

Action Summary Minutes
San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

March 3, 2026 at 10:00 a.m.

The Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was held via video teleconference (VTC): with the Central Region Office (Fresno), the Northern Region Office (4800 Enterprise Way, Modesto, CA 95356), and the Southern Region Office (34946 Flyover Court, Bakersfield, CA 93308). Members of the public were allowed to participate in-person at any of the referenced locations or remotely via Zoom webinar. The CAC Meeting was also webcast.

1. CALL TO ORDER – The Chair, Patricia Matthews, called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL – was taken and a quorum was present to hold the meeting.

County	Member Name	Interest Group	Location
Fresno	Manuel Cunha	IAIG (P)	Fresno
Kern	Christine Zimmerman	IAIG (A)	Bakersfield
	John Sanders	EIG (P)	Bakersfield
	Orchel Krier	CIG (P)	Bakersfield
Kings	Laura Brown	IAIG (P)	Bakersfield
	Kelly Deming	EIG (P)	Fresno
	Patricia Matthews	CIG (P)	Fresno
Madera	Ashley Nebeker	EIG (P)	Fresno
	Jeff Troost	CIG (P)	Fresno
Merced	Chris Medeiros	IAIG (P)	Modesto
	Denise Holmes	EIG (P)	Modesto
San Joaquin	Roger Hoffdahl	IAIG (P)	Modesto
	Ned Leiba	EIG (P)	Modesto
Stanislaus	Chris Savage	IAIG (A)	Modesto
	Jami Aggers	EIG (P)	Modesto
	Chris Fisher	CIG (P)	Modesto
Tulare	Fernando Rios	IAIG (P)	Bakersfield
	Dennis Tristao	EIG (A)	Fresno
	Dennis Mederos	CIG (P)	Fresno

(P) = Primary, (A) = Alternate, IAIG = Industry/Ag Interest Group, EIG = Environmental Interest Group, CIG = City Interest Group

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

4. APPROVE MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 3, 2026

Ms. Matthews asked for member comments on the minutes from the February 3, 2026 CAC meeting. With no comments, the Chair declared the Minutes approved.

Public Comment: none

5. PUBLIC COMMENTS

Public Comment – The following individual provided public comment on this item:

- Cynthia Prieto-Diaz, Resident

6. CHAIR COMMENTS

Ms. Matthews welcomed the committee members.

7. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/APCO COMMENTS

Samir Sheikh, Executive Director/Air Pollution Control Officer, reported that the Governing Board approved just over \$3 million in funding from the California Air Resources Board for the Climate Heat Impact Response Program (CHIRP), which was established to mitigate air quality impacts from emergency power measures used during the 2021–2022 energy crunch. Mr. Sheikh also noted that the state faces a challenging budget year due to a significant deficit and emphasized that the period between the governor's January proposal and the May revision is a critical time for clean air funding advocacy, with more clarity expected once the May proposal is released.

8. VERBAL UPDATE FROM CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (CARB)

Shelah Ott, provided a brief update on CARB's recent and upcoming actions.

Mr. Mederos asked about CARB's approach to mitigating dairy and livestock methane emissions. Ms. Ott noted she does not work directly on this but will follow up with staff who do and provide clarification.

Mr. Savage asked for clarification on the objective and ultimate goal of the continuous soil nitrogen emissions project, specifically whether it is intended to add data to the statewide nitrogen emissions inventory. Ms. Ott said she would follow up with the staff experts on the study for more details.

Mr. Savage also requested that the lead staff for SB 253 reporting attend the next meeting to answer questions, and Ms. Ott stated that she would request this from the appropriate staff.

Ms. Holmes asked whether CARB has proactively reached out to ag industry stakeholders about soil programs and studies, or if the information is only available on their website. Mr. Hixon noted that he would check with staff on the scope of CARB's outreach to ensure agriculture and industry stakeholders are informed, including for dairy and livestock methane programs, and report back.

Mr. Mederos requested a full presentation on the dairy and livestock sector to keep committee members informed for their stakeholders. Ms. Ott agreed to coordinate a future presentation.

Mr. Cunha commended the document but shared his concern about using the term professional for landscapers. He highlighted the extensive work already done on dairy ammonia mitigation and stressed that all agricultural research, including soil NOx studies, should go through the San Joaquin Valley Study Agency. He emphasized the importance of local stakeholder engagement and better communication.

Mr. Tristao suggested a letter from the CAC to emphasize the need for research to be conducted through the San Joaquin Valleywide Air Pollution Study Agency and Ag Tech Committee.

Ms. Nebeker asked how the Study Agency is structured. Mr. Sheikh explained it is a Joint Powers Authority (JPA) with an administrative board of eight county representatives, highlighting its role in policy oversight, collaborative research, and efficiently managing and vetting San Joaquin Valley focused projects and funding.

Ms. Nebeker noted that short notice for CARB meetings and webinars makes it difficult to share information with stakeholders and asked if links to recorded sessions are provided. Mr. Hixon agreed to follow up with recordings and suggested providing them after CAC meetings going forward. Ms. Nebeker confirmed this would be helpful for her stakeholders.

Ms. Brown suggested sending a direct link to CARB's distribution lists to make signing up easier and noted that scheduling multiple meetings on the same day, sometimes simultaneously, discourages participation. She encouraged addressing this issue with CARB.

Ms. Brown asked about the vehicle weight classification for the postponed Drive Forward light-duty vehicle program workshop. Mr. Hixon did not have the information at this time, but offered to follow up with the requested information.

Mr. Sanders suggested including language in a letter requesting reduced vehicle testing for certain industries due to their performance. Mr. Tristao suggested handling that separately and made a motion to develop a letter emphasizing coordination with the soil

NOx research project and dairy/livestock methane programs, ensuring involvement of the Ag Tech group, the San Joaquin Valleywide Air Pollution Study Agency, and the District Governing Board.

Mr. Sheikh, on advice of Counsel, clarified that Item 8 was noticed as an informational item and did not clearly allow for Committee action. He explained the process under the Brown Act for adding an immediate action item to the agenda, noting that the Committee may take action on an item not appearing on the posted agenda only upon a determination that the need to take action arose after the posting of the agenda and that the item requires immediate action.

The Committee then discussed whether to add an immediate action item to the agenda to consider the proposed letter and determined that the need for action arose after the posting of the agenda and required immediate action prior to the next meeting.

Public Comment – No individuals provided comments during the time allotted for public comments on this item.

Moved: Tristao
Seconded: Cunha
Ayes: Cunha, Zimmerman, Brown, C. Medeiros, Hoffdahl, Savage, Rios, Sanders, Deming, Nebeker, Holmes, Leiba, Aggers, Tristao, Krier, Matthews, Troost, Fisher, Mederos
Nays: None

Motion unanimously carried to add an immediate action item to the agenda for potential action.

8a. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION TO SEND LETTER TO CARB REGARDING COORDINATION OF SOIL NOx AND OTHER AG-RELATED RESEARCH

The Chair, Ms. Matthews, opened this item up for discussion by Committee members.

Mr. Tristao made a motion to send letters from the CAC to emphasize the need for NOx research and dairy/livestock methane programs to be coordinated through the San Joaquin Valleywide Air Pollution Study Agency and Ag Tech Committee. Ms. Matthews asked for clarification if there would be two letters. Mr. Tristao confirmed.

Mr. Savage inquired whether the proposed research had already been reviewed by the Study Agency to avoid duplicating efforts. Mr. Sheikh responded that, to his understanding, the recent research solicitation had not been formally vetted by the Study Agency and noted that the request under discussion may involve a more formal role for the Study Agency in coordinating, reviewing, and administering such research.

He also highlighted the broader scope of related efforts, including SB 1383 dairy methane reduction initiatives, and the potential for enhanced coordination.

Mr. Tristao clarified that his motion focused on coordinating soil NO_x research, not broader methane issues, and emphasized continuing this work through the San Joaquin Valley Study Agency.

Mr. Savage suggested that the proposed letter be more general in nature, recommending that CARB work through established Study Agency processes and improve coordination, rather than focusing narrowly on specific projects.

Ms. Holmes emphasized that dairy and livestock methane should be considered distinct categories with different definitions and stressed the importance of including appropriate stakeholders and following established procedures, such as routing efforts through the Study Agency.

Mr. Sheikh asked for clarification on the motion, referencing a suggestion from Mr. Savage to potentially consolidate the two letters into one, and questioned whether the motion was to proceed with one combined letter or two separate letters. Mr. Tristao stated he would amend the motion to incorporate the suggestion of a single letter.

Mr. Cunha stressed that soil NO_x must be addressed promptly, recalling prior research and expressing concern about delays, and noted that livestock should be considered separately. Mr. Tristao stated his understanding that the letter would emphasize soil NO_x and request that it be included in the study.

Public Comment – No individuals provided comments during the time allotted for public comments on this item.

Moved: Tristao
Seconded: Cunha
Ayes: Cunha, Zimmerman, Brown, C. Medeiros, Hoffdahl, Savage, Rios, Sanders, Deming, Nebeker, Holmes, Leiba, Aggers, Tristao, Krier, Matthews, Troost, Fisher, Mederos
Nays: None

The motion unanimously carried for the CAC to send a letter to CARB emphasizing concerns regarding the lack of coordination on soil NO_x efforts and requesting that soil NO_x research be coordinated through the San Joaquin Valleywide Air Pollution Study Agency, with collaboration with the Ag Tech Committee, and that related efforts, including SB 1383 dairy methane reduction initiatives, be similarly coordinated.

9. UPDATE ON ATTAINMENT PLANS AND RULES

Tim Franquist, Director of Air Quality Planning reported that EPA finalized its determination that the Valley attained the 1997 annual PM_{2.5} standard by the 2024 deadline, clearing the way to complete a 20-year maintenance plan. For the 2012 annual PM_{2.5} standard, the Valley is awaiting EPA action on a five-year extension request (to 2030); without it, the District would be required to develop a new Plan (189 or 5% Plan), which would require a stringent and challenging 5% annual emissions reductions requirement until attainment is reached. Finally, the District is proposing to amend Rule 4905 to extend the compliance deadline for low-NO_x natural gas furnaces in mobile homes. A public workshop was held with no adverse comments received.

10. DISTRICT'S ANNUAL AIR TOXICS REPORT FOR 2025

Seth Lane, Program Manager in the Permits department, presented the District's Annual Air Toxics Report for 2025.

Mr. Krier asked about emissions from auto body shops and manufacturing facilities. Mr. Lane explained that controls are considered, some chemicals may escape typical capture, and facilities are assessed using a health-protective approach, with risk adjusted for nearby receptors and controls like static paint.

Mr. Krier inquired about manufacturing facilities using similar coatings. Mr. Lane confirmed these are included in the program and assessed based on chemicals used and proximity to receptors.

Ms. Zimmerman shared her appreciation to Mr. Lane for the thorough and timely air toxics report.

Mr. Fisher asked whether the auto body shop review is education-focused or could lead to enforcement. Mr. Lane explained that the annual Air Toxics Report is informational, providing data on regulated facilities, most of which are compliant, with future actions only for a few auto body shops. Mr. Sheikh added that under AB 25, the focus is on public right-to-know and communication. Most facilities pose no elevated risks, there are no violations, and any further actions will be carefully considered over a multi-year process.

Mr. Fisher asked if facilities using less-than-best-available technology are prioritized higher. Mr. Sheikh responded that prioritization mainly relies on emissions inventories, with technology as a factor, and noted that auto body shop emissions also depend on available coatings and manufacturer choices, which are being monitored statewide.

Mr. Mederos thanked Mr. Lane for the report.

Mr. Tristao commended the comprehensive report. He asked when CARB would update the data. Mr. Lane explained the next update will likely use 2020 inventory data, and the District will incorporate it into future reports.

Mr. Cunha emphasized that incentives for agricultural equipment have been key to significant emissions reductions, highlighting the importance of sustained funding.

Ms. Nebeker inquired about lead agency oversight for CEQA permitting. Mr. Lane explained that the District provides expertise to land use agencies under CEQA, reviewing projects and offering comments on air toxic emissions and their impact on human health. Mr. Sheikh added that the lead agency is typically a city, county, state, or sometimes federal NEPA agency, and the District comments through that process.

Ms. Nebeker asked about categorical exemptions, and Mr. Lane shared that his team reviews all projects for air toxic emissions, while Mr. Sheikh added that the focus is on stationary and mobile sources under CEQA, and the mature permitting program covers projects from auto body shops to large industrial facilities, with fuel reduction projects considered separately.

11. VERBAL REPORT ON STATE IMPLEMENTATION PLANNING EFFORTS

Tim Franquist, Director of Air Quality Planning and Jon Klassen, Director of Air Quality Science provided a brief air quality and planning update, highlighting record improvements in 2025, including the lowest number of unhealthy AQI days and record lows for ozone and PM2.5 exceedances in the San Joaquin Valley. They noted that for the first time, all monitoring sites in the Valley were below the Federal 24-hour PM2.5 threshold for that year, reflecting significant progress due to long-term investments from multiple sectors.

Mr. Krier asked what percentage of trucks and cars operating in California are out-of-state. Mr. Sheikh responded that the numbers are not readily available, depend on vehicle type, and can be complex.

Mr. Troost thanked staff for the condensed update, and asked about 2025 air quality. Mr. Klassen confirmed it was a good year as shown in the presentation charts.

Mr. Cunha highlighted concerns about CARB's proposed regulation of out-of-state trucks, noting potential impacts on interstate commerce and Valley farmers, and requested a presentation from CARB staff overseeing this division to clarify their plans and actions.

12. RECOMMEND CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE REPRESENTATIVES TO THE DISTRICT'S ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP

Stephanie Ng, Director of Community Strategies and Resources explained that the District's Environmental Justice Advisory Group includes six members from the CAC to serve as primary and alternate from each interest group category. She added that the group includes three committee representatives along with alternates, and that the current representatives, Orchel Krier, Manuel Cunha, and Chris McGlothlin, are approaching the end of their two-year terms and have confirmed their willingness to be reappointed.

Mr. Sanders shared his support for Mr. Krier's reappointment.

Ms. Matthews shared her support for Mr. Cunha's reappointment.

The following individual provided public comment during this item:

- Cynthia Prieto-Diaz, Resident

Moved: Mederos

Seconded: Tristao

Ayes: Cunha, Zimmerman, Brown, C. Medeiros, Hoffdahl, Rios, Sanders, Deming, Nebeker, Holmes, Aggers, Tristao, Krier, Matthews, Troost, Fisher, Mederos

Nays: None

Motion carried to recommend the appointment of the following members to represent the Citizen's Advisory Committee on the District's Environmental Justice Advisory Group: (1) Orchel Krier to City Interest Group Representative, Alternate; (2) Manuel Cunha to Industry/Agricultural Representative, Primary; and (3) Chris McGlothlin to Industry/Agricultural Representative, Alternate

13. AB 617 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATES

Stephanie Ng, Director of Community Strategies and Resources, provided an update on AB 617 Community Air Protection Program activities. She noted that agency partners in Kern County, including the City of Arvin, City of Shafter, and Kern County Public Works, are continuing work on sidewalk, road, and bike lane improvement projects. Brian Moore, Manager for CARB's Office of Community Air Protection, provided an update on the third AB 617 consultation group meeting on March 25, focused on reviewing and improving the group's draft charter, and noted it will be held both in-person in Sacramento and virtually.

Mr. Sheikh highlighted that the State's Environmental Justice Advisory Committee is seeking new members, and Mr. Moore confirmed applications are open and will provide the link for CAC distribution.

14. OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS REPORTS

Jaime Holt, Chief Communications Officer, reported that the residential wood smoke reduction season concluded on February 28, with an end-of-season report to be presented in the coming months. She also shared that the District is conducting valley-wide outreach for the Clean Green Yard Machine program, offering rebates for electric lawn equipment, and is preparing for spring outreach events such as Earth Day and Air Quality Awareness Week, encouraging members to share local opportunities for District participation and public education.

Mr. Krier asked about replacing battery-powered electric lawn mowers that no longer work after two years. Ms. Holt explained they cannot be replaced through the program, but warranties may be available from manufacturers. She added that there are still rebates for new electric mowers, even without trading in an old one.

Ms. Nebeker asked if the program covers only lawn mowers or other small engines. Ms. Holt explained it includes several small engine tools such as trimmers, edgers, and electric chainsaws but does not include leaf blowers, and the full list is available on the website.

15. CAC MEMBER COMMENTS

Mr. Tristao expressed sincere gratitude for all of the presentations that were given today. He recognized the efforts of staff members who prepared them.

16. VOLUNTEER TO PRESENT REPORT DURING GOVERNING BOARD MEETING

Mr. Cunha volunteered to present the CAC report at the March Governing Board Meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 12:54 p.m.