



San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District

The CAC approved the Minutes of Tuesday, April 4, 2006 with an amendment to page 4. The amendment will be reflected in the Minutes of Tuesday, May 2, 2006.

GOVERNING BOARD

Mike Maggard, Chair
Councilmember, City of Bakersfield

J. Steven Worthley, Vice Chair
Supervisor, Tulare County

Susan B. Anderson
Supervisor, Fresno County

Barbara Patrick
Supervisor, Kern County

Tony Barba
Supervisor, Kings County

Ronn Dominici
Supervisor, Madera County

Sam Armentrout
Councilmember, City of Madera

Michael G. Nelson
Supervisor, Merced County

Dan Prince
Councilmember, City of Ripon

Thomas W. Mayfield
Supervisor, Stanislaus County

Jack A. Sieglock
Supervisor, San Joaquin County

Seyed Sadredin
Executive Director/
Air Pollution Control Officer

Northern Region Office
4800 Enterprise Way
Modesto, CA 95356-8718
(209) 557-6400
FAX (209) 557-6475

Central Region Office
1990 East Gettysburg Avenue
Fresno, CA 93726-0244
(559) 230-6000
FAX (559) 230-6061

Southern Region Office
2700 M Street, Suite 275
Bakersfield, CA 93301-2373
(661) 326-6900
FAX (661) 326-6985

www.valleyair.org

Action Summary Minutes Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District Central Region Office, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue Governing Board Room, Fresno, CA.

**Tuesday, April 4, 2006
10:00 a.m.**

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, 2700 M Street, VTC Room, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, 4800 Enterprise Way, VTC Room, Modesto.

1. **Call to Order** – The Chair, Dennis Tristao, called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

2. **Roll Call** was taken and a quorum was present.

(P) Designates Primary Member and (A) designates Alternate Member

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Regional Office</u>
Fresno	(**) Karla Edwards, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Central
"	(**) Kevin Hamilton, Environmental (P)	Central
"	Sarah Sharpe, Environmental (A)	Central
Kern	(**) Les Clark, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Southern
"	Dana Karcher, Environmental (P)	Southern
"	Harry Love, Environmental (A)	Southern
"	Brent Green, City (P)	Southern
Kings	Riley Jones, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Central
"	Kelly Deming, Environmental (P)	Central
"	Dennis Tristao, City (P), Chair	Central
Madera	Don Horal, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Central
"	Lee Smith, Environmental (P)	Northern
"	John Wells, City (P)	Central
Merced	Chris Dodson, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Northern
"	Jack Mobley, Industry/Agriculture (A)	Northern
"	Mary-Michal Rawling, Environmental (P)	Northern
"	Dean Wilson, City (P)	Central

2. **Roll Call, continued**

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Regional Office</u>
<u>San Joaquin</u>	Perfecto Munoz, Environmental (A)	Northern
"	Wade Broughton, City (P)	Northern
<u>Stanislaus</u>	Chris Savage, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Northern
"	Denny Hoeh, Environmental (P)	Northern
<u>Tulare</u>	David Harrald, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Central
"	Gary Rohman, Industry/Agriculture (A)	Central
"	(*) Christine Foster, Environmental (P)	Central

(*) Arrived during Item #4

(**) Arrived during Item #5

Also present in the Central Region Office (Fresno) – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, Dave Warner, Director of Permit Services, Roger McCoy, Director of Administrative Services, George Heinen, Supervising Air Quality Engineer, Jaime Holt, Public Education Administrator, Tom Jordan, Special Projects Administrator, Colby Morrow, So. Cal. Gas Co., Alex Krivobok, Communication Systems Analyst and Sissy Smith, Clerk to the Board.

Also present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Jan Ennenga, Manufactures Council of the Central Valley, Karen Morris, Administrative Analyst and Dottie Shoffner, Senior Office Assistant.

Also present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Jerry Frost, Kern Oil and Refining, Nicky Langley, OEHI and Sharon Martinez, Senior Office Assistant.

4. **Chair Comments** – The Chair stated if the CAC members have items of interest they want to share with this group, mention them during the meeting, and we can put them on future agendas.

3. **Approve Minutes of Tuesday, March 7, 2006** – The Chair asked if there were any comments regarding the Minutes.

Mary-Michal Rawling requested the Minutes of Tuesday, March 7, 2006 be revised to reflect an amendment to:

Item # 5, **Deputy APCO Comments**. Ms. Rawling indicated the CAC had a discussion about threshold changes for BACT and wanted that discussion included in the minutes.

Item #7, **Informational Report regarding Air Monitoring Sites and Forecasting.** Ms. Rawling noted during the March 7, 2006 meeting that she asked a question about smaller forecast areas, and the CAC had a discussion about the monitoring and forecasting, and wanted that discussion included in the minutes.

Item #5 – Mr. Sadredin briefed the CAC regarding ARB's Evaluation of District Programs, and indicated one ARB recommendation deals with District regulations pertaining to cost effectiveness thresholds used for Best Available Control Technology (BACT), and ARB has indicated the District's cost effectiveness thresholds are too low. Mr. Sadredin, announced the District will be assembling a workgroup of experts in air pollution control technology to evaluate the District's current cost effectiveness thresholds, and a methodology will be developed to raise those thresholds to an appropriate level, if they are found to be inadequate. Mr. Sadredin noted interested members of the CAC should send him an e-mail volunteering to serve on the workgroup. Mr. Sadredin will make the appointments to the workgroup. The dates of the townhall meetings will be announced in the near future.

The CAC requested an example whereby the District's cost effectiveness numbers are significantly lower than some of the other air districts, and asked if they vary by project, or per rule.

Mr. Sadredin responded that for NO_x, the District's number is approximately \$9,000/per ton, and for the South Coast and some of the other air districts the number is \$24,000/per ton.

Mary-Michal Rawling indicated she would definitely be interested in being a part of the cost effective thresholds workgroup.

Item #7 – Mary-Michal Rawling indicated a statement was made that we generally have cleaner air on the West Side of the Valley versus the East Side, and asked if that is caused by Ozone, or PM, or both?

Shawn Ferreria, Air Quality Project Planner, stated the numbers will vary, and can even be changed by a NEAP event. Mr. Ferreria stated we normally see higher levels of PM and Ozone centered along the Highway 99 Corridor.

Evan Shipp, Supervising Air Quality Planner, announced the District hired a consultant who is currently working on a West Side air monitoring site survey, and after the site survey is completed the District will be going out to those specific sites to do additional monitoring.

Ms. Rawling noted the CAC should be very excited to be receiving more monitors on the West Side of the Valley, and as a body we should always be very supportive of getting more monitors in as many places as possible.

The Chair indicated the Minutes of Tuesday, March 7, 2006 were approved with the amendments to Item #5 and Item #7.

5. **Executive Director/APCO Comments** – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, updated the CAC on:

- The March 16, 2006 Governing Board Meeting
- The April 20, 2006 upcoming Governing Board Meeting

Mr. Sadredin also briefed the CAC on:

- A meeting was recently held to solicit input from stakeholders on how to spend District grant program funds. The meeting was well attended, and the District received good comments on where we should spend the money and how the District can make their system more efficient.
- A report was recently published by California State Fullerton about the cost of air pollution as it pertains to health, and the economic impact of doing business in the Valley. This report will hopefully, be taken to the Governing Board in May, and will also be presented to the CAC at one of their future meetings
- A commitment to do a number of Valleywide townhall meetings was made to the District's Governing Board during the recruitment and selection process of the Executive Director/APCO position. Additional information pertaining to this issue will be provided to all interested parties in the near future. It is hoped the CAC will play a large role in assembling, and participating in the townhall meetings.

The Chair congratulated Mr. Sadredin on his recent appointment as the District's Executive Director/APCO.

A CAC member requested a written report in respect to the meeting soliciting comments, and suggestions regarding expending the District's grant program funds, with concurrence from Mr. Sadredin.

The CAC also requested written information regarding the planned townhall meetings, specifically what type of feedback the District is looking for.

Mr. Sadredin noted the District will put together a summary of information regarding the upcoming townhall meetings for the CAC in the next two to three months.

Ms. Rawling stated the Governing Board recently approved a mitigation agreement, and she asked how does a mitigation agreement work now that the District's ISR Rule has gone into effect.

Mr. Sadredin explained the basic concept of a mitigation agreement is the applicant agrees to provide for one hundred percent mitigation, and at a minimum they have to comply with the ISR Rule.

Ms. Rawling asked for clarification by asking if a mitigation agreement will go through the ISR process first in addition to the contract agreement.

Mr. Sadredin responded by stating yes, if they are subject to the ISR Rule.

The Chair requested Action Item #8 be moved up on the agenda.

8. **Action Item: CAC Support/Oppose Governing Board's Consideration to Adopt the Proposed Amendments to Rule 4702 (Internal Combustion Engines – Phase 2) and Rule 4307 (Boilers, Steam Generators and Process Heater-s 2.0 MMBtu/hr to 5.0 MMBtu/hr** - Dave Warner, Director of Permit Services, briefed the CAC on Amendments to Rules 4307 and 4702. Mr. Warner explained the proposed Amendments to Rules 4307 and 4702 are administrative in nature, and will be presented to the Governing Board for adoption consideration on April 20, 2006.

Mr. Warner explained the proposed amendments are narrowly focused on three issues:

1. Allowing applicants additional time to submit applications
2. Changing a reference to the name of a future rule
3. Removing a reference to Rule 2250 in one section of Rule 4307

Mr. Warner indicated the proposed amendments pose no relaxation of any emission reduction requirements.

Karla Edwards spoke in support of the proposed amendments.

The following persons provided Public Comments during the public comment period of this item:

Colby Morrow, So. Cal. Gas Co., urged the CAC to support the proposed amendments going to the Governing Board for adoption.

Mr. Sadredin announced the proposed amendments to these rules will not relax the requirements, or change the emission reductions requirements, or the

timing of the reductions. The proposed amendments will give applicants more time to file their paperwork, and more time to complete the process.

MOTION TO SUPPORT – *Karla Edwards made the motion that the CAC supports the Governing Board adopting Rules 4702 and 4307 as proposed. Seconded by Kelly Deming and unanimously carried with the following roll call vote:*

Ayes: *Karla Edwards, Les Clark, Riley Jones, Don Horal, Chris Dodson, Chris Savage, David Harrald, Kevin Hamilton, Dana Karcher, Kelly Deming, Lee Smith, Mary-Michal Rawling, Perfecto Munoz, Denny Hoeh, Christine Foster, Brent Green, Dennis Tristao, John Wells, Dean Wilson and Wade Broughton.*

Absent: *Ed Gable, Donald Ikemiya and Mike Smith.*

CAC Action: *CAC Supports Governing Board's Consideration to Adopt the Proposed Amendments to Rule 4702 (Internal Combustion Engines – Phase 2) and Rule 4307 (Boilers, Steam Generators and Process Heater-s 2.0 MMBtu/hr to 5.0 MMBtu/hr).*

6. **Informational Report: SJVUAPCD Draft Proposed Environmental Justice Policy** – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, announced that due to last minute changes to the Draft Proposed Environmental Justice Policy, and because the full Environmental Justice Committee did not have time to review the revised document before this meeting, this item will be moved to next months CAC Agenda. Mr. Sadredin briefed the CAC on the status and the intent of the policy. Mr. Sadredin announced the actual policy will be presented during the May 2, 2006 CAC Meeting.

The Chair requested a copy of the proposed policy be included in the May 2, 2006 CAC Meeting packet, with concurrence from Mr. Sadredin.

7. **Public Education Report** – Jaime Holt, Public Education Administrator, introduced Ms. Maricela Velasquez who recently joined the District in the Public Education Division. Ms. Holt briefed the CAC regarding Ms. Velasquez's job duties which includes bilingual presentations for the District.

Ms. Holt reported on the following:

- A goal of Public Education (PE) will be to attend 100 to 200 outreach events for the next fiscal year. The CAC could assist PE in this effort by informing their constituents the availability of PE for speaking events
- PE will be trying to get a cohesive look for all District brochures
- A **free** one day Study Agency Air Quality Symposium "How Science is Charting a Path to Cleaner Air" will be held on Wednesday, May 17,

2006, 10:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. Piccadilly Inn, University, 4961 N. Cedar Avenue, Fresno, CA., with lunch provided

- The 2006 Clean Green Yard Machine Annual lawn mower trade-in program dates are listed below with all events starting at 9:00 a.m.:
 - May 20, 2006, Cal State, Bakersfield,
 - June 3, 2006, College of Sequoias, Visalia,
 - June 10, 2006, Fresno State University, Fresno
 - June 17, 2006, Merced College, Merced
 - June 24, 2006, San Joaquin Delta College, Stockton
- The Spare the Air Season program is gearing up
- A list server is available and you can receive District news, workshop notices, and other important information via e-mail by subscribing to one of the District's e-mail notification lists at: www.valleyair.org/lists/list.htm The e-mail notification lists are setup and maintained by the end user and not by District staff. Individuals may add or delete their names from these lists at any time.

The CAC provided comments and questions regarding the 2006 Annual lawn mower trade-in program.

- The Neuton company is owned by a woman, and staff should compile some history of this company
- What is the cost of a lawn mower to participants of this program? (**\$150 with trade-in of a mower**)
- How many tons of pollutants are taken out of the air as a result of this program? (**a report to quantify the amount of pollutants removed from the air will be assembled after the lawn mower trade-in program is complete**)
- Why is the program held at colleges and not home improvement stores (**in the past there were parking issues when events were held at home improvement stores**)
- Lawn mowers will be going up in price because of recent legislation
- The District should make an attempt to reach the Spanish community in respect to this program

The Chair asked if Public Education mailed out a list of events they will be participating in, and Ms. Holt indicated a tentative list of events will be sent out this afternoon.

Mr. Sadredin commented on the upcoming Air Quality Symposium "*How Science is Charting a Path to Cleaner Air*", and stated the results of the California Regional Particulate Air Quality Study (CRPAQS) and the Central California Ozone Study (CCOS) will be the District's roadmap for the PM 2.5 and the 8 Hour Ozone Plans the District is required to have ready next year. Mr. Sadredin encouraged the CAC to attend the symposium.

9. **ARB Comments** – No comments were provided.
10. **Public Comments** – No Public Comments.
11. **Rules Under Development** – George Heinen, Supervising Air Quality Engineer,

presented this item.

Mr. Heinen reported on Rule 4570 (Concentrated Animal Feeding).

Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, provided comments in respect to Rule 4570 and noted the rule has forty-nine control practices that dairies and other concentrated animal feed lots can utilize to reduce VOC emissions.

Mary-Michal Rawling asked when the draft for Rule 4570 would be available for the public and the CAC, and staff stated the draft may be out next week.

The CAC requested Rule 4570 (Concentrated Animal Feeding) be added to the May 2, 2006 CAC Agenda for a Support/Oppose action.

The CAC had various comments and concerns regarding Rules 4570, 4703, 4603, 4352, 4311, 4602, and 9310.

The CAC asked if private school bus fleets were eligible for the current funding, and staff indicated private school bus fleets are ineligible for the current funding.

12. **Rule Update – Rule 9310 (School Bus Fleets)**, this item was covered during Item 11.
13. **Report from CAC Technical Rule Review Subcommittee** – Chris Savage indicated there would be no report from the subcommittee today.
14. **CAC Member Comments** – Denny Hoeh suggested the CAC Members participate in Earth Day Events in their respective areas.

Lee Smith made comments in respect to Rule 4570.

Kevin Hamilton stated he believes it has been several months since the CAC received a report from the ARB representative, and he would appreciate ARB's attendance at every CAC meeting.

Mary-Michal Rawling asked Mr. Savage if he received her comments in respect to the Technical Rule Review Subcommittee, and suggested the subcommittee meet within the next two weeks.

Chris Savage stated he did not receive Ms. Rawling's comments. Mr. Savage stated he did not see the necessity of the full subcommittee meeting in two weeks, and instead suggested the Rule Liaison's should make their reports to the CAC during the May 2, 2006 CAC meeting.

Ms. Rawling encouraged the CAC to participate in next months Clean Air events.

Dean Wilson requested a second presentation regarding Air Monitoring Sites specific to the East side/West side of the Valley.

Mr. Wilson also requested clarification regarding Rule 4311 (Flares) and road flares, and asked if Rule 4311 pertains to road flares.

Christine Foster requested a definition of flares as it pertains to Rule 4311.

Mr. Sadredin provided a definition of Rule 4311.

Sarah Sharpe introduced herself to the CAC.

The Chair requested the Clerk introduce new CAC Members.

Ms. Smith introduced:

Karla Edwards, Industry/Agriculture, Primary Member, Fresno County
Sarah Sharpe, Environmental, Alternate Member, Fresno County
Chris Dodson, Industry/Agriculture, Primary Member, Merced County
Jack Mobley, Industry/Agriculture, Alternate Member, Merced County

Ms. Smith noted that Manuel Cunha, who was not in attendance was appointed the Industry/Agriculture, Alternate Member for Fresno County.

The Chair noted the attendance records indicate that Mike Smith, City, Primary Member, Tulare County or Charlie Norman, City Alternate Member, Tulare County have not participated in a CAC Meeting for several months. The Chair stated the CAC Resolution states if a member and his/her alternate fail to attend (three consecutive meetings or half of the meetings in one year (six)), said CAC member shall be replaced by their appropriate appointing authority. The Chair requested the Clerk prepare a letter from the Chair in respect to Mr. Smith and Mr. Norman not attending CAC Meetings for a few months.

15. **CAC Member Suggestions to be Included in the Presentation of the CAC Report during the Governing Board Meeting on Thursday, April 20, 2006**

The CAC voted unanimously in support of the Governing Board adopting the proposed amendments to Rules 4307 and 4702.

Provide the Governing Board with a synopsis on Rule 9310 (School Bus Fleets).

Provide comments regarding the presentations by Public Education.

Report to the Governing Board the discussions that took place in respect to Rule 4570 (Concentrated Animal Feeding).

16. **Volunteer to present CAC Report during Governing Board Meeting, Thursday, April 20, 2006 at 9:00 a.m.** – Dennis Tristao, CAC Chair, volunteered to make the presentation.
17. **Next Meeting** – Tuesday, May 2, 2006 at 10:00 a.m. The meeting will be held via video teleconferencing (VTC) with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating via VTC.
18. **Adjourn** – The Chair adjourned the meeting at 11:35 a.m.

Sissy Smith, Clerk to the Board
Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC)
San Joaquin Valley Unified APCD