

## Action Summary Minutes

San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District

### **GOVERNING BOARD MEETING**

Central Region Office, Governing Board Room  
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

**Thursday, January 16, 2020**  
**9:00 a.m.**

***Meeting held via video teleconferencing with the Central Region Office (Fresno),  
the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office  
(Bakersfield).***

***This meeting was webcast.***

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER – The Chair, Supervisor Mendes, called the meeting to order at 9:09 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present.

*Present:*

Drew M. Bessinger, Mayor	City of Clovis
David Couch, Supervisor**	Kern County
Kuyler Crocker, Supervisor***	Tulare County
Bob Elliott, Supervisor*	San Joaquin County
Christina Fugazi, Councilmember*	City of Stockton
Buddy Mendes, Supervisor, <b>Chair</b>	Fresno County
Lloyd Pareira, Supervisor*	Merced County
Craig Pedersen, Supervisor, <b>Vice Chair</b>	Kings County
Kristin Olsen, Supervisor*	Stanislaus County
Alvaro Preciado, Councilmember	City of Avenal
Monte Reyes, Councilmember	City of Porterville
Tom Wheeler, Supervisor	Madera County

*Absent:*

Dr. Alexander Sherriffs	Appointed by Governor
Chris Vierra, Mayor	City of Ceres

\*Attended in Northern Region Office  
\*\*Attended in Southern Region Office  
\*\*\*Arrived at 9:10 a.m.

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

4. ELECTION OF OFFICERS FOR 2020 – Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/APCO, said this action is the final step for selecting the new Governing Board Chair and Vice Chair for 2020. He said the Governing Board Selection Policy that was established by the Board included the formation of an Ad Hoc Subcommittee that met recently to discuss nominations for the 2020 officers. The nominations by the Subcommittee are Supervisor Pedersen to serve as Governing Board Chair and Supervisor Pareira to serve as Vice Chair for 2020.

Public Comment: None

Moved: Wheeler

Seconded: Reyes

Ayes: Bessinger, Couch, Crocker, Elliott, Fugazi, Olsen, Pareira, Pedersen, Preciado, Reyes, Wheeler, Mendes

Nays: None

***Motion unanimously carried to appoint Supervisor Pedersen as Chair and Supervisor Pareira as Vice Chair of the Governing Board for 2020***

5. END OF YEAR ADDRESS BY CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD, SUPERVISOR MENDES – Supervisor Mendes said it has been his honor and pleasure to serve as Chair of this great Board over the past two years. It's incredible to be able to serve the Valley through this agency that has continued to build a solid track record to be proud of with respect to air quality progress, efficient governance, and excellent customer service.

Starting off this New Year, he said it was important to look back at the last year and celebrate our air quality progress and successes through the efforts of the Board and District staff, who worked closely with Valley stakeholders to move forward our clean air mission and improve the quality of life for the Valley residents. He added that it has been a big year with respect to air quality achievements. In 2019, despite strings of triple digit temperatures, the Valley experienced the region's cleanest air quality year on record for ozone. This includes recording the fewest exceedances on record for both the 84 and 75 parts per billion ozone standards and the lowest eight-hour ozone design value on record. In fact, the Valley actually met the 85 parts per billion standard in 2019, bringing the Valley closer than ever to obtaining federal ozone quality standards.

Chairman Mendes added that the Valley continues to meet the 65 microgram 24-hour PM2.5 standard, and PM2.5 design values continue to decrease, representing a positive trend towards meeting the federal PM2.5 standards in the coming years. He said over the past year, this agency has moved forward to implement its latest clean air plan, the 2018 PM2.5 Plan, as an important next step in the District's ongoing clean air mission. The plan utilizes extensive science and research, state of the art air quality monitoring, and the best available information in developing the strategies for expeditiously bringing the

Valley into attainment with federal PM2.5 standards. The new plan includes a combination of new innovative regulatory and non-regulatory measures for both stationary and mobile sources that build upon stringent air quality measures already in place from District attainment plans and measures adopted by your Board. In implementing this plan, the District has already adopted and put into implementation this winter season a new residential wood burning emission reduction strategy that builds upon years of working with Valley residents to reduce these emissions through an innovative regulatory, incentive, and education-based approach. This last year, the District continued to implement innovative regulatory and incentive-based air quality measures that serve as the model for other agencies throughout the state and the nation. These various air quality measures exceeded all state and federal mandates in a timely fashion with ingenuity and creativity to minimize the cost to Valley businesses while exceeding our mandated emission reduction targets. This last year, the District continued to demonstrate its leadership in implementing the most effective grant program in the state, distributing incentive funding to businesses, public agencies, and residents throughout the Valley to help implement a variety of clean air projects, implementing a number of new incentive programs to deploy new clean air technologies, and successfully advocating for the Valley's fair share of funding in Sacramento and Washington D.C. These incentive programs include everything from our award-winning Tune In Tune Program, to the gold-standard tractor replacement programs, that have provided for a public/private investment of \$506 million in clear air projects throughout the Valley just this past year, resulting in cost-effective emissions reductions achieved in partnership with Valley agriculture, residents, and other Valley stakeholders. Through these programs, thousands of heavy duty vehicles, tractors, other heavy duty equipment, residential wood burning devices, passenger vehicles, lawn mowers, and other equipment were replaced and upgraded this past year, which is quite the achievement. Given this Valley's track record, we also saw continued success in advocating for the Valley's fair share of funding, with hundreds of millions of dollars in new state funding directed to the Valley for a variety of clean air projects.

This last year, the District also faced the challenge of implementing new state AB 617 mandates. This agency acted swiftly to launch a comprehensive strategy for beginning the implementation of these new AB 617 mandates that included extensive community engagement with Valley residents and businesses. Through this robust community engagement effort, your Board approved two new Community Emission Reduction Programs for the communities of Shafter and South-Central Fresno and community air monitoring networks were developed and established using new advanced air monitoring assets. The District will continue to utilize AB 617 as an opportunity to advocate for bringing even more resources into Valley communities to assist address air quality challenges and improve quality of life.

Chairman Mendes said as we enter 2020, it is important that we continue on the Valley's clean air journey to acknowledge all of the clean air progress that I just

discussed, and recognize Valley agriculture, businesses, residents, and others throughout the Valley for their investment and sacrifice in reducing air pollution and bringing about this progress. While the majority of remaining emissions come from mobile sources not under the District's regulatory jurisdiction, given the Valley's enormous air quality challenges, the District will need to continue to identify, adopt, and implement measures that can further reduce emissions from sources under its legal jurisdiction.

As included in the District's new PM2.5 Plan, meeting the federal mandates requires that the District seek additional financial resources to reduce emissions from mobile sources through effective incentive-based strategies that will require \$5 billion in state funding over the next five years. As you'll hear about later, the Governor's Budget released just last week falls well short of providing the funding committed to by the state in our PM2.5 Plan. Implementation of the District's new PM2.5 plan will require extensive engagement with Valley residents, businesses, and other stakeholders to ensure the buy-in and support as we move forward with implementation of new clean air measures. This includes working on additional measures across a variety of sectors that will push the bar with respect to new technologies, and that will only be successful with strong support from the public and businesses being impacted by those measures. Additionally, careful implementation of AB 617 mandates will require continued effort by the District to ensure that AB617 is used as an opportunity for investing in communities and strengthening local economies. Chairman Mendes said there is much work to be done in the coming year, and he was confident that we will again be able to continue our traditions of excellence in serving this Valley. He added he is looking forward to working with this great Board and staff and moving forward with the important work of this agency. Lastly, Chairman Mendes commended Seyed Sadredin, retired Executive Director/APCO, for the great job he did at the District, by setting the groundwork for all of the District's wonderful achievements. He voiced appreciation for the great work and seamless transition of Mr. Sheikh to his new role as Executive Director/APCO, and the Board is fortunate to work with the great staff at the District. He also thanked Dave Warner, Deputy APCO, who will be retiring in March 2020 and said he has been a great asset to this organization.

Chairman Pedersen presented a plaque of appreciation from the District's Governing Board to Supervisor Mendes, thanking him for his leadership and service as Governing Board Chair for 2018-19. Mr. Sheikh thanked Supervisor Mendes for being the best possible boss as Chair of the Governing Board for the past two years. He added Supervisor Mendes has been absolutely vital to the success of this agency during a time when many things happened, implementing the new PM2.5 plan, adopting a more stringent wood burning rule, and launching a number of key programs such as AB 617. It was through the strong leadership of Supervisor Mendes that District was able to achieve so many accomplishments. He also thanked Supervisor Mendes on a personal level for his advice and mentorship. He added that he looks forward to working with Chairman Pedersen in his new role as Governing Board Chair.

6. APPROVAL OF CONSENT CALENDAR – Item Numbers (18 – 25): *These matters are routine in nature and are usually approved by a single vote. Prior to any action by the board, the public was given the opportunity to comment on any consent item.*
18. APPROVE ACTION SUMMARY MINUTES FOR THE SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY UNIFIED AIR POLLUTION CONTROL DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD MEETING OF THURSDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2019
19. RECEIVE AND FILE LIST OF SCHEDULED MEETINGS FOR 2020
20. RECEIVE AND FILE OPERATIONS STATISTICS SUMMARY FOR DECEMBER 2019
21. RECEIVE AND FILE BUDGET STATUS REPORTS AS OF DECEMBER 31, 2019
22. CONTRACT WITH DISTRICT COUNSEL
23. CONTRACT WITH EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO
24. DISTRICT ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERSHIP
25. APPROVE BUDGET TRANSFER IN THE AMOUNT OF \$30,000 FOR AGRICULTURAL EQUIPMENT EMISSION INVENTORY STUDY

District Counsel, Annette Ballatore, called up item 22, CONTRACT WITH DISTRICT COUNSEL, and item 23 CONTRACT WITH EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO and provided a brief summary of the recommendation for final action on salary adjustments made to the employment contracts with the Air Pollution Control Officer and the District Council. Those salary adjustments are in the amount of four percent.

Public Comment: None

Supervisor Pareira left at 9:30 a.m.

Moved: Wheeler  
Seconded: Mendes  
Ayes: Bessinger, Couch, Crocker, Elliott, Fugazi, Mendes, Olsen,  
Preciado, Reyes, Wheeler, Pedersen  
Nays: None

**Motion unanimously carried to approve Consent Calendar Item Numbers 18 – 25**

7. **PUBLIC COMMENT** – *The following persons provided public comment at this meeting:*

- Colby Morrow, So Cal Gas
- Linda Urata, Project Clean Air
- Manuel Cunha, Nisei Farmers League
- Lex Henderson, Clawson Motor Sports

8. **S.T.A.R. RECOGNITION (Service, Teamwork, Attitude, Respect)** – Chenecua Dixon, Personnel Director, recognized the following individuals who reached a service milestone during the fourth quarter of 2019:

**Five Years of Service**

Esthela Soto, Air Quality Specialist  
Sharon Mahoney, Senior Office Assistant

**Ten Years of Service**

Song Thao, Air Quality Specialist

**Fifteen Years of Service**

Angela Frantz, Senior Air Quality Inspector  
Trevor Joy, Air Quality Specialist  
Betty Laudig, Air Quality Specialist

**Twenty Years of Service**

Todd De Young, Director of Grants and Incentives

**Twenty-Five Years of Service**

Kathi Crump, Supervising Air Quality Inspector  
Robert Rinaldi, Air Quality Engineer

9. **REPORT ON DISTRICT CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE ACTIVITIES** – Kevin Abernathy, the new Chair of the Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC), introduced himself and Ms. Kelly Deming, CAC Environmental Interest Group Chair and the new Vice-Chair of the CAC. Mr. Abernathy gave a report on highlights from the Citizens Advisory Committee meeting held January 7, 2020.

10. **RECEIVE AND FILE COMPREHENSIVE ANNUAL FINANCIAL REPORT AND SINGLE AUDIT REPORT FOR THE FISCAL YEAR ENDED JUNE 30, 2019** – Mehri Barati, Administrative Services Director, said the District has an agreement with the accounting firm Price Paige Company, Accountancy Corporation (Price Paige) to provide an annual audit of the District's Comprehensive Annual

Financial Report and any federally funded grant programs in accordance with the Federal Single Audit Act of 1984. She announced that Price Paige has completed their annual audit for the District's audited Comprehensive Annual Financial Report and Single Audit Report for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2019, and once again the District has scored the best score possible. Price Paige found that the District's financials are fairly presented with no endorsements or findings. She congratulated the Board for their commitment to transparency and accountability to the public. She also recognized the District's Finance team for their hard work. Ms. Barati invited Fausto Hinojosa, Managing Partner of Price Paige, who gave the Board members detailed information on the audit results.

Mr. Sheikh thanked the Board for their leadership and guidance. He also thanked Ms. Barati and her team for all their hard work over this last year, as well as maintaining the Board's direction for solid transparency and strong financial systems.

Chairman Pedersen added as the District advocates for more public funding, it is clearly the most important thing we can do in representing the Valley and spending those funds wisely.

11. APPROVE THE DISTRICT'S 2020 LEGISLATIVE PLATFORM – Tom Jordan, Senior Policy Advisor, presented the District's proposed 2020 Legislative Platform containing the District's top priorities for the upcoming legislative session and general principles that will guide the District when taking positions on specific legislative and regulatory proposals, including:
  1. **(State/Federal) Funding for Clean Air Projects:** Provide new and continued funding for investment in projects that reduce air pollution in the disadvantaged communities throughout the Valley. The District's existing attainment plans already contain some of the strongest regulatory measures in the nation, and significant additional reductions in emissions will be achieved from new measures in the upcoming plans for the latest federal standards. However, funding is necessary for reductions to expedite public health benefits and attainment of the federal standards through incentive-based measures. Funding for incentive-based measures is also needed for reducing mobile source emissions since federal law preempts the District from imposing tailpipe emissions standards. The District will pursue all available funding sources including but not limited to Moyer, Cap and Trade, AB 118 at the state level and DERA, Targeted Air Shed, and Farm Bill EQIP at the federal level.
  2. **(State/Federal) Ensure the State Secures Adequate Incentive Funds to Meet the State's Commitment in the Valley's PM2.5 Attainment Plan:** The District's recently adopted PM2.5 plan includes aggressive incentive-based control measure commitments by CARB to accelerate the deployment of new clean vehicles, equipment, and technologies

across a variety of sectors that will require \$5 billion in new incentive funding investment from the state. The District will work with the state to advocate for the incentive funding necessary to meet CARB's emission reduction commitments in the adopted Plan.

3. **(State) Cap and Trade Revenues:** The Cap and Trade program implemented by ARB sets up a mechanism by which affected sources can procure allowances or offsets to meet specified and declining caps on their greenhouse gas emissions. In other words, affected sources will be allowed to invest in reductions in other areas as mitigation for their local emissions. This scenario can potentially lead to adverse impacts in areas that are already disproportionately impacted by criteria pollutant emissions. To mitigate localized air quality impact and provide meaningful public health benefit to disproportionately impacted communities, a significant portion of Cap and Trade revenues must be spent on projects located within, and benefiting individuals living in, disadvantaged communities. In recent years, the District has successfully advocated for significant funding directed towards the Valley through the FARMER (to replace agricultural equipment), Community Air Protection, and zero/near-zero technology demonstration programs. In determining what communities are disadvantaged, the state must identify communities that face significant environmental challenges as well as economic challenges. The District will continue to advocate for receiving its fair share of Cap and Trade revenues to assist in meeting the Valley's air quality objectives.
  
4. **(State) AB 617 Implementation:** The air quality challenges that communities in the San Joaquin Valley face are unmatched by any other region in the nation. Despite decades of progress and significant reductions in air pollution, the San Joaquin Valley, due to its unique geography, topography, and meteorology, continues to face daunting challenges in meeting the latest federal health-based air quality standards. AB 617, if implemented properly, is expected to bring additional clean air resources and strategies to Valley communities that are burdened by socioeconomic disadvantages and air pollution despite significant emissions reductions that have already been achieved regionally. In order to effectively implement the requirements of AB 617, the District will advocate for the following:
  - A. The State should provide adequate resources to fund the administrative, air monitoring, and community outreach activities necessary to effectively implement AB 617 requirements.
  
  - B. State funding for AB 617 emission reduction projects should be based upon need with areas containing identified AB 617 communities and other disadvantaged communities, and disproportionate air quality impacts prioritized for funding.

5. **(State/Federal) Disadvantaged Community Policies:** The San Joaquin Valley is home to a number of disadvantaged communities that deserve care and attention. The District will adhere to the following principles in pursuing efforts to identify and address the needs of these communities.
  - A. The District will support measures that improve quality of life and economic welfare. In identifying communities of need, both socioeconomic and environmental impacts should be considered. The District supports CalEPA's California Communities Environmental Health Screening tool (CalEnviroScreen) as the appropriate tool for identifying disadvantaged communities.
  - B. The District considers poverty as a key factor contributing to diminished public health and will oppose efforts that lead to "redlining" these communities and inhibit economic growth.
  - C. The District will support efforts to target additional state and federal resources to mitigate issues faced in disadvantaged communities.
  - D. The District will oppose measures that dilute local control by diverting local revenues or the authority over the expenditure of local resources to the state or federal government. Reduced local control will weaken local enforcement programs. Local agencies are better suited to efficiently and effectively identify and address community needs.
  
6. **(Federal) Work with Administrative Branch Including EPA to Advance Streamlined and Efficient Implementation of the Clean Air Act Mandates:** Work with EPA administration to build effective working relationship, take advantage of cooperative federalism to make sure Clean Air Act provisions are applied reasonably and in accordance with Congress' original intent. The administration's focus on working with state and local agencies to develop programs that work for their specific situations provides opportunities to pursue administrative solutions to solve some of the issues presented by antiquated provisions of the Act, including the following:
  - A. Contingency Measures in Extreme Non-Attainment Areas:  
Requiring contingency measures in extreme nonattainment areas is irrational and unnecessary. The Act requires all attainment plans to include contingency measures, defined as extra control measures that go into effect without further regulatory action, if planned emissions controls fail to reach the goals or targets specified in the attainment plan. While requiring backup measures was a well-intentioned provision, it does not make sense in areas that have

been classified as “extreme” non-attainment for ozone. These areas, by definition, have already implemented all available and foreseeable measures and still need a “black box” of future measures to define and employ. The term “black box” refers to reductions that are needed to attain the standard, but technology to achieve such reductions does not yet exist. No measures are held in reserve in areas that are classified as “extreme” non-attainment for ozone. With no stones left unturned in such plans, requiring contingency measures in such areas makes no sense. Since the contingency requirement in “extreme” non-attainment areas could actually harm public health, EPA should clarify that state and local air agencies should not be forced to implement the contingency requirements in the Clean Air Act in a manner that leads to delayed cleanup.

- B.** Streamline the Planning Process: Since the 1970’s, EPA has established numerous ambient air quality standards for individual pollutants. We have now reached a point where various regions throughout the nation are subject to multiple iterations of standards for a single pollutant. For instance, there are currently four pending standards for ozone and four pending standards for PM2.5. Each of these standards requires a separate attainment plan leading to multiple overlapping requirements and deadlines. This in turn results in a great deal of confusion, costly bureaucracy, and duplicative regulations, all without corresponding public health benefits. EPA should develop an administrative process to consolidate plans into one unified set of requirements.
- C.** Exceptional Events: The Clean Air Act currently states that exceptional events do not include stagnation or a meteorological event involving high temperatures or lack of precipitation. The District believes that the intent of the Congress was to exclude short term and routine occurrences. Therefore, EPA should clarify that these exclusions do not apply to long-term and extraordinary stagnation and lack of precipitation such as those resulting from a 100-year drought. Additionally, EPA should streamline the review and paperwork requirements of Exceptional Events demonstrations to ensure timely review of Exceptional Events demonstrations.
- D.** Health Risk Based Approach to Emissions Reductions: The Act as it relates to the demonstration of Reasonable Further Progress or Rate of Progress treats all precursors the same, regardless of their potency in harming public health or achieving attainment. Driven by a rapidly expanding body of scientific research, there is now a growing recognition within the scientific community that from an exposure perspective, the National Ambient Air Quality Standards metrics for progress are a necessary but increasingly insufficient

measure of total public health risk associated with air pollutants. In particular, control strategies for sources of PM<sub>2.5</sub> and ozone do not necessarily account for qualitative differences in the nature of their emissions. For PM<sub>2.5</sub>, toxicity has been shown to vary depending on particle size, chemical species, and surface area. In the case of ozone, differences in the relative potency of ozone precursors, VOCs in particular, is not captured by a strict, mass-based approach to precursor controls. EPA should provide weighted credit for emissions reductions based upon a precursor's relative impact upon public health.

**7. (Federal) National Standards for On-Road Heavy-Duty Trucks, Locomotives, and other Mobile Sources under Federal Jurisdiction:**

Despite achieving significant emissions reductions through decades of implementing the most stringent stationary and mobile regulatory control program in the nation, nitrogen oxide (NO<sub>x</sub>) emissions, the primary precursor for both ozone and fine particulates (PM<sub>2.5</sub>) in the San Joaquin Valley, must be reduced by an additional 90% in order to attain the latest federal ozone and PM<sub>2.5</sub> standards that now encroach on natural background levels. The District has jurisdiction over stationary and area sources, which make up less than 15% of the total NO<sub>x</sub> emissions inventory. With over 85% of the Valley's remaining ozone and PM<sub>2.5</sub> precursor emissions now coming from mobile sources under federal jurisdiction, additional reductions from heavy-duty trucks and other mobile sources are needed for the Valley to reach federal air quality standards. Your Board has previously submitted petitions to the federal government requesting that they reduce their fair share of emissions in an equitable manner through more stringent national standards for heavy duty trucks and locomotives, and the District will continue to seek additional opportunities for achieving additional mobile source reductions under federal and state jurisdiction as necessary to meet federal air quality standards.

**8. (State) Truck Emissions Verification:**

Trucks are the largest source of NO<sub>x</sub> emissions in the San Joaquin Valley, and the District has long supported the development of a reasonable program that helps ensure that emissions controls are properly maintained and are not tampered with. Last year, SB 210 (Leyva) was signed into law requiring that the California Air Resources Board develop a truck inspection and repair program. As this program moves forward with implementation, the District supports a smog check program that can rely on onboard diagnostic technology and verifiable self-reporting to minimize the high costs associated with a more traditional smog-check program. Furthermore, the program must contain necessary flexibility to accommodate future technology advancements that can provide for efficient and reliable emissions verification.

9. **(State/Federal) Support Greenhouse Gas Reduction Measures that Provide for Local Criteria and Toxic Air Emissions Benefits and Oppose Greenhouse Gas Reduction Measures that Result in Public Health Detriment:** Many state/federal climate change measures provide for co-benefits in reducing both GHG and criteria pollutant emissions, but there are some measures that may lead to increases in criteria pollutant or toxic emissions. Therefore, the District will support reasonable measures that reduce toxic and criteria pollutants as well as greenhouse gas emissions. The District will oppose measures that are detrimental to public health and inconsistent with the District's mission and air quality statutory mandates by leading to increases in toxic or criteria pollutant emissions in already impacted areas.
  
10. **(State) District Policy Position on The Deployment of Near-Zero and Zero Emission Technologies:** In the development of new zero emission and near-zero emission state strategies, the District will advocate for consideration and prioritization of near-term air quality and public health goals and efforts that may also serve to assist in achieving the transformational changes needed to meet long-term objectives, including:
  - A. Pursue fuel-neutral approaches for identifying technologies and other solutions based on their performance, cost-effectiveness, and ability to assist in meeting established local and state goals.
  - B. Continue to support electrification and other zero-emission technologies when they are commercially available, cost-effective, and provide the required performance and value for the specific application.
  - C. Continue to support near-zero emissions technologies when they are able to provide near-term and cost-effective emissions reductions and public health benefits.
  - D. Continue to support the development and demonstration of the next generation of transformative zero and near-zero emissions technologies.
  
11. **(State) Support Legislation Extending District's Existing Authority for DMV Fees to Match Applicable Federally Mandated Attainment Deadlines:** The District's current authority relating to DMV fees under California Health and Safety Code Sections 40610 through 40613 sunsets in 2024. The current sunset date was set to correspond to the District's attainment date for the latest ozone standard at the time the enabling legislation was enacted (1997). Since then EPA has adopted more restrictive standards with attainment dates ranging from 2031

through 2037. The Valley cannot reach attainment with regulatory measures alone and incentive-based measures are necessary to ensure expeditious reductions in emissions cost-effectively while investing in the local economy. Therefore, the District supports legislation extending the District's authority to match attainment deadlines for federally mandated health standards for which incentive funding is necessary.

12. **(State) Support Policies Designed to Provide Real-Time Accurate Air Quality Information to the Public during Wildfires and Other Air Quality Episodes:** The District has long been a leader in developing tools and policies to provide real-time accurate air quality information to the public. Five of the largest wildfires in the state's history have occurred in the last 10 years with the two largest occurring since 2017. These fires have significantly impacted air quality and public health for a significant portion of the state's population. In response to these conditions, a number of proposals and policies have been developed or are currently being discussed in the Legislature to require that air quality information be made available to the public. Based upon our extensive experience in providing air quality information and activity recommendations to the public, the District will support policies that are designed to provide real-time accurate air quality information to the public.
  
13. **(State/Federal) Seek funding and other support from the California Air Resources Board and Federal Environmental Protection Agency to install and operate additional air quality monitoring instruments throughout San Joaquin Valley:** The District operates one of the most extensive air monitoring networks in the nation. Data from these monitors is utilized to measure progress and assess the need for further reductions needed to attain ambient air quality standards established by EPA. Moreover, the District is also committed to providing accurate and timely air quality information to educate and empower the public to protect themselves during poor air quality episodes. This is accomplished utilizing the air monitoring data through the District's first-in-the-nation Real-Time Air Advisory Network (RAAN).

Installation, operation, and maintenance of the District's air monitoring network is resource intensive. The District's annual operating appropriation for air monitoring is approximately \$5.5 million. Additional resources are required to address the increase in federal mandates relating to air monitoring (more monitors and more labor intensive QA/QC and reporting procedures for existing monitors) and the need for more monitoring capabilities to satisfy new initiatives to provide community-level air quality information.

14. **(State/Federal) Support efforts that provide for cost-effective alternatives to open burning of agricultural waste:** In 2003, state law

was amended to require the District to limit open burning of agricultural material in accordance with a phased-in schedule of deadlines. In addition to those requirements, the state law authorizes the District to postpone the burn prohibition dates for specific types of agricultural material if the District makes three specific determinations and the Air Resources Board (ARB) concurs. The determinations are: (1) there are no economically feasible alternatives to open-burning of the specific type of material; (2) open-burning the specific type of material will not cause or substantially contribute to a violation of a National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS); and (3) there is no long-term federal or state funding commitment for the continued operation of biomass facilities in the Valley or the development of alternatives to burning.

Working closely with the stakeholders over the years to identify economically feasible alternatives to open burning of various agricultural materials, the District had until 2014 achieved an 80% reduction in agricultural burning. The exceptional drought conditions that the Valley experienced from 2012 to 2016 resulted in hundreds of thousands of acres of orchards, vineyards and other agricultural crops being fallowed or removed. These conditions, paired with the demise of the biomass industry in California, which had previously provided the primary alternative to agricultural burning for a significant amount of the agricultural waste generated in the Valley, has created a severe waste disposal issue. Additionally, there are currently no long-term federal or state funding commitments to support the operation of biomass facilities or development of alternatives to open agricultural burning. The combination of these factors has resulted in an increase in open burning over the past several years and threatens the District's ability to continue to maintain broad restrictions on open burning of agricultural waste into the future due to the lack of feasible alternatives capable of handling the volume of agricultural waste generated in the Valley each year.

In November 2015, the District's Governing Board adopted an action plan aimed at short- and long-term measures to alleviate the effect on agricultural growers of the biomass capacity shortfall in the Valley and to identify cleaner alternatives to agricultural open burning. As a part of these efforts to identify and advance cleaner alternatives to open burning of agricultural waste, in November 2017 the District convened the Central Valley Summit on Alternatives to Open Burning of Agricultural Waste to bring together Valley growers, researchers/experts, representatives from the biomass power industry, representatives from new and developing technology vendors, and Valley stakeholders.

As a product of the Summit, the District has recently taken actions to support the development and implementation of cleaner alternatives to agricultural open burning. In November 2018, the District launched a new pilot incentive program to provide financial assistance to growers

opting to implement on-field practices such as whole orchard recycling in lieu of open burning. In addition, in December 2018 the District created a portable equipment registration program to facilitate the use of mobile air curtain burn boxes, which can be up to 80% cleaner than open burning. As the District continues its efforts to work with stakeholders to identify and advance cleaner feasible alternatives, it is clear that additional research and resources are necessary.

The District will support the research and development of alternatives to the open burning of agricultural waste. The District will also advocate for legislation and enhanced energy policies that support the development and deployment of emerging cleaner alternatives to agricultural open burning, including funding resources to support broader implementation of new alternatives.

15. **(State/Federal) Technology Advancement:** Meeting the latest federal air quality standards will require transformative measures and broad deployment of new zero and near-zero emissions technologies. In order to further develop technology to close the gap in required emissions reductions, the District operates a Technology Advancement Program. Along with its own resources, the District is seeking state and federal assistance to advance technology in the following areas.
  - A. Mobile sources projects that demonstrate zero- or near-zero-emissions solutions to mobile source categories with emphasis on goods and people movement, off-road equipment, or agricultural equipment.
  - B. Renewable energy projects that focus on overcoming the barriers that prevent the use or adoption of zero-emission renewable energy sources or reduce emissions from renewable energy systems to make them cleaner than comparable non-renewable alternatives.
  - C. Waste solution projects that focus on waste systems or technologies that minimize or eliminate emissions from existing waste streams and processes, including waste-to-fuel and energy systems, such as ag waste gasification systems, dairy digesters and other bio-fuel and energy applications.
16. **(State/Federal) Support adequate resources and policies to reduce the impact of wildfires and their attendant public health impact:** Wildfires result in significant loss of life and property. Air pollution generated from wildfires is enormous and well exceeds the total industrial and mobile source emissions in the San Joaquin Valley. These emissions result in significant adverse public health impacts in the San Joaquin Valley and in many regions throughout California. California continues to experience a record number of wildfires, and the

resulting emissions causes serious public health impacts and unprecedented levels of PM2.5 and ozone in the San Joaquin Valley and other regions throughout the state. Historically clean rural areas throughout the state and in the San Joaquin Valley have experienced their worst air quality in decades.

Given the devastating public health impact that the Valley suffers from wildfires, the District supports measures that can help reduce the intensity, magnitude, and frequency of wildfires including those that promote effective and expanded use of prescribed burns and mechanical treatment to reduce fuel build-up, including the following:

- A. Additional financial and staffing resources for public and private land managers to conduct prescribed burning as an effective means for reducing fuel supplies that lead to large and uncontrollable wildfires.
  - B. When wildfires occur, fighting wildfires should be funded as other natural disasters are funded. Funding should not be diverted from forest management and fuel reduction activities to fight wildfires.
  - C. Lessening or removal of contradictory environmental protection policies that prohibit the use of mechanized methods, or prescribed burning to reduce fuels when those are the only feasible methods available.
  - D. Changes in the federal policies that better incorporate air quality concerns by shifting focus to prescribed burning and employing fire management techniques that reduce air quality impact when wildfires occur.
  - E. As the State moves forward with addressing public utility related wildfire risk reduction efforts (e.g., Public Safety Power Shutdowns), advocate for resources for the mitigation of related emissions impacts such as increased backup generator usage, and the development and deployment of new cleaner backup energy alternatives, such as fuel-cell microgrids.
- 17. (State/Federal) Support Tax Incentives for Air Quality Grant**  
**Recipients:** Achieving the needed reductions from incentive-based programs and advancing transformative clean air technologies and infrastructure will require significant private sector investment. In many cases, owners of equipment with significant remaining useful life and value must be convinced to take partial financial support from District grants and replace such equipment with more expensive newer and cleaner technology. If the grant dollars received increase tax liabilities,

the District's grant program penetration may not reach the necessary level.

The District's state and federal advocates, Paul Yoder and Sylvia Solis with Shaw, Yoder, Antwih, Schmelzer & Lange, and Lynn Jacquez with CJ Lake, LLC, respectively, provided an update to Board members on activities at the state and federal level.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Connie Young, Citizens Climate Lobby
- Janet Dietz-Kamei, Fresno Resident
- Roger Isom, CA Cotton Ginners and Growers Association and Western Agricultural Processors Association
- Manuel Cunha, Nisei Farmers League

*Supervisor Couch left the room at 10:00 a.m.*

Moved: Mendes  
Seconded: Wheeler  
Ayes: Bessinger, Crocker, Elliott, Fugazi, Olsen, Pareira,  
Mendes, Preciado, Reyes, Wheeler, Pedersen  
Nays: None

***Motion unanimously carried to adopt the District's 2020 Legislative Platform***

*Supervisor Couch returned at 10:53 a.m.*

12. UPDATE ON DISTRICT IMPLEMENTATION OF STATE ADVANCED VEHICLE TECHNOLOGY DEMONSTRATION AND DEPLOYMENT INCENTIVE PROGRAMS - Todd DeYoung, Director of Grants and Incentives, gave Board members an update on District implementation of state advanced technology vehicle demonstration and deployment incentive programs.

Supervisor Elliott commented on the oversubscribed school bus program and asked if staff has considered reallocating some of the funds to ensure they are used in areas with the most demand. Mr. DeYoung responded that staff has discussed this with CARB but because funds come from a mitigation trust in a legal settlement, the settlement actually spelled out exactly how much could go into each category, and so they would have to renegotiate that in the legal document. He clarified the document required that no more than half of the funds can go into any one of the three categories. The District reached the \$32.5 million limit in school bus funding almost right away, so the funding that was left was for shuttle and transit buses. He added staff have asked the same questions and will continue to lobby to make sure that these funds are going into the appropriate areas as necessary. He noted the District has the flexibility to

make adjustments to the program before the second solicitation begins in two years, and it would be a deliberative process to look and see where the demand was and if any renegotiation and rewriting of the trust document needs to happen.

Councilmember Reyes commented that the Porterville EV project has been great for the city and said it means so much to the citizens to see the buses in operation. He added that they are much quieter than older buses and as driver efficiencies increase with learning the vehicles, they have been able to keep the buses running, occasionally throwing in some of the other ones as those efficiencies increase. He said by the end of this month, the charging infrastructure should be fully installed in the corporation yard to more than account for the use of all those buses, and said it has been a great project.

Supervisor Olsen asked if staff anticipates receiving the same amount of funding for the next VW solicitation in two years. Mr. DeYoung responded the next solicitation will again be for \$65 million, which is already set in the mitigation trust documents. Supervisor Olsen said all of the programs discussed in the first half of the presentation were fantastic, and asked about the second shared mobility pilot project and whether funds were going to government agencies or private companies. Mr. DeYoung responded that Mio Car was responsible for the app development and for staffing, making sure that the cars are available and where they're supposed to be. He added a lot of the funding is going to the charging infrastructure and the actual purchase and operation of the vehicles. Supervisor Olsen clarified while the Councils of Governments (COGs) are our partners, all of the funding allocations are going to help increase electric vehicle infrastructure within the private sector. Mr. DeYoung responded affirmatively.

Councilmember Preciado expressed concern for funding for rural disadvantaged communities on the west side of the Valley. He said he felt we still need to do more outreach to those communities, especially because some of them lack the infrastructure for charging stations and electric cars. He said he has been approached by several owner operators of diesel trucks who have already replaced their vehicles without taking advantage of the funding that the District has available because of lack of information and also because they've been misled by retailers. He asked if prior purchases would qualify for funding in the form of rebates. Mr. Sheikh responded generally for truck incentives there was a pre-approval process as required by the funding. He said the District must see whether applicants are eligible in the first place, because the state Truck and Bus Rule is making it more difficult to fund those projects.

Supervisor Mendes commented that historically the District has administered very large and successful school bus replacement programs that are typically oversubscribed. Mr. DeYoung responded affirmatively and said the District has a very mature program. Mr. Sheikh added the District has successfully advocated for Proposition 1B funding for school buses, and has also matched funding for Measure C and other initiatives to replace school buses. He noted the Valley

had one of the oldest legacy fleets in the state, generally due to some of the economic challenges the Valley faces. He added there continues to be a lot of interest from school districts as they face upcoming deadlines and programs continue to be oversubscribed. He said even the new technologies, such as electric buses, can be challenging for a lot of rural areas in the Valley to implement due to the amount of miles they must travel in a day but there still has been some overwhelming response to the District's programs. Supervisor Mendes said the District does a great job administering these incentive programs.

13. DISCUSS POTENTIAL OPPORTUNITIES FOR THE DISTRICT'S COMPREHENSIVE PUBLIC EDUCATION AND OUTREACH PROGRAM – Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, reviewed potential opportunities for the District's comprehensive public education and outreach program in the coming year.

Mayor Bessinger suggested staff should look into utilizing digital billboards for District outreach. Mayor Bessinger asked if a bike giveaway would qualify for one of the District's mini-grants. Ms. Holt responded definitely with some air quality education efforts added to it. For example if a non-profit organization wanted to give away a few bikes as part of an effort to get kids educated on how biking is better not only for your health, but for our air quality. She said that would definitely be in line with the District's mission.

Supervisor Crocker said he completely agrees with the strategy objectives. As for future opportunities, he suggested focusing heavily on incentive programs. He suggested utilizing a town hall type of format throughout the Valley. On the education piece, he suggested showcasing the results that we're having and touting the progress we have made and how we are moving in the right direction, trying to build trust with Valley public. He said it is phenomenal the new technology that is being implemented, and that it was exciting. He said that is something that people would be interested in, that we can showcase how we are trying to drive that new technology. Perhaps showcase people driving around in a little electric UTV or a nice, beautiful Tier 4 engine.

Councilmember Fugazi suggested working with the county Offices of Education who are charged with providing professional development to teachers. In the next generation science standards, there is a huge component that has to do with climate involved in education. She said making sure that teachers have that information, perhaps by conducting a mini institute or something through the Office of Education would be important. She also suggested better outreach at the District's Tune in Tune Up events, where a captured audience is sometimes sitting in their cars for hours waiting for their turn. She observed while the District's information booth is off to the side where residents can sign up for an appointment to utilize their five hundred dollar voucher, most of the people are in their cars. They go through the line and then they drive right off. She recommended taking advantage of that opportunity by reaching out to people

while they are sitting in their cars about some of the programs that they might be able to take advantage of. She also mentioned it would be a good idea to conduct anti-idling outreach and education at these events. Lastly, she said the District needs to walk the talk by showcasing our programs and our initiatives by having District vehicles wrapped with information on some of the District's programs because as people are caught in traffic, they are looking at those things. As far as the mini-grants, she said it was an excellent idea as there are a lot of people in our communities that have great ideas and want to be our partners. By offering the mini grant, they can really get in and meet people where they are who would not otherwise know the efforts of this Board and the work we are trying to do.

Councilmember Preciado asked if the District's Annual Report to the Community was currently available in other languages such as Spanish and Hmong. Ms. Holt responded not currently, but the District could look into that in the future. Councilmember Preciado said there is frequently a lot of misinformation and rumors in the rural communities and said it would be important for residents to learn the facts about air quality and its effect on residents' health. Mr. Sheikh responded staff have been getting more experience in translating documents through the AB 617 process and said it was a great idea for us to consider on the Annual Report. He said unless there were objections from Board members, staff can pursue translating future reports. He added staff are in the phase right now of designing next year's report and are actually pulling the stories together right now. He added there would be a cost associated with translation, but it would be worth the consideration.

Councilmember Reyes voiced agreement for translating the annual report and added that it was critical as we depend on others who are not part of the process to relay the information and it can help avoid misunderstandings. He said the Real-time Electronic Air Quality Display (READ) was one of the most powerful outreach tools that the District has to offer. It offers the result of looking at the app without taking the initiative to pull out your phone and doing it, especially if you're driving or are walking or having a lunch or a conversation. He suggested potentially having READ displays available to move around places in local communities. He said that could be a great way to kind of plant a seed and get people to be conditioned to look for air quality information and as well as observe their own behaviors.

Supervisor Couch said he supports and appreciates staff's efforts. He added a little word of caution on the mini-grants, in light of what recently occurred in Kern County with regard to the census. He said they know at least an instance where someone who was distributing outreach material on the census was also passing out material for a particular political candidate. He said he wanted to be sure that the District puts in place sufficient safeguards to ensure proper use of the funding.

Supervisor Mendes commended staff on doing a good job. He suggested having

Councilmember Preciado do a series of television ads in Spanish to target that audience. Ms. Holt responded affirmatively and responded staff has been working on a Spanish language video to use for community outreach.

Mr. Sheikh thanked the Board for all of their great ideas, not only at this meeting, but many of the ideas that were part of this presentation were ones that originated with conversations that took place between the Board and staff over the last year. He added staff tried to integrate a lot of those ideas into the recommendations that were presented today. Regarding Councilmember Fugazi's suggestion to walk-the-walk, he said staff absolutely agrees and are continuing to transition our fleet vehicles to electric and plug in hybrid vehicles. He added staff have also been looking at opportunities for wrapping vehicles. The District continues to set the bar as a public agency in this area. He also thanked the District's Outreach and Communication team, that is small but mighty, who do a great job of reaching residents in the 8 counties, 59 cities and many rural communities that make up the Valley. He thanked the Board for their constant guidance and Supervisor Crocker for reaffirming the goals of the program that have evolved over many years and keep evolving. He said staff are excited to bring some of these ideas back as they are developed and will be able to immediately move forward with some. He also thanked the Board members in advance for participating in various outreach campaigns for the District and said staff really appreciate their help.

Public Comment: *The following persons commented on this item:*

- Janet Dietz-Kamei, Fresno Resident
- Claire Statham, CVAQ

14. APPOINT AD-HOC GOVERNING BOARD SUBCOMMITTEE FOR HEARING BOARD REAPPOINTMENTS – Mr. Sheikh said every region of the District is served by a Hearing Board that hears various petitions for variances, orders of abatement, permit appeals and other related issues. And by statute, every five member hearing board has to include an attorney, a registered engineer, a medical professional and two public members, and there are primary and alternate members for each of those roles. The terms are three years and are staggered to maintain continuity. The terms of two medical members are expiring on February 20, 2020. He said the Board needs to either reappoint the existing members or appoint new individuals. Part of that process is appointing the Ad Hoc Hearing Board Reappointment Subcommittee that would review the medical members and provide recommendations to the Board on their reappointments. He asked the Chair to appoint two Board members from each region to serve on the Ad Hoc subcommittee.

Chairman Pedersen appointed Mayor Bessinger and Councilmember Preciado to represent the Central Region; Councilmember Reyes and Supervisor Couch to represent the Southern Region; and Supervisor Pareira and Mayor Vierra to represent the Northern Region on the Ad Hoc Subcommittee for Hearing Board

Reappointments.

15. VERBAL REPORT ON CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD ACTIVITIES – In Dr. Sherriffs' absence, Mr. Sheikh referred Board members to the written agenda report on the CARB Board meeting of December 12-13, 2019.
16. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS – None
17. GOVERNING BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS – Mayor Bessinger was he was at the Fresno Madera Police Chiefs Association meeting yesterday, and one of the police chiefs was singing the praise of the District as he was approved for funding of some hybrid police vehicles.

### **ADJOURN**

*Chairman Pedersen adjourned the meeting at 12:21 p.m.*

*The next scheduled meeting of the Governing Board is: Thursday, February 20, 2020, at 9:00 a.m. The meeting starts at 9:00 a.m., in the Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno. The meeting will be held via videoteleconference (VTC) with the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating via VTC.*