



# San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District

## GOVERNING BOARD

**J. Steven Worthley, Chair**  
Supervisor, Tulare County

**Leroy Ornellas, Vice Chair**  
Supervisor, San Joaquin County

**Judith G. Case**  
Supervisor, Fresno County

**Jon McQuiston**  
Supervisor, Kern County

**Tony Barba**  
Supervisor, Kings County

**Ronn Dominici**  
Supervisor, Madera County

**Michael G. Nelson**  
Supervisor, Merced County

**William O'Brien**  
Supervisor, Stanislaus County

**Chris Vierra**  
Council Member, City of Ceres

**Vacant**  
Large City, Central Region

**Vacant**  
Small City, Southern Region

**Seyed Sadredin**  
Executive Director/  
Air Pollution Control Officer

Northern Region Office  
4800 Enterprise Way  
Modesto, CA 95356-8718  
(209) 557-6400  
FAX (209) 557-6475

Central Region Office  
1990 East Gettysburg Avenue  
Fresno, CA 93726-0244  
(559) 230-6000  
FAX (559) 230-6061

Southern Region Office  
2700 M Street, Suite 275  
Bakersfield, CA 93301-2373  
(661) 326-6900  
FAX (661) 326-6985

[www.valleyair.org](http://www.valleyair.org)

## Action Summary Minutes

### Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting

San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District  
Central Region Office, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue  
Governing Board Room, Fresno, CA.

Tuesday, February 6, 2007  
10:00 a.m.

*The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, the Southern Region Office, 2700 M Street, VTC Room, Bakersfield and the Northern Region Office, 4800 Enterprise Way, VTC Room, Modesto. The CAC Meeting was webcast.*

1. **CALL TO ORDER** – The Chair, Dennis Tristao, called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

2. **ROLL CALL** was taken and a quorum was present.

(P) Designates Primary Member and (A) designates Alternate Member

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Regional Office</u>
<u>Fresno</u>	Ryan Jacobsen, Industry/Agriculture (A)	Central
	Kevin Hamilton, Environmental (P)	Central
	(**) Sarah Sharpe, Environmental (A)	Central
	Amarpreet Dahliwal (P)	Central
<u>Kern</u>	(*) Les Clark, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Southern
	Dana Karcher, Environmental (P)	Southern
<u>Kings</u>	Riley Jones, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Central
	Kelly Deming, Environmental (P)	Central
	Dennis Tristao, City (P), Chair	Central
<u>Madera</u>	Donald Horal, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Central
<u>Merced</u>	Chris Dodson, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Northern
	Jack Mobley, Industry/Agriculture (A)	Northern
	Dean Wilson, City (P)	Central
<u>San Joaquin</u>	Ron McManis, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Northern
	Roger Hoffdahl, Industry Agriculture (A)	Northern
	Wade Broughton, City (P)	Northern
<u>Stanislaus</u>	Chris Savage, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Central
	L.D. Hoeh, Environmental, (P)	Northern
	Toni Hanson, City, (P)	Northern

<u>County</u>	<u>Member Name/Interest Group</u>	<u>Regional Office</u>
<u>Tulare</u>	David Harrald, Industry/Agriculture (P)	Central
	Gary Rohman, Industry/Agriculture (A)	Central
	(**) Christine Foster, Environmental (P)	Central

(\*) Arrived after Roll Call  
 (\*\*) Arrived during Item #7

Staff present in the Central Region Office (Fresno) – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO; Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO; Roger McCoy, Director of Administrative Services; Scott Nester, Director of Planning; Jaime Holt, Public Education Administrator; Maria Stobbe, Planning Manager; Don Hunsaker, Supervising Air Quality Planner; George Heinen, Supervising Air Quality Engineer; Lauren Dawson, Air Quality Specialist I; Catherine Thao, Air Quality Specialist I; Sissy Smith, Administrative Secretary; and Toni Taber, Clerk to the Boards.

Staff present in the Northern Region Office (Modesto) – Karen Morris, Administrative Analyst II, and Dottie Shoffner, Senior Office Assistant.

Staff present in the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) – Emily Gonzales-Demont, Administrative Analyst II.

3. APPROVE MINUTES OF TUESDAY, JANUARY 2, 2007 – The Chair asked if there were any comments regarding the Minutes. Hearing no comments the Chair declared the Minutes of Tuesday, January 2, 2007 approved as submitted.

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS  
 No public comments.

The Chair requested meeting attendees power off their cell phones because they interfere with the District’s audio equipment.

5. CHAIR COMMENTS  
 The Chair requested that Item 8, *Action Item: Draft Environmental Justice Strategy Policy*, be heard directly after the Executive Director comments.

6. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS –  
 Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, informed the Committee that the City members of the Governing Board should be appointed by the League of California Cities in late February. He also updated the CAC on items covered at the Governing Board Meeting on January 18, 2007. He stated that the District’s Legislative Platform is pursuing 25% of the Proposition 1B funds, funding to create Air Quality Enterprise Zones, and funding to replace old school buses. He added that the District plans to support container fees if a portion of the fee is

sent to the Central Valley, but will oppose if that condition is not met. He also stated that the District met with Senators Boxer & Feinstein, who pledged to assist the District in seeking funding.

Public Comment: None

CAC Member Comments:

Riley Jones questioned Mr. Sadredin about the enterprise zone. Mr. Sadredin explained that the District is pursuing an Air Quality Enterprise Zone that defines the Zone based on air quality and economics. This Zone would not be limited to the Central Valley, but would be a statewide designation as long as the area met the air quality and economic factors. The Zone would serve as a gatekeeper to pursue funds for economic development of clean air industries.

Amarpreet Dhaliwal asked if the CAC would be able to make recommendations for City appointees to the Governing Board. Mr. Sadredin responded that the League of California Cities is in charge of that process and that CAC members should contact the League to give their input. Dennis Tristao informed the CAC that the "small cities" of the League are meeting in Lemoore on February 22, 2007.

Chris Savage asked if the Senators Boxer & Feinstein said where they would pursue the funding the District is requesting. Mr. Sadredin responded that they did not specify the sources of the funds.

8. Action Item: Draft Environmental Justice Strategy Policy

Sissy Smith informed the Chair that the CAC's Environmental interest group did not have a quorum, so the CAC could take no action on this item. The Chair decided they could proceed to hear the statements of staff and citizens.

Seyed Sadredin presented the report, and stated that he hoped to get a unanimous decision from the CAC on the creation of an Environmental Justice Advisory Council.

Public Comment:

Rosenda Mataka, Grayson Neighborhood Council and President of the Central Valley Environmental Justice Network, stated that the goal of the Environmental Justice Strategy Policy is to enable people with limited access to the governmental process due to language and economic barriers to join the decision making process. Ms. Mataka asked the Board to consider the creation of an Environmental Justice Advisory Council, so the small, rural communities are represented.

L.D. Heoh asked if the District holds community meetings, and if so, where are the meetings held, and are the meetings open to the public. Mr. Sadredin responded that the meetings rotate between the regional offices and are open to

the public. Jaime Holt stated that the schedule of the meetings can be found on the back of the District calendar, on the District's general outreach brochure and on the District's web site. The meeting date was recently changed to the second Tuesday of the month at 10:00 a.m.

Wade Broughten asked for clarification of Mr. Sadredin's comments regarding the unanimous decision. Mr. Sadredin stated that the bylaws state that each interest group must be unanimous in their decision. Mr. Tristao stated that each interest group can present their collective comments.

Les Clark clarified that whether or not the CAC approves the formation of the Environmental Justice Advisory Council, the item still would go to the District Governing Board. Mr. Sadredin confirmed, but said the input from the CAC is important.

Ray León, Latino Issues Forum, advocated creating a space within the District to give a voice to the communities that are most affected by poor air. He stated that the Central Valley is divided into the "Haves," who have the resources to move to areas within the Valley that have better air quality, and the "Have Nots," who do not have the resources and lack the mobility to relocate.

Mr. Tristao asked for clarification from Mr. León that he is requesting a body separate from the CAC, and not the creation of a new CAC interest group. Mr. León confirmed that he would prefer a separate council.

Carolina Simunovic, Fresno Metro Ministry & Central Valley Air Quality Coalition, stated that she appreciated the historical background given by Mr. Sadredin, which illustrated the need for Environmental Justice task groups. Ms. Simunovic stated that the CAC is not a racially and economically diverse group, and they cannot be expected to understand the issues and culture of the poorest in the community. She stated that the quickest solution would be to create an Environmental Justice task force to allow another venue for the majority of the people in the San Joaquin Valley. If the goals of the task force and the CAC run parallel, the two groups can be folded together. Currently, Ms. Simunovic does not see community issues being discussed by the CAC.

Mr. Savage questioned whether or not a new group needed to be created, and asked if the lack of community representation in the process was a failure of the CAC or the community. Ms. Simunovic responded that most people in the community don't know how to access the CAC, and added that the CAC has done an excellent job in outreach to industry, but there has been no outreach to environmental justice groups. She stated that she felt the CAC environmental slots are often taken by environmental lawyers who represent the industry, and not the community at large.

Mr. Sadredin stated that no one should have a fear of enhanced participation. The purpose of forming an Environmental Justice Advisory Council is to provide better two-way communication. He recommends that they proceed with forming the Advisory Council in a similar manner to how the Hearing Board is formed. The District would take recommendations and interview candidates. The Council could be made up of representatives from business, low income communities, and minority associations.

Margarita Guzman, Comitè Asma, stated that the community wants more input on land use and its impact on air quality. She stated that in the neighborhood of Addams, a rural part of the City of Fresno, there are at least ten companies that pollute the air, plus the pollution from Highway 99. Ms. Guzman stated that the District gave a company a permit to operate across from Jane Addams Elementary School, which has the third highest asthma rates in the Fresno Unified School District. That company added the pollution from twelve diesel trucks to the air around that school.

Sarah Sharpe asked if Ms. Guzman would be interested in being on the Environmental Justice Advisory Group if one was formed. Ms. Guzman stated that she would be interested.

Kevin Hamilton stated that the CAC is not tied into the permitting process, but the proposed Environmental Justice Advisory Council could be.

Inès Rojas, Comitè Asma, stated that the Addams community has no political power or resources to control the trucks or the companies that come to the community. The community is near a freeway, and a recent USC study stated that children who grow up near freeways have underdeveloped lungs. She asked the CAC to advance the Environmental Justice proposal to help increase community participation and be more effective.

Mr. Dhaliwal asked if he could be provided a copy of the USC study. Mr. McVaigh stated he would get copies to the CAC.

Liza Blanos, Central Valley Air Quality Coalition, stated that the community is too poor to have internet access. Most in the community do not comprehend the levels of government. Many do not have transportation to the meetings, and can not speak or read English. Many in the community do not have the financial resources to take time off from work to attend the meetings.

Chris Savage questioned how the Environmental Justice Advisory Council could affect air quality. Ms. Blanos stated that when the Central Valley Air Quality Coalition asked the EPA to go to Wasco, over 100 people from the community attended, but if the EPA had gone instead to Bakersfield, those same people would not have had the resources to attend.

Gary Rohman stated that Mr. Sadredin's suggestion is solid. Dean Wilson stated that we have no control over the mobile sources that travel on the highway. Ray León responded that the District could take the mobile traffic into account when issuing a permit for a company. Mr. Wilson also suggested that the Environmental Justice Advisory Council, if one is approved, should look at holding meetings outside of normal business hours to accommodate those who cannot take time off work to attend. He also cautioned the District in their proposed language changes stating that the District must be careful in replacing the words "reasonable" with "best available" as this could cause a good solution to get passed by because it may not be the best, and in replacing the word "public" with "community groups" as this would eliminate the public from participating.

Donald Horal asked Mr. León if any of the Environmental Justice groups work with their City and County representatives. Mr. León stated that they do.

Jack Mobley suggested the community groups also contact their city and county planning departments.

Jenny Sacklar, Fresno Metro Ministry, mentioned that the CAC referred to the community as "these communities" and "those people" and "them" and suggested that this is indicative of the divide between the CAC and the community. She added that the Environmental Justice Advisory Council will fail without a process for effective communication.

Teresa DeAndra, Californians for Pesticide Reform, stated that after being injured in a pesticide incident, she began educating herself on environmental issues, and it has taken her seven years to gain the knowledge she has. She noted that the issues and levels of government can be very confusing to the uninitiated, and an Environmental Justice Advisory Council would bring all of the different environmental justice groups in the Central Valley together and enhance two way communications between the community and the District.

CAC member comments:

The Chair suggested that each respective interest group should meet to solidify their opinion in preparation for the next CAC meeting. The Chair requested that the Clerk to the Boards set up conference calls for the groups. Mr. Savage requested Mr. Sadredin put his proposal in writing for the CAC to examine. The Chair also suggested that the City Interest Groups select a chair in the conference call.

7. Status Report: Regional Blueprint Effort

Lauren Dawson, Air Quality Specialist I, presented the staff report.

Public Comment: None

9. Public Education Report:

Jaime Holt, Public Education Administrator, updated the CAC on the Burn Cleaner Program. She informed the CAC that the applications can be picked up at the District's regional offices or on the District's web site. Mr. Rohman asked if there were restrictions. Ms. Holt replied that the residence must be in the San Joaquin Valley.

Mr. Jones asked how the District verifies the information. Ms. Holt responded that the retailer is responsible for submitting before and after photos of the item in question. Jerry Frost, Kern Oil & Refinery, asked how much funding is available. Ms. Holt replied that there is \$198,000 for the Program.

10. Status Report: Draft 8-hour Ozone Plan

Don Hunsaker, Supervising Air Quality Planner, presented the report. He informed the CAC that the workshop is scheduled for February 8; the draft is scheduled to be received and filed on March 15 by the Governing Board, and approved on April 19. He added that the District is one of four districts in the country to have a draft already available for public review.

Mr. Broughten asked if the workshop will be webcast. Mr. Hunsaker replied that it is VTC only.

Public Comment: None

11. Rules Under Development

George Heinen, Supervising Air Quality Engineer, presented the report.

The Chair asked if the industry had commented. Mr. Heinen replied that the industry had responded on technical matters, and noted that one facility will be converting to producing more energy and fewer emissions.

Public Comment: None

12. CAC Technical Rule Review Subcommittee – No Report

13. ARB Comments – Jeff Lindberg, ARB Planning Liaison for the District, presented the update. He stated that the ARB released its draft Ozone State Implementation Plan last week. The focus of the Plan was the South Coast and San Joaquin Valley, as both districts have the most severe air quality issues in the State and both also have their draft Ozone plans released for public review. He also stated that 80% of the Valley's NOx emissions are from on and off-road mobile sources, so their plan attempts to reduce NOx emissions through replacing older vehicles and enhancing the annual smog check. Copies of the ARB plan are available online at [www.arb.ca.us](http://www.arb.ca.us).

Sarah Sharpe asked about the ARB workshop. Mr. Lindberg stated that the workshop would be held in the District offices in March, but was unsure of the exact date.

The Chair asked for an update on the Hydrogen Highway for the next meeting. Mr. Lindberg agreed.

14. CAC Member Comments and CAC Suggestions to be included in the presentation of the CAC Report during the Governing Board meeting on Thursday, February 15, 2007  
Christine Foster suggested that the Environmental Justice discussion be included in the report to the Governing Board, as well as the Blueprint report and the notice of the upcoming ARB meeting. Ms. Sharpe agreed.  
  
Mr. Dhaliwal suggested that the District follow up on low emission lawnmowers for commercial use.
15. Volunteer to present CAC Report during Governing Board Meeting, Thursday, February 15, 2007 at 9:00 a.m. – The Chair, Dennis Tristao, volunteered to present the CAC Report to the Governing Board on February 15, 2007.
16. Next Meeting – The next CAC Meeting is scheduled on Tuesday, March 6, 2007 at 10:00 a.m. The meeting will be held via video teleconferencing (VTC), with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating. The meeting will also be webcast.
17. Adjourn – The Chair adjourned the meeting at 12:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Toni J. Taber  
Clerk to the Boards  
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District