernathy said it was important have a process that incorporates the CAC being fully engaged in this process, potentially getting the report once it's available for public release and then the potential opportunity to have a meeting with interested stakeholders before the workshop process.

Ms. Zimmerman voiced agreement with comments made by CAC members and said they appreciate Mr. Sax and CARB staff working with the District to ensure that CAC members are notified of results in a timely manner.

Public Comment – None

11. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATES –

- a. Ryan Hayashi, Director of the District’s Compliance Department, provided an update on the District’s ongoing activities related to AB 617 implementation. Throughout 2019, the District worked with Community Steering Committees and the public to develop Community Emission Reduction Programs (CERPs) for the AB 617 communities of South Central Fresno and Shafter. On September 19, 2019, the District’s Governing Board approved the CERPs for both communities, and on February 13, 2020, CARB unanimously approved both CERPs. Mr. Hayashi said District staff is now working with the Community Steering Committees to prioritize and begin implementation of the CERP measures.

Mr. Hayashi said the Board also took action in September 2019 to recommend that CARB considered Southwest Stockton as a second year AB 617 community, and on December 13, 2019, CARB selected Southwest Stockton as one of the 3 new AB 617 communities. The District held an AB 617 Community Kickoff meeting on January 22, 2020, and applications are currently being accepted for the Southwest Stockton Community Steering Committee. The first Southwest Stockton Community Steering Committee meeting is scheduled for March 4, 2020.

- b. Karen Magliano, Division Chief, CARB Office of Community Air Protection, provided an update on efforts underway by CARB to implement AB 617. Ms. Magliano reported that their Board has begun considering the CERPs for the Year 1 communities. The Board will be meeting in the respective communities to consider the CERPs now that they have been adopted by the local air district boards. CARB adopted the CERPs for South Central Fresno and Shafter on February 13, 2020, at a hearing in Shafter, CA. Moving forward CARB will be partnering with the districts on CERP implementation, working on updates to the AB 617 Blueprint based on lessons learned during Year 1, compiling and sharing resources on strategies, and continuing the development of tools to support the program (AQ View Data Portal, Emissions Inventory, and Technology Clearinghouse).

Mr. Cunha thanked Ms. Magliano and Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, who would be retiring soon, for all of their hard work on AB 617 and their many important contributions to improving air quality in the Valley and the state.

Ms. Alves commended the great work that everyone has been doing and said this is something that Valley communities can replicate in the future. She said she looked forward to reviewing the Blueprint and to follow up and see all the good work that continues to happen with collaboration of all the various stakeholders.

12. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, provided an update on outreach efforts in the Valley. The District continues to be involved with schools working on no idling programs and making sure that as we get into the summer months and into next year that they are prepared for those poor air quality days and have the tools they need to know when to adjust outdoor activities. Ms. Holt reported the District held a press event last week in Exeter that was about the cleanest diesel locomotive switchers that are going to be deployed. Lastly, she said staff was looking forward to participating in numerous Earth Day events in April.

Mr. Savage said that his company would have a booth at Earth Day events as well. Ms. Alves said the City of Patterson would hold an Earth and Science Festival in the near future. She asked about future outreach for Bike to Work and Bike to School. Ms. Holt said staff was very mindful of outreach in communities where Bike to School is not feasible due to rural locations. She said more information would be release in early May.

Public Comment: None

13. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS – Chairman Abernathy and CAC members shared fond memories of working with Mr. Warner and Ms. Magliano on many important measures to improve air quality for the Valley's residents. They expressed appreciation for their hard work and dedication and wished them both well in their upcoming retirements from the District and CARB, respectively.
14. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Abernathy volunteered to present the report at the March 19, 2020 Governing Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 11:33 a.m.

Next Meeting – The next CAC meeting is scheduled on April 7, 2020. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.