



GOVERNING BOARD

Hub Walsh, Chair

Supervisor, Merced County

Tom Wheeler, Vice Chair

Supervisor, Madera County

Oliver L. Baines III

Councilmember, City of Fresno

Tony Barba

Supervisor, Kings County

Sally J. Bomprezzi

Councilmember, City of Madera

Dennis Brazil

Mayor, City of Gustine

John Capitman, Ph.D.

Appointed by Governor

Judith G. Case McNairy

Supervisor, Fresno County

David Couch

Supervisor, Kern County

Bob Elliott

Supervisor, San Joaquin County

Harold Hanson

Councilmember, City of Bakersfield

William O'Brien

Supervisor, Stanislaus County

Alexander C. Sherriffs, M.D.

Appointed by Governor

Vacant

Small City - Tulare County

J. Steven Worthley

Supervisor, Tulare County

Seyed Sadredin

Executive Director
Air Pollution Control Officer

Northern Region Office 4800 Enterprise Way Modesto, CA 95356-8718 (209) 557-6400 • FAX (209) 557-6475

Central Region Office 1990 East Gettysburg Avenue Fresno, CA 93726-0244 (559) 230-6000 • FAX (559) 230-6061

Southern Region Office 34946 Flyover Court Bakersfield, CA 93308-9725 (661) 392-5500 • FAX (661) 392-5585 DATE: December 18, 2014

TO: SJVUAPCD Governing Board

FROM: Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO

Project Coordinator: Michelle Franco

RE: ITEM NUMBER 18: APPROVE ACTION SUMMARY

MINUTES FOR THE SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY
UNIFIED AIR POLLUTION CONTROL DISTRICT
GOVERNING BOARD MEETING OF THURSDAY,

NOVEMBER 13, 2014

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the attached Action Summary Minutes.

DISCUSSION:

The following Action Summary Minutes summarize the San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District Governing Board Meeting of Thursday, November 13, 2014.

Attachment:

Action Summary Minutes, SJVUAPCD Governing Board Meeting, November 13, 2014 (15 pages)

www.valleyair.org

Action Summary Minutes

San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

GOVERNING BOARD

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

Thursday, November 13, 2014 9:00 a.m.

Meeting held via teleconferencing with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield).

This meeting was webcast.

- 1. <u>CALL MEETING TO ORDER</u> The Chair, Supervisor Walsh called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.
- 2. ROLL CALL was taken and a quorum was present.

Present:

Oliver L. Baines III, Councilmember Tony Barba, Supervisor Sally Bomprezzi, Councilmember*** Dennis Brazil, Mayor* John Capitman, Ph.D. Judy Case McNairy, Supervisor David Couch, Supervisor** Bob Elliott, Supervisor* William O'Brien, Supervisor* Dr. Alexander Sherriffs Hub Walsh, Supervisor, Chair J. Steven Worthley, Supervisor

City of Fresno
Kings County
City of Madera
City of Gustine
Appointed by Governor
Fresno County
Kern County
San Joaquin County
Stanislaus County
Appointed by Governor
Merced County
Tulare County

Absent:

Skip Barwick, Councilmember Harold Hanson, Councilmember Tom Wheeler, Supervisor, **Vice Chair** City of Tulare City of Bakersfield Madera County

^{*} Attended meeting in Northern Region Office

^{**}Attended meeting in the Southern Region Office

^{***}Arrived at 9:03 a.m.

- 3. <u>APPROVAL OF CONSENT CALENDAR (Item Numbers 18 25)</u> These matters are routine in nature and are usually approved by a single vote. Prior to action by the Board, the public is given the opportunity to comment on any consent item.
 - 18. <u>APPROVE ACTION SUMMARY MINUTES FOR THE SAN JOAQUIN</u>
 <u>VALLEY UNIFIED AIR POLLUTION CONTROL DISTRICT GOVERNING</u>
 BOARD MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 18, 2014
 - 19. <u>RECEIVE AND FILE LIST OF SCHEDULED MEETINGS FOR 2014 AND 2015</u>
 - 20. <u>RECEIVE AND FILE OPERATION STATISTICS SUMMARY FOR</u> SEPTEMBER 2014
 - 21. <u>RECEIVE AND FILE BUDGET STATUS REPORTS AS OF SEPTEMBER</u> 30, 2014
 - 22. <u>EXECUTE AGREEMENT WITH EV CONNECT INC. TO INSTALL</u>
 <u>ELECTRIC VEHICLE CHARGIN INFRASTRUCTURE AT DISTRICT</u>
 <u>OFFICES AT A COST NOT TO EXCEED \$65,000 WITH \$50,000 IN</u>
 FUNDING FROM CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION
 - 23. <u>RECEIVE AND FILE THE 2014 ANNUAL REPORT ON THE DISTRICT'S</u> INDIRECT SOURCE REVIEW PROGRAM
 - 24. RESOLUTION CONCERNING THE RETIREMENT OF LYNN TERRY,
 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE OFFICER OF THE CALIFORNIA AIR
 RESOURCES BOARD
 - 25. <u>AMEND 2014-15 NON-OPERATING BUDGET TO ADJUST ESTIMATED</u> AMOUNTS TO ACTUAL AMOUNTS AS OF 6/30/2014

Public Comment: The following persons commented on this item:

Manuel Cunha, Nisei Farmers League

In response to Mr. Cunha's comments regarding Ms. Terry's retirement, Supervisor Case McNairy said Ms. Terry was instrumental in terms of working through and understanding the issues facing the Valley during her tenure at the Air Resources Board and would be hugely missed. Mr. Sadredin stated he agreed with all the positive comments about Ms. Terry, noting she was a key partner with the District on the 11 attainment plans that were adopted. In addition, he said she did a great job of establishing relationships with Valley stakeholders and members of the environmental and business communities. He asked Dr. Sherriffs to present the plaque prepared by District staff to Ms. Terry at the next ARB Board meeting, upon approval by the Board.

Moved: Worthley Seconded: Case McNairy

Ayes: Baines, Barba, Bomprezzi, Brazil, Capitman,

Case McNairy, Couch, Elliott, O'Brien, Sherriffs,

Worthley, Walsh

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve Consent Calendar Items 18 – 25

- 4. <u>PUBLIC COMMENT</u>: The following persons provided public comment during this item:
 - Sam Chaney
 - Chantelle Neely
 - Pam Nickelty
 - Carla Flores
 - Pam Kolinka
- 5. <u>S.T.A.R. RECOGNITION (Service, Teamwork, Attitude, Respect)</u> Adriana Myovich, Director of Personnel, gave the presentation on this item which formally recognized the employees who reached a service milestone during the third quarter of 2014:

Five Years of Service

William Jones, Air Quality Engineer II
David Lopez, Air Quality Specialist II
Mark Rettberg, Air Quality Field Assistant
Carrie Tuell-Todd, Air Quality Specialist II
Johnathan Yoshimura, Air Quality Engineer II

Ten Years of Service

Joe Aguayo, Air Quality Specialist II Clay Bishop, Supervising Air Quality Specialist Lupe Reyes, Staff Technician II

Fifteen Years of Service

Brad Schwegel, Supervising Programmer/Analyst

Twenty Years of Service

Brian Johnson, Senior Programmer/Analyst Kathi Crump, Supervising Air Quality Inspector

6. APPROVE VOLUNTARY EMISSION REDUCTION AGREEMENT WITH CALTRANS TO RECEIVE FUNDS IN THE AMOUNT OF \$1,500,000 TO MITIGATE AIR QUALITY IMPACTS OF THE PROPOSED CENTENNIAL CORRIDOR PROJECT AND PROVIDE AIR QUALITY BETTERMENT — Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, presented this item which recommended the Board approve and authorize the Chair to sign the Voluntary Emission Reduction Agreement (VERA) with the California Department of Transportation; and, authorize staff to identify, fund and manage air quality projects to fully mitigate construction criteria pollution impacts associated with the Centennial Corridor Project, and to provide additional reductions to provide betterment of air quality in the area of the project.

Mr. Warner gave a brief overview of VERAs, specifically that they are agreements between developers and the District and are designed to mitigate a project's impacts on air quality. He reminded the Board that approval of the VERA in no way implies approval of the project creating the emissions – such project approvals are the jurisdiction of land-use agencies, and approval of the VERA only assures that, if the project does get built, the emissions increases will be properly mitigated. He explained that the District's successful incentive grant programs are integral to execution of VERAs, noting that, at the Board's direction, the District has recently surpassed \$1 billion of public and private investment in clean air projects through the incentive grants, while generating over 100,000 tons of emission reductions. He said the District's program has been recognized by the state, through multiple audits, to be the "gold standard" amongst all such programs, in terms of public accountability, efficiency in operation, and effectiveness in achieving low cost emission reductions.

Mr. Warner gave a brief overview of the Centennial Corridor Project, a highway construction project in Bakersfield, and noted that, in addition to mitigating all of the construction emissions for this project, Caltrans has committed to providing additional reductions specifically to tackle local impacts caused by increased traffic along that highway corridor. He said Caltrans has provided a total of \$1.5 million in funding to accomplish at least 155 tons of emission reductions, most of which will be nitrogen oxides with some diesel particulate - both of which are critical pollutants to the District's health risk reduction efforts.

Dr. Capitman asked how costs per ton are calculated. Mr. Sadredin responded the number is updated every year under the Board's Indirect Source Review Rule. He said typically the dollar amounts in the VERAs are based on staff's experience for projects the District is able to fund and are estimated on the high end of the range. Supervisor Worthley asked if VERAs are contingent on the project being approved and completed. Mr. Sadredin responded affirmatively that the contract can be cancelled before the District is paid if the project is not approved. However, he noted that if funds are given to the District and are already spent for emission reduction efforts then no monies are refunded.

Public Comment - None

Moved: Couch Seconded: Barba

Ayes: Baines, Barba, Bomprezzi, Brazil, Capitman,

Case McNairy, Couch, Elliott, O'Brien, Sherriffs,

Worthley, Walsh

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve Voluntary Emission Reduction Agreement with Caltrans to receive funds in the amount of \$1,500,000 to mitigate air quality impacts of the proposed Centennial Corridor Project and provide air quality betterment

7. APPROVE VOLUNTARY EMISSION REDUCTION AGREEMENT WITH PARAMOUNT PETROLEUM CORPORATION TO RECEIVE FUNDS IN THE AMOUNT OF \$500,000 TO MITIGATE AIR QUALITY IMPACTS OF THE PROPOSED ALON BAKERSFIELD CRUDE FLEXIBILITY PROJECT — Mr. Warner gave the presentation on this item which recommended the Board approve the Voluntary Emission Reduction Agreement with Paramount Petroleum Corporation, and authorize staff to identify, fund and manage air quality projects to mitigate criteria pollution impacts associated with the Alon Bakersfield Crude Flexibility Project. Paramount Petroleum will provide \$500,000 to generate a total of 51 tons of emissions. He reminded the Board that their approval of the VERA is not an approval of the overall project, noting the Board's action today, if approved, would ensure the air quality impacts of the project would be mitigated.

Supervisor Worthley asked if this agreement was mandated by the County or was offered by the industry. Mr. Sadredin responded it was a combination of both, noting the District provides comment on these projects regarding potential air quality impacts, and in this case spoke to County and the project proponent about the importance of mitigating the air quality impacts. He said Kern County has been very cooperative in this process.

Public Comment – The following persons provided comment on this item:

Tom Frantz, AIR

Moved: Couch Seconded: Worthley

Ayes: Baines, Barba, Bomprezzi, Brazil, Capitman,

Case McNairy, Couch, Elliott, O'Brien, Sherriffs,

Worthley, Walsh

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve Voluntary Emission Reduction Agreement with Paramount Petroleum Corporation to receive funds in the amount of \$500,000 to mitigate air quality impacts of the proposed Alon Bakersfield crude flexibility project

8. APPROVE CONTRACT WITH THE CENTRAL CALIFORNIA ASTHMA
COLLABORATIVE TO EXECUTE THE HEALTHY AIR LIVING SCHOOLS
PROGRAM, AND MEMORANDA OF UNDERSTANDING WITH VALLEYPBS
AND KVIE – Mr. Sadredin explained one of the key goals of the District's public education and outreach program is letting the public know about the work being done, progress that has been made and challenges that are faced by the Valley in terms of improving air quality. He said before the District can have the credibility and standing to talk to Valley residents about public health, they need to have confidence in the Board's actions in terms of strategies that are deployed have really produced benefit in reducing air pollution. He said any objective examination of those factors shows there has been significant progress.

Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, gave the presentation on this item which proposed the Board approve an agreement with the Central California Asthma Collaborative (CCAC) to work with schools and county asthma coalitions to promote the Healthy Air Living Schools program, the District's Real-Time Air Advisory Network (RAAN), the school-based No-Idling/Alternative Transportation Campaign and the school-based Clean Air Champions program. In addition, they were asked to consider a Memoranda of Understanding with ValleyPBS and KVIE to continue a partnership to sponsor youth-focused Healthy Air Living.

Supervisor Case McNairy said she believed the District should build capacity, noting asthma coalitions tend to be very grass roots and community based, members of which are often parents who have children with asthma. She said it is important to have people who are passionate and have stories that they can tell. Because she lives in a rural area and works with many rural communities she said she wondered if the District shouldn't continue on a dual path. She voiced her belief that the Flag Program still holds value for some communities versus the RAAN program due to limits of technology.

Supervisor Walsh commented there is value in real-time air quality information to enable residents to make valuable and timely decisions regarding their activities based on current air quality conditions. Regarding the frequency of notifications from the RAAN program, Mr. Sadredin responded that there are customized settings that could limit the type and number of notifications received. He voiced his belief that ultimately there will be a place for the Flag Program in more publicoriented areas in Valley cities; however, he said the focus should be on educating residents about the RAAN program. Ms. Holt commented staff is trying to find a program that works best for schools and is most health protective, noting the next year will be a learning process. Mayor Brazil asked about the number of school districts by county that are currently not participating in the RAAN or No-Idling programs. He said he would be more than happy to attend school district meetings in his area, to encourage participation. Ms. Holt responded almost 75 percent of schools have responded that they are participating on some level, but she would be happy to include Mayor Brazil in future meetings in his area.

Several Board members reiterated the District's position of not continuing to

support the Flag Program and promoting the more health projective RAAN program. Supervisor Worthley asked if money was currently allocated to the Flag Program. Ms. Holt responded that while the District has a few sets of flags left over from last year, there is currently no money allocated for this program nor plans to provide additional flags. Supervisor Worthley noted many people participating in this program are getting information from the media and may not have formally signed up for the RAAN and Flag Programs. He commented that perhaps many decision makers at Valley schools might be misinformed on current air quality conditions and cancel physical activities for students based on information that is not current. He said physical activity, when air quality allows, is necessary for public health, citing the nation's growing obesity problem. He said that is why it is so important to have accurate, real time air quality information as provided by the RAAN program. He also suggested utilizing the many digital signs at local schools to display accurate and current air quality information.

Supervisor Case McNairy voiced concern about rural areas in the Valley that may not have internet or cellular service and ways that air quality information can be communicated to them. Dr. Sherriffs voiced support for Mayor Brazil's suggestion that Board members participate in outreach to local school districts in their regions. He said this is a very ambitious plan and wondered if enough money was being allocated. He compared the potential gains between a lower emission school bus and educating the public on the benefits of changing behaviors to help improve air quality. He noted this is an investment in our future, as these students are the future advocates for the work of the District and said these programs are critically important.

Dr. Capitman noted he serves on the Central California Asthma Coalition Board and has no fiscal interests in that group. He voiced appreciation for the focus on innovation around the RAAN Program, noting one of the elements of the program is to support schools in coming up with their own strategy for how to communicate air quality. He said the language is sometimes confusing regarding whether or not schools should be making provisions for activities not only during the school day but also after hours. Ms. Holt responded the District's Real-time Activity Recommendations (ROAR) include direction for sporting events that occur after hours. She commented Friday night prep football games are the toughest area to target, noting there is a lot of work to do with regard to those events. Dr. Capitman commented that California has failed to meet the national standards for environmental literacy education for several years in a row and is still notably behind several other states in terms of education around environmental issues that occurs broadly in schools. He said part of the challenge is not only how does the District get the message out but also how to engage schools in identifying how to promote a much larger effort amongst environmental literacy education within schools. He said he hoped this could help to identify and document which schools are doing substantial environmental literacy education at each level and build a network around them to broaden that discussion. In context of the broader communication objective, he said this has been a challenging period with the drought and not meeting some measures and

objectives and suggested improving communication to residents that the Valley is always at risk because of its geography and conditions.

Public Comment – *The following persons provided comment on this item:*

Tom Frantz, AIR

Moved: Brazil Seconded: Sherriffs

Ayes: Baines, Barba, Bomprezzi, Brazil, Capitman,

Case McNairy, Couch, Elliott, O'Brien, Sherriffs,

Worthley, Walsh

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve contract with the Central California Asthma Collaborative to execute the Healthy Air Living Schools program, and Memoranda of Understanding with ValleyPBS and KVIE

9. AUTHORIZE RESUBMISSION OF REQUEST TO EPA FOR ATTAINMENT DETERMINATION FOR 1-HOUR OZONE STANDARD AND LIFTING OF SECTION 185 FEDERAL NONATTAINMENT PENALTY MANDATE – Sheraz Gill, Strategies and Incentives Director, and Jon Klassen, Program Manager gave the presentation on this item which recommended the Board authorize the Executive Director/APCO to prepare and submit an updated clean data demonstration to EPA based on 2012 through 2014 ambient air quality data and request a finding that the San Joaquin Valley Air Basin has attained the 1-hour ozone standard. In addition, staff recommended the Board authorize the Executive Director/APCO to resubmit a request to EPA to lift the Clean Air Act Section 185 penalties associated with nonattainment of the 1-hour ozone standard.

Mr. Gill and Mr. Klassen gave an overview of the number of air quality management strategies implemented by the District in the San Joaquin Valley over the last two decades to attain the following health-based national ozone standards: 1-hour ozone standard (124 parts per billion); 1997 8-hour ozone standard (84 parts per billion); and 2008 8-hour ozone standard (75 parts per billion). They reported despite challenging conditions in the summer of 2014, the Valley continued progress and experienced another record setting smog season.

Reflecting on saying goodbye to the veteran Board members who are retiring in December, Supervisors Case McNairy and Barba, Mr. Sadredin reported on the controversy faced by the District when developing the 2007 ozone plan while bumping up to an extreme designation and the efforts of Supervisor Case McNairy and District staff to travel throughout the Valley explaining the dire situation to residents. He noted at that time, the Valley needed a 75% reduction in emissions after previous reductions which seemed impossible at the time based on available technology. He said the Board adopted the plan and made a

commitment that the District would do the best it could through a fast track process and host of other efforts to come into attainment prior to the 2024 deadline.

Mr. Sadredin announced because of the hard work and tough decisions made by the Board, it is now estimated that the District will reach attainment on or before the deadline without the need for a "black box". Noting it was not an easy task, Mr. Sadredin thanked the Board for adopting the toughest rules in the nation, and also thanked the business community for their support with these regulations, which enabled further reductions than the EPA mandate. He also commented on the huge amount of incentive dollars brought into the Valley through the good work of the Board and stakeholders, noting they totaled over a billion dollars and achieved reductions from emission sources that were beyond the District's regulatory authority. He noted the Board invested in significant technology advancement to deal with non-traditional sources and also significant investments in science to better quantify the emissions. He said in the next 3 years, he and staff will bring additional plans to the Board that require another 75% reduction in emissions, which seems nearly impossible but has been accomplished by the District. He thanked the veteran Board members for their hard work which has paid off.

Councilmember Baines thanked staff and commended veteran Board members for the really hard choices they made in the past which are obviously paying off. Regarding the 8-hour ozone standard, he asked why Fresno County was the highest in days over the standard. Mr. Sadredin responded in Fresno County the proportion of mobile sources over stationary sources is higher than Kern County for instance. He said in Kern County, because of major oil production activities, the ratio of stationary source emissions over mobile sources is higher and they have enjoyed greater success because the Board has jurisdiction over stationary sources and not mobile sources. He also commented that community design in terms of land use, sprawl and mobile sources, plays a heavier role in Fresno. In addition, there are climate issues in Fresno County such as the Fresno Eddy, which rotates pollution from Kern County back into Fresno County, which are also affecting the 8-hour ozone standard readings and making it a hot spot. Councilmember Baines asked if the District has reviewed Fresno County's Draft General Plan as it relates to land use. Mr. Sadredin responded the staff always reviews and provide comments on these plans but noted they do not always receive support for their comments. Councilmember Baines said he would assist with that process.

Supervisor Case McNairy reminisced about the two-day extreme nonattainment hearings in 2007 and 2008 with full meeting rooms and protesters in all three regions. She said she believed it was a turning point in the public's awareness of the impact of bad air quality on their personal health.

Public Comment – The following persons provided comment on this item:

Tom Frantz, AIR

Moved: Case McNairy Seconded: Worthlev

Ayes: Baines, Barba, Bomprezzi, Brazil, Capitman,

Case McNairy, Couch, Elliott, O'Brien, Sherriffs,

Worthley, Walsh

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve resubmission of request to EPA for attainment determination for 1-Hour Ozone Standard and lifting of Section 185 federal nonattainment penalty mandate

This item was taken out of turn

13. RECEIVE THE GOVERNMENT FINANCE OFFICERS' ASSOCIATION CERTIFICATE OF ACHEIVEMENT FOR EXCELLENCE IN FINANCIAL REPORTING - Mr. Sadredin said the District is very proud of receiving this award not only because it signifies the financial prudence that the Board exercises but also is a good indicator of how important public accountability and transparency are to the District. He introduced the Finance Director of the City of Santa Cruz, Marcus Pimentel, who represented the Government Finance Officers' Association.

Mr. Pimentel explained the criteria for the award, which cover 17 different component sections and over 183 different data points that are all reviewed and analyzed to ensure they meet the highest standard of governmental finance reporting. He said he was honored to present the award because it demonstrates the Governing Board and the District acknowledge and celebrate staff's work. He thanked everyone and said he applauded the Board's and District's efforts and dedication to the finance industry and to the award.

Mr. Sadredin expressed his gratitude to Mehri Barati, Administrative Services Director. Ms. Barati acknowledged the Board for their commitment to public transparency and accountability. She also thanked Mr. Sadredin for his leadership and commitment to excellence. Ms. Barati also expressed appreciation to staff for their hard work.

Ms. Case McNairy asked if this was the District's first Government Finance Officers' Association award. Ms. Barati responded affirmatively. Ms. Case-McNairy stated earning this award is impressive and asked for a press release to be distributed throughout the Valley to inform the public about the work that is being done, including how diligently spending is being reviewed and recorded. She thanked Ms. Barati and her staff for their efforts.

Supervisor Walsh thanked Mr. Sadredin, Ms. Barati and the staff on behalf of the Board, for the transparency and accountability shown.

10. ALLOCATE AN ADDITIONAL \$2,000,000 IN FUNDING FOR CONTINUED IMPLEMENTATION OF THE HIGHLY SUCCESSFUL BURN CLEANER INCENTIVE PROGRAM TO SUPPORT THE DISTRICT'S EFFORTS TO REDUCE THE IMPACTS OF RESIDENTIAL WOOD BURNING - Mr. Sadredin noted the Board adopted the toughest residential wood burning rule in the nation back in September, noting one of their concerns was to be able to get the message out to the public about the changes to the rule in a short timeframe, as well as encourage them to upgrade to cleaner burning devices. He said the Board allocated \$2.1 million to the Burn Cleaner program, hoping the money would run out quickly and he was happy to report that it had. Because of the extensive public outreach, he reported the District has already received applications for \$2.7 million and is receiving about 100 applications per day. He thanked the media, Ms. Holt and staff for the highly successful program. He said most of the demand is coming for natural gas woodstoves, which are the cleanest, in addition to options for those who enjoy burning wood. Mr. Sadredin recommended the Board reallocate \$2 million from the District's current spending plan to this program. He noted the funds were originally allocated for a truck program but the state has filled the gap and the funds were no longer needed for that program. He said this does not add any dollars to the District budget. He also recognized Mr. Sheikh, Deputy APCO, and the Incentives staff for their hard work processing the numerous applications and the great customer service they provide applicants.

Councilmember Baines commended the Board for getting the word out, noting the program was oversubscribed which was a good thing. He asked about participation rates for impoverished communities. Mr. Sadredin responded over 20% of the total dollars are going to the low income recipients. Supervisor Worthley commented this is great news, noting this rule directly impacts Valley residents and will provide huge improvement for the Valley's air quality. Supervisor Elliott said this is a great story to tell and reinforces the value of the District's incentive programs.

Public Comment – The following persons provided comment on this item:

- Tom Frantz, AIR
- Dolores Weller, CVAQ
- Brittany Dyer, Legislative Assistant to Supervisor Wheeler

Dr. Sherriffs commented the public response to the program is wonderful and speaks to the thought that went into developing it and in some ways exceeds the expected response in regards to gas conversion. He said he was worried about additional funding requests, noting there was not an endless supply of funds available and suggested staff should continue to be proactive to find ways to increase participation by residents.

Moved: Worthley Seconded: Baines

Ayes: Baines, Barba, Bomprezzi, Brazil, Capitman,

Case McNairy, Couch, Elliott, O'Brien, Sherriffs,

Worthley, Walsh

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to allocate an additional \$2,000,000 in funding for continued implementation of the highly successful Burn Cleaner Incentive Program to support the District's efforts to reduce the impacts of residential wood burning

11. RECEIVE UPDATE AND PROVIDE DIRECTION ON BIOMASS POWER PLANT

ASSISTANCE – Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, gave the presentation on
this item which provided the Board with an update on efforts to identify and
develop potential solutions to assist biomass power producers utilizing
agricultural waste. In addition, Mr. Jordan asked the Board to provide direction
on the feasibility and the scope of possible assistance from the District for
biomass power producers facing closure in the short term.

Supervisor Worthley commented the Tracy plant is no longer operational and wondering if District funding assistance could even help. He wondered about the amount of waste processed at that facility that was from the Bay Area. He stated there was not enough information available and there were bigger issues at play for each facility. He said he would not recommend moving forward at this time with providing funding. Mr. Sadredin responded that on the average the Tracy plant processed approximately 30% urban waste. He indicated there were no guarantees that the Tracy plant would reopen even with funding from the District. Supervisor Case McNairy commented this is a legislative issue, noting there were advocates in Sacramento that could assist. Dr. Sherriffs commented staff's method of operation, working with PUC and the Energy Commission was the smart way to go noting that collaboration can go far to address these issues.

Mr. Sadredin noted ultimately if the Valley loses all of these biomass plants there may not be another feasible avenue for agricultural waste, which is currently 70% of the fuel used by these facilities. He said the District is keeping a close eye on the situation, noting concerns about the possible need for increased agricultural burning and said staff will keep the Board updated. Supervisor O'Brien commented on the need to evaluate the net effect on emissions from ag related waste disposal, such as mobile sources that deliver waste to the plants for future assistance efforts.

Public Comment – The following persons provided comment on this item:

- Manuel Cunha, Nisei Farmers League
- Tom Frantz, AIR

12. ACCEPT AND APPROPRIATE \$677,214 IN ADDITIONAL REVENUE FROM THE UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY TO FUND THE REPLACEMENT OF MEDIUM-DUTY TRUCKS – Mr. Sadredin said the District prioritizes efforts to bring financial incentives to the Valley to reduce air pollution from sources not within its regulatory authority and has had great success with lobbying efforts in Washington, D.C. Mr. Sadredin said the EPA selected the District's proposal under the highly competitive Diesel Emission Reduction Act (DERA) fiscal year 2014 National Clean Diesel Funding Assistance Program to replace 48 medium-duty local delivery trucks in the Valley.

Public Comment - None

Moved: Sherriffs
Seconded: Case McNairy

Ayes: Baines, Barba, Bomprezzi, Brazil, Capitman,

Case McNairy, Couch, Elliott, O'Brien, Sherriffs,

Worthley, Walsh

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to accept and appropriate \$677,214 in additional revenue from the United States Environmental Protection Agency to fund the replacement of medium-duty trucks

- 14. VERBAL REPORT ON AIR RESOURCES BOARD ACTIVITIES Dr. Sherriffs reported the Board met on October 23rd and 24th and approved and forwarded to EPA supplemental documentation that the District has met the requirements of Subpart 4 provisions of the federal Clean Air Act and simultaneously approved and forwarded to EPA the District's request to classify the Valley as a serious nonattainment area. He added the Board also approved documentation of emissions reductions generated by the District incentive programs, corresponding inventory updates, and how incentive based reductions are accounted for in the implementation of the Valley's Annual Average PM2.5 Plan.
 - Dr. Sherriffs reported the Board met on September 18th and a number of actions were adopted related to AB 32, the California Global Warming Solutions Act of 2006. He noted there was a zero emission vehicle showcase with a number of cars, motorcycles, busses and heavy-duty trucks on display. Dr. Sherriffs added there a number of zero emissions vehicle models available for sale now in California. Dr. Sherriffs commented the technology is available to achieve a 75% reduction in NOx and the infrastructure needs to be supported.
- 15. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS Mr. Sadredin reported at a September meeting, the Special City Selection Committee approved new three-year terms for the city representatives that serve on the District Governing Board. He thanked Michelle Franco, Deputy Clerk of the Boards, and her staff for the difficult task of calling members from each of the 59 cities in the Valley to achieve a quorum for the meeting. He said Councilmember Bomprezzi, Councilmember

Baines and Councilmember Hanson would be returning to the Board next year. He added Councilmember Barwick chose not to seek re-election so the committee will appoint his replacement sometime early next year. He noted Mayor Brazil still has one year remaining on his current term. Mr. Sadredin said the committee also approved an increase in the ability of the cities within each of the three regions of the District to nominate their representative to the District Governing Board.

Mr. Sadredin invited all Board members to attend the December Governing Board meeting in the Fresno office for a farewell gathering of the departing Governing Board members.

16. GOVERNING BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS – Supervisor Couch suggested the District exempt the state and federal recognized holidays of Thanksgiving and Christmas from any wood burning curtailments. Ms. Case-McNairy asked what the impact on the Valley's air quality would be if there were no curtailments on those days. She commented the air quality might be detrimental to public health if most residents burned on those days. Dr. Sherriffs commented the health effects could be substantial and the effects could linger past the exempted days. He gave the example of Fourth of July fireworks and how the air quality effects linger for days.

Supervisor Couch asked if the Board has taken a position on fireworks. Mr. Sadredin responded the Board has discussed this issue several times and is continually looking to reduce emissions from this source category. Mr. Sadredin pointed out that the most significant source of emissions from fireworks is personal use rather than professional firework shows. He commented this item is listed as a measure to pursue with the next PM2.5 Plan because although this event occurs during summer when levels of PM2.5 are not critical, it does impact the District's attainment strategy.

Supervisor Couch asked staff to research the suggestion and return to the Board with recommendations. Supervisor Walsh commented there may be confusion among residents should some days be exempt and other not. He also expressed concern for the health impact if wood burning were allowed on those days.

Ms. Ballatore-Williamson noted the Board could not take action on this item today because it is not on the agenda, but the Board could take action to place the item on a future agenda.

Dr. Capitman expressed concern regarding this item and noted he was not in support of the item being placed on a future agenda. Councilmember Bomprezzi expressed she did not support the suggestion. Councilmember Baines stated without further information he would not be in favor of the suggestion. Supervisor Worthley commented he would support the item be placed on a future agenda for informational purposes including procedural processes. Supervisor Barba stated the City of Hanford attempted to discourage use of fireworks and residents refused. He added he is opposed to the suggestion.

Mr. Sadredin explained the procedure to exempt a specific day from curtailment would involve changing the rule and determining the impact of the plan. He commented the Board could provide direction on enforcement for the suggested days. He requested direction from the Board and asked for consideration of staffs' workload. Supervisor Walsh stated there is no directive to staff at this time on Supervisor Couch's suggestion.

17. <u>CLOSED SESSION</u> – The Chair called for public comment before adjourning to Closed Session.

Public Comment - None

Ms. Ballatore-Williamson reported during Closed Session, the Board members present unanimously approved staff to intervene in the action, Sierra Club vs. US EPA, Northern District CA Case Number 04596. She reported the Board would continue to meet in Closed Session on the second item disclosed on the Agenda although no action will be taken on that item. Therefore, she said the Board would adjourn out of Closed Session following their discussion.

ADJOURN

Meeting adjourned at 12:22 p.m.

The next scheduled meeting of the Governing Board is: <u>Thursday, December 18, 2014</u>. The meeting starts at 9:00 a.m., in the Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC) with the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating via VTC.