

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District
Governing Board

Governing Board Room
1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno, CA

Monday, April 30, 2007
9:00 a.m.

Meeting held via teleconferencing (VTC) with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield). This meeting was webcast.

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

The Chair, Supervisor Worthley, called the meeting to order at 9:10 a.m.

2. ROLL CALL was taken and a quorum was present.

Present

Tony Barba, Supervisor	Kings County
Raji Brar, Councilmember	City of Arvin
Judith G. Case, Supervisor	Fresno County
Ronn Dominici, Supervisor	Madera County
Jon McQuiston, Supervisor	Kern County
Michael G. Nelson, Supervisor	Merced County
William O'Brien, Supervisor *	Stanislaus County
Henry T. Perea, Councilmember	City of Fresno
Chris Vierra, Councilmember *	City of Ceres
Leroy Ornellas, Supervisor, Vice Chair	San Joaquin County
J. Steven Worthley, Supervisor, Chair	Tulare County

* Attended meeting in Northern Region Office (Modesto)

3. APPROVAL OF CONSENT CALENDAR – Item numbers 15-19. These matters are routine in nature and are usually approved by a single vote. Prior to action by the Board, the public is given the opportunity to comment on any consent item.

15. *Approve Action Summary Minutes for the Governing Board Meeting of Thursday, March 15, 2007*

16. *Receive and File List of Scheduled Meetings for 2007*

17. *Receive and File Operations Statistics Summary for March, 2007*

18. *Receive and File Budget Status Report as of March 31, 2007*

19. *Receive and File Rule 4103 (Open Burning)*

Public Comment: None.

Moved: Case
Seconded: Nelson

Ayes: Barba, Brar, Case, Dominici, McQuiston, Nelson
O'Brien, Perea, Vierra, Ornellas, Worthley
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to approve Items 15-19 as recommended.

4. **PUBLIC COMMENT**—No Public Comment.

5. **REPORT FROM CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE (CAC)**

Dennis Tristao, Chair of CAC, presented the report. Mr. Tristao stated after a year and a half of work, the CAC was able to come to a unanimous consensus on a recommendation for an Environmental Justice Advisory Group. He added the CAC took up the issue of the Ozone Plan, and was divided on the issue, with the Industry Interest Group unanimous in its support of the Ozone Plan, the City Interest Group Divided, and the Environmental Interest Group unanimous in its opposition. An alternative motion was made by the Environmental Interest Group to ask the District take more time to prepare an Ozone Plan under a different classification. No vote could be taken as the quorum was lost. Additionally, the CAC had a discussion on the upcoming Rules.

6. **S.T.A.R. RECOGNITION (SERVICE, TEAMWORK, ATTITUDE, AND RESPECT)**

Carolyn Rose presented the report. The Chair thanked those honorees in attendance for their dedication to the District.

7. **VERBAL REPORT: SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY REGIONAL BLUEPRINT**

Jess Brown, California Partnership for the San Joaquin Valley (the Partnership), stated the Partnership seeks to create a vision for the San Joaquin Valley, to create a strategy to fulfill that vision, and to educate the public to support the strategy. Like the District which unites the eight Valley counties with the common goal of cleaning the air, the Partnership unites the Valley communities to improve land use planning, transportation policies, and air quality. Mr. Brown stated through the Partnership, the Valley was able to secure \$1 billion in funding for the Highway 99 project. Had the Valley legislators not worked together, the Valley would not have received that

money. He stated they have received \$2 million from the state towards the Blueprint Planning Process (Blueprint) which requires a 20% match. He stated he is in front of the Governing Board to ask them to help fund the Blueprint in the amount of \$500,000. He stated the Valley Councils of Governments (COGs) have contributed \$125,000.

Supervisor Case asked if federal dollars were being donated as well. Mr. Brown replied the state funds are actually federal funds the state manages. Supervisor Case asked if he was using transportation funds. He stated they are not at this time. Supervisor Case stated the amount he is requesting is not dissimilar to the \$1.5 million needed to complete the Ozone Study mentioned by Manuel Cunha during the Study Agency Board Meeting, and wanted to evaluate how the dollars compete.

The Chair asked how Mr. Brown reached the figure he is requesting. Mr. Brown replied that the total cost for the Blueprint is \$2.5 million, and \$500,000 is 20% of that total. The Chair stated he felt the Blueprint is a great program, but the Board's responsibility is to clean the air in the Valley, and at \$5,000 a piece, they could purchase 100 gross polluting vehicles for the same price as the contribution the Partnership is requesting. He added he is happy to see the COGs have contributed funds this year, but feels many areas benefit from the Blueprint, so the District should not be the main contributor.

Supervisor Dominici suggested to the Chair the item be agendaized as part of the budget. Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, stated the District supports the objectives of the Blueprint project, but wanted to get a sense from the Board on how they would prioritize funding for the Blueprint. He stated the item could be handled as a part of the budget process next month.

Supervisor O'Brien agreed the item should be agendaized.

The Chair asked for the full course of action in context of the budget and any alternatives staff might have. Supervisor McQuiston stated the COGs ability to contribute is a factor, and if this is important to the COGs, the District might be able to match funds with the COGs. Supervisor Case added the District should include the consideration that they become a signatory as well.

Public Comment: Carol Whiteside stated the region is linking land use, air quality, and transportation, and if this opportunity for the region to work together to solve the issues at hand passes, it will never come again. She stated Sacramento is already paying attention to regional plans, and have offered local government money for land use only if their local plans match with regional plans.

8. VERBAL REPORT: COMPLETION OF THE 2006-07 RESIDENTIAL WOOD BURNING SEASON

Jaime Holt, Public Information Administrator, presented the report and submitted the PowerPoint slides for the record. Supervisor Case asked if the emissions from wood burning in the foothills have been quantified. Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, stated locations above 3,000 feet have been exempted because of meteorology. Supervisor Case suggested the District reexamine that exemption especially around urban hubs in the mountain communities. Mr. Sadredin stated the District will reexamine the Rule in the PM2.5 Plan due next April.

Supervisor Ornellas asked where the Compliance classes for violators of the Wood Burning Rule are held. Ms. Holt stated they are held in each Regional office as needed. Supervisor Ornellas questioned what happens if the violator is on a fixed income and cannot afford to heat his or her home without burning wood. Ms. Holt stated the District works with low income people on a case-by-case basis and sometimes it includes assisting the person with getting into low income energy programs, and sometimes may include an exemption for that person.

Supervisor McQuiston asked if there was a web-based option for the compliance school. Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO, stated they have created a "home school" version for shut-ins, but no web-based option is available at this time.

Supervisor Barba suggested people could get a warning on the first violation, and Supervisor Dominici stated a warning goes a long way. Ms. Holt stated that the compliance team is sensitive to the individual situations and people can appeal their Notice of Violation.

Public Comment: None.

9. RECEIVE AND FILE INDIRECT SOURCE REVIEW ANNUAL REPORT (MARCH 1, 2006 - FEBRUARY 28, 2007)

Dave Warner, Director of Permit Services, presented the report. Mr. Warner thanked Dan Barber, Arnoud Marjollet, Jeff Findley, and Todd DeYoung for their work on this report. Supervisor Worthley confirmed there was a lawsuit filed that could result in the District paying back the funds already received. Mr. Warner stated other air districts are working on adopting their own Indirect Source Review regulations. Mr. Warner added the number of applications have not been as high as expected. One reason is development activity has declined, and another is that developers may be taking a "wait and see" approach based on the lawsuit. Additionally, some developers don't know about the Rule, and the District is working with the cities and counties to get that information out to the developers.

The Chair noted more developers are mitigating their impact by onsite design features such as solar panels rather than paying fees directly to the District. Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, stated the District's goals have always been for the Developers to fully mitigate their air pollution whenever possible, rather than paying fees to the District. Councilmembers Perea and McQuiston asked for a list of the mitigation measures developers can use.

Supervisor Barba asked if there was a provision for people who only develop a small portion of houses at a time to circumvent the Rule. Mr. Sadredin stated the Rule has adequate safeguards to capture those who attempt to phase in their projects to avoid applicability.

Moved: Barba
Seconded: Case

Ayes: Barba, Brar, Case, Dominici, McQuiston, Nelson
O'Brien, Perea, Vierra, Ornellas, Worthley
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to receive and file Indirect Source Review Annual Report (March 1, 2006-February 28, 2007).

10. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS

Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, stated he recently went to Washington D.C. with a coalition of air quality representatives and met with White House representatives and with members of Congress and key staffers with oversight responsibilities. He stated they called themselves the San Joaquin Valley Air Quality Coalition, and took four requests to the federal representatives.

- The Air Quality Enterprise Zone (AQEZ) seeks to create an umbrella program that would help fight the chronic double digit unemployment in the Valley while also encouraging green industry.
- \$100 million in direct funding to the Valley in support of the Ozone Plan.
- Full funding of the Diesel Emission Reduction Account, a nationwide program authorized at \$200 million per year, but never fully funded. The last round of funding gave the program \$25 million of which the Valley received \$500,000. Should they fail to fully fund it, they asked the allocation go to areas that have the highest need.
- \$100 million per year for the Farm Bill's EQUIP program that assists farmers with changing out their equipment and helps them with conservation.

He stated the coalition was well received, but was told there was a war going on, and deficit reduction is a high priority. All funding needs to find offsetting savings in other areas, so other programs could lose money in our favor.

Mr. Sadredin stated he was on a talk show that aired on Fresno radio station KMJ, and was told the District is doing too tough on businesses and needs to go after gross polluting vehicles instead.

11. GOVERNING BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

Supervisor Case stated she was hopeful the KMJ show would be more of a dialogue. She added the District has a big challenge in public education.

12. NO CLOSED SESSION

The Chair called for a 30-minute break at 10:30 a.m.

The meeting reconvened at 11:00 a.m. The Chair asked all those present to speak on the Public Hearing to adopt the revised proposed 2007 Ozone Plan to fill out Request to Speak cards and submit to District Staff.

13. PUBLIC HEARING: ADOPT THE REVISED PROPOSED 2007 OZONE PLAN

Seyed Sadredin, Executive Director/APCO, submitted the PowerPoint presentation for the Record. The report was presented by: Mr. Sadredin; Rick McVaigh, Deputy APCO; Scott Nester, Director of Planning; Don Hunsaker, Planning Manager; and Jessie Hafer, Air Quality Specialist II. Mr. Sadredin noted District staff has worked on this Plan for over a year, and thanked everyone involved for the long hours and hard work they put into the Plan.

Mr. Sadredin stated that the staff recommendation followed an extensive public process, and every effort was made to avoid the reclassification to Extreme. He noted that even under the “no constraints” analysis, the Valley falls short of the 75% NOx reduction needed as the technology isn’t available. He stated that all control measures were examined and that compliance with the proposed Plan will cost businesses \$20 billion. He added that the Plan calls for \$3 billion in state and federal funds, and calls for utilizing new technology as soon as it becomes available.

Mr. Sadredin stated that the Plan is the most expeditious path to attainment, and that 50% of the Valley will be in attainment by 2015, with 90% in attainment by 2020, and all Valley residents will reach attainment by 2023. He noted that attainment towards particulate matter (PM) 2.5 is advanced by the Ozone Plan. He stated staff recommends a Dual Path strategy to reach attainment as early as possible. He noted the “Dual Path” term was coined by Pete Weber of the California Partnership for the San Joaquin Valley, but the Dual Path concept has been in the Plan all along in Chapter 8, the term is

just a rebranding of the original concept in order to make it easier to communicate.

Mr. Sadredin stated the Plan is tough and aggressive and relies on best available science and technology, and the Plan can be amended as new technologies and strategies become available.

After staff's presentation, the Chair called a 30-minute recess at 12:29 a.m. He reminded all those present wishing to speak on the revised proposed 2007 Ozone Plan to fill out the Request to Speak cards.

The Chair reconvened the meeting at 1:07 p.m.

Supervisor Case stated in 2004, the District submitted a One-hour Ozone Plan but it was never enacted by EPA due to their revocation of the standards. She stated she remembered it involved the District asking for a reclassification to Extreme and required lower thresholds for permitting. She asked if the District went to the lower thresholds. She understands the District is on track to meet the standard in that Plan.

Mr. Sadredin affirmed the District reclassified in the Plan, but since EPA revoked the standard, the Valley was never officially reclassified as Extreme. He noted the permitting requirements didn't kick in, but the District implemented all of its commitments in the Plan. Mr. Nester stated the District implemented all the control measures in the Plan, with a few remaining to come to the Board soon. He stated the District is on track for attainment of that standard by the 2010 deadline.

Public Comment:

The Chair stated there were over 60 speakers signed up so far, and all speakers would be limited to two minutes.

Kurt Karperos, ARB, stated he supports the Plan as sound and meeting federal eligibility requirements.

Kerry Drake, EPA, stated the official review of the Plan doesn't begin until it's submitted. He stated EPA is committed to local control, and applauded the District for an expeditious plan. He stated he looks forward to reviewing the Plan and working with the District.

The following individuals provided testimony on the Plan:

Kevin Abernathy, Dairy Care's & CA Dairy Campaign
Maria Arevalo, Latinos United for Clean Air
Irma Arrollo, Lupe la Union Del Pueblo Entero
Liza Balanos, Central Valley Air Quality Coalition
Sonny Barger

Shirley Batchman, CA Citrus Mutual
Nidia Bautista, Coalition for Clean Air
John Beyer, USDA-NRCS
Stephanie Camoroda, Latino Issues Forum
Tim Carmichael, Coalition for Clean Air
Les Clark, I.O.P.A.
Brian Cohen
Vince Correll, Woodward Park Home Owner's Association
Paul Cort, EarthJustice
Manuel Cunha, Nisei Farmer's League
Joaquina Darneil, Campacinas Unidos
Jan Ennenga, Manufacturers Council of the Central Valley
Dale Erwin
Kathryn Erwin-Loschke, RN
Caroline Farrell, Center on Race, Poverty & the Environment
Leticia Figueroa
Josefina Flores, Venida for Workers
Laura Foulks
Jerry Frost, Kern Oil Refinery, Co.
Don Gaede, MD
Michelle Garcia, American Lung Assoc.
Don Giacomazzi, Western United Dairyman
Haley Grant, Kid's Clean Air Network
John Grant, Mom's Clean Air Network
Tom Grave, Merced Alliance for Responsible Growth
Carolyn Hamilton, Resident
Kevin Hamilton, American Lung Assoc/Med Advocates for Healthy Air
Sabrina Hernandez, IDEAU--Great Valley Center
Nettie R. Higginbotham (read into the record by Carolina Simunovic)
Allyson Holman, Merced/Mariposa County Asthma Coalition
Roger Isom, CA Cotton Ginners and Growers
Sarah Jackson, EarthJustice
Louise Johnson, Catholic Diocese of Stockton Env. Justice Committee
Rodney Kamper
Lisa Kayser-Grant, Mom's Clean Air Network
Melissa Kelley-Ortega, Merced/Mariposa County Asthma Coalition & Moms CAN
Gabrielle Kirkland, CA Grape & Tree Fruit League
Dr. Roger Larson, Fresno Madera Med. Society
Cindy Lashbrook, Community Alliance with Family Farmers
Domatila Lemus, Campacinas Unidos
Rey Leon, Latino Issues Forum
Dr. David Lighthall, Central Valley Health Policy Institute
Patrick Losdile
Lupe Martinez, CRPE
Katie Matthews, San Joaquin Farm Bureau Federation

Candice Adam Medefind, Moms CAN
Marit Medefind, Kids CAN
Ed Moreno, MD, County Public Health Officer
Brent Newell
Suzanne Noble, WSPA
Jean Okuye
Jaime Ortega, Merced Mariposa Asthma Coalition
Andrea Perez, LUCA
Kathryn Phillips, Environmental Defense
Tim Phillips
Josefina Pichardo, Comite ASMA
Mike Polyniak, MKP ENV
Vannessa Ramirez
Mary-Michal Rawling, Merced/Mariposa County Asthma Coalition
Stuart Rawling
Betsy Reifsnider, Catholic Charities, Stockton Diocese
Lillian Roberts, Moms CAN
Nick Robinson
Kristy Rocha, Western United Dairyman
Inez Rojas, ASMA
Jenny Sacklar, Fresno Metro Ministry
Will Scott, Jr., African American Farmers of CA
Sarah Sharpe, Coalition for Clean Air
Carolina Simunovic, Fresno Metro Ministry
Daniela Simunovic
Jeffrey Smith (read into the record by Sarah Sharpe)
Lee Snyder
Judy Stege (read into the record by Carolina Simunovic)
Trica Stever, Tulare Co. Farm Bureau
Kyle Stockard, Stop Wal-Mart Action Team
Aracely Toppete, Lupe la Union Del Pueblo Entero
Vicky Trevillyan, Catholic Charities, Stockton Diocese
Arthur Unger, Sierra Club
Martha Valencia, CRPE
Esperanza Valle, Lupe la Union Del Pueblo Entero
Howard K. Watkins, Central Valley Progressive PAC
Pete Weber, CA Partnership for the San Joaquin Valley
Rod Webster, Merced Group Sierra Club
John Wiens, Independent Businessman

The Chair asked if the District wanted to respond before the Board Members discuss the topic. Mr. Sadredin thanked the Public for attending. He stated no one in the room would want to go to the Extreme designation if there were any other possible option. He further stated the Plan does not delay cleaning the air, and the only people advocating the delay of clean air are those who advocate delaying approval of the Plan. He stated any delay on approving

the plan will delay the regulatory calendar and all of the rules and regulations the District hopes to have in place by 2010 will be delayed. He noted no speaker gave a specific suggestion as to how to bring the Valley into attainment any sooner than proposed.

Mr. Sadredin stated of the \$3.2 billion health care cost noted on slide 13 of the presentation, \$30 million is attributed to Ozone health issues, the remaining is attributed to particulate matter (PM). Under this Plan, the Valley will meet the PM2.5 standard by 2015, so 99% of the cost will be eliminated by 2015 under this plan.

Mr. Sadredin stated San Joaquin County and Modesto are already in attainment. Stanislaus County will be in attainment by 2015, and Merced will be in attainment soon. He stated, the Valley will reduce the number of days exceeding the limit gradually and dramatically until, in 2023, there will be no days of exceedences anywhere in the Valley.

The Chair called for a 15-minute recess at 5:40 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 5:57 p.m.

Supervisor McQuiston asked about the various “clocks” mentioned throughout the presentation. Mr. Sadredin replied there are four clocks. The three year clock is that the Plan is due three years from the day the Valley received its non-attainment designation. Then there is the six month transportation budget conformity clock, which ends when EPA receives the Plan and accepts that the conformity budget is adequate. The third clock is the 18 month sanction clock to allow EPA to review the Plan and make amendments if needed. The final clock is the 24 month clock for the federal implementation plan, which begins the same day the 18 month sanction period begins. Once it’s triggered, the 24 month clock does not turn off until EPA approves our plan.

Councilmember Brar clarified that Mr. Sadredin feels the Plan is the best possible Plan they can turn in. Mr. Sadredin confirmed. She stated when Mr. Sadredin first presented the Plan to the City of Arvin, he stated no stone was left unturned, yet the District incorporated some of the Alternative State Implementation Plan’s (Alt SIP) suggestions. Mr. Sadredin stated when he brought the first draft to Arvin, he noted by the time the process is over, no stone will be left unturned. He stated the Alt SIP measures adopted give them only .5 ton/day more. Councilmember Brar asked what major roadblock is preventing the Valley from reaching attainment sooner, and it is disheartening to hear there is nothing that can be done. Mr. Sadredin responded that the constraints on available technology are the key limitation. Councilmember Brar asked for clarification on the District’s authority to implement operational controls. Mr. Sadredin stated that federal laws including the Clean Air Act and the Interstate Commerce Clause prohibit the

District from regulating tailpipe emissions directly or indirectly through operational controls.

Supervisor Barba stated we've done what we can, but technology hasn't caught up yet.

Councilmember Perea expressed a thank you to the staff and the public for attending. He asked if the Dual Path is the same thing as Chapter 8 but with a new spin. Mr. Sadredin stated the rebranding communicates the strategy better, but for staff it has always been one path to reach attainment as quickly as possible. The Chair noted the District has a history of adopting new technology as soon as it becomes available. Councilmember Perea stated if 80% of our NOx emissions are from motor vehicles, then the Board needs to force the hand of those who have legal authority. He added if the Board is more vocal in their pleas to ARB, it would buy a lot of goodwill in the community. He stated Chapter 8 has great ideas, but would like it to be more solid.

Supervisor Nelson thanked his constituents for attending, and the staff for working hard on the Plan. He noted there was some confusion in the public as to what the Public Hearing is about— Ozone, particulate, pesticides— and noted this discussion is focused on Ozone. He noted his daughter has asthma, but if either of his children leaves the Valley, it will not be due to air quality but to the lack of well-paying good jobs. He stated he was surprised there was a lot of misinformation that the District has done little to clean up the air, when a lot has actually been done. He stated if the Board fails to approve the Plan, the economic impact will be great, not just to the businesses, but to the people employed by the businesses. He noted he supports staff recommendations and would make a motion of support. The Chair accepted his motion and continued soliciting comments.

Supervisor Case noted the District has a legal obligation to submit a plan on June 15, 2007. She asked why staff didn't do an EIR. Phil Jay, District Counsel, stated there is no legal requirement for the EIR because there is no adverse impact versus the status quo. Mr. Jay noted the last time the Board bumped up from Serious to Extreme, a lawsuit was brought saying we needed to complete an EIR. A judge ruled an EIR was unnecessary because compared to not doing anything, the Plan improves air quality. The Chair noted the Plan is not designed to cover every detail, and those details come out in rule development. Mr. Sadredin stated every rule adopted that is not administrative follows CEQA. Supervisor Case asked if we are open to litigation if we do not submit the Plan on time. Mr. Jay stated we are open to lawsuits based on both failing to turn in a federal plan, and failing to follow state requirements since the state requires the Plan as well.

Supervisor Case stated she understands the sense of urgency from the Public. She added if they understood the bureaucratic regulations the District had to operate under, the comments heard during the public hearing may have been different. Supervisor Case would like to see the Dual Path strengthened with agreed upon benchmarks. She requested the staff bring the Dual Path back to the Board for further discussion.

Supervisor Dominici stated he believes staff has put in so much time and research that they have the best possible data that can be proven. He noted staff will continue working on reaching the deadline as quickly as possible and will find the new technology.

Supervisor McQuiston noted the Board is compelled to follow the legal path because deadlines have consequences. He stated he would like to see a meaningful discussion on executable measures and would like staff to return to the Board frequently with updates on the Dual Path.

Councilmember Brar stated Arvin didn't know they had an ozone problem until December, and she can't go back and tell her constituents there's no hope. She stated the people are being let down. She added people don't think about air pollution because they can't see it, so they can't visualize how they are polluting.

Councilmember Vierra stated Public Health is the number one priority of the Board, but the Plan has to be realistic, because if it can't be realized, it's useless. He noted manufacturers will make new technology as fast as they can because new technology equals new money for them.

Supervisor O'Brien stated the District has a proactive and professional staff. He stated that 80% of the NOx pollution is from mobile sources and noted that NAFTA doesn't require trucks entering the United States to have any environmental standards. He mentioned that an ad in the Modesto Bee targeting him stated a baby girl born today will not breathe clean air until she graduates from high school; the ad doesn't state that the baby girl is breathing 80% cleaner air than her mother did 25 years earlier. Supervisor O'Brien stated he met with many people recently regarding air quality, including a woman from Knight's Ferry who told him she was moving because the air quality is so bad, but Knight's Ferry is in attainment, so there is clearly a need to educate the public.

The Chair stated he has a son who has asthma and will be turning 25 in nine days. He noted that the air he breathed as a baby was 80% dirtier than the air he breathes now. He reiterated that we have a legal obligation to submit a Plan. He noted any delay of action delays implementation of the Plan which delays cleaning the air.

Supervisor Case asked Supervisor Nelson to add to his motion to require District staff to bring the Dual Path back to the Board in order to create some benchmarks to keep it active and alive. Supervisor Nelson agreed.

Moved: Nelson
Second: Case

Ayes: Barba, Case, Dominici, McQuiston, Nelson
O'Brien, Vierra, Ornellas, Worthley
Nays: Brar, Perea

Motion to approve staff recommendations 1-8 and direct staff to return to the June 21, 2007 Board Meeting with the Dual Path plan passed with a vote of nine Ayes and two Nays.

14. **Other Business**
None

15. **ADJOURN**

The Chair adjourned the meeting at 6:56 p.m.

The next meeting is scheduled for Thursday, May 17, 2007. Meeting starts at 9:00 a.m., Central Region Office, Governing Board Room, 1990 E. Gettysburg Avenue, Fresno. The meeting will be held via video teleconferencing (VTC), with the Northern Region Office (Modesto) and the Southern Region Office (Bakersfield) participating via VTC. Governing Board Meetings are webcast.

Respectfully submitted,

Toni J. Taber, Clerk to the Boards
San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District