

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

May 5, 2020
10:00 a.m.

Meeting held via video teleconferencing with the Central Region Office (Fresno). This meeting was also webcast. Given the international COVID-19 pandemic, and consistent with the California Department of Public Health's recommendations and Governor Newsom's Executive Order N-29-20, no physical location was provided for public attendance.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Kevin Abernathy, called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m. He announced the District was responding to the COVID-19 pandemic by holding this meeting in a manner consistent with Governor Newsom's Executive Order N-33-20 and California Department of Public Health's recommendations for social distancing. He quickly summarized that the meeting was being held via video teleconference and webcast with no physical location for public attendance. However, he said members of the public who wished to address the Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC) members would be provided the opportunity to do so during the appropriate commenting periods. He thanked the CAC members and the public for their patience as we implement this new meeting format in response to the COVID-19 pandemic.

2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting but not to take action.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha / IAIG (P)	VTC
Kern	Les Clark / IAIG (P)	VTC
	Wayne Clausen / CIG (P)	VTC
Kings	Kelly Deming / EIG (P)	VTC
	Tim Parcel/IAIG (A)	VTC
Merced	Kevin Abernathy / EIG (P)	VTC
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl / IAIG (P)	VTC
	Ned Leiba / EIG (P)	VTC
	Eleassia Davis / CIG (A)	VTC
Stanislaus	Chris Savage / IAIG (P)	VTC
Tulare	Derek Williams / IAIG (P)*	Central

*Arrived at 10:08 a.m.

* (P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 4, 2020 AND MARCH 3, 2020 – This item was tabled as there was not a quorum present to take action.
4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None
5. CHAIR COMMENTS – Chairman Abernathy
6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, reported that throughout the COVID-19 pandemic the District is continuing to provide essential services in support of our mission to improve air quality and protect public health in the Valley, albeit many District operations have had to be modified to accommodate social distancing recommendations by public health officials. As an air quality update, Mr. Sheikh reported that the historically good air quality seen this last winter has continued into the early spring. While it's too early to directly determine the impacts of the various control measures that the District has put into place and the impacts from the measures put into place in response to COVID-19, the District is pulling some data together and will be sharing an analysis as the pandemic continues to unfold.

Mr. Cunha asked if CAC members would receive a presentation on the District's recommended budget for 2020-21 at their next meeting. Mr. Sheikh responded that it is not part of the District's process to present the recommended budget to CAC members, but he said he would be happy to provide an update at the next meeting. Mr. Cunha asked for specific budget information on FARMER funding and the District's Tractor Replacement Program and whether the District is on track to meet State Implementation Plan (SIP) deadlines. Mr. Sheikh that staff would provide an update on next year's budget advocacy later in the meeting.

Mr. Abernathy said it was an interesting dynamic considering we have virtually shut the economy down due to COVID-19 and the Valley is seeing some air quality benefits as a result. He asked if staff had an idea where we are at today in reference to the latest ozone standard. Mr. Sheikh responded it was too early to determine the impacts on the shutdown on ozone levels. He added the Valley will be entering the summer ozone season and staff will be evaluating conditions to gain a better understanding on the impacts.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Jessica Coria, Program Manager Air Quality Science and Planning, provided an update on the District’s planning and rule development efforts.

Public Comment – None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD – Laura Carr, CARB representative, gave a brief summary of the Board meeting held on April 23, 2020.

Public Comment - None

9. ANALYSIS OF 2000-2020 EMISSIONS TRENDS AT CARB FRESNO AIR MONITORING SITE – Nargis Jareen and Barbara Weller, Ph.D., CARB Research Division, provided an overview of 20 years of air pollution and exposure research in the San Joaquin Valley, including health outcomes seen in the Fresno Asthmatic Children’s Environment Study (FACES) and the Children’s Health and Air Pollution Study (CHAPS). CARB also reported on the air quality trends observed in the Fresno area, including significant reductions in NO₂, PM₁₀, and PM_{2.5}, as well as reductions in polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons. Under a new CARB contract, researchers will continue work to investigate source-specific exposures for multiple pollutants, study wildfire-related health outcomes, and continue to follow-up on the health outcomes of the CHAPS cohort.

Mr. Cunha asked if the CARB study will also be including the impacts of the District’s successful Check Before You Burn program on Valley air quality. Ms. Weller responded that the study will look at a host of PM sources such as mobile sources, residential burning, prescribed burning, and wildfires.

Mr. Leiba complimented this presentation and suggested there should be health effect studies as part of the AB 617 process in Stockton. He also reminded CARB staff that CAC members asked to be involved in the Request for Proposal (RFP) process in terms of new studies in the Valley.

Mr. Clark commented on stationary source aspects of the study. He said the costs associated with the proposed actions to address the remaining emission would be astronomically high and would continue to impact large and small oil producers to the point where some would have to go out of business.

Mr. Sheikh commented that the District is very interested in the study and has not been involved to this point. He said staff received information in late-April and are looking at the data right now. He said staff would continue to interact with CARB and the researchers to get a better handle on the information included in the study.

Public Comment: None

10. UPDATE ON DISTRICT'S RESPONSE TO COVID-19 – Morgan Lambert, Deputy APCO, provided an update on the District's proactive approach in responding to the COVID-19 pandemic based on directives, guidelines, and recommendations from local, state, and federal officials. The District has significantly modified its operations in order to continue conducting the District's essential air quality efforts and providing meaningful mechanism for stakeholder engagement. Mr. Lambert also updated the CAC on the COVID-19 emergency economic assistance relief measures adopted by the Board at the April 2020 meeting.

Mr. Clark thanked Mr. Lambert for his presentation and said it was timely because he represents a lot of small oil operators who will have to shut down their operations because COVID-19. He added they are very mindful of their compliance and will make every effort to stay in compliance during the pandemic.

Chairman Abernathy said the District permits the majority of the critical infrastructure when it comes to feeding the nation and a good part of the world. He said the fact that staff have been able to very eloquently put together a process in such a short time was impressive and gave kudos to all involved. He said from his experience, the District was the only agency that has been able to make accommodations and put together a clear, concise process moving forward.

Public Comment – None

11. LEGISLATIVE UPDATE – Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, gave members an update on the current status of the state legislature, the state budget process, and also legislative activities at the federal level.

Mr. Cunha said NRCS just got notice that they will receive \$18 million, plus an additional \$5 million in state funding for their tractor program this year. He mentioned that CARB's Truck and Bus Rule is taking a lot of trucks out of commission, which is making it hard for the small owner operators to find trucks to haul agricultural products. He suggested working with the federal government to address in the stimulus funding package to get newer, used trucks to farmers and independent truck drivers as soon as possible and address this issue.

Mr. Sheikh said CARB does not have a lot of tools at their disposal right now to provide any flexibility with the DMV registration component of that issue. He said staff definitely would like to work with Mr. Cunha to help address this issue with funding from the COVID-19 economic stimulus package.

12. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATES –

- a. Ryan Hayashi, Director of the District’s Compliance Department, provided an update on the District’s ongoing activities related to AB 617 implementation. Throughout 2019, the District worked with Community Steering Committees and the public to develop Community Emission Reduction Programs (CERPs) for the AB 617 communities of South Central Fresno and Shafter. On September 19, 2019, the District’s Governing Board approved the CERPs for both communities, and on February 13, 2020, CARB unanimously approved both CERPs. Mr. Hayashi said District staff is now working with the Community Steering Committees to prioritize and begin implementation of the CERP measures.

The Board also took action in September 2019 to recommend that CARB consider Southwest Stockton as a second year AB 617 community, and on December 13, 2019, CARB selected Southwest Stockton as one of the 3 new AB 617 communities. The District held an AB 617 Community Kickoff meeting on January 22, 2020, and applications are currently being accepted for the Southwest Stockton Community Steering Committee. The first Southwest Stockton Community Steering Committee meeting is scheduled for March 4, 2020.

Since the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, the District has been working with the Community Steering Committees to re-envision the process and community engagement in light of stay-at-home orders and social distancing recommendations. Beginning May 6th, the District will begin holding community steering committees utilizing online meeting tools to continue moving forward with the process during the pandemic.

- b. Vernon Hughes, CARB Office of Community Air Protection, provided an update on efforts underway by CARB to implement AB 617 in light of the current situation surrounding COVID-19. Mr. Hughes reported that their Board is working to complete the process of considering the CERPs for the Year 1 communities. CARB adopted the CERPs for South Central Fresno and Shafter on February 13, 2020, at a hearing in Shafter, CA. Moving forward CARB will be partnering with the districts on CERP implementation, working on updates to the AB 617 Blueprint based on lessons learned during Year 1, compiling and sharing resources on strategies, and continuing the development of tools to support the program (AQ View Data Portal, Emissions Inventory, and Technology Clearinghouse).

Mr. Clark expressed concern about being left out of the loop of potential rules and regulations from AB 617 Community Emissions Reductions Programs (CERPs). Mr. Hughes responded that the process to develop CERPs and corresponding rules is a public process and staff works hard to get community members engaged.

Mr. Sheikh added the District has just started this process with the Community Steering Committee in Stockton and said it was premature to be talking about what might be contained in the CERPs. With regards to District regulations, there is a very public process and staff works closely with stakeholders and stationary sources with respect to the cost of different options and the socioeconomic impacts that are related to the different options. The District is also discussing using its incentives programs towards those efforts as well. With the current COVID-19 situation, he said staff is ensuring the public process remains intact with proposed regulations and programs from AB 617.

13. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, provided an update on outreach efforts in the Valley including a meeting with Burn Cleaner retailers, upcoming social media advertising for the Burn Cleaner program, and the District's Kids Kit. She added staff would also be participating in virtual Bike Month activities with Councils of Governments (COGs) in the Valley.

Public Comment: None

14. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS – Mr. Abernathy asked for an update on the ERC Review conducted by CARB. Mr. Sheikh responded CARB did not have an update for this month's meeting, but he understood their plan is to hold a workshop in the near future before taking the item to their Board. Mr. Abernathy reiterated that he would like the coordination of CARB's information release to CAC members, prior to giving that information to their Board.

Mr. Leiba reiterated the need for real health studies that show health outcomes from well-designed studies.

15. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Abernathy volunteered to present the report at the next Governing Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:16 p.m.

Next Meeting – The next CAC meeting is scheduled on June 2, 2020. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.