

Action Summary Minutes

San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

GOVERNING BOARD STUDY SESSION

The Pines Resort
54449 Road 432, Bass Lake, CA 93604

**Wednesday, September 19 and
Thursday, September 20, 2018**

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER – The Chair, Supervisor Mendes, called the meeting to order on September 19, 2018, at 11:22 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was not present.

Present:

David Ayers, Mayor**	City of Hanford
David Couch, Supervisor****	Kern County
Bob Elliott, Supervisor	San Joaquin County
Buddy Mendes, Supervisor, Chair	Fresno County
Kristin Olsen, Supervisor*	Stanislaus County
Craig Pedersen, Supervisor	Kings County
Monte Reyes, Councilmember***	City of Porterville
Dr. Alexander Sherriffs	Appointed by Governor
Tom Wheeler, Supervisor	Madera County
J. Steven Worthley, Supervisor, Vice Chair	Tulare County

*Arrived at 11:30 a.m

**Arrived at 11:38 a.m.

***Arrived at 11:53 a.m.

****Arrived at 8:30 a.m. on Thursday, September 20, 2018

Absent:

Drew M. Bessinger, Councilmember	City of Clovis
John Capitman, Ph.D	Appointed by Governor
Christina Fugazi, Councilmember	City of Stockton
Lloyd Pareira, Supervisor	Merced County
Chris Vierra, Mayor	City of Ceres

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE
4. HOUSEKEEPING AND LOGISTICS - Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, welcomed everyone to the District's annual Governing Board Study Session. He thanked the Board members and stakeholders for their attendance. He reminded

all that this was a Brown Act-compliant public meeting that would be conducted in a less-formal, round table setting.

5. WELCOMING REMARKS – Supervisor Wheeler welcomed Board members and thanked them for coming to Bass Lake for the Governing Board Study Session. He thanked the owners and staff at the Pines Resort for their hospitality and support for this meeting.

Chairman Mendes announced that since a quorum was not present, item number 6 would be tabled until Thursday morning and item 13 would be taken first as it was an update item that did not require action by the Board.

This item was taken out of order

13. PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE DRIVE CLEAN IN THE SAN JOAQUIN PROGRAM AND DEMONSTRATE THE ONLINE APPLICATION PORTAL FOR VALLEY RESIDENTS – Brian Dodds, Program Manager, and Mehri Barati, Administrative Services Director, presented the Board with a progress report on the implementation of the District's Drive Clean in the San Joaquin Program, a demonstration of the online application process for the vehicle replacement option, and an overview of the outreach strategy necessary to increase program participation.

Mr. Sheikh thanked and recognized Ms. Barati and Mr. Dodds for their excellent presentation and work on this program and congratulated Mr. Dodds on his recent promotion to Program Manager. He said as the District is advocating and competing for funding, it will be very important that we have flexible, broad options available for residents to take advantage of these types of programs. He said this program, as approved by the Board last year, will add the new online dimension making it easier for residents to access the program. He said staff have received very positive feedback on the program enhancement. He asked the Board for their suggestions prior to the upcoming valley-wide launch of the program.

Supervisor Mendes said he observed a recent Tune In Tune Up event in Fresno and said he was very impressed by the large number of cars that were processed in a short period of time. He said he has never seen such an organized event. Supervisor Elliott asked if the requirement to keep the vehicle for 30 months was required for all program components. Ms. Barati responded affirmatively.

Mr. Sheikh added that the Board approved the vehicle rebate component as an addition to the state rebate program to increase program participation from Valley residents. He said within the Tune In Tune Up program, staff found that repair wasn't always the best option, so the Board approved a pilot vehicle replacement program which served as an ongoing foundation for a program that not only the District operates but also South Coast AQMD is trying to operate now. He said the replacement component requires the high polluting vehicle to be scrapped.

Mr. Sheikh said the Repair, Rebate, and Replacement programs are all very different but complimentary to each other and each one plays a specific role for residents. Supervisor Elliott asked if the vehicle rebate could be incorporated with the vehicle replacement program. Mr. Sheikh responded at the Board's direction last year, due to potentially low out-of-pocket expenses for the replacement program, they decided the rebate could not be combined with the replacement component. He said there are other rebates available including state and PG&E funds but the local dollars are limited to the two separate programs.

Supervisor Wheeler said he was surprised by the high number of residents who are purchasing hybrid vehicles. Mr. Dodds responded that hybrid vehicles are very attractive to residents who might experience "range anxiety" by purchasing a vehicle that runs solely on electricity. Supervisor Wheeler asked if vehicle owners received a trade in value for their older, high polluting vehicle. Mr. Dodds responded they do not. Mr. Sheikh added that part of the reason the program works as well as it does is that staff have systems in place with District partners to navigate participants' way through the finance process. He said the District is not involved at all in credit approvals but does connect residents with dealers and other applicable partners. He said part of the process is engaging with dealer partners to make sure they are able to commit to the systems that are in place. He added that the District is looking for more dealer partners to participate in the program.

Supervisor Worthley asked if any dealer was able to participate in the program. Ms. Barati responded affirmatively, and said dealer partners must sign a contract and agree to adhere to the terms of the program. Supervisor Worthley suggested expanding the online application portals to include the Burn Cleaner program to make it more convenient for applicants. He clarified that residents can also apply for the Drive Clean in the San Joaquin in person, at District offices. Mr. Dodds responded affirmatively.

Supervisor Mendes encouraged all Board members to attend a future Tune In Tune Up event and said they would be very impressed at the efficiency and excellent customer service provided to residents. Supervisor Wheeler said he attended an event in Madera and he could not believe the number of residents participating in the program. Supervisor Mendes said he was also impressed at how local law enforcement agencies partnered with event coordinators to make sure event traffic ran very smoothly.

Public Comment: None

Supervisor Olsen arrived at 11:30 a.m.

Mayor Ayers arrived at 11:38 a.m. – Deputy Clerk of the Boards, Michelle Franco, announced that quorum was reached

7. UPDATES FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD AND FEDERAL ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY – Mr. Sheikh introduced Michael Benjamin, Chief of the Air Quality Planning and Science Division at the Air Resources Board (ARB). Mr. Benjamin said ARB has a long history of collaborating with the District along with communities and industries in the Valley to deal with very unique and challenging air quality issues. He said these challenges are not just at the regional scale but also increasingly at the community scale. He added working together as partners, we have had tremendous success but the work is not done. Mr. Benjamin said ARB is working collaboratively with the District to develop and adopt the 2018 PM2.5 Plan to demonstrate a strategy for attaining federal fine particulate matter standards. He also said ARB is collaborating with the District on a new challenge, implementation of AB 617 which includes mitigating emissions and exposure at the community level. He said Mr. Sheikh and his team have been very actively engaged with ARB on both challenges, which they really appreciate.

He said the ARB Board is planning to hold their December meeting in Fresno to consider adoption of the District's PM2.5 Plan, which is incumbent on the District's Governing Board hearing the plan in November. He added another planned step is that ARB staff will be presenting the mobile source elements of the plan to their Board at their October meeting for consideration and adoption. Mr. Benjamin recognized and voiced appreciation for Mr. Sheikh's and Mr. Gill's leadership on the plan. He said the District is very near completing the plan which build on the results of 20-plus years of air quality research in the Valley, more than 2-3 years of really intense technical work and strategy development by staff in both agencies, and also significant input from community members and businesses in the Valley. He added this would be a major achievement for both agencies. He also recognized the Governing Board for their engagement on the plan, including several Board members who attended the community meeting held in Fresno in August.

In regards to AB 617, he said this program is an important step in transforming how ARB, as an air quality agency, thinks about air pollution. It used to be a regional concern, but due to the passage of AB 617, ARB is looking to protect communities in the Valley and elsewhere who are subject to the most extreme air pollution burdens. He said both ARB and the District have key responsibilities in implementing this program and successful implementation of the program will require close coordination. He said thus far, ARB and the District have been doing that and again credited Mr. Sheikh and staff for working very closely with ARB. He gave an overview of the various steps involved in AB 617 implementation along with upcoming steps in the process. He added a key component to AB 617 implementation is the development of partnerships to develop community-oriented solutions. Although initially only 2 of the 10 selected communities will be in the Valley, he said he believes there will be other communities in the Valley that will be included in future years. Lastly, he said that while the PM2.5 Plan and AB 617 are two distinctly different efforts, they have the same objective of protecting public health by reducing emissions.

Supervisor Wheeler asked how the 10 communities were selected under AB 617 and why there were only 2 in the Valley that were chosen. Mr. Benjamin responded that many communities in the state feel that they are disadvantaged. He said the challenge is that ARB wants the program to succeed and taking all of the elements needed to successfully develop an emission reductions strategy in the Valley will require staff from the District with assistance from ARB going into the community, understanding all of the emission sources in the community perhaps on a scale not previously thought about. The level of technical work will be incredibly intensive and involve emission inventory development, deployment of air monitors which will be very challenging, analyzing all of that information along with a strong element of community involvement as to how these community-level plans are implemented. He said it would take at least a year or two to develop extensive emissions reductions plans in each community. He added ARB and the District were allocated limited resources and therefore community selection was limited. Mr. Sheikh clarified that the City of Shafter and South Central Fresno were the initial communities selected by ARB from the initial 3 recommended by the District.

Supervisor Pedersen said Valley stationary sources have long carried the emission reduction burden in the Valley. He recognized that regulating mobile sources is a challenge and asked how the healthy Cap and Trade funding mechanism can be utilized to get greater emission reductions impacts from non-stationary sources. He also asked what would happen if the funding were no longer available. Mr. Benjamin responded that the collective challenge for ARB and the District is that it is getting more expensive and harder to get emission reductions. He said there are no other options to meeting the federal standards and recognized that the District has achieved success at attaining emission reductions from stationary sources and Valley businesses have borne those costs. Mr. Benjamin acknowledged everyone is operating under a little bit of uncertainty when it comes to funding on an ongoing annual basis but said he is optimistic that ARB will develop programs that are effective and create an environment in the legislature where they are willing to continue to provide funding for the programs.

Supervisor Pedersen said it makes sense that the stationary sources who have carried the emission reductions burden for so long should not be the focus of future regulatory efforts. Mr. Benjamin responded that new vehicles are 99% cleaner than they were in the 1960s and all drivers have borne the costs of those new cars through what they pay at the dealership. He said heavy duty trucks are at least 90% cleaner than what they were in the past and the trucking companies have borne related costs. He said ARB has tried to strike a balance between cost effectiveness and where it makes sense to get the emission reductions. He added half to two-thirds of emission reductions in the draft PM2.5 Plan are coming from ARB measures while half the problem is coming from the sources that ARB has control over. He said he feels the most cost effective area for the District to achieve additional reductions is residential wood combustion, especially for discretionary burning, and acknowledged that the District has taken

that on with their Hot Spots Strategy in the draft plan.

Supervisor Worthley thanked Mr. Benjamin for his acknowledgement of the fine work done by the District and the Board to achieve what they have with regards to stationary source reductions. He suggested it would be appropriate that every meeting should start off with letting everyone know how far the Valley has come in reducing emissions because in many cases people show up thinking that the air quality is terrible. He added a lot can be done to alleviate residents' concerns when they understand the context of what the District and ARB are doing. They need to be educated to the fact that the District and Valley have made so much progress over the past 25 years and while it has been a lot of work and very expensive, he said he wishes he could have raised his children with the air quality the Valley is experiencing now.

With regards to cost benefit analysis, and how the disadvantaged communities were determined, Supervisor Worthley gave the example of a community in his jurisdiction with a large trucking company that is located near residents. He said a simple answer to that community would be to relocate the trucking business to improve the air quality in that community, but the air quality would not improve across the Valley as a result of moving the trucking company. He said given the limited resources, the overall goal should be to improve air quality Valleywide and not just within individual communities. Mr. Benjamin responded within the framework of AB 617 implementation, he believed there was a way to address the air quality concerns of the community and the entire Valley through identifying significant sources in each one and coming up with ideas for emission reduction strategies.

Supervisor Mendes asked for an example of a community-based outcome. Mr. Benjamin responded that traditionally, ARB have operated from the top down acting as air quality experts, telling residents and industries what the problems are and how they can be fixed. He said AB 617 will change the landscape, along with increased public access to information. He added that communities and the public now have power with the addition of low-cost air quality sensors as they are collecting that information and making it available. He added the power dynamic between agencies and communities has changed and said ARB recognizes that they can no longer operate as they have in the past. He said it is important for community members to feel heard, that they have a voice in the process, and that the outcome was fair. Supervisor Mendes expressed concern at Mr. Benjamin's implication that information is good regardless of the quality of the information. He said there must be standards adhered to with regards to the quality of the information.

Supervisor Olsen expressed concern at the use of low-cost sensors by the public and quality control issues. She asked if there would be set standards as to the sensors used for accountability measures for the District and communities. Mr. Benjamin responded that South Coast AQMD has pioneered the development of AQ-SPEC where they evaluate air quality sensor performance, reliability and

accuracy. He said many residents are utilizing that website to determine how valid the information is from different sensors. Mr. Benjamin said when ARB designs their portal, they will add a quality metric to the data which is still in the planning stages.

Mr. Sheikh thanked Mr. Benjamin for his updates and collaboration with the District.

*The Board took a break for lunch at 12:39 p.m.
The Board reconvened at 1:20 p.m.*

Mr. Sheikh introduced Meredith Kurpius, Associate Director with the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Region 9 Air Division, who has been working closely with the District on PM2.5 planning efforts as well as other areas on which they have worked closely with the District. Ms. Kurpius updated members on several recent personnel changes at EPA. She said it has been an incredible 2 years for her working with the District on PM2.5. Now 2 years and more than 20 public meetings later, there is a draft PM2.5 Plan out for review. She said the biggest thing she wanted to say at the meeting today was what an amazing and incredible accomplishment this is for the District staff and Governing Board. She acknowledged the importance of getting the plan together and the partnerships that have been required to bring about the plan. While she was thankful for being a part of the process, she said the real credit goes to the hard work of the District, in partnership with the state and the myriad of stakeholders who have been participating over the years as well as the Board members who have been supportive of this plan.

She announced that EPA has received a complaint from the Committee for a Better Arvin, Committee for a Better Shafter, National Parks Conservation Association, and other organizations which asked EPA to issue a finding of failure to submit for all three PM2.5 standards within 30 days. As this complaint was just received, she said she has no other information at this time but it ups the ante in terms of timing and outcomes for the District's plan. She urged staff to move forward to get the District's plan approved as quickly as possible.

In terms of the ozone standards, Ms. Kurpius thanked the District for working together on their Ozone Reasonably Available Control Technology (RACT) State Implementation Plan (SIP). She said staff was integral in getting some last minute information together to meet a court-ordered deadline this summer, which was a really important accomplishment. Now there is the 2016 Ozone Plan for the 2008 standard. She explained a recent court decision on contingency measures, which changed the landscape for contingency measures and impacted that plan. Since that time, there has been a later petition, South Coast AQMD vs. EPA, which affects the Reasonable Further Progress (RFP) calculations. She said EPA has held off on acting on the District's plan through no fault of the District, but now has a court-ordered deadline to approve the plan except for the pieces affected by the recent court decisions. EPA's plan is to

issue a decision by December 19, 2018, and the comment period closes on October 1, 2018. She said the parts affected by the court decisions have a later deadline of January 31, 2019. EPA believes they have a solution worked out with the state on the RFP calculations but the contingency measure issue still needs to be worked out. Lastly, she commended the District for its Technology Advancement Program, and said it was one of the best programs in Region 9.

Supervisor Pedersen expressed concern about the new complaint, and asked if the response to the complaint could result in a situation similar to how EPA handled the last PM2.5 Plan submitted by the District. Ms. Kurpius responded that the current situation with PM2.5 is different than the previous one. When the extension request for the 1997 standard was before EPA, she said they had to make a decision within 6 months and they don't have the same time constraint with the District's current plan. She explained that a finding of Failure to Submit for the District's PM2.5 Plan would allow 18 months for the plan to be submitted before sanctions would begin, and the sanction clock gets turned off at the submission of a complete plan. In response to a question regarding current federal and state dynamics, she said a lot has changed with the new Administration. She said adherence to the Clean Air Act is actually stricter with the new Administration and they do not believe in the philosophy of "sue and settle". She also said EPA Regional offices do not have the same kind of engagement with headquarters and encouraged the Board and District to contact EPA headquarters with their concerns.

Supervisor Elliott asked for clarification of the 30-day deadline contained in the new complaint. Ms. Kurpius responded that EPA has 30-days to make a finding of Failure to Submit, which would formally acknowledge that the District and state did not submit the plan according to the Clean Air Act deadlines. She said with the District's planned timeframe, the plan will come to EPA later this year, and they would make a Completeness Determination that the District satisfied their requirement to submit the plan, which would remove any sanctions possibilities from the District. However, the 2-year Federal Implementation Plan (FIP) clock would remain in place until EPA approves the plan.

Mr. Sheikh clarified the FIP requirement and said it would be important for the District plan to be submitted and approved so the Board would not lose authority to implement future measures. He gave an overview of the issues facing the District's PM2.5 and Ozone plans, including contingency, and said staff is working on a strategy to address these remaining issues. With regard to the 30-day deadline in the complaint, he said the District's plans to submit the plan are well within that timeframe and two-year FIP time clock. He voiced appreciation for Ms. Kurpius' engagement in the plan process and thanked her update.

8. REVIEW, REAFFIRM AND/OR FINE-TUNE THE DISTRICT'S MISSION STATEMENT, VISION STATEMENT, AND CORE VALUES – Mr. Sheikh said in October 2006 the Board first adopted the District's Mission Statement, Vision Statement and a comprehensive suite of Core Values. Together, these guide District actions by providing a solid foundation and framework for strategic decision-making and the conduct of the District's day-to-day business under the Board's direction.

He added the District's Mission Statement, Vision Statement and Core Values are not simply slogans or posters on the wall, they define who we are as an agency and require ongoing attention and daily follow-through to ensure their goals are achieved in practice through everyday decisions and interactions. The Board has periodically reviewed the Mission Statement, Vision Statement and Core Values to ensure that they continue to be relevant, appropriate and reflect the Board's priorities and direction. Towards that end, Mr. Sheikh asked the Board to review, reevaluate and consider any possible changes to the District's Mission Statement, Vision Statement and Core Values.

Supervisor Worthley suggested to end the last sentence of the Mission Statement by adding the word "measures", as in "*Our Core Values have been designed to ensure that our mission is accomplished through common sense measures*". He added that the air cannot be cleaned up with common sense alone, but it is by different measures adopted using common sense. Supervisor Mendes agreed, and said it was a good suggestion. Supervisor Olsen said the District's Vision Statement, Mission Statement and Core Values were excellent. She suggested the last sentence of the Mission Statement could read "... *our mission is accomplished through common sense, feasibility and sound science*", but to incorporate Supervisor Worthley's suggestion, she suggested changing to "...*through common sense and feasible measures based on sound science*".

Supervisor Elliott said when common sense was added in the first place, "measures" was implied. He voiced agreement with the suggested changes and said it was great to reaffirm the common sense aspect with all of this. With regards to the District's Core Values, he said it was importance to recognize the balance needed with the value of "*Active and Effective Air Pollution Control Efforts with Minimal Disruption to the Valley's Economic Prosperity*". He added that he was certainly a fan of sound science as well, which is why he always supports the District's research efforts. He voiced agreement for the suggested changes. Supervisor Wheeler commented on the flow of the Vision Statement and suggested changing it to "*working with Valley residents to take pride in our collective efforts...*"

Mr. Sheikh offered framing on the Vision Statement and said it was designed to describe what the mission would look like if fully accomplished and what we would like to see is Valley residents taking pride in our collective efforts to continuously improve air quality. Mayor Ayers suggested considering adding the words "*evidence-based*" to "*sound science*"

Supervisor Worthley suggested having staff put together the proposed changes to the Mission Statement and bringing it back to the Board for review and approval at a later date. With regard to the Core Values, he said he struggles with the term “*minimal disruption of businesses*” because it gives the impression that what we ask businesses to do is minimal and it is not. He suggested making it a positive statement, such as “*Active and Effective Air Pollution Control Efforts while Improving the Valley’s Economic Prosperity*”. Dr. Sherriffs agreed with Supervisor Worthley’s comments and in the theme of collaboration at the Study Session, suggested changing the last Core Value to read “*seeking collaboration with federal, state, local agencies, agriculture, businesses, community groups and individuals to advance our mission.*” With regard to the word “opinions of all Valley residents” in the Core Value, Supervisor Worthley suggested incorporating something that will put into context that the District has come so far and some who engage in discussions about the Valley’s air quality have no recollection of the challenges faced by the District over which they have no control, such as wildfires. He said it goes to respect for opinions but also there is an educational aspect of giving people information that allows them to come to reasonable opinions.

Mr. Sheikh thanked the Board for giving staff the time to work through their suggested changes. He said based on the Board’s direction, staff would work to incorporate the suggested language changes to the Mission Statement and Core Values, and would bring back a proposal for consideration at a future Board meeting.

Public Comment: None

9. REVIEW AND PROVIDE INPUT ON DISTRICT’S ECONOMIC ANALYSIS OF REGULATIONS – Mr. Sheikh said the Board just talked at length about the District’s Core Values that drive what we do and a number of them are related to not just minimizing the disruption to the Valley’s economy but also improving the Valley’s economy. He introduced Sheraz Gill, Deputy APCO, who led the Board on a review of the District’s socioeconomic analysis process and solicited input on any further enhancements to the process prior to commencing the rule development process associated with implementation of the *2018 PM2.5 Plan* and other upcoming District regulatory efforts.

Supervisor Elliott asked for clarification on how a discrepancy between staff and stakeholder cost estimates is resolved. Mr. Gill responded staff does extensive research in determining cost estimates; however, if a discrepancy exists staff works closely with stakeholders to understand any additional costs and incorporate those costs into the economic analysis where appropriate. Supervisor Elliott said it is important for the District to take into account the expertise of those people who are affected by the proposed measures to tell us what it is really going to cost.

Supervisor Worthley suggested including new educational requirements and costs when implementing new regulations. Mr. Gill agreed and said staff tries their best to incorporate every single element or cost associated with proposed measures. Dr. Sherriffs asked what efforts were made to consider the health costs and benefits of meeting the standards. Mr. Sheikh responded that the driver in the framing of the socioeconomic analysis is about reducing air pollution as part of a package of measures that will help the District achieve air quality standards and improve public health. The question of specific health impacts and costs is complex and this process is not intended for that analysis. He added the challenge is trying to quantify a specific health effect or impact related to the very specific category in the proposed measure. He said this analysis is very difficult to conduct for measures that actually achieve very little on their own, but really work in aggregate with other measures over many years to achieve the health benefits of attaining the federal health-based standards. Mr. Sheikh said this item is about the economic impact of proposed measures and where they fit in as part of a collective of measures to address a particular standard.

Supervisor Ayers said it was very difficult to quantify the health benefits of individual measures. He commented on the enormous health effects of the wildfires on one of his patients and said it would be tough to assign an economic value to that.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Genevieve Gale, Central Valley Air Quality Coalition

Mr. Sheikh said staff would incorporate the suggestions received from Board members at this meeting and continue to make the economic analysis process even better. He voiced appreciation for the feedback received from the Board.

10. UPDATE FROM SJVAPCD EMPLOYEES' ASSOCIATION – Mr. Sheikh said that the productive relationship between the District and the SJVAPCD Employees' Association is a source of great pride for the District and is extremely important to maintaining the District's STAR work culture. Having a happy and motivated staff is extremely important in promoting the very effective customer service focused programs of the District. He introduced Anna Myers, President of the SJVAPCD Employees' Association who gave a brief update to the Board on the Association's very positive and proactive relationship with the District.

This item was taken out of order

12. THE DISTRICT S.T.A.R. (Service, Teamwork, Attitude and Respect) WORK CULTURE – Mr. Sheikh said the District takes great pride in the positive feedback received from stakeholders regarding the interactions they have with staff. He said the District has long been committed to establishing and maintaining a workforce that not only produces innovative, effective, and high quality technical work but also provides exceptional customer service to the public, the regulated community, and others we encounter while conducting

District business. He said the District has developed and implemented STAR (Service, Teamwork, Attitude and Respect), a District-wide work culture program aimed at creating an atmosphere in which providing exceptional service, demonstrating effective teamwork, maintaining a positive attitude, and showing respect to others are an intrinsic part of each employee's job.

Mr. Sheikh said the Governing Board's support and guidance has been instrumental to the STAR work culture as its success requires total buy-in and commitment from every level of the organization. He said the purpose of this item was to seek the Board's continued support and guidance as well as to serve as an educational opportunity to provide an insightful view into the District's STAR work culture for the newer Board members. He introduced Mr. Gill, Morgan Lambert, and Dave Warner, Deputy APCOs, who presented the key elements of STAR, core implementation principles, detailed implementation actions, and results of STAR.

Chenecua Dixon, Personnel Director, introduced several District staff members, including Jennifer Ledergerber, Silvana Procopio, Sarah Hasan, My Dang, Esthela Soto, Ify Mordi, Cassandra Melching, Brian Clements, Ariana Orozco, Youjin Kim, Ryan Buchanan, Jessica Coria, and Carrie Tuell-Todd who each provided testimony on how the District's STAR work culture has enriched their work experience and positively impacted their lives.

Christine Zimmerman (Western States Petroleum Association), Kevin Abernathy (Milk Producers' Council and Dairy CARES), Manuel Cunha (Nisei Farmers League), and Chris McGlothlin (California Cotton Ginners and Growers' Association and Western Agricultural Producers' Association) also presented several examples of excellent customer service they have received from District staff and commended them for great work ethics and efficiency.

Mr. Sheikh thanked staff for their great testimony, and said as the new Executive Director/APCO of the organization, hearing their stories and seeing their STAR spirit in action was very touching. He also thanked the stakeholders for their testimony on the value of STAR, saying he was very fortunate in his position to have the greatest staff working on these issues. He said the reason this item was placed on the agenda is that STAR begins at the top and having the Board's guidance and support for the program is essential to its ongoing success. He asked Board members for any suggestions or comments they might have to continue to improve the program and thanked them again for their support.

Supervisor Mendes said the magic formula is time as it takes years for an organization like the District to get to where it is today with the STAR culture. He added that it has everything to do with how the staff is led and how the culture develops. He gave examples of other government agencies with a negative work environment, poor leadership and as a result employee morale is bad. He said ultimately it is all about hiring employees with good attitudes which must be embedded and whose attitudes become contagious to other employees.

Supervisor Pedersen said when he first began to serve on the Board he was a healthy skeptic of the District and its work culture. He said now, he completely support's the District's STAR culture as the employees' passion, pride, and emotions show. He said as Board members, it is their mission to carry that passion with them everywhere they go and every meeting they attend at every level.

Supervisor Worthley said he has always been amazed by the District's STAR work culture. He said it is important for Board members to understand the culture that has been created and to not ever stop thinking that this whole concept of appreciating staff for what they do is not important. He said the huge amount of funding that the District is awarded on an annual basis does not just happen, but is because of District staff that go above and beyond in competing for these funds. He said it is important for the Board to continually recognize efforts by District staff by thanking them publicly and sharing their many accomplishments and the STAR work culture with Valley residents. He encouraged Board members to be the cheerleaders for the District staff who appreciate and deserve it.

Supervisor Elliott said it was hard to follow Supervisor Worthley's comments and that he would be missed when he retires in December. He said he has been attending the Study Session for several years and said he enjoys hearing similar stories from different staff every year, which shows him that the STAR work culture if really working. He said one of the most important components of STAR is the effort to break down silos and instill the idea that everyone is working for the good of the organization. He said the wider focus gives everyone better focus on how they can be a better provider of excellent service to all of the District's customers.

Dr. Sherriffs said he is all in favor of keeping the STAR culture at the forefront of District operations. He agreed that is comes from above, and said while he would love to take credit for this program, it belongs to District leadership. With regards to enhancement, he said the relationship with stakeholders is so important and the work culture has allowed them to develop trust with District employees. He said Valley residents and individuals are also stakeholders and it was important to hear from them as to how the District is doing. The Environmental Justice community and community groups also become increasingly important as we begin work on AB 617.

Mayor Ayers echoed the comments of Board members and said this is an excellent work culture. He agreed that it really starts at the top and his experience is that Board members treat each other and staff with a huge amount of respect and dignity and complimented everyone for their part in developing the STAR work culture and said it truly is a learning experience and he embraced it 100%.

Supervisor Wheeler said he has served on the Board for quite some time, and said you are only as good as the people you hire to work for you. He said he makes a point to always speak to staff at every level and it was important for the Board to continue to embrace and demonstrate STAR in their interactions and decisions including choosing leaders for the organization, like Mr. Sheikh. He said he loves serving on the Board and working with this wonderful staff and that he shares the STAR program with Madera County employees every chance he gets.

Supervisor Olsen applauded the STAR work culture and said this presentation made her feel very positive and uplifted which illustrates the power of STAR. She encouraged staff to continue their good work from the leadership team to all staff and said this was an impressive organization.

Councilmember Reyes said every time he walks into District offices, he feels positive and engaged with staff and that he is able to take care of the business at hand. He said from the leadership team to all staff members, this is an impressive organization.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Les Clark

The Board adjourned at 4:57 p.m.

The Board reconvened at 8:36 a.m. on Thursday, September 20, 2018 and a quorum was present.

This item was taken out of order

6. REVIEW ASSESSMENT OF RENEWED ENGAGEMENT WITH SCHOOLS AND PILOT PROJECT TO DEPLOY REAL-TIME ELECTRONIC AIR QUALITY DISPLAYS (READ) – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, and Heather Heinks, Public Education Administrator, presented an assessment of the effectiveness of the renewed engagement with schools in the Healthy Air Living Schools Program and the District’s pilot project to deploy Real-Time Electronic Air Quality Displays (READs) at Valley schools to replace the retired Air Quality Flag Program. Mr. Sheikh recognized the Board and said without their direction and support the program’s success would not have possible.

Supervisor Worthley asked if the District has had any schools use their electronic digital signs to display the READ data. Mrs. Heinks responded that many of the signs will not support READ as they do not have an active WiFi connection to download the real-time air quality information. However, the District is really close implementing this solution with one school that has a newer sign with a WiFi connection. She said there are outstanding technical issues that the District is working with the school to try to resolve.

Supervisor Wheeler asked how much money is allocated for this program. Ms. Holt responded that in the District's current budget there is funding for two full time temporary staff members and \$50,000 for READ displays. She added that staff's recommendation is not that there be any increase to the budget for this program, but only that the money for temporary staff be used to fund one full-time regular position. Supervisor Wheeler voiced agreement and said he thinks it's a really great program and we should try to advertise as much as possible. He also voiced support for Supervisor Worthley's suggestion to use the digital signs in front of the schools to display READ information. He suggested airing the READ video on television.

Councilmember Reyes suggested the District work to reach the marching bands at middle and high schools and educate them on the impact of elevated air pollution concentrations on students during outdoor activities such as performances at sporting events.

Supervisor Elliott suggested utilizing school web pages to display READ as just about every school has a web page whether or not they have an outdoor digital sign. Ms. Heinks said the District has the ability to provide personalized school site air quality information through a "widget" that can be placed directly on a school's web page. Mr. Elliott commended staff for doing a great job by incorporating all of these different ways to get the word out and get the most up to date information out to the schools.

Dr. Sherriffs agreed it is a great program and part of the proof is we don't hear about schools backing out of the program once they begin. He asked about the main resistance for the other half of the schools that are not participating, why it was harder for them and what were the barriers for them. Ms. Holt responded, most of the time it is just getting the right person and that person feeling empowered to set policy. Mrs. Heinks added that at least some schools were hesitant to empower parents with air quality information. She said they don't want parents telling them that they need to cancel transportation and reorganize the afterschool activities and maybe cancel a football game that generates a lot of money.

Mr. Sheikh said staff incorporate the suggestions and directions provided by the Board into the way the program is implemented. Also, as Supervisor Worthley mentioned, Mr. Sheikh said staff will work to contact school Board members in an attempt to leverage better action at the district level.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Wheeler
Seconded: Worthley
Ayes: Ayers, Couch, Elliott, Olsen, Pedersen, Reyes,
Sherriffs, Wheeler, Worthley, Mendes
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve staff recommendations to amend the District's Position Control List to add one full-time Air Quality Education Representative I/II to provide the necessary ongoing staffing for the Healthy Air Living Schools Program.

This item was taken out of order

11. COLLABORATION WITH LAND MANAGERS TO INCREASE PRESCRIBED BURNING AND REDUCE FOREST FUELS TO MINIMIZE AIR QUALITY IMPACTS FROM WILDFIRES – Mr. Lambert presented the Board with an update on the District's efforts to collaborate with land management agencies to fuel reduction efforts, including increase prescribed burning. He also provide an update of current state and federal efforts to address forest management and fuel reductions in state and federal forested lands.

Mr. Sheikh said this is a very fast moving and complicated situation and staff would continue to bring updates to the Board. He said the District is working to convene a high-level meeting between key District staff and Board members, key representatives of the United States Forest Service, and other stakeholders. He asked Board members to provide further direction and guidance as staff continue to work with land managers to facilitate forest management and fuel reduction efforts.

Supervisor Wheeler said this was a good start but so small compared to the big picture of what is really happening with wildfires in the state. He said according to the U.S. Forest Service, we have spent \$2.5 billion fighting wildfires this year. He said if even \$1 billion were spent on forest management efforts, we wouldn't have the magnitude of the issues we are currently experiencing with wildfires in the state. He added there has been more acreage burned this year to date than all of last year. He said the most renewable resource that we have in California is going to waste due to forest fires. Right now in California, he said we are importing 80% of our building materials. He commended staff on the informative and comprehensive report.

Mayor Ayers agreed that our forests are not being managed correctly and that many residents do not feel safe from the effects of wildfires. He said one of the more important responsibilities for elected officials is the safety and welfare of their constituents. He said it is impossible to provide safety and health measures for them when we have experienced these huge wildfires in the state. He said it is obvious that the revenue from a healthy logging industry could support forest management. He added that during the District's legislative advocacy trip to Washington, D.C., a measure mentioned was forest grazing, which could also be

a revenue source and could help with forest management.

Supervisor Olsen said she agreed with Board members' comments and suggested not to let the U.S. Forest Service use lack of funds as an excuse because that is what they have been doing for years. She added funding is not the problem of the U.S. Forest Service, it is their mindset and culture and they just need to go in and get it done. She said contracting out to Sierra Resource Management is a viable option.

Supervisor Worthley said one of the Board's biggest frustrations has been trying to schedule a meeting with the U.S. Forest Service leaders in a timely fashion due to their decentralization. He said it will continue to be a problem and suggested expanding our coalition of interests and suggested working with timber, biomass, grazers and water agencies to put pressure on the U.S. Forest Service to do something. He said it will take a consolidated effort of many interests to push this forward. There is a lot of activity now, after the huge losses in the state due to wildfires, including many deaths and homes lost. There is finally an awakening that we need to manage our forests but with over 60% of the forested property in California under federal ownership, too often the state is talking to itself. He added if we aren't talking to the federal officials we are wasting our time. He said we need to keep this up, keep putting pressure on them, we need to build coalitions and keep pushing. With regards to funding, one of the approaches that has been addressed and apparently is being used is the concept of taking the water agency, or the hydroelectric power agency plant like PG&E, they can actually go out and get private money to do these projects on federal lands with the idea, that they get to produce the power and get the water to deliver to the farmers and the cities in exchange for having done these projects and they pay back the private equity investors out of their proceeds for earnings from the increase water. He said we have to get back to using forest resources to pay for forest management efforts. There is not enough money to go to the federal treasury and try to pay for the scale of efforts required to properly manage forested lands. If we use the assets, including grazing, timber, water and wildlife interests to actually pay for this process, we can get a lot done. He said it is going to take time and we have to be strategic about it. This problem needs attention and needs it now and we need to work diligently to bring the U.S. Forest Service to the table and we need to put as much pressure on them as we can. A whole change of mindset is required, of going back to the working forests, the forests are supposed to be a resource, part of the process is you harvest timber, you graze, that is how you pay for things in the National Forests.

Supervisor Pedersen thanked staff and the District's federal lobbyists for getting the District's legislative advocacy group into a couple of meetings with the U.S. Forest Service in Washington D.C. The most discouraging statement he heard was that they were going to increase their fuel management team by 100% by going from one staff member to two.

Councilmember Reyes said forest management definitely needs to improve and it trickles all the way down to the cities getting mutual aid calls and operating on skeleton fire department crews protecting the city. He said these calls are great training opportunity for city firefighters but they are taking their lives in their own hands when they do that. He said there are a lot of after effects from not having proper forest management and it also affects tourism as well. He said he agreed that the District needs to build every coalition it can to make that happen.

It was consensus of the Board members present to continue moving forward with the District's efforts to facilitate forest management and fuel reduction efforts, including the District's participation in the Governor's Forest Management Task Force.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Genevieve Gale, CVAQ
- Kevin Hamilton, Central CA Asthma Collaborative

The Board took a brief recess at 10:12 a.m.

The Board reconvened at 10:22 a.m.

14. ENSURING THAT ALL OPPORTUNITIES FOR ENGAGEMENT UNDER AB617 ARE INCLUSIVE OF ALL COMMUNITY STAKEHOLDERS – Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, said meaningful and effective implementation of AB 617 in the San Joaquin Valley requires full engagement of all sectors within each of the Valley's disadvantaged communities. Under AB 617, CARB is tasked with establishing the framework that guides state and District efforts in fulfilling various mandates under AB 617. Valley businesses have raised concern that CARB's initial framework is leaning in a direction that would give businesses little or no opportunity to participate in the various venues for public engagement being contemplated by the state. As first-year implementation of AB 617 begins within selected communities in October of 2018, this issue is timely and of critical importance. Mr. Warner added while the District supports CARB's efforts to provide for participation by Valley residents, the District also believes that it is important to provide businesses' meaningful opportunities to participate to realize the full benefits envisioned under AB 617.

Councilmember Reyes commented that the list of suggested steering committee participants is a large cross section of the community. Due to the diverse membership of local chambers of commerce, he suggested enlisting their assistance in outreaching to their membership on AB 617 and the solicit steering committee participation.

Supervisor Elliot said he believes that staff's recommendations are very common sense and the steering communities definitely need to include the business community. He added without their input we are at a disadvantage trying to obtain the most effective and efficient participation. He said he completely

supports the common sense recommendations.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- John Haley, AERA Energy
- John Lorrea, CA League of Food Processors
- Kevin Abernathy, Milk Producers' Council

Moved: Worthley

Seconded: Elliott

Ayes: Ayers, Couch, Elliott, Olsen, Pedersen, Reyes,
Sherriffs, Wheeler, Worthley, Mendes

Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve staff recommendations for ensuring that opportunities for engagement under AB 617 are inclusive of all community stakeholders.

15. UPDATE ON THE DISTRICT'S LOW-COST AIR MONITORING SENSOR ACTION PLAN – Jon Klassen, Program Manager, presented Board members an update on the District's low-cost air monitoring sensor action plan including the development and implementation of the low-cost sensor testing laboratory and the steps being taken to develop resources for use by the public.

Mr. Sheikh added there are some major limitations with current low-cost sensor technology. He said it is a fast changing landscape in terms of the number of products that are coming out and a lot of them are being developed in China and other places. There is a lot of early excitement about these sensors and the access they provide to air quality information, but we are also hearing lot of concerns now because of the fact that no one understands the proprietary nature of the algorithms that are used the lack of open source access. There are going to be ones that prove out to better than over time. We want to be helpful enough in that process as we always do and take advantage of every technology that is available to ultimately do better monitoring and the plan that the Board has put together is going to ultimately do that.

He said another concern staff have experienced with these technologies is that on a quantitative bases in terms on what they are reading, as Mr. Klassen mentioned about PurpleAir, it is one example where it can have major consequences in terms of the ways that residents manage their activities if they were to rely on these technologies on a quantitative bases. In reviewing the graph on PurpleAir, there were days where the levels were over 50 percent higher than what was being read at the same regulatory site by a much better sensor that the District operates and calibrates. What that really means is that when we talk about school activity and different levels, you could see a level one or two happening in real life and level three or four happening in PurpleAir. If you

are looking at that sensor and using that as your means of determining how you manage your activities, you end with obviously some very concerning situations in terms of the way that data is used by residents. We want to be very proactive on this front and do a lot of education with the public on their performance. South Coast AQMD has been conducting a significant amount of testing on these sensors with their Air Quality Sensor Performance Evaluation Center (AQ-SPEC). The District is looking to complement their efforts with our work in this arena as we test these sensors under real-world Valley conditions. Mr. Sheikh said the District goal with this action plan is to take advantage of wherever these sensors can be qualitatively useful to determine areas that may need further investigation using the District suite of regulatory-grade monitors that may provide information useful in developing strategies. Mr. Sheikh added that the District is moving forward with significant investments regulatory-grade technologies that include many portable, mobile and deployable units to respond to community-level monitoring needs in areas where an air monitoring station is not currently located. Of course, he said there are only so many of regulatory-grade monitoring solutions that the District can deploy due to the cost, and the question becomes will these low-cost sensors reach the point where they could actually help alert us to do issues we may need to address in monitoring plans. He asked the Board for additional guidance as to how we move forward in this area.

Dr. Sherriffs commented that the technology is here, and we have to be prepared to address the outcomes. He said it was critical to recognize the limits but also important to be proactive and take advantage of the potential benefits of these sensors. He added it was great to hear the ways that the District is already diving into this area and partnering with other agencies to clarify the accuracy of data and so on. He said the emphasis on the partnering is so important because we should take advantage of the technology and develop true citizen scientists and make the public become smarter about the way they use and interpret this information.

Councilmember Reyes said he thinks that the biggest factor here is that the public understand the conditions and factors that contribute to what is being measured by these sensors. He noted that he has a handheld air quality monitor that measures several pollutants. He gave an example of opening a packet of earl grey tea and the monitor went through the roof for VOCs. He said butane lighters will also make his handheld air monitor peak. In addition, he tore up a facial tissue in proximity to his monitor and got increase readings from that action. He added vacuuming, cleaning, painting, nail polish, folding laundry, inexpensive plastics in the sun, pets shaking and scratching, hitting his couch cushions, all caused a spike in readings of his monitor. He said having people understand what happens is important because without best practices it becomes as useful as a dull knife.

Supervisor Pedersen agreed with Mr. Sheikh's characterization of low cost sensors. He said the Board needs to be cognizant of the hundreds of millions of

dollars that have been spent in the District to improve air quality and the overwhelming measurement system that we have currently. He said while this is an effort of the state legislature to invent some new process, the process already exists and we need to be careful about how much money we spend on monitoring because it does nothing to clean the air. From a personal standpoint, he said if residents want personal air sensors to direct them in a way that avoids their perception of air quality issues, he has no problem with that but riding this thing too far into the sunset doesn't get us anywhere closer to cleaner air. Rather it spends a lot of money chasing information that already exists.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- John Larrea, CA League of Food Processors
- Kevin Hamilton, Central CA Asthma Collaborative
- Genevieve Gale, CVAQ

16. DISCUSS POTENTIAL POLICY POSITIONS FOR PRIORITIZING DEPLOYMENT OF ZERO-EMISSION AND NEAR ZERO-EMISSION TECHNOLOGIES - Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, led the Board on a discussion of potential policy positions for prioritizing near-term air quality and public health benefits through the deployment of zero-emission and near zero-emissions technologies as expeditiously as possible, including:

1. In the development of new state strategies, advocate for consideration and prioritization of near-term air quality and public health goals and efforts that may also serve to assist in achieving the transformational changes needed to meet long-term objectives.
2. Pursue fuel-neutral approaches for identifying technologies and other solutions based on their performance, cost-effectiveness, and ability to assist in meeting established local and state goals.
3. Continue to support electrification and other zero-emission technologies when they are commercially available, cost-effective, and provide the required performance and value for the specific application.
4. Continue to support near-zero emissions technologies when they are able to provide near-term and cost-effective emissions reductions and public health benefits.
5. Continue to support the development and demonstration of the next generation of transformative zero and near-zero emissions technologies.

Mr. Sheikh asked for the Board's direction as continued conversations with state agencies and the legislature take place. He added recent legislation, such as SB 100, has made this issue more important as there is now additional funding at

stake. He said guidance received from the Board today would be integrated into the recommended policy positions to be used to guide staff in their advocacy efforts.

Supervisor Worthley said he was very supportive of the position of looking for a balanced approach and said staff needs to continually push back to ensure the District is able to fund the most cost effective projects. He said we need to look at how we can get measurable impacts on improving our air quality soon. He added that poorer residents in our state are being killed by energy prices and there is a lack of understanding at what cost.

Supervisor Elliott concurred with Supervisor Worthley's comments, and said it makes sense to make the best use of the available resources. He said if there are technologies available now, at a much more cost effective basis, it makes good sense to use them. The District has standards they are required to meet and needs to use all of the resources it can, which requires looking at all of the options and taking a fuel-neutral, market-driven approach. Mr. Sheikh said he wanted to recognize the state for moving forward with the principles being discussed today, as the biggest, costliest commitment in the District's draft plan is turning over tens of thousands of trucks with near-zero NOx technology, which is currently natural gas technology. He said in the next 4 or 5 years, the Valley must achieve a large amount of reductions, and that measure alone is going to cost well over a billion dollars. On the other hand, although staff have been very successful in advocating to bring additional funds to the Valley, there have also been other missed opportunities. Staff needs to continue to push for prioritization of near-term air quality and public health goals. He added there is a lot of push and pull between these different legislative and policy directions that make it a very interesting landscape for the District to operate under. The Board has always operated at the forefront, with the District's Technology Advancement Program which funds a lot of zero-emission technologies, but also needs to get the reductions needed to protect public health and bring the Valley into attainment.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Colby Morrow, So Cal Gas
- Kevin Hamilton, Central CA Asthma Collaborative
- Dolores Barajas-Weller, CVAQ

Supervisor Pedersen said education of legislators on the importance of natural gas near-zero technologies is key, as there was legislation introduced last year to completely get rid of natural gas. The District is spending a lot of money in technology and trying to get zero-emissions vehicles on the road. Mr. Sheikh said that element would be incorporated in the way that staff implement these policy positions. Supervisor Couch said natural gas must be much more a part of this solution and ARB needs to move forward with their mobile source measures faster than 2021. He suggested this be added to the motion to approve staff

recommendations.

Mr. Sheikh clarified the motion with the addition that District staff advocate for an earlier date for implementing the Heavy Duty Truck measure that would achieve those reductions earlier than 2021. Supervisor Olsen said she would not support that motion. Mr. Sheikh clarified that it was an incentive-based measure, not a regulatory measure, and would hold ARB accountable to make sure those incentives were available earlier than 2021 for fleets that choose to go to .02 technology. Supervisor Olsen clarified there would be 0% of mandate associated with that measure. Mr. Sheikh responded that ARB's Heavy Duty Truck Measure is an incentive-based measure.

Moved: Wheeler
Seconded: Couch
Ayes: Ayers, Couch, Elliott, Olsen, Pedersen, Reyes,
Sherriffs, Wheeler, Worthley, Mendes
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve the policy positions as recommended by staff with the addition that District staff advocate that ARB implement the incentive-based heavy duty truck measure contained in the draft plan earlier than 2021.

17. DISTRICT'S EFFORTS TO INCREASE INTEREST IN KERN COUNTY TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF DISTRICT INCENTIVE FUNDING FOR CLEAN AIR PROJECTS – Todd DeYoung, Program Manager, gave the Board a progress report on the District's efforts to increase participation in Kern County of District incentive funding for clean air projects. Mr. DeYoung asked for Board members' input on potential options for enhancing the District's incentive programs in Kern County.

Mr. Sheikh asked for additional direction or guidance from Board members on this item. He said none of the incentive programs discussed during this item could be approved at today's meeting, but staff could bring them for Board consideration as part of the PM2.5 Plan or through a specific action if the Board was interested in pursuing these new programmatic areas. He said in Kern County, the efforts of the District staff have been fruitful in getting better engagement from the agricultural community to take advantage of these programs.

Supervisor Worthley said in regards to the enhanced Burn Cleaner program, he has been a strong advocate for trying to move this forward because he much prefers the carrot to the stick approach. He said one approach to get residents to think about changing out their dirty wood burning device for a clean one is if they get a violation and are given the opportunity to upgrade to a clean device as part of settling the violation. He said he was afraid that just relying on the hearth dealers has its limitations. That approach relies on someone who has already

realized that they want to replace their wood burning device, but there are many residents out there who haven't given any thought to it and if we can get to those people there is a whole new population of people who haven't been addressed. He said we need to look for new and novel ways to reach the population to encourage them to take advantage of these programs, beyond just the folks who are in the market for a new woodstove.

Supervisor Couch thanked the Board for making this a priority last year, which he said was very helpful. He thanked staff for their hard work, saying they undersold themselves a bit because they saw a 50% increase in participation rates due to their efforts. He asked staff to continue focusing on this area. He asked if the District has the ability to provide funding for a grade separation projects that ease traffic congestion and reduce emissions. Mr. Sheikh responded that the District's Public Benefits Grant program is directly aimed at municipalities and local agencies. He said the District has given tens of millions of dollars for local fleet programs, etc. He said grade separation projects have been eligible in the Requests for Proposals that the District has opened up, but the challenge has been that these projects are not as cost-effect as many other projects and often the amount of funding the District could provide have not been enough for these very expensive projects.

Supervisor Worthley left at 12:03 p.m.

Supervisor Elliott said these are all great ideas to try and address some of the hot spots. He asked for clarification on whether the increased incentives offered in hot-spot areas would be able to be used across the Valley. Mr. Sheikh said the District's Hot Spots strategy adds additional regulatory requirement in hot spots areas, for example a lower wood burning threshold which will result in more no burn days. To supplement the additional regulatory requirements, there would be greater incentive funds available in those areas. In that case, he said the greater incentive levels would likely only be in the hot spots areas, which would also have the greater regulatory burden. He said the District could not afford to offer the higher level of incentives throughout the entire Valley and get the reductions that we need under the PM2.5 plan. The idea is to couple the higher incentives with tougher regulations in those hot-spot areas.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Couch
Seconded: Pedersen
Ayes: Ayers, Couch, Elliott, Olsen, Pedersen,
Reyes, Sherriffs, Wheeler, Mendes
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to support staff recommendations and direct staff to continue to look at options to increase interest in Kern County to take advantage of District incentive funding for clean air projects

18. DISTRICT IMPLEMENTATION OF CALIFORNIA'S OIL AND GAS METHANE REGULATION – Arnaud Marjollet, Permit Services Director, and Ryan Hayashi, Compliance Director, provided an update on the District's progress in implementing the state Oil and Gas Methane Reduction Regulation.

Early in the regulation development process for state Oil and Gas Methane Reduction Regulation, the Air Resources Board and stakeholders requested that the District implement the state regulation due to the extensive experience the District has in regulating oil and gas operations. In May 2016, the Board directed staff to develop a regulatory program to efficiently and effectively implement the regulation. In December 2017, the Board adopted the rules necessary to implement the state regulation. In implementing the state regulation, the District is using its existing comprehensive permitting and enforcement infrastructure, minimizing duplicative permitting and administrative requirements through the use of a streamlined registration program, and providing extensive compliance assistance and education for affected facilities as they come into compliance with this new regulation.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Genevieve Gale, CVAQ
- Christine Zimmerman, WSPA

19. PUBLIC COMMENT - None

ADJOURN

The Chair adjourned the meeting at 12:31 p.m.

The next scheduled meeting of the Governing Board is: October 18, 2018. The meeting starts at 9:00 a.m., in the Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno. The meeting will be held via video teleconference (VTC) with the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating via VTC.