

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

September 1, 2020
10:00 a.m.

Meeting held via video teleconferencing with the Central Region Office (Fresno). This meeting was also webcast. Given the international COVID-19 pandemic, and consistent with the California Department of Public Health's recommendations and Governor Newsom's Executive Order N-29-20, no physical location was provided for public attendance.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Kevin Abernathy, called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m. He announced the District was responding to the COVID-19 pandemic by holding this meeting in a manner consistent with Governor Newsom's Executive Order N-33-20 and California Department of Public Health's recommendations for social distancing. He quickly summarized that the meeting was being held via video teleconference and webcast with no physical location for public attendance. However, he said members of the public who wished to address the Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC) members would be provided the opportunity to do so during the appropriate commenting periods. He thanked the CAC members and the public for their patience as we implement this new meeting format in response to the COVID-19 pandemic.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting but not to take action.

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Location</u>
Fresno	Manuel Cunha / IAIG (P)	VTC
	Gary Yep / CIG (P)	VTC
Kern	Christine Zimmerman / IAIG (A)	VTC
	Wayne Clausen / CIG (P)	VTC
	Carolyn Temple / EIG (P)	VTC
Kings	Kelly Deming / EIG (P)	VTC
Madera	Don Horal / IAIG (P)	VTC
	Brittany Dyer / EIG (P)	VTC
Merced	Kevin Abernathy / IAIG (P)	VTC
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl / IAIG (P)	VTC
	Ned Leiba / EIG (P)	VTC
	Eleassia Davis / CIG (A)	VTC

Stanislaus	Chris Savage / IAIG (P)* Richard O'Brien / CIG (P)	VTC VTC
Tulare	Derek Williams / IAIG (P)	VTC

*arrived at 10:15 a.m.

* (P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR AUGUST 4, 2020 – The Chair asked for member comments or questions regarding the Minutes from August 4, 2020. Hearing none, the Chair deemed the Minutes approved.

Public Comment: None

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

5. CHAIR COMMENTS – None

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, provided the CAC members an update on two key items from the August 2020 Governing Board meeting:

- The Governing Board authorized agreements with Valley Clean Air Now to continue implementation of the Drive Clean in the San Joaquin Vehicle Replacement Program. This includes approximately \$7.1 million in new grant funding for the program, and up to \$840 thousand for program administration.
- The Governing Board had a discussion about the District's Commercial Underfired Charbroiling Strategy and 2018 PM2.5 Plan commitments. The discussion included the District's ongoing efforts and progress to date, the technological difficulties in developing and deploying feasible control technologies, and the severe economic impacts to the restaurant industry from the COVID-19 pandemic.

Mr. Cunha said since most restaurants have been closed to indoor seating since earlier this year, does the District have a plan to provide incentives to assist with costs, if they are required to install new equipment and controls. Mr. Sheikh responded that incentives would be a huge part of the strategy. For example, he said currently the District offers 100% funding for the control technology and two years of maintenance costs. He said at the recent Board meeting, there were some discussions around increasing funding for maintenance costs to include five years to make sure there is more certainty about the ability of restaurants to implement the controls. He added the

District is currently focusing on high throughput commercial underfired operations. He said timing is also a consideration, so actually putting together a plan this year does not necessarily mean the controls need to be in place this year. He said it could be a long window of time to enable the District to work with the restaurants to deploy incentives and then ultimately work towards that goal. Mr. Sheikh said there may need to be different strategies for existing restaurants versus new restaurants. Mr. Sheikh said one of the results of the discussion with the Governing Board was the establishment of a focus group consisting of restaurant owners to work through the challenges and opportunities, what incentive program structures might work the best, and what timeframes may be feasible.

Public Comment: None

7. UPDATES ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Jessica Coria, Program Manager Air Quality Science and Planning, provided an update on the District’s planning and rule development efforts.

Public Comment: None

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD – Laura Carr, CARB representative, provided a brief summary of the Board meeting held on August 27, 2020.

Mr. Cunha commented on the CARB’s new Ocean-Going Vessels At Berth regulation. He said COVID-19 has introduced many challenges at the ports for the transportation of products, and said CARB should be considering these issues, rather than trying to develop new rules for our ports.

Public Comment: None

9. PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO FOR CONSIDERATION IN THE APPOINTMENT OF THREE CAC MEMBERS TO SERVE ON THE EMISSION REDUCTION CREDIT PROGRAM PUBLIC ADVISORY WORKGROUP – Morgan Lambert, Deputy APCO, advised the CAC members that in response to the recent review by CARB of the District’s Emission Reduction Credit (ERC) program, the Governing Board created a new public advisory workgroup to assist in developing solutions to enhance the ERC program. Mr. Lambert solicited recommendations for three members of the CAC (one from each interest group) to participate on the public advisory workgroup. The following members were recommended by their respective CAC interest groups: Les Clark (Industry/Ag), Kelly Deming (Environmental), and Mayor Richard O’Brien (City).

Mr. Savage asked if there was a good cadence set up to get feedback from the workgroup back to CAC members. He said it was important for members to have a

good understanding on progress being made. He added this was a very important issue to the entire District and getting feedback at the right time to CAC members for additional input was very important in his mind. Mr. Abernathy agreed and asked staff moving forward to provide an update, along with the newly appointed public advisory workgroup members, at future CAC meetings.

Public Comment: None

10. UPDATE ON WILDFIRE IMPACTS AND RESPONSE – Jon Klassen, Director of Air Quality Science and Planning, and Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, provided the CAC with an update on the August 2020 lightning siege that resulted in hundreds of wildfires across the state. Emissions from these fires resulted in significant particulate matter and ozone air quality impacts across the Valley. In response, the District has issued bilingual Health Cautionary Statements and Air Quality Alerts and utilized multiple outreach platforms to inform the public of the need to protect themselves and reduce their exposure by moving indoors to a filtered, air-conditioned environment if possible.

Chairman Abernathy asked if the District has completed any modeling that would give us any indication of how much worse the impacts of wildfire smoke on PM2.5 on ozone would have been if the District had not had all of the rules in place that have made the air quality significantly better. Mr. Sheikh responded it was a difficult question to answer, but over the years PM2.5 and ozone have dropped significantly because of the various measures that industries, cities, and residents have all worked hard to put into place. For example, he said this time of the year we might be seeing single digit values for PM2.5 on a typical day where we actually saw values exceeding 150 micrograms due to the wildfires. The emissions and the impacts that come from these massive wildfires completely overwhelm all of the local emissions in the Valley. He said the reduced emissions that we now see in the Valley help to some extent with the air quality effects of wildfire smoke.

Chairman Abernathy asked if the District has the ability to label wildfires as an exceptional event. Mr. Sheikh said when it comes to federal attainment purposes and showing whether or not the Valley meets various federal standards, there are provisions within the Clean Air Act and processes that EPA has developed that allow emissions from wildfires to be considered exceptional events. He added it would allow for the air quality impacts from wildfires to be subtracted or eliminated from the calculations that are used for federal purposes in determining attainment with air quality standards. He said the real issue is that there is a lot of work and modeling and other science that must be pulled together to be able to eliminate these values from the federal equations. He said Mr. Klassen has an entire team that is working on that right now.

Mr. Cunha said agricultural leaders have met with the Division of Occupational Safety and Health (Cal/OSHA) to develop guidelines for agricultural workers and processing

facilities related to wildfire smoke. He said they are in the process of distributing 400,000 N95 masks to agricultural organizations in the Valley. He said they are also distributing surgical masks to farm families and labor contractors throughout Valley communities to protect farmworkers and their families.

Mr. Sheikh acknowledged Mr. Cunha's comments and said the District recognizes the unprecedented scale of responding to wildfire smoke impacts in the middle of a pandemic. He added staff has done their best to assist in this area with respect to the OSHA regulation.

Public Comment: None

11. LEGISLATIVE UPDATE – Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, gave members an update on issues dealt with by the legislature during their most recent session.

Mr. Cunha expressed concern about diminished Cap and Trade funding and the growing state budget deficit. He said the over expenditures would cause havoc for the District's State Implementation Plan (SIP) and for other programs where incentives are important, including FARMER funding.

Mr. Jordan said Cap and Trade has been the main funding source and there is a lot more competition for those funds this year. CARB made a very large commitment in the SIP for incentive funds and it is getting harder and harder to figure out where all of those funds are going to come from. He said staff have had some discussions with people about the broader issue of air quality incentives in the state and how we come up with those revenues for tractors, trucks and all of the programs we operate.

Mr. Savage strongly suggested the Board take a more active and very public position that the Cap and Trade funding needs to go towards air quality improvement projects and any dollar that is spent on non-air quality projects is completely a departure from the intent of the program.

Mr. Abernathy suggested the CAC should have an in-depth discussion on how the diversity of the group could help the District in providing advocacy in Sacramento. Mr. Sheikh said it is all hands on deck right now and he agrees that we need to advocate as forcefully and effectively as possible right now. He said he would be open to placing an item on a future agenda with some policy positions and recommendations that would allow this body to weigh in with some specificity about the issues that were just discussed.

Mr. Abernathy suggested CAC members provide a letter of support for increased incentive funding from Cap and Trade. Mr. Cunha agreed and made a motion to authorize the Chairs of each Interest Group and CAC Chair to work with staff to create a

letter emphasizing the importance of Cap and Trade funds be directed to programs that provide air quality benefits.

Moved: Cunha
Seconded: Deming
Ayes: Cunha, Zimmerman, Horal, Hoffdahl, Savage, Williams, Deming,
Dyer, Abernathy, Leiba, Yep, Clausen, Davis, O'Brien
Noes: None

Motion passed unanimously to authorize the CAC Chair and Chairs of each Interest Group to work with staff to create a letter focused on the short term priorities and also restating those priorities in the budget process. In addition to stressing the importance of Cap and Trade funding should be directed to programs that provide air quality benefits.

Public Comment: None

12. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATES –

- a. Ryan Hayashi, Deputy APCO, provided an update on the District's ongoing activities related to AB 617 implementation. Since the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, the District has been working with the Community Steering Committees to re-envision the process and community engagement in light of stay-at-home orders and social distancing recommendations. The Community Steering Committees are continuing to have meetings utilizing online meeting tools. The South Central Fresno and Shafter communities are continuing to work on implementing the Community Emission Reduction Programs (CERPs) approved earlier this year. The Stockton community is working to develop a Community Air Monitoring Plan and CERP for consideration by the District and CARB later this year. At the August meeting, the District Governing Board approved the issuance of meeting stipends for resident members of the Community Steering Committees.

Mr. Hayashi also provided an update of the District's efforts to propose communities for CARB's consideration under Year 3 of the AB 617 program. The District held a public workshop on August 3, 2010, to solicit input on communities and the proposed community selection methodology for Year 3 of the program. The Governing Board will consider staff's Year 3 community proposal at the September 17, 2020, meeting, and CARB will consider community nominations for final selection in the 4th Quarter of 2020.

- b. Vernon Hughes, CARB Office of Community Air Protection, provided an update on efforts underway by CARB to implement AB 617. Moving forward, CARB will be partnering with the districts on CERP implementation, working

on updates to the AB 617 Blueprint based on lessons learned during Year 1, compiling and sharing resources on strategies, and continuing the development of tools to support the program (AQ View Data Portal, Emissions Inventory, and Technology Clearinghouse). At the September 24, 2020, board meeting, CARB will receive an update on the implementation of the Community Emissions Reduction Programs adopted for South Central Fresno, Shafter, West Oakland, and Imperial.

Public Comment: None

12. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, provided an update on the District’s outreach efforts in the Valley, including comprehensive outreach related to the effects from wildfires; Summer Healthy Air Living program with slightly altered messaging due to the pandemic; Drive Clean in the San Joaquin program is now virtual; and preparations for the upcoming Check Before You Burn season.

Public Comment: None

13. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS –

14. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING – Mr. Abernathy volunteered to present the report during the September 17, 2020 Governing Board meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:08 p.m.

Next Meeting –The next CAC meeting is scheduled on October 5, 2020. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating.