

Action Summary Minutes  
**San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District**

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**October 6, 2020**  
**10:00 a.m.**

*Meeting held via video teleconferencing with the Central Region Office (Fresno). This meeting was also webcast. Given the international COVID-19 pandemic, and consistent with the California Department of Public Health's recommendations and Governor Newsom's Executive Order N-29-20, no physical location was provided for public attendance.*

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Kevin Abernathy, called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m. He announced the District was responding to the COVID-19 pandemic by holding this meeting in a manner consistent with Governor Newsom's Executive Order N-33-20 and California Department of Public Health's recommendations for social distancing. He quickly summarized that the meeting was being held via video teleconference and webcast with no physical location for public attendance. However, he said members of the public who wished to address the Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC) members would be provided the opportunity to do so during the appropriate commenting periods. He thanked the CAC members and the public for their patience as we implement this new meeting format in response to the COVID-19 pandemic.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting but not to take action.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha / IAIG (P)	VTC
Kern	Les Clark / IAIG (P)	VTC
	Wayne Clausen / CIG (P)	VTC
	Carolyn Temple / EIG (P)	VTC
Kings	Kelly Deming / EIG (P)	VTC
Madera	Don Horal / IAIG (P)	VTC
	Brittany Dyer / EIG (P)	VTC
Merced	Kevin Abernathy / IAIG (P)	VTC
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl / IAIG (P)	VTC
	Ned Leiba / EIG (P)	VTC
Stanislaus	Chris Savage / IAIG (P)*	VTC
	Richard O'Brien / CIG (P)	VTC

Shivaugn Alves/EIG (P)\*

Tulare

Derek Williams / IAIG (P)

VTC

*\*arrived at 10:15 a.m.*

*\* (P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group*

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR SEPTEMBER 1, 2020 – This item was tabled because there was not a quorum present to take action.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, provided the CAC members an update on a few key items:

- On September 23, 2020, the Governor issued an Executive Order that contained several very ambitious goals. The key goals include: 100 percent of in-state sales of new passenger cars and trucks will be zero-emission by 2035; 100 percent of medium-and heavy-duty vehicles in the state be zero-emission by 2045 for all operations where feasible and by 2035 for drayage trucks; and 100 percent zero-emission off-road vehicles and equipment by 2035 where feasible. The Order also goes on to describe a number of other areas where various state agencies are directed to look at a variety of low carbon and zero emission opportunities.
- On September 17, 2020, the Governing Board adopted recommendations that CARB consider the community of Arvin/Lamont in South Kern County for both community air monitoring and emission reduction program and a secondary nomination for the community of La Vina in South Madera County. The District's recommendations for additional communities are contingent upon sufficient state resources being made available to support implementation of this program.

Mr. Cunha mentioned a letter written by the EPA Administrator in response to Governor Newsom's Executive Order mandating state implementation of zero emission vehicles. He suggested adding this topic to a future meeting agenda.

Mr. Sheikh confirmed there was a response from EPA on the zero emission vehicle targets that are in the Executive Order raising concerns about the legality of the implementation of that mandate. He said the state recently responded to the letter and staff would continue to keep CAC members updated as the situation develops. Mr.

Sheikh said he would also present a summary of the Executive Orders at the Governing Board meeting next week.

Chairman Abernathy said he would appreciate if the Governor found a way to realistically accomplish this goal, which would certainly help the District meet its air quality goals.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Jessica Coria, Program Manager Air Quality Science and Planning, provided an update on the District’s planning and rule development efforts.

Public Comment: None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD – Laura Carr, CARB representative, provided a brief summary of the Board meeting held on September 24, 2020.

Public Comment: None

9. CARB UPDATE ON RESEARCH PLANNING – Sonya Collier, Air Resources Engineer in CARB’s Research Division, provided the CAC with a review of the draft initiatives for CARB’s 2021-2024 Triennial Research Plan and sought feedback from CAC members. The plan included draft initiatives under the following categorical areas: Health, Environmental Justice, Economics, Air Quality – State Implementation Plans, Air Quality – Mobile Sources, and Climate. CARB is currently coordinating with stakeholders and research partners on the draft initiatives and plans to take the plan to their board in January 2021.

Mr. Leiba said he applauds the interest in health analysis and studies. He said health studies should be fundamental to the work that the District is doing. He asked if an RFP has been developed for any asthma studies in the Stockton AB 617 area, as there have been multiple requests for such a study.

Bonnie Holmes-Gen, Branch Chief of CARB’s Health Exposure Assessment Branch, responded that CARB has some research that is ongoing on asthma, asthma incidence, and use of asthma medications that has included thousands of individuals statewide. She said she would find out how many participating individuals are located in the Stockton area, and said the method of study is using GPS-enabled asthma inhalers and collecting information on where they see asthma incidents. The study is trying to tie those incidents and medication uses to sources and understand better both where they are seeing the incidence and the primary sources that are causing these asthma incidents. She added in the context of their current research planning cycle, they are

looking at the need for a better understanding of the health-based baselines in AB 617 communities and how CARB can both develop more information on those health baselines and look toward understanding what metrics might be important to better track health.

Mr. Cunha expressed concern at the effects of COVID-19 on businesses, transportation, jobs, and the health and welfare of our communities. He said it was important for CARB and other agencies to take these recent developments into consideration for future research projects and planned regulation.

Jorn Herner, Branch Chief of CARB's Research Planning, Administration & Emissions Research Section, responded that they consider the economic impact of any rules they are considering. He added it was clear that COVID-19 has affected our transportation sector quite significantly and CARB has put in place a number of different research projects to start to explore those areas.

Public Comment: None

10. RECEIVE UPDATE ON 2020 AGRICULTURAL BURNING REPORT – Jessica Coria, Program Manager in the District's Air Quality Science and Planning Department, presented an update on the progress in preparing the District's 2020 Staff Report and Recommendations on Agricultural Burning. This report is required every 5 years to address the requirements imposed by SB 705 (Florez). Ms. Coria discussed the longstanding efforts to reduce agricultural burning in the Valley and the ongoing efforts to identify additional alternatives for the remaining categories that are still currently allowed to be burned. The 2020 Report will assess the availability, feasibility, and cost of alternatives, and will provide recommendations to the Governing Board in December 2020 to consider in addressing the mandates under state law. The adopted recommendations will be submitted to CARB in December 2020 for their review and concurrence as required by law.

Mr. O'Brien asked about the emissions from open burning compared to using diesel chippers and shredders. Mr. Coria responded that staff will be conducting a life cycle emissions analysis for each of those potential alternatives to ensure there is a net benefit. She said so far they have seen that it is only a fraction of the emissions that would occur from open burning.

Mr. Williams suggested that staff conduct a study on the composition of the pollutants from open burning versus using diesel chippers and shredders.

Public Comment: None

11. UPDATE ON DISTRICT RESPONSE TO CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD'S REVIEW OF DISTRICT EMISSION REDUCTION CREDIT SYSTEM – Morgan Lambert, Deputy APCO, provided an update on the District's actions in response to CARB's review of the emission reduction credit (ERC) system. The ERC Public Advisory Workgroup held its first meeting on September 18, 2020. The workgroup was created by the Governing Board to provide a forum for discussion and suggestions to assist the District in developing solutions and enhancements related to the District's ERC and offset equivalency system, as needed to maintain an effective permitting system that allows for the protection of public health and strong economic growth in the Valley. Additionally, Mr. Lambert advised the members that the Governing Board took action at their September 2020 meeting to provisionally remove all emission reductions from Ag-ICE and orphan shutdown projects from the equivalency system effective September 17, 2020. This action was taken to address concerns raised by CARB about the creditability of these projects, and to allow the public process to inform the development of mechanisms and methodologies for the use of these and other types of creditable emission reductions in demonstrating equivalency. With the removal of these credits, the system cannot demonstrate equivalency with the surplus value test for NOx and VOC, and any new major source or federal major modification triggering NOx or VOC offsets under District Rule 2201 must now provide "surplus at time of use" credits. The District is working on finalizing the 2020 annual equivalency demonstration for the remaining pollutants and tests required under Rule 2201. The District plans to hold a public workshop in late October or early November with the final report being submitted to EPA and CARB by no later than November 20, 2020.

Public Comment: None

12. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATES –
- a. Ryan Hayashi, Deputy APCO, provided an update on the District's ongoing activities related to AB 617 implementation. Since the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, the District has been working with the Community Steering Committees to re-envision the process and community engagement in light of stay-at-home orders and social distancing recommendations. The Community Steering Committees are continuing to have meetings utilizing online meeting tools. The South Central Fresno and Shafter communities are continuing to work on implementing the Community Emission Reduction Programs (CERPs) approved earlier this year. The Stockton community is working to develop a Community Air Monitoring Plan and CERP for consideration by the District and CARB later this year. At the August meeting, the District Governing Board approved the issuance of meeting stipends for resident members of the Community Steering Committees.

Mr. Hayashi reported that on September 24, 2020, CARB's Board received an update on Community Emission Reduction Programs from Imperial County, Bay

Area AQMD, and the District's two communities. This was an informational item and included no Board action.

The Annual Report drafts for South Central and Shafter community steering committees have been posted to each of the community specific AB 617 webpages and were presented to CSC members for comment. The final reports will be taken to the District's Board in November.

Mr. Hayashi also reported that the District has submitted 5 project plans to CARB for the use of Community Air Protection incentive funds to implement measures contained in the South Central and Shafter CERPs. These projects have to be approved by CARB prior to using these funds. The projects submitted to date are as follows:

- Truck re-route study in Fresno (first project to receive approval in the state)
  - Commercial lawn and garden
  - Residential lawn and garden
  - Alternatives to agricultural burning
  - Low-dust nut harvester
- b. Karen Buckley, CARB Office of Community Air Protection, provided an update on efforts underway by CARB to implement AB 617. Moving forward, CARB will be partnering with the districts on CERP implementation, working on updates to the AB 617 Blueprint based on lessons learned during Year 1, compiling and sharing resources on strategies, and continuing the development of tools to support the program (AQ View Data Portal, Emissions Inventory, and Technology Clearinghouse). At the September 24, 2020, board meeting, CARB received an update on the implementation of the Community Emissions Reduction Programs adopted for South Central Fresno, Shafter, West Oakland, and Imperial. In addition, each year CARB considers the selection of new communities for the program. In November, staff will release draft recommendations and the Board will considered the selection of new communities in December 2020.

Public Comment: None

12. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – This item was tabled in the interest of time.

Public Comment: None

13. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS – None

14. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Abernathy volunteered to present the report during the October 15, 2020 Governing Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:34 p.m.

Next Meeting – NO MEETING IN NOVEMBER. The next CAC meeting is scheduled on December 1, 2020. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.