

## Action Summary Minutes

San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

### **GOVERNING BOARD MEETING**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**Thursday, January 18, 2018**  
**9:00 a.m.**

***Meeting held via teleconferencing with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield).***

***This meeting was webcast.***

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER – The Chair, Supervisor Mendes, called the meeting to order at 9:04 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present.

*Present:*

John Capitman, Ph.D	Appointed by Governor
Bob Elliott, Supervisor**	San Joaquin County
Buddy Mendes, Supervisor, <b>Chair</b>	Fresno County
Kristin Olsen, Supervisor**	Stanislaus County
Lloyd Pareira, Supervisor**	Merced County
Craig Pedersen, Supervisor	Kings County
Monte Reyes, Councilmember	City of Porterville
Dr. Alexander Sherriffs	Appointed by Governor
Chris Vierra, Mayor**	City of Ceres
Tom Wheeler, Supervisor	Madera County

*\*\*attended in Northern Region Office*

*Absent:*

David Ayers, Mayor	City of Hanford
David Couch, Supervisor	Kern County
Christina Fugazi, Councilmember	City of Stockton
J. Steven Worthley, Supervisor, <b>Vice Chair</b>	Tulare County

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

4. APPROVAL OF CONSENT CALENDAR – Item Numbers (19 – 24): *These matters are routine in nature and are usually approved by a single vote. Prior to any action by the board, the public was given the opportunity to comment on any consent item.*

19. APPROVE ACTION SUMMARY MINUTES FOR THE SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY UNIFIED AIR POLLUTION CONTROL DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD MEETING OF THURSDAY, DECEMBER 21, 2017

20. RECEIVE AND FILE LIST OF SCHEDULED MEETINGS FOR 2018

21. RECEIVE AND FILE OPERATIONS STATISTICS SUMMARY FOR DECEMBER 2017

22. RECEIVE AND FILE BUDGET STATUS REPORTS AS OF DECEMBER 31, 2017

23. CONTRACT WITH DISTRICT COUNSEL

24. RECEIVE AND FILE COMPREHENSIVE ANNUAL FINANCIAL REPORT AND SINGLE AUDIT REPORTS FOR THE FISCAL YEAR ENDED JUNE 30, 2017

District Counsel, Annette Ballatore-Williamson, summarized Item #23 CONTRACT WITH DISTRICT COUNSEL, as required under the Brown Act.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Wheeler

Seconded: Pedersen

Ayes: Capitman, Elliott, Olsen, Pareira, Pedersen,  
Reyes, Sherriffs, Vierra, Wheeler, Mendes

Nays: None

***Motion unanimously carried approve Consent Calendar Item Numbers 19 - 24***

5. PUBLIC COMMENT – *The following persons provided testimony during this item:*

- Dave Warningham, Lennox

6. S.T.A.R. RECOGNITION (Service, Teamwork, Attitude, Respect) – Chenecua Dixon, Personnel Director, recognized the following staff who reached a service milestone during the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter of 2017:

**Five Years of Service**

Heather Heinks, Public Education Administrator

**Ten Years of Service**

Jennifer Schmall, Air Quality Specialist  
Jennifer Sitton, Air Quality Assistant

**Fifteen Years of Service**

Robert Harris, Programmer/Analyst

**Twenty Five Years of Service**

Thomas Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor  
Suzanne Walls-Medina, Senior Air Quality Specialist

7. **APPROVE THE DISTRICT'S 2018 LEGISLATIVE PLATFORM** – Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO said each year the Board adopts the District's Legislative Platform that guides its advocacy efforts at the state and federal level both with respect to legislation as well as any administrative actions that the District needs to take with respect to the priorities that have been established by the Board.

Mr. Sadredin reported last year was a very successful one for the District at both the state and federal level, with the passage of legislation that dealt with some of the District's Clean Air Act issues in the US House of Representatives along with a Senate Hearing. He reported that at the state level, the District enjoyed tremendous success with the Cap and Trade deal that was agreed to by the Legislature, bringing hundreds of millions of dollars of funding to the Valley. The Valley's air quality needs were comprehensively communicated to the Legislature and for that Mr. Sadredin thanked all of the District's stakeholders from the business community as well as the environmental organizations that helped bring hundreds of millions of dollars to the Valley to be used for clean air projects through the District's incentives programs. He said in the coming months, as the District's budget is developed, staff will present to the Board the additional resources that may be needed to administer the increase in funding. Mr. Sadredin introduced Paul Yoder and Lynn Jacquez, the District's state and federal advocates who gave an update on the legislative activities in Sacramento and Washington, D.C.

Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, gave an overview of the District's Legislative Platform, including the proposed approach to federal mandates, which will guide the District's legislative advocacy efforts.

**RECOMMENDED 2018 PRIORITIES:**

1. **(Federal/State) Funding for Clean Air Projects:** Provide new and continued funding for investment in projects that reduce air pollution in the disadvantaged communities throughout the Valley. The District's existing attainment plans already contain some of the strongest regulatory measures in the nation, and significant additional reductions in emissions will be achieved from new measures in the upcoming plans for the latest federal standards. However, funding is necessary for reductions to expedite public health benefits and attainment of the federal standards through incentive-based measures. Funding for incentive-based measures is also needed for reducing mobile source emissions since federal law preempts the District from imposing tailpipe emissions standards. The District will pursue all available funding sources including but not limited to Moyer, Cap and Trade, AB 118 at the state level and DERA, Targeted Air Shed, and Farm Bill EQIP at the federal level.
2. **(State) Cap and Trade Revenues:** The cap and trade program implemented by ARB sets up a mechanism by which affected sources can procure allowances or offsets to meet specified and declining caps on their greenhouse gas emissions. In other words, affected sources will be allowed to invest in reductions in other areas as mitigation for their local emissions. This scenario can potentially lead to adverse impacts in areas that are already disproportionately impacted by criteria pollutant emissions. To mitigate localized air quality impact and provide meaningful public health benefit to disproportionately impacted communities, a significant portion of Cap and Trade revenues must be spent on projects located within, and benefiting individuals living in, disadvantaged communities. In determining what communities are disadvantaged, the state must identify communities that face significant environmental challenges as well as economic challenges.
3. **(State) AB 617 Implementation:** Pursue policies aimed at streamlined implementation of state mandates under AB 617 and work to compel the State of California to provide funding for local air districts' costs to implement those mandates. AB 617 requires ARB to develop a uniform statewide system of annual reporting of criteria pollutants and toxic air contaminants at "capped" facilities and certain other stationary sources. This bill further requires ARB to develop a plan and system to identify the highest priority locations across the state for implementing community-level monitoring at the identified locations by 2018. Additional site-specific air monitoring and measures to reduce emissions at these locations are then imposed if it is determined that these facilities emit air pollutants in, or materially affect the selected locations or communities. Finally, AB 617 requires that air districts ensure that sources of air pollution at capped facilities are subject to Best Available Retrofit Control Technology.

The District and ARB already administer and implement a myriad of programs that can help fulfill the emissions inventory, air monitoring, and regulatory assessment objectives laid out under AB 617. The District will work actively to ensure that the upcoming mandates under AB 617 are integrated into existing programs as efficiently as possible.

**4. (Federal) Work with Administrative Branch Including EPA to Advance Streamlined and Efficient Implementation of the Clean Air Act**

**Mandates:** Work with new EPA administration to build effective working relationship, take advantage of new cooperative federalism to make sure Clean Air Act provisions are applied reasonably and in accordance with Congress' original intent. The new administration's focus on working with state and local agencies to develop programs that work for their specific situations provides opportunities to pursue administrative solutions to solve some of the issues presented by antiquated provisions of the Act, including the following:

- A. Contingency Measures in Extreme Non-Attainment Areas:** Requiring contingency measures in extreme nonattainment areas is irrational and unnecessary. The Act requires all attainment plans to include contingency measures, defined as extra control measures that go into effect without further regulatory action, if planned emissions controls fail to reach the goals or targets specified in the attainment plan. While requiring backup measures was a well-intentioned provision, it does not make sense in areas that have been classified as "extreme" non-attainment for ozone. These areas, by definition, have already implemented all available and foreseeable measures and still need a "black box" of future measures to define and employ. The term "black box" refers to reductions that are needed to attain the standard, but technology to achieve such reductions does not yet exist. No measures are held in reserve in areas that are classified as "extreme" non-attainment for ozone. With no stones left unturned in such plans, requiring contingency measures in such areas makes no sense. Since the contingency requirement in "extreme" non-attainment areas could actually harm public health, EPA should clarify that state and local air agencies should not be forced to implement the contingency requirements in the Clean Air Act in a manner that leads to delayed cleanup.
  
- B. Streamline the Planning Process:** Since the 1970's, EPA has established numerous ambient air quality standards for individual pollutants. We have now reached a point where various regions throughout the nation are subject to multiple iterations of standards for a single pollutant. For instance, there are currently 4 pending standards for ozone and 4 pending standards for PM2.5. Each of these standards requires a separate attainment plan which leads to

multiple overlapping requirements and deadlines. This in turn results in a great deal of confusion, costly bureaucracy, and duplicative regulations, all without corresponding public health benefits. EPA should develop an administrative process to consolidate plans into one unified set of requirements.

**C. Exceptional Events:** The Clean Air Act currently states that exceptional events do not include stagnation or a meteorological event involving high temperatures or lack of precipitation. The District believes that the intent of the Congress was to exclude short term and routine occurrences. Therefore, EPA should clarify that these exclusions do not apply to long-term and extraordinary stagnation and lack of precipitation such as those resulting from a 100-year drought. Additionally, EPA should streamline the review and paperwork requirements of Exceptional Events demonstrations to ensure timely review of Exceptional Events demonstrations.

**D. Health Risk Based Approach to Emissions Reductions:** The Act as it relates to the demonstration of Reasonable Further Progress or Rate of Progress treats all precursors the same, regardless of their potency in harming public health or achieving attainment. Driven by a rapidly expanding body of scientific research, there is now a growing recognition within the scientific community that from an exposure perspective, the National Ambient Air Quality Standards metrics for progress are a necessary but increasingly insufficient measure of total public health risk associated with air pollutants. In particular, control strategies for sources of PM<sub>2.5</sub> and ozone do not necessarily account for qualitative differences in the nature of their emissions. For PM<sub>2.5</sub>, toxicity has been shown to vary depending on particle size, chemical species, and surface area. In the case of ozone, differences in the relative potency of ozone precursors, VOCs in particular, is not captured by a strict, mass-based approach to precursor controls. EPA should provide weighted credit for emissions reductions based upon a precursor's relative impact upon public health.

**5. (Federal) National Standards for On-Road Heavy-Duty Trucks and Locomotives under Federal Jurisdiction:** Despite achieving significant emissions reductions through decades of implementing the most stringent stationary and mobile regulatory control program in the nation, nitrogen oxide (NO<sub>x</sub>) emissions, the primary precursor for both ozone and fine particulates (PM<sub>2.5</sub>) in the San Joaquin Valley, must be reduced by an additional 90% in order to attain the latest federal ozone and PM<sub>2.5</sub> standards that now encroach on natural background levels. The District has jurisdiction over stationary and area sources, which make up less than 15% of the total NO<sub>x</sub> emissions inventory. With over 85% of the Valley's remaining ozone and PM<sub>2.5</sub> precursor emissions now coming from mobile sources under federal

jurisdiction, the Valley cannot reach attainment even if all stationary sources were to be shut down.

6. **(State) Truck Emissions Verification:** The District anticipates state legislation relating to smog check for trucks in the coming year. Given that trucks are the largest source of NOx emissions in the San Joaquin Valley, the District supports a reasonable program that helps ensure that emissions controls are properly maintained and are not tampered with. However, given the high cost and detriment to ordinary conduct of commerce, the District cannot support a smog check program for trucks similar to the existing smog check program for light duty vehicles requiring individual vehicle testing at specially designed testing facilities. Instead, the District supports a smog check program that can rely on onboard diagnostic technology and verifiable self-reporting. Furthermore, the program must contain necessary flexibility to accommodate future technology advancements that can provide for efficient and reliable emissions verification.
7. **(State/Federal) Oppose Climate Change Measures that Result in Public Health Detriment Due to Increases in Criteria or Toxic Air Emissions:** Although climate change measures provide for many co-benefits in reducing both greenhouse gasses and criteria pollutant emissions, there are some measures that may lead to increases in criteria pollutant or toxic emissions. Therefore the District will support reasonable climate protection measures that reduce greenhouse gas emissions as well as toxic and criteria pollutants. The District will oppose climate change measures that are detrimental to public health by leading to increases in toxic or criteria pollutant emissions in already impacted areas.
8. **(State) Support Legislation Extending District's Existing Authority for DMV Fees to Match Applicable Federally Mandated Attainment Deadlines:** The District's current authority relating to DMV fees under California Health and Safety Code Sections 40610 through 40613 sunsets in 2024. The current sunset date was set to correspond to the District's attainment date for the latest ozone standard at the time the enabling legislation was enacted (1997). Since then EPA has adopted more restrictive standards with attainment dates ranging from 2031 through 2037. The Valley cannot reach attainment with regulatory measures alone and incentive-based measures are necessary to ensure expeditious reductions in emissions cost-effectively while investing in the local economy. Therefore, the District supports legislation extending the District's authority to match attainment deadlines for federally mandated health standards for which incentive funding is necessary.
9. **(State/Federal) Disadvantaged Community Policies:** The San Joaquin Valley is home to a number of disadvantaged communities that deserve care and attention. The District will adhere to the following principles in pursuing efforts to identify and address the needs of these communities:

- A. The District will support measures that improve quality of life and economic welfare. In identifying communities of need, both socioeconomic and environmental impacts should be considered. The District supports CalEPA's California Communities Environmental Health Screening tool (CalEnviroScreen) as the appropriate tool for identifying disadvantaged communities.
- B. The District considers poverty as a key factor contributing to diminished public health and will oppose efforts that lead to "redlining" these communities and inhibit economic growth.
- C. The District will support efforts to target additional state and federal resources to mitigate issues faced in disadvantaged communities.
- D. The District will oppose measures that dilute local control by diverting local revenues or the authority over the expenditure of local resources to the state or federal government. Reduced local control will weaken local enforcement programs. Local agencies are better suited to efficiently and effectively identify and address community needs.

- 10. (State/Federal) Seek funding and other support from the State Air Resources Board and Federal Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) to install and operate additional air quality monitoring instruments throughout San Joaquin Valley:** The District operates one of the most extensive air monitoring networks in the nation. Data from these monitors is utilized to measure progress and assess the need for further reductions needed to attain ambient air quality standards established by EPA. Moreover, the District is also committed to providing accurate and timely air quality information to educate and empower the public to protect themselves during poor air quality episodes. This is accomplished utilizing the air monitoring data through the District's first-in-the-nation Real-Time Air Advisory Network (RAAN).

Installation, operation and maintenance of the Districts air monitoring network is resource intensive. The District's annual operating appropriation for air monitoring is approximately \$2.9 million. Additional resources are required to address the increase in federal mandates relating to air monitoring (more monitors and more labor intensive QA/QC and reporting procedures for existing monitors) and the need for more monitoring capabilities to satisfy new initiatives to provide community-level air quality information.

- 11. (State/Federal) Support efforts that provide for cost-effective alternatives to open burning of agricultural waste:** In 2003, state law was amended to require the District to limit open burning of agricultural material in accordance with a phased-in schedule of deadlines. In addition

to those requirements, the state law authorizes the District to postpone the burn prohibition dates for specific types of agricultural material if the District makes three specific determinations and the Air Resources Board (ARB) concurs. The determinations are: (1) there are no economically feasible alternatives to open-burning of the specific type of material; (2) open-burning the specific type of material will not cause or substantially contribute to a violation of a National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS); and (3) there is no long-term federal or state funding commitment for the continued operation of biomass facilities in the Valley or the development of alternatives to burning. Working closely with the stakeholders over the years to identify economically feasible alternatives to open burning of various agricultural materials, the District has achieved an 80% reduction in agricultural burning.

Given current energy policy in California, biomass power facilities, which are one of the primary alternatives to agricultural burning, are in jeopardy. Many biomass plants in the Valley are nearing the end of their long-term contracts with utilities and find themselves in a position where the power that they provide is not the type of power that utilities are seeking (baseload vs. intermittent) and that the prices being offered for new contracts are too low to support their operations.

The District will support efforts to help level the playing field and provide fair competition between biomass plants and other renewable sources of power. The District will also support research and development of alternatives to the open burning of agricultural waste.

**12. (State/Federal) Technology Advancement:** The San Joaquin Valley Air Basin is classified as an “Extreme” non-attainment area for ozone. This means that that technology does not currently exist to bring the region into attainment of the federal ozone standard. Meeting the newest air quality standards will require transformative measures and technologies to achieve near zero emissions. In order to further develop technology to close the gap in required emissions reductions, the District operates a Technology Advancement Program. Along with its own resources, the District is seeking state and federal assistance to advance technology in the following areas:

- A.** Mobile sources projects that demonstrate zero- or near-zero-emissions solutions to mobile source categories with emphasis on goods and people movement, off-road equipment, or agricultural equipment.
- B.** Renewable energy projects that focus on overcoming the barriers that prevent the use or adoption of zero-emission renewable energy sources or reduce emissions from renewable energy systems to make them cleaner than comparable non-renewable alternatives.

- C. Waste solution projects that focus on waste systems or technologies that minimize or eliminate emissions from existing waste streams and processes, including waste-to-fuel and energy systems, such as ag waste gasification systems, dairy digesters and other bio-fuel and energy applications.

- 13. (State/Federal) Support adequate resources and policies to reduce the impact of wildfires and their attendant public health impact:** Wildfires result in significant loss of life and property. Air pollution generated from wildfires is enormous and well exceeds the total industrial and mobile source emissions in the San Joaquin Valley. These emissions result in significant adverse public health impacts in the San Joaquin Valley and in many regions throughout California. In the summer of 2008, California experienced a record number of wildfires, and the resulting emissions caused serious public health impacts and unprecedented levels of PM2.5 and ozone in the San Joaquin Valley and other regions throughout the state. Historically clean rural areas throughout the state and in the San Joaquin Valley experienced their worst air quality in decades, and pollutant levels and the number of daily exceedances of the health-based standards were significantly higher than ever before in recorded history. California experienced record setting drought conditions during the past four years. Due to these conditions, there is a tremendous amount of dead trees and materials that dramatically increase the risk of catastrophic wildfire.

Given the devastating public health impact that the Valley suffers from wildfires, support measures that can help reduce the intensity, magnitude, and frequency of wildfires including those that promote effective and expanded use of prescribed burns and mechanical treatment to reduce fuel build-up, including the following:

- A. Additional financial and staffing resources for public and private land managers to conduct prescribed burning as an effective means for reducing fuel supplies that lead to large and uncontrollable wildfires.
- B. When wildfires occur, fighting wildfires should be funded as other natural disasters are funded. Funding should not be diverted from forest management and fuel reduction activities to fight wildfires.
- C. Lessening or removal of contradictory environmental protection policies that prohibit the use of mechanized methods, or prescribed burning to reduce fuels when those are the only feasible methods available.
- D. Changes in the federal policies that better incorporate air quality concerns by shifting focus to prescribed burning and employing fire management techniques that reduce air quality impact when wildfires occur.

**14. (State/Federal) Support Income Tax Exemption for Air Quality Grant**

**Recipients:** Achieving the needed reductions from incentive-based programs and advancing transformative clean air technologies and infrastructure will require significant private sector investment. In many cases, owners of equipment with significant remaining useful life and value must be convinced to take partial financial support from District grants and replace such equipment with more expensive newer and cleaner technology. If the grant dollars received remain taxable, the District's grant program penetration may not reach the necessary levels.

Dr. Sherriffs thanked the presenters for the information and for clarifying the District's strong commitment to working for the national ultra-low NOx standards for heavy duty trucks as that is critical to meeting the Valley's needs. Mr. Sadredin added that this Board has gone as far as stating on the record that if state and federal government do not do their part with respect to mobile sources, the District may actually assign them those obligations in the State Implementation Plan.

Supervisor Elliott voiced agreement with the slight shift in focus on the District's efforts at the federal level to work for common sense administrative solutions this year, particularly in light of the fact that this is an election year and achieving significant legislative results is probably less likely. Also he said last year, Administrator Pruitt seemed very amenable to this concept of cooperative federalism and trying to work with the District to accommodate some of the concerns addressed to him in Washington, D.C. He said he wanted to confirm that we hadn't given up on the effort to achieve common sense adjustments to the Clean Air Act. He said the District should still continue to support legislation that would support those adjustments every chance they get. Mr. Sadredin responded that his recommendations to the Board are consistent with what Supervisor Elliott is suggesting but said it will not be a top priority. Supervisor Elliott said he concurred with that approach.

Regarding assignments, Supervisor Pedersen said the District has been hesitant to breach the issue of lack of land management in forestry divisions and asked if the District will be changing that strategy. Mr. Sadredin said that is something that has been put on the table but there are a lot of legal concerns and staff is pursuing assignments as a last resort. He said he hoped at the state level that ARB will do what they need to do with regards to trucks and at the federal level, it may have to be framed in a manner consistent with federal law that prohibits local jurisdictions from making federal assignments.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Tom Frantz, Association of Irrigated Residents

- Janet Diets-Camay, Fresno Resident
- Dolores Weller, Central Valley Air Quality Coalition (CVAQ)
- Genevieve Gale, CVAQ

*Moved:* Wheeler

*Seconded:* Olsen

*Ayes:* Capitman, Elliott, Olsen, Pareira, Pedersen, Reyes,  
Sherriffs, Vierra, Wheeler, Mendes

*Nays:* None

***Motion unanimously carried to adopt the District's 2018 Legislative Platform***

8. ROLE OF DISTRICT'S RAAN PROGRAM IN ALERTING PUBLIC DURING EPISODES OF POOR AIR QUALITY – Mr. Sadredin introduced Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, and Jon Klassen, Program Manager, who presented a review of the effectiveness of the District's Real-time Air Advisory Network (RAAN) program as a tool for Valley residents to receive timely air quality information and take protective actions as necessary. In addition, they reviewed the District's actions in response to the recent episode of poor air quality with the Board and asked them to evaluate if any changes or program enhancements were necessary.

Supervisor Wheeler commented that as a lifelong Valley foothill resident, he remembers the old days driving down to the Valley and hitting a layer of what appeared to be fog but was actually air pollution. He said it is obvious that the Valley's air quality has vastly improved thanks to the efforts of the District and the Governing Board. Supervisor Elliott thanked staff for the excellent report, saying it provides excellent perspective to just how far the Valley has come in terms of how bad the air quality used to be. He asked about the status of the planned Real-time neighborhood level information. He said the Board has taken the approach of being more health protective by giving residents valuable air quality information on an hourly basis, as opposed to EPA's standard which is a 24-hour average. He said some may erroneously take the 1-hour reading and translate it to be a 24-hour average. He said his recommendation is to continue to give the public the more health protective hourly information so they can make informed decisions about their exposure to high levels of pollutants. He said it is a balancing act to not frighten residents, who may not understand the nuances of the different air quality levels.

Dr. Capitman said that he has found that individuals have great access to air quality information every day on multiple channels and on multiple media. He said it is striking that every time he mentions air quality conditions, most people are not aware or are not tracking the conditions. He said the District is facing the classic challenge in public health, which is not just trying to educate people but actually trying to get them engaged and thinking about the air quality and making

choices on a daily basis as a result. He said while he feels very proud about all of the information, access and outreach, he does feel it is warranted to have a more in depth conversation with people about what leads to behavior change.

Supervisor Pedersen said the reality is that people are so loaded with information on a daily basis that the folks with challenges are interested and will listen, but the majority of people will tune out. He asked if it were better to spend money on fixing the issues or do you get so enamored with the message that we lose our focus on reducing emissions. Dr. Sherriffs commented that it is a great challenge in terms of the public health issues and said the District needs to engage people where and whenever they can and you engage different people in different ways. He said it is guaranteed there will be bad air quality episodes in the future, and people are living in terms of air quality today and not how it was 20 years ago. He said he feels the two big issues are how people can protect themselves and what can you do so you're not adding to the problem now and in the future.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Tom Frantz, Shafter Resident
- Pat Nowlin
- Margie Bell
- Maria Polite
- Janet Diets Camay, Fresno Resident
- Mariah Thompson
- Thomas Menz, Fresno Resident
- Genevieve Gale, CVAQ
- Angela Islas, Central Valley Asthma Collaborative
- Nikita Dariyinani
- Dolores Weller, CVAQ
- Martha Kelly, Central CA Environmental Justice Network

Councilmember Reyes commented on the changes in society and technology over the years, which have led to some of the challenges faced by the Valley and its residents today. He said almost everything done at the District has to do with forethought and ways to get residents to change their behaviors based on what their limitations are and said there have been great strides that have taken place.

9. REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE CENTRAL VALLEY SUMMIT ON ALTERNATIVES TO OPEN BURNING OF AGRICULTURAL WASTE – This item was tabled to the next meeting.
10. RECEIVE FINAL RESIDENTIAL WOOD BURNING SURVEY RESULTS AND CONSIDER OPTIONS FOR PROGRAM ENHANCEMENTS – Jessica Olsen, Air Quality Analysis and Research Supervisor, and Samir Sheikh, Deputy APCO, presented this item which reviewed key findings and recommendations from the

District's Residential Wood Burning Survey, which was authorized by the Board in June 2017.

Dr. Sherriffs commented that this information is important and critical in terms of the absolute health effects of wood smoke and in terms of the Valley meeting the PM2.5 standards. He said it is clear from the results there is a lot of public support to build on and there is room to make this a stronger and more effective rule. In terms of targeting the 10% of people that use wood burning as their sole source of heat, he said that is a major source of pollution and it is important to engage that group as there a large bang for the buck. Mr. Sadredin responded it is important to communicate through the public education process that the Valley has no choice but to make the rule, which is already the most stringent in the state, even tougher. He said a case can be made through both the health benefits and the fact that dollar per ton, there is no other rule that comes near the effectiveness of this rule.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Janet Diets Camay, Fresno Resident
- Thomas Menz, Fresno Resident

*Mayor Vierra and Dr. Capitman left at 11:58 a.m.*

*Supervisor Olsen left at 12:28 p.m.*

Mr. Sadredin announced that quorum had been lost so no action could be taken at this time. He said there would be plenty of opportunities for public engagement before enhancements to the rule would return to the Board.

Supervisor Wheeler suggested more public education is needed on the availability of wood burning device incentives. Supervisor Pedersen commented that some residents will just not follow the wood burning restrictions as they feel like it is their legal right to burn on their own property.

Mr. Sadredin said due to lack of a quorum staff could use prior guidance from the Board to develop future enhancements for Board consideration. Chairman Mendes' responded affirmatively.

11. RECEIVE THE GOVERNMENT FINANCE OFFICERS' ASSOCIATION CERTIFICATE OF ACHIEVEMENT FOR EXCELLENCE IN FINANCIAL REPORTING – Mr. Sadredin announced that the District received the Government Finance Officers' Association of the United States and Canada (GFOA) Certificate of Achievement for Excellence in Financial Reporting for the District's Comprehensive Annual Financial Report (CAFR) for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2016. He thanked the Board for holding the District's feet to the fire in terms of exercising its fiduciary responsibilities and Mehri Barati, Director of Incentives and Administrative Services, and her Finance and Accounting teams for doing such a great job.

12. PROCESS USED IN ASSESSING DISTRICT COSTS AND REVENUES – Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, presented this item which asked the Board to review and provide guidance relating to the process used by District staff in assessing District costs and revenues. Mr. Sadredin said staff is nearing completion of their preliminary work and the purpose of this item was to obtain any final guidance from the Board. He said preliminary findings indicate that a modest fee increase is likely and staff have been communicating this with members of the business community.

Supervisor Pedersen voiced agreement with the District's process and said it is the most responsible way to operate an organization like this. He said Mr. Sadredin has always been sensitive to the needs of the organization as well as the community and modest adjustments in today's world are part of doing business as the cost of doing things is not getting cheaper. Supervisor Elliott added his emphatic agreement with the process used and said it is imperative to continue using the zero based budgeting approach to ensure the District's priorities are in the right place and we are getting the best bang for the buck. He said he also agrees with making fee increases the last resort, but said if we have to do it then it is absolutely necessary to have this public process to educate the people who will be affected.

Public Comment: None

13. APPOINT AD HOC SUBCOMMITTEE FOR HEARING BOARD APPOINTMENTS – Mr. Sadredin asked the Chair to appoint two Board members from each region to review survey results and qualifications of the District Hearing Board Public Primary and Alternate members whose terms expire on February 28, 2018. Chairman Mendes appointed Supervisor Pariera and Supervisor Elliott (Northern Region); Supervisor Worthley and Supervisor Couch (Southern Region); and Supervisor Wheeler and Chairman Mendes (Central Region) to the Ad Hoc Subcommittee for Hearing Board appointments.
14. APPOINT AD HOC BUDGET SUBCOMMITTEE – Mr. Sadredin asked the Chair to appoint up to seven Board members to the District's Ad Hoc Budget Subcommittee to review and provide recommendations to staff during the budgeting process. Chairman Mendes appointed himself, Supervisor Pedersen, Councilmember Reyes, Supervisor Wheeler, and asked the Deputy Clerk of the Boards to invite Councilmember Fugazi, Supervisor Olsen, and Mayor Vierra to the Ad Hoc Budget Subcommittee.
15. VERBAL REPORT ON AIR RESOURCES BOARD ACTIVITIES – Dr. Sherriffs reported on highlights from the California Air Resources Board meeting of December 14, 2017, including:

- The Air Resources Board approved the 2017 Climate Change Scoping

Plan Update (Update) along with the Environmental Analysis (EA) prepared for the Update and written responses to environmental comments received on the EA.

- The Air Resources Board approved the Fiscal Year 2017-18 Funding Plan for Clean Transportation Incentives, including substantial investments from four related funding sources: the Low Carbon Transportation Program funded with Cap-and-Trade auction proceeds; the Air Quality Improvement Program; one-time Volkswagen settlement funding for the zero emission vehicle aspects of vehicle replacement programs; and one-time funding for the Zero/Near Zero Emission Warehouse Program. These programs provide incentives for clean vehicle and equipment projects to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and air pollution with a priority on benefiting disadvantaged and low-income communities and low-income households. The plan includes incentives for zero-emission and plug-in passenger cars, clean trucks and buses, and advanced technology freight projects. The plan also includes a three-year strategy for heavy-duty vehicle investments to guide these funding decisions.

16. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – None

17. GOVERNING BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS – None

18. CLOSED SESSION – Ms. Ballatore-Williamson announced since quorum was lost, the Board would not adjourn to Closed Session and the items would be tabled until the next meeting.

Public Comment: None

## **ADJOURN**

The Chair adjourned the meeting to Closed Session at 12:55 p.m.

*The next scheduled meeting of the Governing Board is: Thursday, February 15, 2018. The meeting starts at 9:00 a.m., in the Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC) with the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating via VTC.*