

Action Summary Minutes  
San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

**May 2, 2023 at 10:00 a.m.**

*The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, VTC Room, 34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield and teleconference in the Northern Region Office, VTC Room, 4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto. Members of the public were allowed to participate in-person at any of the referenced locations or remotely via Zoom webinar. The CAC Meeting was also webcast.*

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Manuel Cunha, called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting.

County	Member Name	Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha	IAIG (P)	Fresno
	Kacey Auston-Tibbetts <sup>1</sup>	EIG (P)	Fresno
Kern	Les Clark	IAIG (P)	Bakersfield
	John Sanders <sup>2</sup>	EIG (P)	Bakersfield
	Orchel Krier	CIG (P)	Bakersfield
Kings	Laura Brown <sup>3</sup>	IAIG (P)	Fresno
	Brayden Sanchez	EIG (A)	Fresno
	Patricia Matthews	CIG (A)	Fresno
Madera	Brittany Dyer <sup>4</sup>	EIG (P)	Fresno
Merced	Amy Lopes	IAIG (A)	Modesto
	Jose Delgadillo	CIG (P)	Modesto
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl	IAIG (P)	Modesto
	Ned Leiba	EIG (P)	Modesto
Stanislaus	Jami Aggers	EIG (P)	Modesto
	Richard O'Brien <sup>5</sup>	CIG (P)	Modesto
Tulare	Derek Williams <sup>6</sup>	IAIG (P)	Fresno
	Dennis Mederos	CIG (P)	Fresno

*(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group*

3. APPROVE MINUTES FOR APRIL 4, 2023 – Mr. Cunha asked for member comments on the minutes from the previous CAC meeting. Hearing no comments or changes, he declared the minutes approved.

<sup>1</sup> Left meeting at 11:12 a.m.

<sup>2</sup> Left meeting at 12:11 p.m.

<sup>3</sup> Left meeting at 11:56 a.m.

<sup>4</sup> Left meeting at 12:07 pm

<sup>5</sup> Left meeting at 10:24 a.m.

<sup>6</sup> Left meeting at 11:21 a.m.

Public Comment: none

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – none
5. CHAIR COMMENTS – Mr. Cunha welcomed the committee members and staff, and thanked everyone for their attendance.
6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, welcomed the committee members and thanked them for strong attendance.
  - On April 20, 2023, Councilmember Rosa Escutia-Braaton from the City of Modesto and Councilmember Gilberto Reyna from the City of Wasco were appointed by the Special City Selection Committee to the Governing Board to fill a large city and small city vacancy, respectively.
  - In April 2023, the Governing Board approved the new Valley-wide Clean Air Rooms program to provide residential air filtration units to residents in Disadvantaged Communities throughout the San Joaquin Valley with up to \$1,000,000 in funding for this program.
  - In April 2023, the Governing Board approved a new Car Share Program within the Shafter AB 617 community, consistent with the approved Community Emissions Reduction Program for Shafter.
  - In May 2023, the Governing Board will be holding a hearing to receive public comments on the District's Recommended 2023-24 Budget. Additionally, the Governing Board will be holding a public hearing and considering adoption of the District's Contingency Measure State Implementation Plan Revision for the federal PM2.5 ambient air quality standards.

Ms. Dyer inquired about the Clean Air Room program, and how the locations would be determined and distributed throughout the Valley. Mr. Sheikh responded that the funding would be distributed proportionally based on County population and would target low income or disadvantaged communities as identified by CalEnviroScreen.

Ms. Dyer shared a concern that in Madera County, North Fork is often impacted by smoke from wildfires but is not accurately represented in CalEnviroScreen.

Public Comment: none

7. UPDATE ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES – Emily Kneeland, Planning Department Program Manager, provided an update on the District's planning and rule making efforts. Specifically, Ms. Kneeland shared that they continue to work on developing a revised attainment plan for 2012 PM2.5 standard. She also shared about the public workshop held in March and have another scheduled for May 11<sup>th</sup>.

8. VERBAL REPORT FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (CARB) – Laura Carr, CARB representative, provided an update from the April 27-28 CARB Board Hearing. She shared the Board adopted the In-Use Locomotive and the Advanced Clean Fleet regulations.

Ms. Auston-Tibbetts asked if there would be an alternate plan for extending timelines to small fleets based on manufacturing delays, and if there will be grants and incentives to the small business owners.

Mr. Williams would like to see data on how the dollar figure of savings to the trucking industry were calculated along with the information on how the numbers of lives saved and health dollars saved were calculated.

Mr. Sanders would like information on who is producing the equipment for the oil industry, since there are no vendors to provide electric/zero emission equipment.

Ms. Brown would like someone to explain how the \$48 billion of savings in operating costs are being substantiated.

Mr. Cunha requested follow up on how many trucks are registered in California.

Ms. Carr suggested coming back to the June CAC meeting with the appropriate staff from CARB who can answer these questions. Mr. Cunha expressed his appreciation to Ms. Carr and recommended coming back for the June CAC meeting.

9. UPDATE ON STATE FUNDING AND LEGISLATIVE SESSION – Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, provided an informational update on the state budget process and discussed the status of a series of bills that are of particular interest to the District and are being considered by the Legislature currently.

Ms. Dyer asked if there is any specific information being tracked with the Inflation Reduction Act. Mr. Jordan responded that there are many areas of the IRA that are being tracked by a multidisciplinary group at the District to monitor as federal funding comes out.

Mr. Cunha thanked Mr. Jordan for his presentation and Mr. Sheikh for the District's work on tracking funding opportunities.

Public Comment: none

10. REPORT ON CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD PROGRAM REVIEW OF DISTRICT ADMINISTRATION OF STATE AIR POLLUTION REDUCTION INCENTIVE PROGRAMS – Sheraz Gill, Deputy APCO, presented the results of the CARB program review of the District administration of state emission reduction incentive programs. This

review was the largest incentive program review ever conducted by CARB and covered eleven fiscal years, nine distinct incentive programs, approximately 13,500 individual projects, and more than \$623 million in funding. The review concluded that the District incentive programs reviewed are achieving their emissions reduction and program objectives in an effective and efficient manner and revealed no negative findings.

Mr. Leiba inquired about the annual federal single audit, and if this was a part of that process. Mr. Sheikh responded that the annual financial audits have been conducted every year with no findings, and are consistently reported to the Governing Board. Mr. Sheikh further explained that this specific audit is a deep dive programmatic audit as well as a state Department of Finance audit, which is well beyond the regular audit protocols.

11. REPORT ON 2022-2023 WINTER RESIDENTIAL WOODSMOKE REDUCTION STRATEGY – Robert Gilles, Program Manager in the Air Quality Science and Planning Department, and Heather Heinks, Program Manager in Outreach and Communications, presented the District’s report on implementation of the residential woodsmoke reduction strategy for the 2022-2023 winter season.

Mr. Krier shared a concern that the Governor is trying to eliminate gas stoves and water heaters, but yet the District is promoting gas stove inserts. Mr. Sheikh responded that the District offers these an option to reduce wood burning with both gas and electric heat sources being viable options.

Ms. Matthews suggested sharing the actual consumer cost of replacement stoves as part of the outreach, along with rebate amounts so that residents can have an idea of how much their actual investment will be.

12. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATES – Jessica Olsen, Director of Community Strategies and Resources, provided an update on the District’s ongoing activities related to AB 617 implementation. CARB has selected 4 communities in the Valley for focused clean air resources. South Central Fresno, Shafter, Stockton, and Arvin/Lamont. Each community has developed a community emissions reduction program and a community air monitoring plan and each consist of a community steering committee made up of residents, business representatives, community based organizations, local agencies, and other stakeholders who meet and work together to see the various adopted measures implemented in their community. In all of these communities, the District has continued to host monthly meetings on Zoom, but based on community interest, we have now planned for an in-person meeting for each of our CSCs. The District and CSCs have made progress on several incentives measures the past few weeks, including deploying a car share program in Shafter with Board approval last month, and the lawn mower exchange program in Arvin with CARB’s approval a few weeks ago.

Laura Zaremba-Schmidt, CARB Office of Community Air Protection, discussed the Community Air Grant program, for which the deadline to apply closed April 24. CARB will take an updated version of their Blueprint guidance to their Board in October. Ms. Matthews inquired about the lawnmower replacement program, and if there is any incentive program for the purchase of a new lawnmower. Ms. Olsen explained that the difference in the program for AB 617 communities is that the full cost of the replacement equipment is covered, and they are offered a full swap out. She further explained that outside of the AB 617 communities there is a \$250 incentive for replacement equipment.

13. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORT – Heather Heinks, Program Manager, provided an update on the District’s outreach and communication efforts.

14. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS-

Ms. Matthews shared the ongoing issues happening in Kings County due to flooding.

Mr. Cunha expressed concern on the after affects throughout the Valley from flooding.

15. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING-

Mr. Cunha volunteered to present at the April Governing Board Meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:14 p.m.